RICE UNIVERSITY

Deep Song: The Historical and Musical Contexts of Osvaldo Golijov's Ayre

by

Craig Alan Hauschildt

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE Doctor of Musical Arts

APPROVED, THESIS COMMITTEE:

Dr. Walter Bailey, Director
Associate Professor of Musicology

Richard Brown,
Professor of Percussion and Chair of Harp and Percussion

Dr. Deborah Hafer,
Associate Professor of French Studies

Dr. Richard Lavenda,
Professor of Composition and Theory and Director of Graduate Studies

HOUSTON, TEXAS
DECEMBER 2013
ABSTRACT

Deep Song: 
The Historical and Musical Contexts of Osvaldo Golijov’s Ayre 
by 
Craig Alan Hauschildt

Osvaldo Golijov (b. 1960) composed Ayre, a song cycle for soprano and large ensemble, in 2004. On the larger thematic level, it explores the history of the conflicts among Christians, Jews, and Muslims—as well as their similarities—to reflect more broadly on the contemporary relationship between Israel and Palestine.

To accomplish his goal, Golijov utilizes folk music and poetry from Andalusia, Morocco, Sardinia, and Lebanon as well as poetry by Mahmoud Darwish, a Palestinian poet. Golijov also interweaves the unique talents of specific musicians into the score, which thus becomes a vehicle to showcase the virtuosity of soprano Dawn Upshaw, who premiered and recorded the work, and Golijov's hand-selected ensemble of instrumentalists, known as the Andalucian Dogs.

Like Luciano Berio's Folk Songs (1964), which served as Golijov's model, Ayre is constructed using significant amounts of preexisting material. In addition, it incorporates substantial contributions from its original performers. This study examines Golijov’s own contributions and those provided by others to identify more clearly Golijov’s role as composer. It also places Golijov's work in the broad historical context of twentieth-century music, taking into account the unique
relationship between the composer and performer in the world of jazz and the many classical composers who have incorporated elements of folk and popular music into their art music. Additionally, it examines the music of select classical and popular composers—Béla Bartók, Igor Stravinsky, Aaron Copland, Duke Ellington, George Gershwin, and Gil Evans—to understand the censure that has often accompanied the appropriation of music from outside one’s normative style.

The study concludes that Golijov, like many other postmodern composers, is not composing in reaction to the complexity and intellectualism of mid-century modernism, but rather he is composing in the manner of composers from the past who reverentially appropriated materials from a wide variety of musical traditions. Thus, even though Golijov relies on a significant amount of pre-existing material to construct Ayre, the work is ultimately a result of his own creative energy.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This study would not have been possible without the support of generous friends, family members, and colleagues. I wish to express my most sincere appreciation:

For my parents, Leo and Leorita Hauschildt, who have believed in me and supported my studies, whether I was playing xylophone rags or plucking amplified cacti.

For Dr. Walter Bailey whose guidance, support, and timely sense of humor were indispensable during the preparation of this document.

For Richard Brown, Dane Richeson, Michael Spiro, and Bridget-Michaele Reischl—my mentors who have held me to high standards and shared their friendship over the years.

For Dr. Richard Lavenda for his guidance during my graduate studies.

For Dr. Gregory Barnett, Brandon Bell, Mary Brower, Brian Connelly, Deborah Dunham, Paul Ellison, Julia Fox, Dr. Marianna Gariazzo, Dr. Matthias Henze, Luke Hubley, Dr. Nicolai Jacobsen, Dr. Annie Krieg, Dr. Michael O’Brien, Francesca Romo, Dr. Melissa Warak, and many others—who have answered questions and engaged in the stimulating conversations that allowed me to develop the ideas contained in this document.

For all of my friends and colleagues who have helped to maintain my sanity or, at the very least, tolerated my moments of psychosis during the last several months—including, but certainly not limited to Amanda Flosbach, Andrew and Jaime Mireles, and the entire Da Camera staff.

For all of the Shepherd School of Music and Fondren Library staff—especially Suzanne Taylor who has kept me on track over the course of many years.

And for Osvaldo Golijov, whose passion is inspiring and contagious.

I conclude by echoing an acknowledgment that Mineo Kimura, my father-in-law, made in his dissertation thirty-two years ago to Kana, his daughter and my wife, “for substantial moral support and sharing life with me.” I’d like to extend that sentiment to both Kana and Leio, our one-year-old son—my constant source of joy.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract ii
Acknowledgments iv
List of Examples vi
List of Tables x
Preface xi
Introduction 1

Part the First: A Twentieth-Century Historical Narrative

Chapter One - (C)overt Passions 11

Chapter Two - Crossroads 41

Chapter Three - The Library Card 74

Chapter Four - Many Modes of Modernism 96

Part the Second: Osvaldo Golijov's Ayre

Chapter Five - Different Soups 118

Chapter Six - A Journey from Andalusia to Jerusalem 132

Conclusion 180

Bibliography 190
# LIST OF EXAMPLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Rimsky-Korsakov's <em>100 Chants Nationaux Russes</em>, Op. 24, No. 6, mm. 1-4</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Rimsky-Korsakov's <em>100 Chants Nationaux Russes</em>, Op. 24, No. 23, m. 1</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Béla Bartók’s <em>Falun, Sz. 79</em>, I. Vivacissimo $\downarrow=196$, beginning to rehearsal 2 (woodwinds only)</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Dance for Violin (an example of the so-called Bulgarian rhythm)</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Belt Dance, m. 1 to 6 – Béla Bartók’s Original Transcription</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Belt Dance, m. 1 to 6 – Béla Bartók’s Later Transcription (Note more nuanced rhythm and ornamentation)</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Derek Bermel’s <em>Tied Shifts</em>, I. Driving, relentless $\downarrow=184$ ($\downarrow=\downarrow$ sempre), Rehearsal A to B</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Henry Cowell’s <em>Dynamic Motion</em>, mm. 1 to 18</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.1 Aaron Copland’s <em>Scherzo humoristique</em>, mm. 5 to 8</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.2 George Gershwin’s <em>Rhapsody in Blue</em>, Rehearsal G to 4 after rehearsal G</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.1 Aaron Copland’s <em>Music for the Theatre</em>, mm. 1 to 1 before rehearsal 2 (brass and percussion only)</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.2 Aaron Copland’s <em>Music for the Theatre</em>, rehearsal 5 to rehearsal 7 (woodwinds, brass, percussion, and piano only)</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.1 Aaron Copland’s <em>Third Symphony</em>, IV. Molto deliberato (freely at first), mm. 1 to 6 (woodwinds only)</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.2 Aaron Copland’s <em>Third Symphony</em>, IV. Molto deliberato (freely at first), Rehearsal 85 to rehearsal 86 (brass and percussion only)</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Work/Composition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>Aaron Copland’s <em>Third Symphony</em>, IV. Molto deliberato (freely at first), Rehearsal 127 to four after rehearsal 127 (percussion only)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>Aaron Copland’s <em>John Henry</em>, Rehearsal 127 to four after rehearsal 127 (strings and percussion only)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.1</td>
<td>Aaron Copland’s <em>Third Symphony</em>, II. Allegro molto ($\updownarrow$=108), Rehearsal 37 to rehearsal 38 (oboe only)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>Version Comparison of the Theme from Aaron Copland’s <em>Third Symphony</em>, II. Allegro molto ($\updownarrow$=108), Rehearsal 37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>George Gershwin’s <em>Porgy and Bess</em>, Introduction, mm. 1 to 7 (piano reduction)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Aaron Copland’s <em>Short Symphony (No. 2)</em>, I. Tempo $\downarrow$=144 (incisivo), Rehearsal 4 to rehearsal 6 (metric reduction)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>George Crumb’s <em>Ancient Voices of Children</em>, IV. “Todas las tardes en Granada, todas las tardes se muere un niño,” line 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>Luciano Berio’s <em>Folk Songs</em>, I. “Black is the color,” beginning to rehearsal 1 (viola only) – Viola performed like a fiddle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.2</td>
<td>Luciano Berio’s <em>Folk Songs</em>, II. “I wonder as I wander,” beginning to m. 4 – Harp imitates a guitar (the harp part can also be performed by a guitar per Berio’s instructions)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>Luciano Berio’s <em>Folk Songs</em>, III. “Loosin yelav,” beginning to rehearsal 1 – Harp imitates an oud</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>Luciano Berio’s <em>Folk Songs</em>, VII. “Ballo,” Rehearsal 7 to rehearsal 8 (strings only) – viola and cello strummed like a guitar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>Osvaldo Golijov’s <em>Ayre</em>, I. “Mañanita de San Juan,” beginning to rehearsal A (soprano only)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.2</td>
<td>Osvaldo Golijov’s <em>Ayre</em>, I. “Mañanita de San Juan,” rehearsal A to rehearsal C (soprano only)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>Osvaldo Golijov’s <em>Ayre</em>, I. “Mañanita de San Juan,” rehearsal D to rehearsal E (soprano only)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.4</td>
<td>Osvaldo Golijov’s <em>Ayre</em>, I. “Mañanita de San Juan,” rehearsal F to rehearsal G (soprano only)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
17 Osvaldo Golijov's *Ayre*, I. “Mañana de San Juan,” rehearsal C to rehearsal D (clarinet and soprano only) 138
18 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, I. “Mañana de San Juan,” rehearsal F (clarinet and Horn only) 139
19 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, I. “Mañana de San Juan,” rehearsal G to end (guitar and cello only) 140
20 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, II. “Y Una Madre Comió Asado,” mm. 1 to 12 141
21.1 Luciano Berio’s *Folk Songs*, II. “I wonder as I wander,” mm. 5 to 6 (clarinet, strings, and soprano only) 143
21.2 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, II. “Y Una Madre Comió Asado,” mm. 51 to 57 (flute, clarinet, horn, and soprano only) 144
22 Transcription of the repeated melodic cell from “Tancas serradas a muru” on Coro del Supramonte di Orgosolo’s *Pascoli serrati da muri* 148
23 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, III. “Tancas Serradas a Muru,” mm. 21 to 36 (soprano only) 149
24 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, IV. “Luna,” mm. 1 to 16 153
25 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, IV. “Luna,” mm. 41 to end (ronroco only) 153
26 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, IV. “Luna,” mm. 49 to end (bass only) 154
27 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, V. “Nani,” mm. 1 to 14 (soprano and flute only) 155
28 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, VI. “Wa Habibi,” mm. 1 to 5 (winds, soprano, and electronica only) 159
29 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, VI. “Wa Habibi,” mm. 132 to end (electronica only) 160
30 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, VII. “Aiini Taqtiru,” mm. 1 to 12 163
31 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, IX. “Suéltate las Cintas,” mm. 1 to 12 168
32 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, X. “Yah Annah,” excerpt 171
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Composition/Source</th>
<th>Pages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Osvaldo Golijov’s <em>Ayre</em>, XI. “Ariadna en su Laberinto,” mm. 15 to 23 (soprano only)</td>
<td>174</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Osvaldo Golijov’s <em>Ayre</em>, XI. “Ariadna en su Laberinto,” mm. 26 to 29 (bass only)</td>
<td>175</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35.1</td>
<td>Metric emphasis of traditional flamenco soleares</td>
<td>176</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35.2</td>
<td>Gil Evans’ “Solea,” reductive rhythmic transcription with appropriate accents indicated</td>
<td>176</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Osvaldo Golijov’s <em>Ayre</em>, XI. “Ariadna en su Laberinto,” mm. 194 to end</td>
<td>179</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Positive and Negative Connotations of the Terms Folk, Popular, and Classical</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Works Composed between 1921 and 1926 by Béla Bartók</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Working Versions of Stravinsky’s <em>Les noces</em> between 1914 and 1923</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>George Gershwin’s <em>Porgy and Bess</em> (Introduction tempo)</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Source Material for Each Track on the Album <em>Sketches of Spain</em></td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Region of Origin by Movement in Luciano Berio’s <em>Folk Songs</em></td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>The Comparison of the Use of Various Languages in Luciano Berio’s <em>Folk Songs</em> and Osvaldo Golijov’s <em>Ayre</em></td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Instrumentation of Luciano Berio’s <em>Folk Songs</em> and Osvaldo Golijov’s <em>Ayre</em> (including a list of musicians who premiered <em>Ayre</em>)</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Division of Osvaldo Golijov’s <em>Ayre</em> into Four Sections</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Formal Structure of the Second Movement of Osvaldo Golijov’s <em>Ayre</em></td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Form and Source Material for Osvaldo Golijov’s <em>Ayre</em>, III. “Tancas Serradas a Muru”</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Formal Structure of Osvaldo Golijov’s <em>Ayre</em>, VI. “Wa Habibi”</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Historical narratives are more than a simple series of events and anecdotes; the details that narrators choose to highlight reveal how they perceive themselves in relationship to history and their role within society. Since it is inevitable that some facts will be featured at the expense of others, it is impossible to eliminate personal bias from the account. Therefore, we should embrace these biases in order to understand the purpose of any historical narrative.

