

## II

### UPPER SEMI-CONTINUOUS COLLECTIONS OF THE SECOND TYPE

CONSIDER a compact and connected space  $S$  satisfying Axioms 0, 1 and 2 and in which there are no contiguous points.

A collection  $G$  of continua is said to be an *upper semi-continuous collection of the first type* (type 1) provided it is true that (1) the continua of the collection  $G$  are mutually exclusive and (2) if  $g$  is a continuum of the collection  $G$  and  $g_1, g_2, g_3, \dots$  is a sequence of continua of  $G$  and, for each  $n$ ,  $A_n$  and  $B_n$  are points of  $g_n$  and the sequence  $A_1, A_2, A_3, \dots$  converges to a point of  $g$ , then for every infinite subsequence of  $B_1, B_2, B_3, \dots$  there is an infinite subsequence of that subsequence converging to a point of  $g$ .

A collection  $G$  of continua is said to be an *upper semi-continuous collection of the second type* (type 2) provided it is true that (1) if  $g$  is a continuum of the collection  $G$  and  $g_1, g_2, g_3, \dots$  is a sequence of distinct continua of  $G$  and, for each  $n$ ,  $A_n$  and  $B_n$  are points of  $g_n$  and the sequence  $A_1, A_2, A_3, \dots$  converges to a point of  $g$ , then for every infinite subsequence of  $B_1, B_2, B_3, \dots$  there is an infinite subsequence of that subsequence converging to a point of  $g$ , (2) no two elements of  $G$  have more than one point in common, (3) if a point is common to two elements of  $G$  it is itself an element of  $G$  and there exist at least two non-degenerate elements of  $G$  containing it, (4) if the point  $P$  is common to two elements of  $G$  and  $g$  is a non-degenerate

element of  $G$  containing  $P$  then there exists a region  $R$  containing  $P$  such that no component of  $R - P$  contains both a point of  $g$  and a point of some other element of  $G$  that contains  $P$  and such that furthermore no point of  $R$  belongs both to a connected subset of  $R - P$  that contains a point of  $g$  and to a connected subset of  $R$  that contains  $P$  but no other point of  $g$ .

Let  $G$  denote some definite upper semi-continuous collection of continua of type 2 filling up the space  $S$ .

DEFINITION. A degenerate continuum of the collection  $G$  which is a point belonging to some non-degenerate continuum of  $G$  is called a *junction element* of  $G$ .

THEOREM 1. No junction element of  $G$  is a point of uncountably many different continua of the collection  $G$  and if there exist infinitely many distinct continua  $g_1, g_2, g_3, \dots$  of  $G$  all containing the same point  $g$  then the sequence of point sets  $g_1, g_2, g_3, \dots$  converges to the point  $g$ .

*Proof.* Suppose  $g$  is a point which is an element of  $G$  and  $g_1, g_2, g_3, \dots$  is a sequence of distinct and non-degenerate continua of the collection  $G$  all containing  $g$ . There exists a sequence of points  $P_1, P_2, P_3, \dots$  converging to the point  $g$  and such that, for each  $n$ ,  $P_n$  belongs to  $g_n$ . Hence if  $X_1, X_2, X_3, \dots$  is another sequence of points such that, for each  $n$ ,  $X_n$  belongs to  $g_n$  and  $n_1, n_2, n_3, \dots$  is an ascending sequence of natural numbers then, since  $G$  is upper semi-continuous, some subsequence of  $X_{n_1}, X_{n_2}, X_{n_3}, \dots$  converges to  $g$ . It follows that the sequence  $X_1, X_2, X_3, \dots$  converges to  $g$ . Let  $H$  denote the set of all continua of  $G$  that contain  $g$ . Since every sequence of continua of the set  $H$  converges to a point,  $H$  is countable.

THEOREM 2. If  $g$  is a non-degenerate element of  $G$  there do not exist uncountably many elements of  $G$  which are points of  $g$ .

## 44 Fundamental Point Set Theorems

*Proof.* Suppose there is an uncountable set  $H$  of elements of  $G$  such that every element of  $H$  is a point of  $g$ . For each point  $h$  of the set  $H$ , let  $g_h$  denote a definite non-degenerate continua of the set  $G$  which contains  $h$  but which is distinct from  $g$ . Let  $\mathcal{W}$  denote the collection of all the continua  $g_h$  for all points  $h$  of  $H$ . Since  $\mathcal{W}$  is an uncountable collection of non-degenerate point sets there exist a point  $k$  belonging to  $H$ , a sequence  $h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots$  of distinct points of  $H$  and a sequence of points  $P_1, P_2, P_3, \dots$  such that (1)  $g_k$  is distinct from  $g$ , (2) for each  $n$ ,  $P_n$  belongs to  $g_{h_n}$  and (3) the sequence  $P_1, P_2, P_3, \dots$  converges to a point  $P$  belonging to  $g_k$  but distinct from  $k$ . There exists an ascending sequence of natural numbers  $n_1, n_2, n_3, \dots$  such that  $h_{n_1}, h_{n_2}, h_{n_3}, \dots$  converges to some point  $X$ . Since the points  $h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots$  all belong to  $g$  so must  $X$ . Therefore, since  $G$  is upper semi-continuous, some subsequence of  $P_{n_1}, P_{n_2}, P_{n_3}, \dots$  converges to  $X$ . But this is impossible since  $X$  is distinct from  $P$ .

**DEFINITION.** If the element  $g$  of  $G$  is not a junction element of  $G$  then  $g$  is said to be the *sequential limit element* of the sequence  $g_1, g_2, g_3, \dots$  of elements of  $G$  provided it is true that if  $h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots$  is a convergent subsequence of the sequence of *point sets*  $g_1, g_2, g_3, \dots$  then (1) the sequence of point sets  $h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots$  converges to a subset  $L$  of the point set  $g$  and (2) if  $L$  contains a point of  $g$  which is a junction element of  $G$  then  $L$  is that point and, for every region  $R$  containing  $L$ , there exists a number  $m$  such that, for every  $n$  greater than  $m$ ,  $h_n$  is a subset of some component of  $R - L$  that contains some point of  $g$ .

If the element  $g$  of  $G$  is a junction element of  $G$  then  $g$  is said to be the *sequential limit element of the sequence*  $g_1, g_2, g_3, \dots$  of elements of  $G$  provided it is true that (1) the sequence of *point sets*  $g_1, g_2, g_3, \dots$  converges to the point  $g$

and (2) if  $x$  is a non-degenerate continuum belonging to  $G$  and containing the point  $g$  there exists a region  $R$  containing  $g$  such that no continuum of the sequence  $g_1, g_2, g_3, \dots$  contains a point which lies in a component of  $R-g$  that contains a point of  $x$ .

A sequence of elements of  $G$  is said to *converge* to the element  $g$  if  $g$  is the sequential limit element of that sequence.

DEFINITION. The element  $g$  is said to be a *limit element* of the set  $H$  of elements of  $G$  if  $g$  is the sequential limit element of some sequence of distinct elements of  $H$ .

The following theorem may be easily proved.

THEOREM 3. *If  $H$  and  $K$  are sets of elements of  $G$ , every limit element of  $H+K$  is a limit element either of  $H$  or of  $K$ .*

A subset of  $G$  is said to be *closed* if it contains all of its limit elements.

The set  $D$  of elements of  $G$  is said to be a domain of elements of  $G$  if no element of  $D$  is a limit element of a set of elements of  $G$  no one of which belongs to  $D$ . In other words,  $D$  is a domain if no element of  $D$  is a limit element of  $G-D$  that is to say if  $G-D$  is closed.

THEOREM 4. *If  $H$  and  $K$  are subcollections of  $G$  and each element of  $K$  is a limit element of  $H$  then every limit element of  $K$  is a limit element of  $H$ .*

*Proof.* Suppose  $g$  is an element of  $G$  which is a limit element of  $K$ . There exists a sequence  $k_1, k_2, k_3, \dots$  of continua of  $K$  converging to a subset  $L$  of  $g$  such that either  $k_1, k_2, k_3, \dots$  are all junction elements of  $G$  or none of them is and such that (1) if  $g$  is not a junction element of  $G$  and  $L$  contains a point of  $g$  which is a junction element of  $G$  then  $L$  is that point and, for every region  $R$  containing  $L$ , there exists a number  $m$  such that, for every  $n$  greater than  $m$ ,  $k_n$  is a subset of some component of  $R-L$  that contains some point of  $g$  and (2) if  $g$  is a junction element of  $G$  then

## 46 Fundamental Point Set Theorems

if  $x$  is a non-degenerate element of  $G$  containing  $g$  there exists a region  $W_x$  containing  $g$  such that no continuum of the sequence  $k_1, k_2, k_3, \dots$  contains a point which lies in a component of  $W_x - g$  that contains a point of  $x$ .

For each  $n$ , there exists a sequence  $h_{n1}, h_{n2}, h_{n3}, \dots$  of continua of  $H$  converging to a subset  $L_n$  of  $k_n$  such that (1) if  $k_n$  is not a junction element of  $G$  and  $L_n$  contains a point of  $g$  which is a junction element of  $G$  then it is that point and for every region  $R$  containing  $L_n$  there exists a number  $m_{nR}$  such that, for every  $i$  greater than  $m_{nR}$ ,  $h_{ni}$  is a subset of some component of  $R - L_n$  that contains some point of  $k_n$  and (2) if  $k_n$  is a junction element of  $G$  and  $x$  is a non-degenerate element of  $G$  containing  $k_n$  there exists a region  $W_{x_n}$  containing  $k_n$  such that no continuum of the sequence  $h_{n1}, h_{n2}, h_{n3}, \dots$  contains a point which lies in a component of  $W_{x_n} - k_n$  that contains a point of  $x$ .