The act of creating this document has forced me to examine my own narrative and to reflect on what it means. Going through school, I had often sensed that I was at a disadvantage because, as I told myself, I was not “breastfed on Brahms.” At the time that I entered college, my musical background was primarily focused on concert and marching band music. Although I knew the names of some of the most famous classical composers, my understanding of music history was limited. I felt that my perceived lack of exposure and experience left me at a disadvantage to those who were already familiar with much of the Western canon. At the time, I did not appreciate that each of my colleagues and I brought unique and valuable experiences to the music that we were studying and creating every day. Each new style of music that we studied or composition that we analyzed gradually led us towards a path of personal discovery that would aid us in our fledgling careers.

One of the pivotal moments of my student years came while I was exploring a style of music that was particularly foreign to me at the time, Afro-Cuban folkloric music. I originally believed that this style of music lay outside of my passion for classical
music. Although I initially chose to pursue it more as a means of challenging myself than out of a passion specifically for the music, my exposure to this tradition brought me to the realization that all styles of music are interrelated and capable of great aesthetic beauty. In the process, I discovered the nuance and intricacy of the sacred music of Santeria, a syncretic religion that developed as a fusion of Catholicism and Yoruba religious beliefs in Cuba during the nineteenth century.¹

**Personal Discovery of a Folkloric Tradition**

My first true folkloric experience occurred at the age of twenty-three. Although I had studied a number of musical traditions from Ghana, Brazil, and Cuba during my time as an undergraduate, it was not until I spent a summer in San Francisco studying the sacred music of Santeria with percussionist Michael Spiro that I came to understand what is for me the true essence of folkloric music. Although one could justifiably question the authenticity of studying a Cuban musical tradition from an American in San Francisco, the experience of making music within the Cuban community in the Bay Area, which includes both Cuban ex-patriots and Americans who are immersed in the culture, provided the kind of authentic communal experience that is representative of many authentic folk music traditions. This community welcomed me into their lives and in the process helped me to understand that folkloric music is equally as much about community and personal interaction as it is about the incredible music.

In my studies I focused on learning the okonkolo, the smallest of the three bata drums used during a Santeria religious ceremony, and on the first two sections of music from these ceremonies, the oro seco and the oro cantado (the music in these sections is more straightforward than the third and final section of music). Although this musical tradition continues to be transmitted orally, transcriptions of the music have been available since the mid-1990s, when foreign musicians began to study the music and apply Western notation to the oral tradition. Although it would be easy to argue that no one transcription accurately describes the music or can be considered the officially sanctioned version, transcriptions of the drumming and of the songs have flourished and are now available from a number of sources.²

Before I had studied bata drumming, I had a misconception that folk music consisted primarily of simple diatonic melodies in a relatively elementary harmonic context, regardless of national origin. I was not prepared to understand the complexity of the formal structures, the intricate rhythmic conversations, and the nuanced interplay of Afro-Cuban music.

Cuban colonists in the nineteenth century thought very little of the musical culture of the enslaved Africans. Many dismissed Afro-Cuban artistic expression as “soca de negros” (something blacks do), and “it was openly condemned as an influence that

would carry the Cuban people ‘back to a barbarous phase of [cultural] prehistory.’”

In 1873, Walter Goodman, an English painter and writer, described the music as unsophisticated and emphasized the performers’ use of simple instruments and gyrational dance moves. These sentiments illustrate a common misconception that persists today that African music and music of the African diaspora is primitive and unsophisticated.

As a part of the community of musicians in San Francisco, I discovered just the opposite: the complexities of the music are difficult to notate or even describe adequately using Western notion and theoretical concepts. I fondly remember playing for Regino Jimenez, a respected Cuban bata drummer. After completing the oro seco he commented on how although I played the right notes and followed the form, I played with an American accent. Later, Spiro explained that Jimenez’s comment meant that I was playing the rhythms using equally divided rhythmic subdivisions and that this music often demanded subtle rhythmic nuances that led to a slightly uneven metric subdivision that more closely mimicked the rhythm of the languages used in Santeria.

Western notation does not easily allow for subtly unequal subdivisions. When Western musical traditions utilize particular rhythmic lilts, like the Viennese waltz or American jazz, the rhythms are noted more simply and the performers are

---


5 For a more detail explanation and analysis of the subtle shifts in the rhythmic feeling of Afro-Cuban folkloric music, see Rumba Clave, “Rumba Clave: An Illustrated Analysis,” Blogger (blog) (January 21, 2008), http://rumbaclave.blogspot.com/.
expected to interpret them with the correct feel. By learning to feel the rhythmic nuance of bata and appreciating the complexity of its hocketed rhythmic counterpoint, I discovered a rich and engaging musical tradition, which many Europeans, who viewed the African-derived music as being culturally inferior to their own musical traditions, had previously shunned.

From Spiro to Golijov

Out of my pursuit of Afro-Cuban music, I developed a newfound appreciation for the interconnectedness of music that has led me to seek out composers like Osvaldo Golijov, who actively incorporates culturally identifiable music from a number of traditions into his compositions. For example, he incorporates Eastern European klezmer idioms into *Dreams and Prayers of Isaac the Blind*, elements of Argentine tango into *Last Round*, Afro-Cuban bata drumming and popular music into *La Pasión según San Marcos*, and Romanian gypsy music into *The Man Who Cried.*

Although the cultural plurality of Golijov’s music is one of the dominant traits of his style, I do not believe—as some people have asserted—that he appropriates the various musical traditions merely to put them on display. Instead, he respectfully incorporates them into a musical fabric that adds extra-musical context to the work—as exhibited in works like *Ayre*, a song cycle that brings together folk material from a number of sacred and secular sources from the region around the Mediterranean Sea.

---

As I set out for San Francisco, I did not anticipate that my study of Afro-Cuban music would draw me into a world that would fundamentally change how I viewed the classical music traditions that I loved. That experience led me to the work of Osvaldo Golijov whose music, like Ayre, often fuses unique elements of cultural music traditions with classical aesthetics. In doing so, he challenges many assumptions about performing a composed work and is successful in recreating the communal elements of folk music in a classical setting.
Introduction
Deep song, or *cante jondo*, is a subgenre of flamenco that the Spanish poet Frederico Garcia Lorca considered to be the oldest, most pure form of music from Andalusia.\(^7\)

In the 1920s Lorca and the composer Manuel de Falla worked together along with many other Spanish artists to promote this style of music through lectures, writings, and performance contests. In a speech given on February 19, 1922, Lorca stated:

> Gentlemen, the musical soul of our people is in great danger! The artistic treasure of an entire race is passing into oblivion! Each day another leaf falls from the admirable tree of Andalusian lyrics, old men carry off to the grave priceless treasures of past generations, and a gross, stupid avalanche of cheap music clouds the delicious folk atmosphere of all Spain.\(^8\)

They sought to preserve the *cante jondo* in an effort to spread an awareness of the cultural heritage and significance of Andalusia. According to Falla, this style of music “grew from accumulated secular, historical events on our peninsula” and that it represents a unique fusion of Catholic, Arabic, and Gypsy musical traditions.\(^9\) The rich cultural and musical heritage of Andalusia that Lorca and Falla so adamantly fostered and defended serves as the starting point for Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, a virtuosic song cycle he composed for Dawn Upshaw that references numerous folk songs and traditions stretching from Andalusia to the Middle East.

This study is split into two parts to understand better the genesis and musical ideas of *Ayre*. On the surface Golijov’s music appears most closely associated with relatively recent post-modern trends and stands in contrast to the complexity and

\(^7\) Lorca, *Deep Song*, 24-5.

\(^8\) Ibid., 23.

\(^9\) Ibid., 25-6.
overt intellectualism of mid-century high modernism, exemplified by composers
associated with the Darmstadt School, such as Pierre Boulez, Bruno Maderna, and
Karlheinz Stockhausen. On closer examination, however, *Ayre* belongs to a rich
heritage of compositions and musical study that predates the twentieth century, is
historically and culturally aware, and is musically engaging.10 It is this deep
connection with the heritage of music that I explore in the first part of this paper.
Having examined the historical context of *Ayre*, the second part turns to the specific
musical and cultural aspects that Golijov brings together to create this early twenty-
first century masterpiece.

Before discussing the historical narrative, I will briefly examine the history of
ethnomusicology over the course of the last century and a half. *Ayre*, like Luciano
Berio’s *Folk Songs*, is comprised of a series of folk and popular songs from a number
of distinct cultural sources and understanding the evolution of this field of study is
useful in understanding elements of Golijov’s work. Additionally, I will survey the
use of terms like classical, popular, and folk music. These terms carry great
importance in this narrative, yet they have shifting definitions that make them
difficult to define firmly or use without confusion.

---

10 For more information regarding the Darmstadt School of composers, the role of the first
generation of composers in defining modernist orthodoxy, and the changes that arose in subsequent
generations, see Christopher Fox, “Darmstadt and the Institutionalisation of Modernism,”
*Contemporary Music Review* 26/1 (February 2007): 115-23; and Paul Attinello, “Postmodern or
37.
The Evolution of Ethnomusicology

Musicians of different cultural backgrounds have shared their music throughout history. These exchanges have fueled the evolution of musical traditions and often take place along trade routes or between neighboring communities where cultural encounters occur. Interest in comparing distinct musical traditions led to the development of comparative musicology in the nineteenth century, which later became known as ethnomusicology. Alan Merriam, a prominent ethnomusicologist of the late twentieth century, traced the evolution of his field by examining how musicologists have defined the terms comparative musicology and ethnomusicology since the late nineteenth century. He traces the term comparative musicology to Guido Adler, a Viennese musicologist, who in 1885 coined the term by stating:

... comparative musicology has as its task the comparison of the musical works—especially the folksongs of the various peoples of the earth for ethnographical purposes, and the classification of them according to their various forms.”

This early definition of comparative musicology broadly referred to “the task of comparing musical works” while more specifically focusing on “the folksongs of the various peoples of the earth.”

---

11 Jordi Savall and Yo-Yo Ma have explored these ideas in various performance projects that examine musical exchanges along the trade route known as the Silk Road. For more information, see Hespèrion XXI, Hispania & Japan: Dialogues (Barcelona: Alia Vox, 2011), CD; and The Silk Road Project. www.silkroadproject.org.


13 Ibid., 199.
Merriam notes that the field of study evolved and the term ethnomusicology replaced comparative musicology in 1950, when Jaap Kunst first coined the term in his book *Musicologica* by arguing that:

> The name of our science is, in fact, not quite characteristic; it does not “compare” any more than any other science. A better name, therefore, is ... ethno-musicology.14

Merriam continues by questioning the Euro-centricity of his field of study as well as the focus on folk music being limited to oral transmission. He seems disappointed in descriptions of the field, like Glen Haydon’s from 1941 that defines comparative musicology as the study of either “non-European musical systems and folk music” or “the songs of birds.”15 This definition not only fails to acknowledge the numerous European popular and folk traditions that were considered acceptable as part of the discipline, but it also ignores the sophistication of other cultures’ musical traditions by relating them to bird song rather than European classical music. In these definitions, one can observe the same type of cultural prejudice that we have examined from the colonial Europeans as they first encountered music from the African diaspora in South America.16

Merriam notes that another factor that some used to define folk music was the means of transmission. Haydon believed that “[m]ost, if not all, of the music studied in comparative musicology is transmitted by oral tradition.”17 Although Merriam

---

14 Merriam, 194.
15 Ibid., 191.
16 See page 4.
17 Merriam, 191-2.
died in 1980 and was unable to see the technological revolution of the Internet change how cultural traditions are documented and shared, his statements demonstrate that he understood that the means of transmission of musical information was not an effective way of distinguishing folk music from European classical music.

In an attempt to address the difficulties associated with defining ethnomusicology as a field distinct from musicology Merriam draws the following line of reasoning:

We can also, in definition, find ourselves struggling with the very words we use. Thus, for example, [Mantle] Hood, in the Introduction to *The Ethnomusicologist*, writes that ‘One point is clear: The subject of study in the field of ethnomusicology is music.’ While surely almost all of us would agree that this is so, we have only to stop to wonder how to define ‘music’ to discover ourselves in difficulty again. That is, if ethnomusicology is cross-cultural in its approach, which it certainly is, the problem of identifying the phenomenon ‘music’ becomes crucial.18

Therefore, how one defines music, whether it is folk, popular, or classical, becomes key to understanding how one needs to approach its study. This need forces us to consider how narrowly we define these terms and why we define them in such manners.

**Elements of Folk, Popular, and Classical**

The terms folk, popular, and classical can be applied to nearly every musical tradition, yet they are also used to define specific genres of music. I have charted

---

18 Merriam, 190.
both the positive and negative connotations that I have commonly heard associated with each term (see Table 1).

Table 1 Positive and Negative Connotations of the Terms Folk, Popular, and Classical

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Positive Connotation</th>
<th>Negative Connotation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Folk</td>
<td>For the people; perfected through oral transmission</td>
<td>Simple, unrefined, and naïve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Popular</td>
<td>Well-liked by many and can unite communities</td>
<td>Purely for commercial gain</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classical</td>
<td>Well-established; time tested</td>
<td>Old and staid; unrelated to the present</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Burdened with these connotations, these terms become tools that anyone can use either to exalt or degrade one type of music in comparison to another. The choice of the term one uses to describe a particular type of music should therefore be treated with great care since nearly all styles of music have elements of both the positive and negative connotations listed above. By relating aspects of all three terms to each musical style, one is able to see the connections between apparently unrelated styles of music more clearly.

Jazz is an excellent example of a type of music that is problematic to cast solely in terms of a single designation of either folk, popular, and classical. The jazz tradition developed as a fusion of musical styles including, but not limited to, the blues, ragtime, and marches, all which existed around the turn of the twentieth century. The styles of music that came together to create what we now refer to as jazz
featured both folk and popular elements, and the commercial success of any given work had as much to do with the color of the performer’s skin as with the style of music they performed. In the hands of Louis Armstrong, Duke Ellington, Glen Miller, and Benny Goodman, swing and the blues were popular and commercially viable styles of music in the 1920s and ‘30s. But, as the popularity of rock and roll and R&B surpassed them in the ensuing decades, they became classic icons of a bygone era. This transformation continued with the rise of funk and electronic instruments in the 1960s and ‘70s. While some jazz aficionados longed for the classics of Duke Ellington or Count Basie, bebop star Miles Davis continued develop new styles of jazz by fusing elements of swing and bebop with various other styles to create eclectic albums—from Sketches of Spain to Bitches Brew. The stylistic progression from one generation to another makes it difficult to define what the essence of jazz music is and to distinguish it as primarily either folk, popular, or classical.

Jazz is not the lone example of this phenomenon. The styles of Cuban son, Brazilian samba, and Argentine tango develop along much the same line as jazz in the United States in the sense that they developed as a fusion of many styles of folk and popular traditions around the turn of the twentieth century and continued to evolve.

---

19 Miles Davis, Sketches of Spain (New York: Columbia, 1960), LP; and Bitches Brew (New York: CBS, 1970), LP.

20 For more information regarding the development of jazz, see Ted Gioia, The History of Jazz (New York: Oxford University Press, 1997).

21 For more information regarding the development of Cuban son, see Cristóbal Diaz Ayala, The Roots of Salsa: The History of Cuban Music (New York: Excelsior Music Publishing, 1995); or Ned Sublette, Cuba and Its Music: From the First Drums to the Mambo (Chicago: Chicago Press Review, 2004). For more information regarding the development of Brazilian samba, see Claus Schreiner, Música Brasileira: A History of Popular Music and the People of Brazil (New York: M. Boyars, 1993). For more information regarding the development of Argentine tango, see Robert Thompson, Tango: The Art History of Love (New York: Pantheon Books, 2005), particularly chapter 7; and for more
Whether the music originated in the social clubs of Havana, the favelas in Rio de Janeiro, or the brothels of Buenos Aries, the musical element of a folk tradition does not change suddenly when the music becomes commercially viable or when others observe it from a future vantage point and consider it a classic. It retains its core musical elements at each point along its evolution, and the distinctions of classical, popular, and folk begin to lose meaning as a way to describe a particular style.

Because each term lacks a uniform definition, using these terms individually to identify specific styles will not aid us in understanding Ayre, but recognizing that each carries a set of particular associations, which define as much as segregate genres of music, will aid in understanding elements of the historical narrative that places Ayre in a broad context. This narrative will examine composers that were interested in understanding the music that surrounded and inspired them, including popular and folk styles. As we follow this narrative, it will become apparent how the development of the field of ethnomusicology created new means for composers to experience a wide range of musical styles from around the world. Many composers, like Golijov, explored these musical traditions and, in the process of integrating elements of these traditions into their compositions, have created new works that utilize the rich cultural history of the world to create their own deep songs.

---

Part the First:
A Twentieth-Century Historical Narrative
Chapter One - (C)overt Passions

Barbaric\(^2\)\(^2\)

- Nicolai Rimsky-Korsakov on Yuli Melgunov's heterophonic transcriptions of Russian folk music

Folk music, it seems to me, is beautiful only when it is idealized (but in folk style, of course). Think how disgustingly village peasant women sing what are really often beautiful songs. Remember those wild screams and roars which accompany the best melodies and the untrained voices which howl them. ... [Unrestrained realism in art] lowers the art, pulling it down from these lofty regions where the human soul dwells to the level of physiological necessities, gymnastics, massage, etc.\(^2\)\(^3\)

- Vasily Kalinnikov in a letter written in 1900

These quotes by Nicolai Rimsky-Korsakov, one of the leading Russian nationalistic composers of the late nineteenth century, and his younger contemporary Yuli Kalinnikov are indicative of the general attitude held by many urban composers regarding folk music in the late nineteenth century. Although Rimsky-Korsakov and Kalinnikov were interested folk material and frequently incorporated it into their works, they clearly believed it was raw and needed refinement.

Rimsky-Korsakov and Kalinnikov were not alone in their feelings towards authentic folk music. Rimsky-Korsakov's colleagues in the Russian composers' group known as The Five, Mily Balkirev, César Cui, Modest Mussorgsky, and Alexander Borodin, often portrayed Russian nationalism in their music through exotic references to

Russian folk culture, but their references were neither authentic nor based on ethnomusicological field work. Rimsky-Korsakov and the other members of the group imitated Mily Balakirev’s style of handling folk material by eliminating non-diatonic notes and avoiding or altering leading tones. They did this on the belief that they were recapturing more authentic folk elements.24

This style of folk song adaptation is evident in Rimsky-Korsakov’s 100 Chants Nationaux Russes, Op. 24, a collection of folk song arrangements from a variety of sources close to him including his friends, servants, and older collections of folk songs.25 Note that rather than starting with the original source of the songs, he took each from a convenient source and packaged them in a manner that most closely matched his aesthetic values. Rimsky-Korsakov, having never traveled to hear the source of the folk material, was unable to preserve the original settings of the folk songs and as a result set them in an idealized way. It is impossible to imagine Russian villagers accompanying these melodies with triadic harmonies such as those found in the sixth song from the collection, or set against the contrapuntal accompaniment of the twenty-third song (see Example 1.1-2).

25 Ibid.
These idealized songs are typical results from the cosmopolitan embrace of nationalism that was common at the time. Richard Taruskin, the well-regarded musicologist, notes that the interest in nationalism during this period “had far less to do with style than with subject matter and what might be described as ‘ethos,’ that is, the proper attitude of sympathy toward that subject matter” and he describes Rimsky-Korsakov as “alienated from undoctored folk music.”

Yuliy Melgunov was a Russian pianist who became interested in discovering the source of Russian folk music through his work with the German philologist Rudolf

---

Westphal believed that Russian folk songs were a well-preserved and important heritage of the world and should be studied more thoroughly. Therefore, Westphal assigned Melgunov the task of studying the metrics of these songs by doing field research in the town of Tishinino. It was there that he discovered that Russian folk songs were not merely tunes, but that they were polyphonic entities.27 Nikolai Palchikov, an ethnographer who was also interested in transcribing authentic polyphonic transcriptions of these folk songs, notes:

... a fully realized performance of a song ... can be given only by a chorus, and individual singers can sing only elements or parts, so to speak, of the song—the tunes out of which the whole song is assembled by the chorus.28

In his collection *Russian Songs Directly from the Voices of the People*, Melgunov makes the first attempts to combine all of the individual parts to create the whole song. Having never before experienced this specific type of heterophonic nuance—much less seen transcriptions of it, he needed to devise new methods to accurately transcribe each individual voice. For this collection, Melgunov decided to ask the singers to sing alone so that he could transcribe each line before he then combined them to create the whole. While this method was less than ideal, since the musicians were unaccustomed to performing individually, it served as the basis of a newfound interest in authenticity and a new aesthetic that embraces the naturally occurring heterophonic dissonances and other musical nuances foreign to traditional Western art music sensibilities.

---

28 Ibid., 724.
Melgunov’s aesthetic stood in stark contrast to Rimsky-Korsakov’s. Therefore, it makes sense that when Rimsky-Korsakov first came across Melgunov’s collection of folk songs he described the unaltered heterophony as “barbaric,” as noted in the epigraph of this chapter. His brash reaction to the more authentic transcriptions illustrates his aesthetic: folk music was most beautiful when certain elements of the music were smoothed out and adapted. Melgunov comments on their differences by stating that “[n]o true lover of beauty can escape being overcome with despair at the icy indifference of the Russian musical intelligentsia towards the dying out of Russian folk song.”

It is clear from this statement that tensions between the competing aesthetics were strong, even a decade before Adler had coined the term comparative musicology to describe the burgeoning study of folk music. The birth of this new field around this point in time reflects the growing interest in the authenticity of folk material and the development of an aesthetic that appreciates the natural beauty and complexity of unaltered folk music.

From Russia to Hungary

Béla Bartók, a Hungarian ethnomusicologist, pianist, and composer, became a leader in the study of authentic folk music in the first half of the twentieth century. Bartók described his beliefs at length in numerous essays and lectures. In concluding his essay on the relationship between folk and art music, Bartók describes what it means to him to experience a folk tradition in its natural cultural setting when he states:

29 Taruskin, *Stravinsky and the Russian Traditions*, 726.
[the influence of folk music on higher art music] is most effective for the musician if he acquaints himself with folk music in the form in which it lives, in unbridled strength, amidst the lower people, and not by means of inanimate collections of folk music which anyway lack adequate diatonic symbols capable of restoring their minute nuances and throbbing life. If he surrenders himself to the impact of this living folk music and to all the circumstances which are the conditions of this life, and if he reflects in his works the effects of these impressions, then we might say of him that he has portrayed therein a part of life.\textsuperscript{30}

This passage shows that the division between the aesthetic of Rimsky-Korsakov, whose \textit{100 Chants Nationaux Russes} was likely one of the “inanimate collections of folk music” he is referencing, and the aesthetic of the comparative musicologists is still strong in 1920. Bartók’s description of the music’s “unbridled strength” matches what I experienced while studying Afro-Cuban folkloric music within the Cuban community in San Francisco. I believe that the strength that he describes comes partially from the communal experience of folk music performances, and Bartók believes that those experiential elements give folk music its unique spirit. In another essay discussing music education, he points out that “music making is more natural than listening.”\textsuperscript{31} He notes the difference between the role of music in rural populations where “there is no division of people into audience and performers” and in urban populations where they “have lost their spontaneous music-making activity.”\textsuperscript{32} He believes that the loss of communal musical experiences made it “necessary to revive [folk music] in [urban populations] in an artificial way” as

\textsuperscript{31} Ibid., 511.
\textsuperscript{32} Ibid.
found in the art music adaptations of folk songs by composers like Rimsky-Korsakov.³³

Bartók also points out that Western notation is an inadequate tool in capturing the
essence of folk music because it “lack[s] adequate diatonic symbols capable of
restoring their minute nuances and throbbing life.”³⁴ In his four-volume study of
Rumanian folk music, Bartók develops new notational elements to help address the
deficiency.³⁵ He appropriates slurs, arrows, parentheses, and other markings to
help identify the rhythmic and pitch nuances of the music, but a classically-trained
musician would likely struggle with interpreting these transcriptions accurately
without already having a familiarity with the Romanian music in its natural setting.