Case 1. Suppose that neither  $g$  nor  $L$  is a junction element of  $G$ . Then there exists an ascending sequence of numbers  $j_1, j_2, j_3, \dots$  such that the sequence of continua  $h_{1j_1}, h_{2j_2}, h_{3j_3}, \dots$  has, as its sequential limiting set, a subset of  $L$ . The element  $g$  of  $G$  is the sequential limit element of the sequence  $h_{1j_1}, h_{2j_2}, h_{3j_3}, \dots$  of elements of  $G$ .

Case 2. Suppose that  $L$  is, but  $g$  is not, a junction element of  $G$ . There exists a sequence of connected domains  $D_1, D_2, D_3, \dots$  closing down on  $L$ . There exists an ascending sequence of natural numbers  $j_1, j_2, j_3, \dots$  such that, for each  $n$ ,  $k_{j_n}$  lies in some connected subset  $T_n$  of  $D_n - L$  that contains a point of  $g$ . For each  $n$  there exists a connected domain  $I_n$  containing  $k_{j_n}$  and lying wholly in  $D_n - L$  and there exists a natural number  $i_n$  such that  $h_{j_n i_n}$  is a subset of  $I_n$ . The sequence of continua  $h_{j_1 i_1}, h_{j_2 i_2}, \dots$  converges to the point  $L$ . Suppose  $R$  is a region containing  $L$ . There

exists a number  $\delta$  such that, for every  $n$  greater than  $\delta$ ,  $D_n$  is a subset of  $R$ . If  $n > \delta$ ,  $I_n + T_n$  is a connected subset of  $R - L$  containing  $h_{j_n i_n}$  and some point of  $g$ . Therefore the element  $g$  of  $G$  is the sequential limit element of the sequence of elements  $h_{j_1 i_1}, h_{j_2 i_2}, h_{j_3 i_3}, \dots$ .

Case 3. Suppose that  $g$  is a junction element of  $G$  and that there exists a number  $q$  such that if  $n > q$ ,  $k_n$  does not contain  $g$ . Let  $x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots$  denote the non-degenerate elements of  $G$  that contain  $g$ . There exist an infinite sequence  $j_1, j_2, j_3, \dots$  of natural numbers all greater than  $q$  and a sequence  $D_1, D_2, D_3, \dots$  of domains closing down on the point  $g$  such that (1) for each  $n$ ,  $k_{j_n}$  is a subset of  $D_n$  and of  $S - \bar{D}_{n+1}$ , (2) no matter what natural number  $n$  may be, no continuum of the sequence  $k_{j_1}, k_{j_2}, k_{j_3}, \dots$  lies in a component of  $D_n - g$  that contains a point of  $x_n$ . For each  $n$  there exists a connected domain  $I_n$  containing  $k_{j_n}$  and lying wholly in  $D_n \cdot (S - \bar{D}_{n+1})$  and there exists a number  $i_n$  such that  $h_{j_n i_n}$  is a subset of  $I_n$ . No continuum of the sequence  $h_{j_1 i_1}, h_{j_2 i_2}, \dots$  contains a point of a component of  $D_n - g$  that contains a point of  $x_n$ . For if  $h_{j_m i_m}$  contained a point of a connected subset  $T_m$  of  $D_n - g$  containing a point of  $x_n$  then  $m$  would necessarily be equal to or greater than  $n$  and  $I_m + T_m$  would be a connected subset of  $D_n - g$  containing  $k_{j_m}$  and a point of  $x_n$ . It follows that the element  $g$  of  $G$  is the sequential limit element of the sequence  $h_{j_1 i_1}, h_{j_2 i_2}, \dots$ . Hence  $g$  is a limit element of  $H$ .

Case 4. Suppose that  $g$  is a junction element of  $G$  and that there exists an infinite sequence of natural numbers  $j_1, j_2, j_3, \dots$  such that, for each  $n$ ,  $k_{j_n}$  is a non-degenerate continuum containing  $g$ . There exist an infinite subsequence  $i_1, i_2, i_3, \dots$  of the sequence  $j_1, j_2, j_3, \dots$  and a sequence of domains  $D_1, D_2, D_3, \dots$  closing down on  $g$  such that, for

## 48 Fundamental Point Set Theorems

each  $n$ ,  $k_{i_{n+1}}$  is a subset of  $D_n$  and there is no component of  $D_n - g$  containing both a point of  $k_{i_n}$  and a point of some other continuum of  $G$  that contains the point  $g$ .