More recently, Golijov addresses the same issue when discussing one of the
movements from Ayre.

[The elements of communal spirit] theoretically could be notated, by
inventing a new symbol. But they all come from real life, from my
experience of witnessing huge demonstrations in Argentina, with
drums—boom-boom, and thousands of people not singing. It’s like a
human ocean coming through the streets.³⁶

The implication is that notation can function simply as a guide and that the nuances
need not always be notated. In these instances, the experience and knowledge of
performers acquainted folk traditions will enable them to inject the communal spirit

³³ Bartók, Béla Bartók Essays, 511.
³⁴ Ibid., 318.
into the music without overt instruction thus adding a new dimension to a performance.

Bartók leaves little room to question how he felt regarding composers who utilize folk music without experiencing it in the villages as Melgunov and Palchikov had. He describes the use of folk music by Chopin, Liszt, the Slavonic composers (presumably including Rimsky-Korsakov, Kalinnikov, and Balakirev), and other authors of popular art music from his time in his essay “The Influence of Folk Music on the Art Music of Today” by saying that they:

... have a certain erudition which blends in their works (mostly single melodies without accompaniment) certain peculiarities from the folk style of their country with the conventional pattern of the higher art music. The reference to folk music presents something refreshing and exotic to their works, while the application of art patterns results in many banalities: the artistic value of such melodies cannot be compared with that of the untarnished folk melodies. Popular art melodies generally lack the perfection so very characteristic of pure folk music.\(^{37}\)

In another essay, “The Relation of Folk Song to the Development of the Art Music of Our Time,” he elaborates by describing the mixture of “exoticism and banality [as] something imperfect, inartistic, [and] in marked contrast to the clarity of real peasant music with which it compares most unfavorably.”\(^ {38}\) Embellishing his well-defined feelings, he refers to these banal treatments of folk music as “whitewash” and juxtaposes it with his understanding of the true influence of peasant music as “the expression of the real spirit of the music of any particular people which is so

\(^{38}\) Ibid., 322.
hard to render in words.” To conclude his already striking assessment he labels the aforementioned composers as “blockhead[s] ... with no musical talent [that need] to run to ‘the people’ in order to get inspiration for [their] thin idea[s].”39 These strong feelings are a result of his passion for both folk and art music and his desire to treat both traditions with great respect.

These two impassioned essays regarding the relationship between folk and art music from 1920 and 1921, respectively, appear shortly before what Malcolm Gilles describes as “a period of compositional fallow” in Bartók’s life that began in 1923 and ended with a sudden resurgence of composition in 1926.40 In fact, Bartók composed relatively little during the five-year span stretching back to the time of his essays in 1921 through the end of 1926 (see Table 2).

---

40 Gillies, “Fallow Years,” 213.
Table 2 Works Composed between 1921 and 1926 by Béla Bartók

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Composition</th>
<th>Sz.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1921</td>
<td>Violin Sonata No. 1</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1922</td>
<td>Violin Sonata No. 2</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1923</td>
<td>Táncsvit (Dance Suite) for orchestra</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1924</td>
<td>Falun (Village Scenes) for voice and piano</td>
<td>78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1926</td>
<td>Falun (Three Village Scenes) for 4 or 8 Female Voices and Chamber Orchestra</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In Gilles' reappraisal of Bartók's fallow years, he notes that during this period Bartók went through a divorce, a second marriage, the birth of his second son, frequent illness, the onset of chronic shoulder pain that would plague him for the remainder of his life, and in 1925 he even lamented that he had become an "ex-composer." 

I propose another possible reason for his compositional struggles in addition to the ones that Gilles mentions. In his essay from 1921, Bartók also stated that:

... artistic perfection can only be achieved by one of two extremes: on the one hand by peasant folk in the mass, completely devoid of the culture of the town-dweller, on the other by creative power of individual genius. The creative impulse of anyone who has the

---

misfortune to be born somewhere between these two extremes leads only to barren, pointless, and misshapen work.43

By 1921, he had composed several successful works in the art music tradition that did not rely on folk material, including his opera Bluebeard's Castle, his ballet The Wooden Prince, and two string quartets. However, by that point he had also collected over 10,000 folk songs and had used two hundred and seven folk melodies in twenty-four of his compositions.44 Could his statement about those born between the two extremes actually be in reference to himself? The violin sonatas from 1921 and 1922 are both complex works that are a result of Bartók's quest to explore the "creative power of individual genius," yet so much of his work and passion rest at the other end of his spectrum. In addition to the difficulties that his life presented during this period, I believe that he may have struggled with his personal identity within the terms that he laid out in the essay.

Bartók only composed two other works from the period between 1921 and 1926 and both commemorate specific events. Táncsvit was composed to celebrate the fiftieth anniversary of the union of the cities of Buda and Pest to create Budapest and the original version of Falun, for voice and piano, was composed to celebrate his second marriage in 1924.45 It is plausible that during this period he may have

43 Bartók, Béla Bartók Essays, 322.
44 Mineo Ota, "Why is the 'Spirit' of Folk Music so Important? And the Historical Background of Béla Bartók's Views of Folk Music," International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music 1 (June 2006): 33; and Vera Lampert, Folk Music in Bartók's Compositions: A Source Catalog, ed. Vera Lampert and László Vikárius (Budapest: Hungarian Heritage House, 2008), 55-153. The total number of folk songs does not include those from Three Rondos on Folk Tunes, which Bartók began composing in 1916 but did not complete until 1927.
struggled with how to incorporate folk material into his compositions in an effort to create meaningful works that are infused with the spirit of folk music. *Táncesvit* and *Falun* both prominently feature folk elements and may have served as experiments to see if the fusion was even possible. Few people yearn to create banal, meaningless art and surely Bartók was no exception. His passion lay at both extremes and he sought to bring them together in order to define himself as a composer with creative genius who could incorporate the richness of folk music within his works.

In an effort to combat the artificial quality commonly found in other folk music adaptations, Bartók strives to imbue his art music with the communal strength that is hallmark of folk music. In 1924, Bartók composed *Falun*, a typical set of five folk songs adapted for voice and piano. Two years later, he orchestrated the final three songs, adding three additional singers and what I term a “small township” of fifteen instrumentalists to the soprano and piano. I believe that one can hear “the expression of the real spirit” of folk music, which Bartók believed was so difficult to articulate, in this orchestration. The increased number of musicians, both vocal and instrumental, creates the communal feeling that is lacking in folk songs arranged for voice and piano alone.

Vera Lampert exhaustively cataloged the source of the folk material in all of Bartók’s works and shows that the main vocal melodies from this movement of *Falun* originate in Zvolanská, a village in Slovakia, but there is no reference to the origins
of the orchestral introduction. The orchestral sections of the first movement are distinctive due to Bartók’s combination of asymmetric meter and a very fast tempo. Unlike Igor Stravinsky’s more famous use of asymmetric meter in the “Sacrificial Dance” in *Le Sacre du Printemps* from a decade earlier, this dance music is marked to be played at *Vivacissimo, J=196*, a tempo much faster than other mixed-meter music from the time (see Example 2).

---

46 Lampert, 154-5.
Example 2 Béla Bartók's *Falun, Sz. 79, I. Vivacissimo* \( \mathbf{J}=196 \), beginning to rehearsal 2 (woodwinds only)

Three Village Scenes, SZ79 by Bela Bartok
© Copyright 1927 by Boosey & Hawkes, Inc. Copyright renewed.
Reprinted by permission.

Bela Bartok “3 Village Scenes”
© Copyright 1927 by Universal Edition A.G., Wien/UE 8713
© Copyright renewed 1954 by Boosey & Hawkes Inc.
English translation and orchestral score copyright 1954 by Boosey & Hawkes Inc., New York
All rights in the USA owned and controlled by Boosey & Hawkes Inc.
I believe that Bartók discusses the inspiration for this music in his essay from 1938 entitled “The So-called Bulgarian Rhythm,” in which he describes this exact style of music. He delineates it from European art music, which he states only utilizes ñ and ñ meters (and their equivalents), and gives examples of this asymmetric rhythmic style whose tempi are well in excess of a metronome marking of 200 and can even reach up to ñ=650 (see Example 3).\textsuperscript{47}

**Example 3** Dance for Violin (an example of the so-called Bulgarian rhythm)\textsuperscript{48}

The use of the so-called Bulgarian Rhythm in *Falun* is unique in his output because of its use of an extremely fast tempo.\textsuperscript{49}

---

\textsuperscript{47} Bartók, *Béla Bartók Essays*, 40-1.

\textsuperscript{48} Ibid., 44, Example 5.

\textsuperscript{49} János Breuer identifies a similar style of rhythm, which he calls Kolinda Rhythm in his article “Kolinda Rhythm in the Music of Bartók.” Although the mixed-metric element of these Christmas songs is not unique among folk traditions, it was unusual in Western art music at the time. In the
Bartók’s general avoidance of combining ultrafast tempi with mixed meter, as is common in the Bulgarian style, is likely due to the unfamiliarity of this style of music for orchestral musicians. In the same essay on Bulgarian rhythm, Bartók described an experience where he had asked two violinists to play the following folk melody (see Example 4.1), which utilizes a similar ultrafast tempo as Bartók uses in the \textit{Falun} excerpt.

\textbf{Example 4.1} Belt Dance, m. 1 to 6 – Béla Bartók’s Original Transcription\textsuperscript{50}

![Example 4.1 Belt Dance, m. 1 to 6 – Béla Bartók’s Original Transcription](image)

Even after several rehearsals, the players would transform the meter of the dance into $\frac{4}{4}$, to which they were more accustomed. He also notes in this essay that the nuance of the Bulgarian rhythm in the melody was not only too complicated for the orchestral musicians but it also took several years for Bartók himself to understand more fully the tricky passage (see Example 4.2).\textsuperscript{51}

\footnotesize{forward to his collection of Romanian folk music, Bartók distinguishes the asymmetrical rhythmic patterns of the Kolinda from so-called Bulgarian rhythms, which are associated with faster tempi. Breuer similarly distinguishes the Kolinda and Bulgarian styles by their distinct tempi. He identifies many examples of the Kolinda rhythm in Bartók’s art music output and included the example from \textit{Falun}. Breuer’s other examples of the Kolinda rhythm are usually marked below $\frac{3}{2}$=125. Besides the \textit{Falun} excerpt, only one other example (Mikrokosmos VI, No. 140 which is marked at $\frac{3}{2}$=160) crosses that tempo threshold. Although Breuer considers the \textit{Falun} excerpt to be an example of Kolinda rhythm, it is probably more likely to be an example of the faster Bulgarian style. See János Breuer, “Kolinda Rhythm in the Music of Bartók,” \textit{Studia Musicologica Academiae Scientiarum Hungaricae} 17/1-4 (1975): 44.}

\textsuperscript{50}Bartók, \textit{Béla Bartók Essays}, 42, Example 3.

\textsuperscript{51}Ibid., 42.
These moments of discovery are something that anyone who has studied unfamiliar material has experienced. Rather than feeling embarrassed that he got the rhythm wrong the first time, Bartók appears to have been humbled by the understanding that learning is a process and not a destination. Through humbling experiences like the one he described, Bartók may have realized that orchestral musicians were unlikely to perform accurately the rhythmic nuance of the ultrafast music without experiencing the music first hand and therefore utilized the slower Kolinda style in his music more frequently in the mixed-meter passages of later works.

Although examples of the so-called Bulgarian rhythm are still uncommon in Western art music, some composers today have found ways of incorporating the spirit of this music into their compositions. For example, the first movement of Derek Bermel’s *Tied Shifts*, which was composed for the chamber ensemble *eighth blackbird* in 2004, appears to reference the same folk traditions as Bartók studied. Bermel had traveled to Plovdiv, Bulgaria in 2001 where he worked with the

---

Bulgarian folk clarinetist Nikola Iliev. The folk traditions that Bartók was exposed to in the previous century are evident in Bermel's composition as seen in the ornamentation, its $\frac{3}{8}$ meter, and generally quick tempo (see Example 5).\(^{53}\)

**Example 5** Derek Bermel's *Tied Shifts*, I. Driving, relentless $j=184$ ($j\Rightarrow \text{sempre}$). Rehearsal A to B

---

Given the contrasting aesthetics that had existed regarding folk and art music at the end of the nineteenth century, Bartók initially saw little to gain in combining the folk and art music traditions in meaningful ways. Although he discovered that orchestral musicians would struggle to recreate folk nuances and yearned for them to experience folk music so that they could capture its spirit, he found ways to combine the two styles of music for which he had a passion without creating banal, pointless art.

In 1931, Bartók singles out two of his contemporaries, Stravinsky and Manuel de Falla, for having “studied not only books and museums but the living music of their countries” even if they had not gone on such journeys themselves.⁵⁴ Although Bartók clearly prefers “journeys of collection,” as Bermel did in this century, Bartók seems more comfortable with the grey areas between art music and folk music than he had ten years earlier.

**Stravinsky’s Use of Russian Folk Material**

Stravinsky did not openly reciprocate Bartók’s positive feelings. Upon hearing news of Bartók’s death in 1945, he said that “I never liked [Bartók’s] music anyway”⁵⁵ and fourteen years later he went on to say:

> I know the most important musician [Bartók] was, I had heard wonders about the sensitivity of his ear, and I bowed deeply to his religiosity. However, I never could share his lifelong gusto for his

native folklore. His devotion was certainly real and touching, but I couldn’t help regretting it in the great musician.\(^56\)

His statement here is unequivocal. He connects “lifelong gusto for his native folklore” as something to regret in a musician, but this assertion seems strange taking into account Stravinsky’s reliance on folklore in so much of his music, particularly from his so-called Russian period.

Commenting to Robert Craft in the late 1940s Stravinsky expressed that he "was bored with folk music and even more so with the question of its connections with his work."\(^57\) Tired of these questions, Stravinsky seemed comfortable making a number of errant and often contradictory statements later in life in an effort to help mold others’ perceptions of his music. Taruskin examines these tendencies in his article “Stravinsky and the Traditions: Why the Memory Hole?” and provides further insight into why Stravinsky would so starkly distance himself from a composer like Bartók, who shared a common interest in folk music. Taruskin went so far as to say, “one cannot expect frankness from his origins from a man so deeply ashamed of them.”\(^58\) He points out that Stravinsky suffered from a “chronic sense of cultural inferiority” which left him “doubtful of the validity of his work and fearful about his ultimate place in history.”\(^59\) As a result, he felt it necessary to make these types of

\(^{56}\) Schneider, 125.


\(^{59}\) Ibid.
comments that distanced him from appearing to rely on folk music as his teacher and the other members of The Five had previously done.\textsuperscript{60}

In reality, Stravinsky was very interested in the field of comparative musicology and Bartók was quick to note Stravinsky’s reliance on folk material during a lecture at Harvard in 1943. He stated that he strongly believed “almost all of the motives [in \textit{Le sacre du printemps}] seem to be Russian peasant music motives or their excellent imitations” and continued to note that the most interesting innovations in the work are indebted to folk traditions.\textsuperscript{61} Although Bartók could not prove these connections, his instincts were correct and more recently, Taruskin was able to verify it by examining the sketchbook Stravinsky used while composing \textit{Le sacre du printemps}. Taruskin notes in his article “Russian Folk Melodies in ‘The Rite of Spring’” that “the sketchbook shows in graphic detail how Stravinsky, at the onset of full maturity, used Russian folk music as an instrument of self-emancipation from the constricting traditions of Russian art music.”\textsuperscript{62}

Stravinsky was not only interested in folk music, but he also shared the concern with authenticity that we have already seen in Bartók, Melgunov, and Palchikov. Stravinsky is clearly aware of the issues surrounding the collection of folk materials when he notes “everyone who transcribes folk melody—by ear or from a phonograph—modifies it, adapting it to one’s own level of understanding.”\textsuperscript{63}

\textsuperscript{60} Taruskin, “Stravinsky and the Traditions: Why the Memory Hole?”: 11.
\textsuperscript{63} Mazo, 103.
Acknowledging these realities, when he searched for folk song collections he strived to find what Mazo describes as “reliable and unmediated sources of folk music,” as evidenced by a letter he wrote to his mother from 1916 asking her help to purchase collections “recorded phonographically only.” Additionally, Stravinsky alludes to the subtleties and nuance (or manner) of folk music in his autobiography as he describes his first experience hearing folk music in a village as a child:

To this day I clearly remember the tune, and the way [village women] sang it, and how, when I used to sing it at home, imitating their manner, I was complimented on the trueness of my ear.

It is quite possible that the memory Stravinsky describes came from one of the many vacations to villages outside St. Petersburg that his and other families often took during the summers. These trips likely exposed him to the styles of folk music that permeate his music in works like Le Sacre du printemps, Renard, Pribaoutki, and Les noces.

Both Stravinsky and Bartók experienced the stigma associated with compositions that blended aspects of art and folk music, yet found ways to incorporate elements of each into their music. The young Bartók once believed that perfection could only originate in one of these extremes, while Stravinsky feared that his reputation would suffer if others viewed his music as being too closely affiliated with folk music in general or the provincial qualities of Russia. Both composers found ways of combining the elements of the music that they passionately admired and created

---

64 Mazo, 103.
65 Ibid., 123.
their unique musical voice in the process. Bartók came to embrace folk music in his compositions in an overt manner, acknowledging that his originality stemmed directly from his passion for ethnomusicology, while Stravinsky covertly maintained an interest in Russian folklore while downplaying any connections that he may have had with folk melodies and music in an effort not to diminish the originality of his work.

**The Long-Term Project**

In a series of conversations with Robert Craft recorded in *Expositions and Developments*, Stravinsky states that:

I became aware of an idea for a choral work on the subject of a Russian peasant wedding early in 1912; the title, *Svadebka, Les Noces*, occurred to me almost at the same time as the idea itself. As my conception developed, I began to see that it did not indicate the dramatization of a wedding or the accompaniment of a staged wedding spectacle with descriptive music. My wish was, instead, to present actual wedding material through direct quotation of popular—i.e. non-literary—verse. I waited two years before discovering my source in the anthologies by Afanasiev and Kireievsky, but this wait was well rewarded, as the dance-cantata form of the music was also suggested to me by my reading of these two great treasures of the Russian language and spirit.\(^{66}\)

Although this quote comes from later in his life and should be approached with care, it yields several important things to note regarding the importance of the work. First, the gestation period for the work is unusually long and spanned roughly eleven years, predating *Le scare du printemps* and finally receiving its premiere in 1923, long after the end of the First World War and just less than seven months

---

before the death of Vladimir Lenin in his homeland. Europe had undergone tremendous change during this period and the music of the final version of *Les noces* reflects the changing aesthetic following the war. Second, Stravinsky envisioned this project as a non-dramatic presentation of the wedding ritual rather than a dramatic work more similar to *L'oiseau de feu* or *Pétrouchka*. The removal of the dramatic elements distance the work from the prevailing Romanticism that still dominated the musical landscape of Europe in 1912 and related the work more closely to its folk origins. Finally, although Stravinsky freely acknowledges his literary source material, as to be expected, he does not identify any of the musical source material for the work.67

The fact that Stravinsky spent such a long period developing *Les noces* indicates that the project was very important to him. Over the course of the eleven years of its development, it went through several versions (see Table 3).

---

67 For a complete list of the textual sources, see Taruskin, *Stravinsky and the Russian Traditions*, II, 1423-40.
Table 3 Working Versions of Stravinsky’s *Les noces* between 1914 and 1923

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Version</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Instrumentation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1914-15</td>
<td>Two string quintets (one arco and one pizzicato) and nine winds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1914-15</td>
<td>Two string quintets (one arco and one pizzicato) and nine winds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>1915-17</td>
<td>Twenty-seven winds and brass, eight strings, harp, piano, harpsichord, and cimbalom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>1918-19</td>
<td>Two cimbaloms, harmonium, pianola, and percussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>1922-23</td>
<td>Four pianos and percussion (ten players)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In addition to these five versions, sketches also exist for an orchestral version similar in instrumentation to *Le Sacre du printemps*. The numerous possible orchestrations demonstrate that *Les noces* was not a project that Stravinsky ignored during this long period, it was something that occupied his attention as he strove to find the right balance of timbres to accompany the presentation of the wedding ritual.

---


The evolution of the instrumentation from an orchestra of similar scope to *Le sacre du printemps* to an unusual combination of pianos and percussion is indicative of a general change in aesthetics from the dramatic and richly colorful Romanticism of the late nineteenth century to the comparatively dry Neo-Classicism, which flourished in the wake of the First World War. As with the innovations in *Le sacre du printemps*, this change can be traced to folk origins as well. Yevgeniya Linyova, an important folk song collector in Russia who followed in the wake of Melgunov and Palchikov, was among the first Europeans to utilize the phonograph to aid in collecting folk songs and published three sets of polyphonic folk song transcriptions between 1904 and 1909.\(^70\) She once described the performance of a folk singer she particularly admired as “simple, strictly rhythmical, and not for a minute did it exceed the limits of artistic truth” even though the song reflected a recent, deeply personal tragedy.\(^71\) This emotionless style of singing stands in contrast to the more dramatic styles of *L’oiseau de feu* and *Pétrouchka* and is what ultimately is embedded into the essence of *Les noces*, both instrumentally and musically.

Stravinsky described the final version as “perfectly homogeneous, perfectly impersonal, and perfectly mechanical.”\(^72\) Before deciding on a battery of pianos, xylophone, timpani, and other various percussion instruments, he experimented with pianolas, harpsichords, and cimbalom, all instruments capable of percussive, cold attacks without the kind of sustain and warmth of Romantic music.

---

\(^70\) Taruskin, *Stravinsky and the Russian Traditions*, 727. Stravinsky owned the first volume of Linyova’s collections based on the same letter he sent his mother that we discussed earlier. For more information, see Mazo, 103.

\(^71\) Ibid., 732.

Stravinsky’s evolution from Romantic expression to the emotionless character of *Les noces* parallels the fascination with the impersonality of industrialism by the Dada artists with whom he associated in Paris. Examining works like Francis Picabia’s *Fille née sans mère* [Girl Born without a Mother] (c. 1917), one can see how these artists treated new technology as a subject in their work during the same period.\(^{73}\)

The subject of the painting is neither a girl nor a mother; it is a large mechanical device that serves as an ironic metaphor for human life. Surrounded by gold in a possible reference to Byzantine icons of the Madonna, the mechanical nature of the machine replaces the human figures that are implied by the title of the work. In this way, Stravinsky’s musical evolution is part of a larger cultural phenomenon occurring in Paris during the 1920s, which pitted the personal and the impersonal much in the same way Linyova described her ideal Russian folk performer.