Suppose first that  $L_{i_n}$  is identical with  $g$ . Then there exists a number  $t_n$  such that  $h_{i_n t_n}$  lies in some component of  $D_n - g$  that contains a point of  $k_{i_n}$ .

Suppose secondly that  $L_{i_n}$  is not identical with  $g$ . Let  $P_n$  denote some point of  $L_{i_n}$  distinct from  $g$ . If  $n > 1$  there exists a connected domain  $U_n$  lying in  $D_{n-1}$  and containing  $P_n$  but no point of any continuum of the sequence  $x_1, x_2, x_3, \dots$  except  $k_{i_n}$ . There exists a number  $t_n$  such that  $h_{i_n t_n}$  lies in  $D_{n-1}$  and intersects  $U_n$ .

Therefore, whether or not  $L_{i_n}$  is identical with  $g$ , the continuum  $h_{i_n t_n}$  lies in a component of  $D_{n-1} - g$  that contains a point of  $k_{i_n}$ . It follows that if  $m$  is any natural number there exists a number  $\delta_m$  such that if  $n > \delta_m$  then  $h_{i_n t_n}$  is not a subset of any component of  $D_{\delta_m} - g$  that contains a point of  $x_m$ . Hence  $g$  is the sequential limit element of the sequence  $h_{i_1 t_1}, h_{i_2 t_2}, \dots$ .

The following theorem may be easily established.

**THEOREM 5.** *If the sequence  $H_1, H_2, H_3, \dots$  of elements of  $G$  converges to the element  $L$  of  $G$  and, for each  $n$ ,  $K_n$  is an element of  $G$  such that either  $H_n$  is a point of the continuum  $K_n$  or  $K_n$  is a point of the continuum  $H_n$  then the sequence  $K_1, K_2, K_3, \dots$  converges to  $L$ .*

**THEOREM 6.** *In order that the element  $g$  of  $G$  should be a limit element of the subcollection  $H$  of  $G$  it is necessary and sufficient that every domain of elements of  $G$  that contains  $g$  should contain an element of  $H$  distinct from  $g$ .*

*Proof.* This condition is clearly necessary. It will be shown that it is sufficient. Suppose  $g$  is not a limit element of  $H$ . Let  $K$  denote the set consisting of all limit elements of  $H$  together with all elements of  $H$  distinct from  $g$ . Let  $R$

denote the set  $G-R$ . No element of  $R$  is a limit element of  $G-R$ . For if an element  $x$  of  $R$  were a limit element of  $G-R$ , that is to say of  $K$  then, by Theorems 3 and 4,  $x$  would be a limit element of  $H$ . Therefore  $R$  is a domain of elements of  $G$ . But  $R$  contains  $g$  but no element of  $H$  distinct from  $g$ .

The subcollections  $H$  and  $K$  of  $G$  are said to be *mutually separated* if no continuum of either of them is a subset of a continuum of the other one and neither of them contains a limit element of the other one.

A subcollection of  $G$  is said to be *connected* if it is not the sum of two mutually separated collections.

EXAMPLES. Suppose that the straight line intervals  $AB$  and  $BC$  have only the point  $B$  in common and that  $AB$  and  $BC$  are both continua of the collection  $G$ . Then the point  $B$  is also an element of  $G$ . The *point sets*  $AB$  and  $BC$  are connected and have a point  $B$  in common and therefore the *point set*  $AB+BC$  is connected. But neither of the point sets  $AB$  and  $BC$  is a *subset* of the other one and neither of the elements  $AB$  and  $BC$  of  $G'$  is a limit element of the other one. Therefore the set of *elements* of  $G$  consisting of  $AB$  and  $BC$  is *not* connected. The *point set*  $AB+BC$  is identical with the point set  $AB+B+BC$ . But the set whose *elements* are  $AB$  and  $BC$  is quite different from the set whose elements are the three continua  $AB$ ,  $B$  and  $BC$ . Indeed the latter set is a connected set of elements of  $G$ . For if it is the sum of two sets, one of them (call it  $H$ ) contains  $B$ . The other one,  $K$ , contains at least one of the continua  $AB$  and  $BC$ . But  $B$  is a subset of each of these continua. Hence  $H$  and  $K$  are not mutually separated.

If, in this example,  $AB$ ,  $B$  and  $BC$  are the only elements

<sup>1</sup>No element of  $G$  is a limit element of a single element of  $G$  or of any finite set of elements of  $G$ .



## 50 Fundamental Point Set Theorems

of  $G$  then the point  $B$  is a domain of elements of  $G$  and so is  $AB$ , as well as  $BC$ . For no one of these elements is a limit element of any set of elements of  $G$ . But in the space  $S$  whose elements are the *points* of the continuum  $AB+B+BC$ , the point  $B$  is not a domain nor is  $AB$ ,  $BC$  or any other continuum except the whole of  $S$ .