In 1994, the Pokrovsky Ensemble, led by ethnomusicologist and conductor Dmitri Pokrovsky, released an unusual recording of Stravinsky’s *Les noces* that explores the folk origins of the work as well as Stravinsky’s interest in the mechanical qualities of the music.\(^{74}\) To prepare for the recording, members of the ensemble traveled to villages throughout the southern and western regions of Russia to learn and experience the folk songs that may have served as the source material for *Les noces*, in their original environment just as Bartók would have preferred. *Les noces* is

---

\(^{73}\) To view Picabia’s *Fille née sans mère*, visit http://www.nationalgalleries.org/object/GMA 3545.

\(^{74}\) Pokrovsky Ensemble, CD.
placed amongst fifteen Russian village wedding songs on the CD, highlighting the similarities between Stravinsky’s music and the traditional folk songs.

The vocal timbre that the ensemble produces in both the recordings of *Les noces* and the folk songs runs counter to predominant classical aesthetics, but it infuses the work with the aesthetics of Melgunov, giving the work a sense of the communal spirit that is also found in orchestral interludes of Bartók’s *Falun*. The ensemble used Stravinsky’s final version of the work, but replaced the pianos with Yamaha Disklaviers in a purely mechanized way, perhaps fulfilling Stravinsky’s desire to use pianolas in the fourth version of the work. I find that setting the edgy vocal timbre against the mechanized accompaniment further enhances the ironic qualities of Dadaism found in the work.

Like Taruskin, Pokrovsky believed that "Stravinsky knew this material much better than he pretended." He estimated that about ten minutes of Stravinsky’s 23-minute score can be linked to existing Russian folk songs and that some of the music is related to Georgian folk songs and Russian Orthodox music. As discussed earlier, one should not necessarily take Stravinsky at his word when he states that only "one of the themes of *Les noces* is folk derived." As with Bartók’s assessment of *Le sacre du printemps*, Pokrovsky’s personal experiences with Russian folk music may have

---

75 Lewis Segal, "Playing Detective with Stravinsky: By juxtaposing the composer’s ’Les Noces’ with Russian folk music, the Pokrovsky Ensemble is bringing an international debate over the masterwork’s origins to Brentwood," *Los Angeles Times*, 28 January 1996.
76 Ibid.
77 Taruskin, *Stravinsky and the Russian Traditions*, 1372.
identified the folk sources in Stravinsky's music even if it may be impossible to confirm with certainty.

In addition to Pokrovsky's assertions, others have noted authentic folk elements in *Les noces*. Alexander Kastalsky, a contemporary of Stravinsky and a connoisseur of Russian folk polyphony, had measured praise for the work. Although he felt that Stravinsky's composition was not purely authentic, he acknowledged the accuracy of certain aspects of the piece.78 Also, Taruskin's analysis of Stravinsky's musical material highlights both a connection between Stravinsky's music and the Istomin collection of folk songs as well notes Stravinsky's use of *popevki*, short motives that folk singers used to improvise.79 With the assertions of these three men, it seems reasonable to suspect that Stravinsky was acquainted with authentic folk music and was either well researched or had experienced it in its natural setting. Given his aversion to being publically associated with folk music, he kept these sources hidden in an effort to highlight the perceived artistic quality of the work.

As we have examined, both Bartók and Stravinsky incorporated folk elements into their art music in distinct ways. They both forged a middle ground between the idealism of the art music and the spirit of folk music. They did so within a context of social pressure to adhere to one or the other aesthetic that dated back at least to the late nineteenth century in Russia. Although Bartók was more open in discussing the

78 Taruskin, *Stravinsky and the Russian Traditions*, 1409-11. For specific examples, see Ibid., Example 17.35.
79 Ibid., 1363 and 1365.
influence of folk material on his work, both composers clearly assimilated the folk traditions and used them as the basis of their works.

Although *Falun* and *Les noces* were composed nearly a century before *Ayre*, Bartok and Stravinsky were forced to confront issues similar to the ones that faced Golijov. All three composers engaged with the issue of how to fuse elements of folk and classical music; they also addressed the stigma associated with such endeavors. In the course of the twentieth century many composers confronted these issues in the United States in relation not only to folk music, but also to newly developing styles of popular music such as blues and jazz. Chapter two will explore that confrontation.
Chapter Two - Crossroads

Put any good ‘authentic,’ traditional singer before a microphone or on a platform before an audience not of its own kind, and soon the peculiar requirements of the situation produce the typical traits of exhibitionism.\(^{80}\)

- Charles Seeger

The split between modern and post-modern aesthetics in the United States that developed in the middle of the twentieth century—and that Golijov and his contemporaries confronted at the turn of the twenty-first century—are rooted in the legacy of American composers who struggled in the 1930s and ‘40s to develop their own unique compositional identity distinct from that of Europe. Many of these composers looked to American popular and folk music traditions to inspire a new style of art music.

These musicians struggled with many of the same issues that the key players from the first chapter had approached in the 1910s and ‘20s. Although the stigma associated with utilizing folk music in one’s compositions remained, the economic and political conditions following the Great Depression led some composers to disregard it and focus their efforts on serving the working class. Because many visual artists and composers worked within similar circles, one can see how the role of music and art changed within society by examining both the visual and aural art forms.

In the 1920s, changes in technology led to an increase in the influence of popular music in the United States, especially the music that is now most commonly referred to as jazz. One of the key factors contributing to the rise of its popularity was the advancement of recording and broadcast technology, which allowed localized musical traditions and styles to become commercially viable on a broader scale. The *Original Dixieland Jass Band* made the first jazz recording in 1917 and the first commercial radio broadcast occurred in Pittsburgh in 1920. AT&T’s Bell Laboratories developed electronic recording technology by 1925 and were able to record the Philadelphia Orchestra using this improved technology in 1931. Although both recording and broadcast technology would continue to improve, radios and record players had already fundamentally changed the way that music was disseminated to the public by the 1930s. This shift allowed musicians, particularly of popular music, to reach larger audiences. Combined with the founding of organizations like the American Society of Composers, Authors and Publishers (ASCAP) in 1914, which allowed greater ability for composers and publishers to collect royalties, the music industry began to develop and affect changes in popular, folk, and art music in the ensuing decades. Composers and musicians could now hear jazz, the urban popular music, a variety of folk styles from around rural America, and the classical traditions of Europe with ease. With access


to a wider variety of musical styles, these composers now had more sources to draw from and questions regarding the issue of musical authenticity continued to increase.

The Roots of an American Tradition

Antonín Dvořák, the Bohemian composer, was invited to serve as the director of the National Conservatory of Music in New York City from 1892 to 1895. While he was in the United States, he encouraged fledgling composers to break away from the yolk of French and German composers and incorporate the folk music of the United States into their classical compositions. He famously offered String Quartet No. 12 “American” as an example of how a composer could be inspired by African-American spirituals and the sounds of the railroad.84

At the time, it was common for young American composers to make pilgrimages to Europe to study the art of composing rather than to use the vernacular music of the United States as their models. One early exception to this rule was Charles Ives, who studied under Horatio Parker at Yale in the 1890s. Parker had himself studied in Germany, and many of the works that Ives composed while under his tutelage are similar in style to Johannes Brahms and Robert Schumann.85 It was during the same

---

84 For more information regarding Antonín Dvořák’s residence in the United States, see Michael Beckerman, New Worlds of Dvořák: Searching in America for the Composer’s Inner Life (New York: Norton, 2003).

period that Ives composed his First String Quartet (1897-1900), which fuses gospel hymns associated with organizations such as the Salvation Army with the European tradition of the string quartet.\textsuperscript{86}

Although the tradition of Americans studying composition in Europe continued, European teachers like Nadia Boulanger encouraged her international students to embrace that music that they associated with their homelands and to incorporate its elements into their own compositions.\textsuperscript{87} Both Aaron Copland, who incorporated aspects of jazz into his art music, and later Astor Piazzolla, an Argentine composer who incorporated aspects of tango into his art music, studied with the revered pedagogue.

Works that combine popular and art music, as exemplified by selected compositions of Copland and Piazzolla, are often judged from one of two perspectives. The first, which I believe is most common, is that these hybrid compositions, which fuse popular and art music, are somehow less serious than pure art music. A competing viewpoint is to consider them in the same light as the evolution of other great composers, without prejudice against their incorporation of folk and popular elements. This view acknowledges that every young musician, regardless of when they are alive, where they live, or which style of music they are most associated with, learns the musical traditions that surround them and decides which elements of these musical styles they will appropriate and which elements they will reject. The

\textsuperscript{86} Ives was familiar with these hymns through his work as a church organist and though accompanying his father to revivalist tent meetings in his youth.

\textsuperscript{87} For more information on Nadia Boulanger’s life, see Léonie Rosensteil, \textit{Nadia Boulanger: A Life in Music} (New York: Norton, 1982).
choices that each individual musician makes lead to the development of their personal style, which can evolve throughout their lives as they encounter more music. I believe that the first perspective is related to pressure that Bartók felt to choose a single path and create either authentic folk or the purely art music, and the second perspective reflects the middle ground that composers like Bartók and Stravinsky successfully navigated as discussed in the last chapter. As new technology allows greater access to a variety of musical styles, this phenomenon becomes more apparent because the appropriation of material becomes more diverse and identifiable.

**Folk Music and the New Deal**

In the 1920s and ‘30s, many American composers began to develop a national musical style by incorporating elements of American folk and popular music into their compositions. During that period, radio became the place where a variety of these musical styles could come together. The Federal Government had collected recordings of American folk music traditions during the era of New Deal politics in hopes of “introduc[ing] the country to its many parts and regions.” In 1939, CBS asked Alan Lomax, a folk song collector and anthologist who worked for the Library of Congress, to create twenty-five programs featuring American folk music for the CBS radio program *American School of the Air*, a radio-series that was broadcast into 120,000 classrooms across the country. The library had found an outlet to

---

88 Szwed, 153.
distribute their recordings and educate the public about who they were collectively by exposing them to their individual cultural treasures.89

Although not initially interested in the radio, Lomax became excited to write, host, and perform on the show once he understood how he could use it to reach larger audiences than he was able through localized concerts alone. Although Lomax had hoped to focus solely on folk music, CBS executives also saw an opportunity for the program to serve as a synergy between folk and art traditions and to help educate Americans about the sophistication of art music. John Szwed described CBS’s concept as “the folk supplying the raw material of art, the popular media helping it reach a larger audience, and the serious artists developing and refining it.”90 Although the project seemed to synthesize all three idioms, the result lacked authenticity and Lomax was disappointed by the final product.91

CBS commissioned works from leading composers of the era including Aaron Copland, Roy Harris, William Grant Still, Ferde Grofé, and Ruth Crawford Seeger as well as Seeger’s husband, Charles Seeger, another famous folklorist. Aaron Copland, a highly respected composer at the time, was selected in 1940 to write an orchestral work based on the folk song “John Henry.” The song describes a showdown between John Henry, a former slave and steel-driver that worked for a railroad company, and the steam-powered hammer, representing the advance of technology.

89 Szwed, 152-3.
90 Ibid., 153.
91 Ibid., 154.
The story ends tragically when John Henry, although victorious over the machine, dies of exhaustion. Lomax recounted his collaboration with Aaron Copland:

I recall the day I took all our best field recordings of “John Henry” to one of our top-ranking composers, a very bright and busy man who genuinely thought he liked folk songs. I played him all sorts of variants of “John Henry,” exciting enough to make a modern folk fan climb the walls. But as soon as my singer would finish a stanza or so, the composer would say, “Fine. Now let’s hear the next tune.” It took him about a half-hour to learn all that “John Henry,” our finest ballad, had to say to him, and I departed with my treasured records. Not sure whether I was more impressed by this facility, or angry because he had never really listened to “John Henry.”

When his piece was played on the air, I was unsure no longer. My composer friend had written the tunes down accurately, but his composition spoke for the Paris of Nadia Boulanger, and not for the wild land and the heart-torn people who made the song. The spirit and the emotion of “John Henry” shone nowhere in this score because he had never heard, much less experienced them. And this same pattern held true for all the folk symphonic suites for twenty boring weeks.92

It would not be difficult to imagine Bartók in a similar position, lamenting the composition as it attempted to fuse folk and art music without capturing either the communal spirit of the folk music or the creativity of art music. The lack of authenticity to either the folk or art music traditions left Lomax disappointed in the results of this and the other works commissioned by the composers previously listed.93 It is this kind of disappointment that feeds the viewpoint that works that synthesize a variety of musical styles are less interesting than works that adhere to either a pure art, folk, or popular aesthetic.