In the theory of upper semi-continuous collections of type 1, in order that the element  $g$  of  $G$  should be a limit element of the subcollection  $H$  of  $G$  it is necessary and sufficient that the point set  $g$  should contain a limit point of the point set  $H^*-g$ . This condition is neither necessary nor sufficient here. To see that it is not sufficient consider again the collection whose elements are  $AB$ ,  $B$  and  $BC$ . Here the point  $B$  is a limit point of the point set  $BC-B$  but the element  $B$  is not a limit element of the element  $BC$ . To see that it is not necessary consider the following example.

In a Cartesian plane let  $O$  denote the origin of coordinates and let  $A$  denote the point  $(1, 0)$ . There exists a sequence  $P_1, P_2, P_3, \dots$  whose terms are the points between  $O$  and  $A$  whose abscissas are rational numbers. For each  $n$ , let  $A_n$  denote a point with the same abscissa as  $P_n$  but with an ordinate equal to  $1/n$ , let  $B_n$  denote a point whose abscissa is that of  $P_1$  but whose ordinate is  $-1/n$  and let  $P_nA_n$  and  $P_1B_n$  denote straight line intervals with endpoints as indicated. Let  $S'$  denote the dendron obtained by adding together the straight line interval  $OA$ , all the intervals  $P_1A_1, P_2A_2, P_3A_3, \dots$  and all the intervals  $P_1B_1, P_1B_2, P_1B_3, \dots$ . Let  $G'$  denote the collection whose elements are  $OA$ , the intervals of the sequences  $P_1A_1, P_2A_2, P_3A_3, \dots$  and  $P_1B_1, P_1B_2, P_1B_3, \dots$  and the points of the sequence  $P_1, P_2, P_3, \dots$ . The collection  $G'$  is an upper semi-continuous collection of type 2 filling up the space  $S'$ . Let  $g$

denote the interval  $OA$  and let  $H$  denote the set whose elements are the points of the sequence  $P_1, P_2, P_3, \dots$ . The element  $g$  is a limit element of the set  $H$  of elements of  $G'$ . But it is not true that some point of  $g$  is a limit point of the point set  $H^* - g$ . Indeed there is no such point set since  $H^*$  is a subset of  $g$ .

In the theory of upper semi-continuous collections of type 1, if  $H$  is a subcollection of  $G$  then in order that  $H$  should be closed it is necessary and sufficient that  $H^*$  should be closed. Here this condition fails as to sufficiency but not as to necessity. In the space  $S'$  of the last example, there exists an infinite ascending sequence of distinct natural numbers  $n_1, n_2, n_3, \dots$  such that the sequence of points  $P_{n_1}, P_{n_2}, P_{n_3}, \dots$  converges to the point  $P_1$ . Let  $H$  denote the set whose elements are  $P_1A_1$  and the intervals of the sequence  $P_{n_1}A_{n_1}, P_{n_2}A_{n_2}, P_{n_3}A_{n_3}, \dots$ . The point set  $H^*$  is closed but the set  $H$  of elements of  $G$  is not closed since  $OA$  is a limit element of  $H$  which does not belong to it. Hence the condition in question is not sufficient.

Again, let  $H$  denote the subcollection of  $G'$  whose elements are the intervals of the sequence  $P_1B_1, P_1B_2, P_1B_3, \dots$ . The point set  $H^*$  is closed but the point  $P_1$  is a limit element of  $H$  which does not belong to it.

The following theorem holds true.

**THEOREM 7.** *If  $T$  is a closed point set and  $H$  is the set of all elements of  $G$  that contain one or more points of  $T$  then  $H^*$  is closed.*

If the upper semi-continuous collection  $G$  is of type 1 and  $H$  is a subcollection of  $G$  then in order that  $H$  should be connected it is necessary and sufficient that  $H^*$  should be. But if, in the last example,  $H$  denotes the collection whose elements are the intervals  $OA$  and  $P_1A_1$ ,  $H^*$  is connected but  $H$  is not. So this condition is not sufficient here.

## 52 Fundamental Point Set Theorems

It is however easily seen to be necessary. Furthermore the following theorem holds true.