---

92 Szwed, 153-4.
93 The commissions included William Grant Still’s Can’tcha line ’em, Amadeo De Filippi’s Raftman’s Dance, Ruth Crawford Seeger’s Rissoty Rossity, as well as other works by Roy Harris, Ferde Grofé, and Charles Seeger.
Interest in the Proletariat

The politics and economic circumstances following the onset of the Great Depression influenced some composers’ desire to connect with those people hit hardest by the harsh realities of the day. Before Charles Seeger became known for his efforts to collect recordings of folk songs for the Library of Congress, he was an art music composer who taught at the University of California at Berkeley. After moving to New York City in 1921, he gradually became an active member of political circles.94 One night in the winter of 1931-32, the composers Henry Cowell, Ruth Crawford Seeger, and Charles Seeger gathered to discuss their “feelings of guilt at being unable to connect their music with the present social catastrophe.”95 Later that year, these types of discussions led them to form the Composers’ Collective, a group of several art musicians united by a common interest in loose Marxist ideals.

The Collective met for four years and had as many as twenty-four members. They succeeded in creating two volumes of *Workers Song Books*, which Copland described as “a powerful weapon against class struggle.”96 Scholar Gayle Murchison points out, however, that Copland and the other composers in the Collective surely understood that there was a chasm between the well-traveled and well-studied composers and the workers, who labored to earn their living. Copland, having reviewed the first volumes, had noted that one of the songs most popular with workers, “The

---

95 Pescatello, 109.
Scottsboro Boys Will Not Die” by L. E. Swift, was not a particularly well-composed work based on classical musical aesthetics. Regarding his own offering to the collection, Copland admitted to Seeger that “Into the Streets May First,” was likely un singable by the workers due to its use of chromatic notes in the melody.97 Seeger and Copland were typical members of the Collective—conservatory trained in the European classical tradition. In the early years of the Collective, its members were unaware of American folk music and instead looked to sources already familiar to them, like The Five from Russia, as models for their own workers’ songs.98 In 1931, Thomas Hart Benton, the American Regionalist painter and amateur harmonica player, approached Seeger to perform a number of popular American folk songs at the dedication of his mural at the New School for Social Research. This partnership between the artist and the composer slowly brought Seeger into the world of folk music and led him to the realization that “here I was an American musician not knowing anything about the music that was going on in the United States except what was going on in the big cities.”99

Upon hearing Aunt Mollie Jackson, a Kentuckian folk singer who often worked with Alan Lomax throughout the years, sing for some of the Collective members, Seeger realized that Jackson was “on the right track and [the members of the Collective] are on the wrong track.”100 Having experienced the communal spirit of folk music, which Bartók was similarly drawn to in a variety of Eastern European folk traditions,

98 Ibid., 17, 182.
99 Ibid., 230.
100 Pescatello, 135.
Seeger understood that he needed to connect with the American folk traditions by going into rural America to learn about them directly rather than meeting in Manhattan to discuss the folk elements of Russian art songs with other composers. Following this realization, Seeger accepted a position in the Resettlement Administration (RA) in 1935 with the intention of using music to help develop cultural ties amongst the families who had been relocated as part of the program to combat rural poverty. Seeger described the communities as “a disparate bunch of families gotten together on good land, shown how to buy good seed, how to fertilize, how to plant, how to harvest, and how to sell cooperatively and meanwhile fight, sometimes disastrously, with their religious beliefs.”

The fighting between families was just one of the many difficulties that Seeger and the others encountered trying to implement this social experiment. The musicians hired to be placed in the communities were professionally trained musicians who had spent their studies learning the classical repertoire, but when they were placed in these communities among the rural families many did not know how to relate to the unfamiliar culture of the farmers. Seeger bemoaned that the musicians were pushing their musical preferences on the people and he said to them that “from [the time you move into a community], you’re a human being ... The first thing for you to do is to find out what music the people can make. Then put that to the uses for which you’re sent to the community — to make the people in that community get

---

101 Pescatello, 137-8.
along.” He encouraged them not to question if the folk music is good music, but rather to question what the music is good for. Seeger implored that:

... if [their music] bids fair to weld the community into more resourceful and democratic action for a better life for themselves, their neighbors and the human race, then it must be conceded to be “good for” that. The chances that it will be found good in technical and stylistic terms will probably be more than fair.

Through his efforts to connect the professionally trained musicians with the members of the RA communities, Seeger gained an appreciation for the value of music outside of a concert hall. These experiences led to a type of musical understanding that was similar to the Germanic movement of Gebrauchsmusik, a term which Paul Nettl coined in 1921 to describe music that served practical social purposes.

Although they had originally set out to use music in thirty-three resettlement communities, their struggles and the changing political climate meant that support for the project dwindled, and by 1937 only a small number of communities had ever been served. Seeger felt that, in Pescatello’s words, “although [their efforts through the RA] might have succeeded at some later time; in the midst of the Depression, people were still more interested in survival than in idealistic notions about engineering new communities and fostering utopian enterprises through the

---

102 Pescatello, 140.
103 Reuss, 233.
arts.” The political realities of the day loomed too large to overcome in their efforts to use music as a means of social engineering.

Although Seeger’s work with the RA was an apparent failure, it provided his first real field experience outside the realm of art music and allowed him to develop and articulate his concept of how music should function in American society. Seeger laid out his understanding of that function in the forward to an article, *Journal of a Field Representative*, by Margaret Valiant, a fellow musician from the RA:

**Ten Principles that Reflect the Function of Music in American Society**

1. Music, like any art, is not an end in itself, but is a means for achieving larger social and economic ends;

2. To make music is the essential thing — listening is only accessory;

3. Music as a group activity is vastly more important than music as an individual accomplishment;

4. Every person is inherently musical, and music can be associated with any human activity;

5. The nation’s musical culture is to be evaluated as to the extent of the participation of the whole population, rather than the virtuosity of a fraction of it;

6. The basis for musical culture is the vernacular of the broad mass of the people — its traditional, often called *folk*, idiom; popular music, such as jazz, and professional, high art music are elaborate superstructures built upon the common base;

7. There is no ground for quarreling between various idioms and styles, provided a proper relationship is maintained — jazz need not be scorned, nor professional art music artificially stimulated, nor folk music stamped out or sentimentalized;

---

105 Pescatello, 150.
106 Ibid., 145-6.
8. The point of departure for any worker new to a community should be the tastes and capacities of the group; and activities introduced should be directed toward developing local leadership rather than encouraging dependence on outside help;

9. The main question is not be [sic] whether music is good, but what music is good for; and if it can help the people become more independent, capable, and democratic, it must be approved;

10. Workers should combine music making with whatever other activities and arts that help to make music serve a well-rounded function in the community.

By creating this list, Seeger acknowledged the same types of social pressures between art and folk traditions that Bartók and Stravinsky experienced, with the addition of the new influence of popular music. Seeger, like Bartók and Stravinsky, appreciated a variety of musical styles from different communities and had experienced the tension that existed between these communities. He believed that music served social and cultural purposes and to that end, it could be used to bring together communities or to define their differences. Along with other artists and composers, like Aaron Copland, Henry Cowell, and Thomas Hart Benton, he was interested not only in folk music, but also in finding ways of bringing the folk and art aesthetics together. In the last decade of his life, at the age of eighty-four, Seeger stated that “folklore and folk music are only temporary bypaths for me and I sometimes rile up a bit when I am referred to as a student of folk music.” Four decades after his work with the RA he wished to define himself as a musicologist
who was interested in all of the music of the world and this list points to his initial
discovery and understanding of how these musical worlds intersect.107

The Connection between Folk and Abstraction in Art and Music

Benton was primarily known as a Regionalist painter and as the teacher of Jackson
Pollock, the famous American painter associated with Abstract Expressionism. As
noted earlier, Benton was also a folk musician of some renown and introduced
Seeger to American folk music.108 Benton’s last mural, The Sources of Country Music,
was commissioned by Nashville’s Country Music Foundation and was completed in
in 1974.109 It includes images of folk musicians and dancers that represent the
diverse origins of country music and measures an impressive six feet tall by ten feet
across. It portrays the communal spirit of the musical tradition through the action
of the scene, which he represents by contorting the bodies of the dancers, fiddlers,
and the choral conductor in unusual ways.110

As a folklorist, Benton was a close friend with both Seeger and Lomax and shared a
similar interest in using folk material in creating serious art. Leo Mazow, an art
historian who has examined the role of music in Benton’s art, notes, “Both [Benton
and Seeger] envisioned folk music as a primary source in the study of American

107 Reuss, 222.
108 Benton spent years studying the harmonica and even developed a special tablature that was
later purchased by Hohner Musical Instruments and is still in use today. For more information
regarding the connection between music and his artwork, see Leo Mazow, Thomas Hart Benton and
109 To view Benton’s The Sources of Country Music, visit
110 Mazow, 111-6.
culture and sought to bridge the gap between vernacular expressions and their public appreciation as legitimate art.”\textsuperscript{111}

Although the realism of folk art may seem unrelated to the otherworldliness of abstract modernism, many artists from these distinct styles are closely related. Jackson Pollock, one of Benton’s most famous pupils, is well known for his modernistic tendencies towards abstraction. Although his abstract works, like \textit{The Moon Woman} from 1942, do not seem to share the same aesthetic as his teacher’s folk murals on the surface, both men seem to have experimented with similar ideas of combining realism and abstraction in the early 1930s.\textsuperscript{112} Comparing Benton’s \textit{Ballad of the Jealous Lover of Lone Green Valley} (1934) with Pollock’s \textit{Going West} (1934-5), one can see both painters mixing realism with abstraction.\textsuperscript{113} The phenomenon of a single artist exploring both folk and abstract styles is not unique to Benton and Pollock. Composers, like Cowell and Copland, often operated in similar circles as the visual artists and experienced with similar aesthetic shifts.

Many consider Cowell an ultra-modernist composer for his groundbreaking piano works like \textit{Dynamic Motion} (1916), which utilizes both tone clusters and the

\textsuperscript{111} Mazow, 10.
\textsuperscript{112} To view Pollock’s \textit{The Moon Woman}, visit http://www.guggenheim.org/new-york/collections/collection-online/artwork/3473.
\textsuperscript{113} To view Benton’s \textit{Ballad of the Jealous Lover of Lone Green Valley}, visit http://collection.spencerart.ku.edu/eMuseumPlus?service=ExternalInterface&module=collection&objectId=9953&viewType=detailView. To view Pollock’s \textit{Going West}, visit http://americanart.si.edu/collections/search/artwork/?id=19820.
sympathetic resonance of open strings, and *The Banshee* (1925) for string piano (see Example 6).\textsuperscript{114}

**Example 6** Henry Cowell’s *Dynamic Motion*, mm. 1 to 18

He performed his music on several European tours in the 1920s and ‘30s, and during the final tour Schoenberg invited him to perform for his composition class in

\textsuperscript{114} A string piano is regular piano played by manipulating the strings rather than the keys.
Berlin. But, like Lomax, Seeger and Copland, Cowell was fascinated with folk music traditions of the United States and many other countries. Concurrent with his international touring as a groundbreaking pianist, he taught classes on Music of the World’s Peoples, and the Guggenheim Foundation awarded him a grant to study comparative musicology in Berlin.\textsuperscript{115} Many of his students developed an interest in a broad range of musical styles, and, although many authors have not included an examination of Cowell’s life and musical output in their narratives of twentieth-century music, he is another representative of a type of composer who draws on a number of musical interests in his compositions.\textsuperscript{116}

The Evolution of Aaron Copland

Copland, who knew Cowell through the Composers Collective, frequently incorporated elements of American popular music into his own art music compositions as a young composer. At the age of twenty he composed a short work for solo piano entitled \textit{Scherzo humoristique in D major “The Cat and The Mouse.”} Although smaller in scope than George Gershwin’s \textit{Rhapsody in Blue}, another work that fuses jazz and classical music from four years later, the works share similar harmonic and rhythmic material that indicate a common source. One can note these similarities by comparing the “Very fast and rhythmic” theme from \textit{Scherzo

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{enumerate}
\item Works that reflect Cowell’s interest in the musical traditions of the world include Celtic Set (1938, Ireland), \textit{Persian Set} (1957, Iran), \textit{Symphony No. 13 “Madras”} (1956-8, India), Ongaku (1957, Japan), and a series of works titled \textit{Hymn and Fuguing Tunes} (1944-64, United States).
\end{enumerate}
\end{footnotesize}
*humoristique* with the “Agitato e misterioso” section of *Rhapsody in Blue* (see Examples 7.1-2).