**THEOREM 8.** *If  $T$  is a connected point set and  $H$  is the set of all continua of the collection  $G$  that contain one or more points of  $T$  then  $H$  is a connected set of elements of  $G$ .*

*Proof.* Suppose, on the contrary, that  $H$  is the sum of two mutually separated sets  $H_1$  and  $H_2$ . Suppose the point sets  $T \cdot H_1^*$  and  $T \cdot H_2^*$  have a point  $P$  in common. The point  $P$  belongs to a continuum  $h_1$  of  $H_1$  and a continuum  $h_2$  of  $H_2$ . Since  $H_1$  and  $H_2$  are mutually separated,  $h_1$  and  $h_2$  are distinct and non-degenerate. Hence  $P$  is an element of  $G$ . It belongs to one of the sets  $H_1$  and  $H_2$  and it is a subset both of the continuum  $h_1$  of  $H_1$  and of the continuum  $h_2$  of  $H_2$ . This involves a contradiction. It follows that  $T \cdot H_1^*$  and  $T \cdot H_2^*$  are mutually exclusive. Therefore a continuum of the set  $H$  belongs to  $H_i$  ( $i=1, 2$ ) if, and only if, it has a point in common with  $T \cdot H_i^*$ .

Suppose now that one of the sets  $T \cdot H_1^*$  and  $T \cdot H_2^*$  contains a point  $X$  which is a limit point of the other one. Suppose  $T \cdot H_1^*$  does. If  $X$  does not belong to  $G$  it is a point of a continuum  $g_X$  of  $G$  and  $g_X$  is a limit element of  $H_2$ , contrary to the supposition that  $H_1$  and  $H_2$  are mutually separated. If  $X$  does belong to  $G$  then it belongs to  $H_1$  and if  $C_g$  denotes the set of all non-degenerate continua of  $G$  that contain  $X$  then  $C_g$  is a subset of  $H_1$ . Either  $X$  or some element of the set  $C_g$  is a limit element of the set  $H_2$ . Thus the supposition that Theorem 8 is false leads to a contradiction.

If the collection  $G$  is of type 1 and  $D$  is a domain containing the element  $g$  of  $G$  there exists a domain  $\mathcal{W}$  containing  $g$  and such that every point set of the collection  $G$  that contains a point of  $\mathcal{W}$  is a subset of  $D$ . But if  $D$  denotes the set of all points of the dendron  $S'$  whose ordinates are nu-

merically less than  $1/10$ ,  $D$  is a domain containing the continuum  $OA$  and no matter what point set  $W$  may be containing  $OA$ , regardless of whether it is a domain, the continua  $P_1A_1, P_2A_2, P_3A_3, \dots, P_{10}A_{10}$  and  $P_1B_1, P_1B_2, P_1B_3, \dots, P_1B_{10}$  all belong to  $G$  and contain points of  $W$  but no one of them is a subset of  $D$ . However, the following proposition holds true.

**THEOREM 9.** *If  $D$  is a domain containing the element  $g$  of the collection  $G$  there exists a domain  $W$  containing  $g$  such that if there are any continua of the collection  $G$  which contain points of  $W$  but which are not subsets of  $D$  then there are only a finite number of such continua and each of them contains a point of  $g$  which is a junction element of  $G$ .*

*Proof.* There exists a sequence of domains  $D_1, D_2, D_3, \dots$  closing down on the point set  $g$ . Suppose that, for each  $n$ ,  $D_n$  contains a point  $P_n$  of  $S-g$  belonging to some continuum  $g_n$  of  $G$  which is not a subset of  $D$ . There exists a sequence of distinct natural numbers  $n_1, n_2, n_3, \dots$  such that the sequence of points  $P_{n_1}, P_{n_2}, P_{n_3}, \dots$  converges to some point  $P$ . For each  $i$ ,  $g_{n_i}$  contains a point  $X_{n_i}$  of  $S-D$ . The point  $P$  necessarily belongs to  $g$ . Since  $G$  is upper semi-continuous it follows that there exists a subsequence  $m_1, m_2, m_3, \dots$  of the sequence  $n_1, n_2, n_3, \dots$  such that  $X_{m_1}, X_{m_2}, X_{m_3}, \dots$  converges to a point of  $g$ . But this is impossible since  $g$  is a subset of the domain  $D$  and no point of this sequence belongs to  $D$ . Hence there exists a number  $m$  such that every continuum of  $G$  which contains a point of  $D_m-g$  is a subset of  $D$ .

Suppose now there exist infinitely many distinct continua  $h_1, h_2, h_3, \dots$  of the set  $G$  such that, for each  $n$ ,  $h_n$  contains both a point  $B_n$  of  $g$  and a point  $C_n$  not belonging to  $D$ . There exists an infinite sequence of distinct natural numbers  $n_1, n_2, n_3, \dots$  such that the sequence  $B_{n_1}, B_{n_2}, B_{n_3}, \dots$

## 54 Fundamental Point Set Theorems

converges to some point  $B$ . The point  $B$  necessarily belongs to  $g$ . Hence there exists an infinite subsequence  $m_1, m_2, m_3, \dots$  of the sequence  $n_1, n_2, n_3, \dots$  such that  $C_{n_1}, C_{n_2}, C_{n_3}, \dots$  converges to some point of  $g$ . But this is impossible.

**THEOREM 10.** *If  $D$  is a domain containing at least one continuum of the collection  $G$  then the collection of all continua of  $G$  that lie wholly in  $D$  is a domain of elements of  $G$ .*

*Proof.* Suppose  $g$  is an element of  $R$ , the set of all continua of  $G$  that lie in  $D$ . By Theorem 9 there exists a domain  $W$  containing  $g$  such that (1)  $D$  contains every point set of the collection  $G$  that contains a point of  $W$  but no point of  $g$ , (2) of the point sets of the collection  $G$  that intersect  $g$  all but a finite number are subsets of  $D$ . Suppose  $g$  is a limit element of a subcollection  $H$  of  $G$ . Then there are infinitely many elements of  $H$  each containing a point of  $W$ . Hence there are infinitely many of them lying wholly in  $D$  and therefore belonging to  $R$ . Hence  $R$  is a domain of elements of  $G$ .

**DEFINITION.** The sequence  $D_1, D_2, D_3, \dots$  of domains of elements of  $G$  is said to *close down* on the set  $K$  of elements of  $G$  if (1)  $K$  is the set of all elements of  $G$  which belong to every domain of this sequence, (2) for each  $n$ ,  $\overline{D_{n+1}}$  is a subset of  $D_n$  and (3) for every domain  $R$  of elements of  $G$  such that  $K$  is a subcollection of  $R$  there exists a number  $n$  such that  $D_n$  is a subcollection of  $R$ .

**THEOREM 11.** *If  $g$  is an element of  $G$  which neither is a junction element of  $G$  nor contains one and  $H_1, H_2, H_3, \dots$  is a sequence of domains (of points) closing down on the point set  $g$  and  $D_1, D_2, D_3, \dots$  is a sequence of domains of elements of  $G$  such that, for each  $n$ ,  $D_n$  contains  $g$  and  $D_n^*$  is a subset of  $H_n$  then the sequence  $D_1, D_2, D_3, \dots$  closes down on the element  $g$ .*

**THEOREM 12.** *If  $D$  is a domain of elements of  $G$  and  $H$  is a domain of points and  $g$  is an element of  $G$  belonging to*

*D* and lying in *H* then there exists a connected domain *Q* of elements of *G* such that *g* belongs to *Q*,  $\bar{Q}$  is a subset of *D* and  $Q^*$  is a subset of *H*.

*Proof.* There are two cases to be considered.

Case 1. Suppose *g* is not a junction element of *G*. Let  $C_g$  denote the set of all junction elements of *G* which are not elements of *D* but which are points of *g*. The set  $C_g$  is finite. If *P* is a point of *g* not belonging to  $C_g$  there exists a domain  $W_P$  (of points) lying in *H* and containing *P* such that every element of *G* that contains a point of  $\bar{W}_P$  belongs to *D*. If *P* is a point of  $C_g$  there exists a domain  $T_P$  (of points) containing *P* and lying in *H* such that if  $x$  is any continuum of the collection *G* that contains a point lying in a component of  $T_P - P$  that contains a point of *g* then  $x$  belongs to *D*. There exists a domain  $N_P$  (of points) containing *P* such that  $\bar{N}_P$  is a subset of  $T_P$ . Let  $Q_P$  denote the set of all points *y* of  $N_P$  such that *y* belongs to a component of  $N_P - P$  that contains a point of *g*. The point set  $Q_P$  is a domain. With the help of the Borel-Lebesgue Theorem and the fact that  $P + g \cdot Q_P$  is identical with  $g \cdot N_P$  it may be seen that there exists a finite set *Z* of domains covering  $g - C_g$  such that if *z* is any domain of the collection *Z* there exists a point *P* of *g* such that *z* is identical with  $Q_P$  or with  $W_P$  according as *P* is or is not a point of the set  $C_g$ . Let *Q* denote the set of all elements  $x$  of *G* such that  $x$  and *g* belong to a connected set of elements of  $G - C_g$  all, except *g*, lying in  $Z^*$ . It may be shown that *Q* is a connected domain of elements of *G* and that  $\bar{Q}$  is a subset of *D*.

Case 2. Suppose *g* is a junction element of *G*. Let  $C_g$  denote the set of all non-degenerate elements of *G*, if there are any, which are not elements of *D* but which contain the point *g*. The set  $C_g$  is finite. There exists a domain  $W_1$  containing *g* such that no point of  $W_1$  lies both in a con-

## 56 Fundamental Point Set Theorems

nected subset of  $W_1 - g$  that contains a point of  $C_g^*$  and in a connected subset of  $W_1 - W_1 \cdot C_g^* + g$  that contains  $g$ . There exists a domain  $W_2$  lying in  $W_1$  and containing  $g$  such that if  $x$  is any element of the set  $G$  which contains a point of the component of  $W_1 - W_1 \cdot C_g^* + g$  that contains  $g$  then  $x$  belongs to  $D$ . There exists a domain  $W_3$  containing  $g$  and lying in  $H$  such that  $\overline{W_3}$  is a subset of  $W_2$ . Let  $Q$  denote the set of all elements  $x$  of  $G$  such that  $x$  and  $g$  belong to a connected set of elements of  $G$  all lying in  $W_3$  and containing no point of  $C_g^*$  other than the point  $g$ . It may be seen that  $Q$  is a connected domain of elements of  $G$  and that  $\overline{Q}$  is a subset of  $D$ .

**THEOREM 13.** *If the elements of  $G$  are called "points" and every domain of elements of  $G$  is called a "region" and the "point"  $x$  is said to be contiguous to the "point"  $y$  if and only if either  $x$  is an ordinary point of the continuum  $y$  or  $y$  is an ordinary point of the continuum  $x$ , the axioms of  $\Sigma_c'$  all hold true for this interpretation of point, region and contiguity.*

With the help of the preceding theorems it is easy to see that all of the axioms of  $\Sigma_c'$  except Axiom 1 hold true for this interpretation. It will be shown that Axiom 1 also holds.

*Proof.* Let  $T$  denote the set of all continua  $g$  such that  $g$  is either a junction element of  $G$  or a non-degenerate continuum of  $G$  that contains one. It may be shown that the set  $T$  is countable. Hence there exists a sequence  $g_1, g_2, g_3, \dots$  whose terms are the continua of  $T$ . By Theorem 81 of Chapter I of P. S. T., there exists a sequence  $Z_1, Z_2, Z_3, \dots$  such that (1) for each  $n$ ,  $Z_n$  is a subcollection of  $G_n$  covering  $S$  and  $Z_{n+1}$  is a subcollection of  $Z_n$ , (2) if  $H$  and  $K$  are two mutually exclusive closed point sets there exists a number  $m$  such that if  $x$  and  $y$  are intersecting regions of  $Z_m$  and  $x$  intersects  $H$  then  $y$  contains no point of  $K$ . For each natural number  $n$ , let  $Q_n$  denote the set of all domains  $D$  of elements of  $G$  such that

(1) for some finite subcollection  $H$  of  $Z_n$  that properly covers some continuum of the set  $G$ ,  $D^*$  is a subset of  $H^*$ , (2)  $D$  contains no element of the sequence  $g_1, g_2, g_3, \dots$  of subscript less than  $n$ .

With the help of Theorem 12 it may be shown that there exists a sequence  $\beta_1, \beta_2, \beta_3, \dots$  such that (1) for each  $m$ ,  $\beta_m$  is a sequence  $D_{m1}, D_{m2}, D_{m3}, \dots$  of domains of elements of  $G$  that closes down on  $g_m$ , (2) the domain  $D_{mn}$  contains no element of the sequence  $g_1, g_2, g_3, \dots$  distinct from  $g_m$  and of subscript less than  $n$ , (3) there exists a finite subcollection  $H_{mn}$  of  $Z_n$  properly covering  $g_m$  and such that  $D^*_{mn}$  is a subset of  $H^*_{mn}$ .

For each  $n$ , let  $G'_n$  denote the set whose elements are the domains of the set  $Q_n$  and those of the sequence  $D_{1n}, D_{2n}, D_{3n}, \dots$ . It is clear that the sequence  $G'_1, G'_2, G'_3, \dots$  satisfies, with respect to "point" and "region," all the conditions required of  $G_1, G_2, G_3, \dots$  under (1) and (2) in the statement of Axiom 1. It will be shown that it also satisfies those required under (3). Suppose  $R$  is any domain whatsoever with respect to  $G$ ,  $x$  is an element of  $R$  and  $y$  is an element of  $R$  either identical with  $x$  or not. There exists a connected domain  $D$  with respect to  $G$  containing  $x$  and such that  $\bar{D}$  is a subset of  $R - y + x$ . If  $H$  is any domain of ordinary points containing the point set  $x$  there exists a number  $\delta$  such that if  $n > \delta$  then the point set  $H$  contains the point set obtained by adding together all the regions (in the original sense) of the set  $G_n$  that contain points of  $x$ . It follows, with the help of Theorem 11, that if  $D$  is any domain of elements of the set  $G$  containing the element  $x$  then there exists a number  $\delta'_n$  such that if  $n > \delta'_n$  and  $Q$  is a domain of the set  $G'_n$  that contains  $x$  then  $\bar{Q}$  is a subset of  $D$ .

Thus all of the conditions of Axiom 1, except (4), are satisfied here. But space is compact. Hence (4), also, is fulfilled.