**Example 7.1** Aaron Copland’s *Scherzo humoristique*, mm. 5 to 8

![Score image](example71.png)

The Cat and the Mouse by Aaron Copland  
© Copyright by The Aaron Copland Fund for Music, Inc. Copyright renewed.  
Boosey & Hawkes, Inc., sole licensee for the USA.  
Reprinted by permission.

**Example 7.2** George Gershwin’s *Rhapsody in Blue*, Rehearsal G to 4 after rehearsal G

![Score image](example72.png)

Copland also used elements of popular music in large-scale works like *Music for the Theatre* from 1925. The opening trumpet and drum set fanfare and the music from rehearsal 5 to 7 captures the essence of Louis Armstrong and early jazz idioms from the early 1920s (see Examples 8.1-2).
Example 8.1 Aaron Copland’s Music for the Theatre, mm. 1 to 1 before rehearsal 2 (brass and percussion only)
Example 8.2 Aaron Copland's *Music for the Theatre*, rehearsal 5 to rehearsal 7 (woodwinds, brass, percussion, and piano only)
Example 8.2 (cont.)

Music for the Theater by Aaron Copland
© Copyright 1932 by The Aaron Copland Fund for Music, Inc. Copyright renewed.
Boosey & Hawkes, Inc. sole licensee.
Reprinted by permission.
During the Depression, when he worked with the Composers’ Collective and joined the social circles of the Seegers, Copland became more interested in folk music and its use in building national identities. In 1938 David Diamond, a composer and friend of Copland, noted that of the few things decorating Copland’s walls he had a Mexican rug, photos of Carlos Chávez and Silvestre Revueltas, and a caricature of Frida Kahlo.\(^{117}\) His fascination for Mexican culture developed during his first visit to Mexico in 1932 where Chávez was conducting a concert exclusively of Copland’s music. The Mexican Revolution was still fresh and the country had a revolutionary spirit that the members of the Composers’ Collective appreciated.\(^{118}\) Copland, describing his satisfaction with the trip, stated that:

> The best is the people—there’s nothing remotely like them in Europe. They are really the ‘people’—nothing in them striving to be bourgeois. In their overalls and bare feet they are not only poetic but positively “émouvant.”\(^{119}\)

This trip had a profound impact on Copland’s life and, as a result, he composed *El Salón México* in the subsequent years.\(^{120}\) The work was his first to utilize folk material and although he did not collect the songs himself, as Bartók would have preferred, the work was inspired by his experience with the Mexican people. Like Stravinsky, he found his material in published collections, specifically *Cancionero*


\(^{118}\) Murchison, 194.

\(^{119}\) Ibid., 192.

\(^{120}\) Aaron Copland. *El Salon Mexico* (New York: Boosey & Hawkes, 1939).
Copland never felt the need to hide his source material as Stravinsky had, likely due to the general interest in folk music of his colleagues that surrounded him at that time.

*El Salón Mexico* marked the beginning of a new period of composition in Copland’s life that included several works based on folklore and songs from the United States, especially a series of three ballets from the late 1930s and early ‘40s. Although he does not quote any specific folk songs in *Billy the Kid* (1938), he sets his music to an American folk story that was quite popular at the time. His ballet *Rodeo* (1942), like *El Salón Mexico*, utilizes American folk songs, including the fiddle tune “Bonyparte,” which comes from Alan Lomax’s collection *Our Singing Country*.122 *Appalachian Spring* (1944), a commission from the Martha Graham Dance Company, features the now famous Quaker song “Simple Gifts” as the basis of one of the later scenes.

Copland uses folk song as the theme for a set of variations beginning with a simple statement of the tune by the clarinet at rehearsal 55. The third variation concludes with a more complex contrapuntal treatment of the tune at rehearsal 60. The staggered entrances create a sense of mounting excitement and energy. In this example, Copland is manipulating the folk material through compositional techniques more often associated with music from the Classical Era. Although he does not deconstruct the themes in the manner of Stravinsky’s *Le sacre du printemps*, he found a successful way of incorporating folk material into art music with greater

---

121 Murchison, 195; Rubén Campos, *El folklore musical de las ciudades* (Mexico: Secretaría de Educación Pública, 1930); and Frances Toor, *Cancionero Mexicano* (Mexico: Mexican Folkways, 1931).

success than he had earlier with *John Henry*, the orchestral suite which he composed in 1939 for Lomax's radio show.

In the late 1930s, many of his friends, including the composer David Diamond, felt disappointed that Copland had abandoned serious music in favor of a more populist style, particularly his film music. In 1939, Diamond wrote to Copland, concerned about his recent accessible music:

> I am just a bit dazed about your choice of direction, but I feel terribly sure the aesthetic is as strong as it always was. Knowing that you understand my tastes so well, I am assured that you are not too concerned about my opinions of your recent scores. I know that the future output is going to be very fine, and rich and full of the qualities I love so in your music. Being the honest, real human being you are, you'll never disappoint me. By having sold out to the mongrel commercialists half-way already, the danger is going to be wider for you, and I beg you dear Aaron, don't sell out yet,—hang on to a more vital, inventive, and more creative impulse when it comes. Don't let it go out so easily when the tasks are set before you. I've understood all you've done from the financial point of view, and I trust you'll be able to relax a great while now. If my words seem as incoherent as you always think they do when I get on such ravings, it's simply that where I've thought of the deeper and more profound results, you've scanned the surface for your solution and that's why I never feel I have to explain my words. For I feel your feeling for surface attractiveness is only temporary, and I hope I'm around to see that wonderful day you are really acknowledged for your intrinsic worths.\(^\text{123}\)

Four years later, while Copland was working on another film score, Diamond wrote again imploring him to compose another serious work:

> Everyone keeps saying, why doesn't Aaron write a symphony when he's capable of getting such wonderful ideas down . . . make lots of

money, come back and write a wonderful large orchestra work and show people that you can pull it off.\textsuperscript{124}

But while his friend were concerned about the direction of his creative output, Copland seemed to be in control:

I knew what my friends did not, that I was composing during the waiting-around periods on the film production, that I was collecting ideas for a ballet for Martha Graham and for a large work, either a piano concerto or a symphony.\textsuperscript{125}

From these statements, it is clear that Diamond and others believe in the importance of serious music and are concerned that Copland’s output from this era does not live up to its standards. While they are concerned, Copland’s comment seems to reflect a man in control and one who knows for whom he is writing. He viewed his work on \textit{Appalachian Spring} and the work that would presumably become the \textit{Third Symphony} as a projects that were worthy to be defined as serious music. As we have already seen, \textit{Appalachian Spring} is a work that included folk elements and the \textit{Third Symphony} will stand as his largest, most serious composition from this period that blends folk elements with European musical aesthetics.

Elizabeth Crist notes in her examination of the compositional process of the \textit{Third Symphony} that:

\begin{quote}
Copland knew as early as 1940 that he needed to write a major concert work in the simplified manner of his functional scores from the late 1930s if he were to prove the aesthetic viability of his new...
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{124} Crist, 379.
\textsuperscript{125} Ibid., 380.
style and rehabilitate his reputation with those composers suspicious of his functional scores.¹²⁶

Rather than shying away from the influence of folk music, he embraces it within the context of the symphony, a European form, rich with history and importance. Unlike the modified symphonic forms commonly used by composers like Jean Sibelius, whose Symphony No. 7 is a single-movement work, or Roy Harris, who had more recently completed his Folk Song Symphony, a seven-movement work scored for chorus and orchestra, Copland’s Third Symphony is a work in the traditional four-movement form of a Classical or Romantic Era symphony.

As Crist notes, Copland began sketching the themes for the symphony in 1940 around the time he was working on a film score for Our Town and on John Henry, the work for radio that Lomax feel unsuccessfully combines the elements of folk and art music.¹²⁷ He continued working on other projects—including Lincoln Portrait, his ballet Rodeo, and his very popular Fanfare for the Common Man—while he composed the symphony over the six-year period leading to its premiere in 1946.

Fanfare for the Common Man was one of eighteen fanfares that were commissioned for the Cincinnati Symphony Orchestra as an artistic contribution to the war effort and was later incorporated into the opening of the final movement of his symphony.¹²⁸ Other fanfares commissioned for this project included A Fanfare for the Fighting French by Walter Piston, A Fanfare for Paratroopers by Paul Creston,

¹²⁶ Crist, 402.
¹²⁷ Ibid., 382. See page 47.
¹²⁸ Pollack, Aaron Copland, 360.
and the *Fanfare for the Signal Corps* by Howard Hanson. The title of Copland’s work was clearly connected to the other fanfares in the series and was specifically inspired by a speech entitled “Century of a Common Man” given by Vice-President Henry Wallace as the United States entered the war in 1942.\(^{129}\) Through this reference, it became associated with the growing patriotism in the United States during the time of the Second World War.

The music from *Fanfare for the Common Man* is featured predominantly in the final movement of the symphony and its extra-musical associations become interconnected with the larger work. The fanfare theme is first presented by the woodwinds in a hymn-like texture, alluding to the influence of Protestant culture in the United States (see Example 9.1).

**Example 9.1** Aaron Copland’s *Third Symphony*, IV. Molto deliberato (freely at first), mm. 1 to 6 (woodwinds only)

Third Symphony by Aaron Copland
Reprinted by Permission.

Following the woodwind statement of the music from rehearsal 85 through 88, the *Fanfare for the Common Man* is presented in its original form featuring the brass and percussion sections (see Example 9.2).

**Example 9.2** Aaron Copland’s *Third Symphony*, IV. Molto deliberato (freely at first), Rehearsal 85 to rehearsal 86 (brass and percussion only)
The symphony concludes with the sounds of percussionists using hammers to pound anvils, referencing the story of *John Henry* and the importance of both the railroad and the spirit of the workers upon which the country was built (see Examples 10.1-2).

**Example 10.1** Aaron Copland’s *Third Symphony*, IV. Molto deliberato (freely at first), Rehearsal 127 to four after rehearsal 127 (percussion only)

[Diagram of the passage from the Third Symphony by Aaron Copland]

*Third Symphony by Aaron Copland
© Copyright 1947 by The Aaron Copland Fund for Music, Inc. Copyright renewed.
Boosey & Hawkes, Inc., sole licensee.
Reprinted by Permission.*

**Example 10.2** Aaron Copland’s *John Henry*, Rehearsal 127 to four after rehearsal 127 (strings and percussion only)

[Diagram of the passage from John Henry]

*John Henry by Aaron Copland
© Copyright 1953 by The Aaron Copland Fund for Music, Inc. Copyright renewed.
Boosey & Hawkes, Inc., sole licensee.
Reprinted by permission.*
In addition to the folk references found in the final movement of the symphony, the theme that appears in the trio of the second movement also appears to have folk origins. This theme derives from one of the melodies that Copland originally sketched for *Appalachian Spring* but never used in the ballet; thus, it predates the premiere of the symphony by six years. The melody from the symphony was described as having “remote suggestions of a leisurely, carefree cowboy tune,” likely due to its use of the pentatonic mode common in American folk music, and only varies slightly from the original sketch (see Example 11.1-2).\(^{130}\)

**Example 11.1** Aaron Copland’s *Third Symphony*, II. Allegro molto \( (J=108) \), Rehearsal 37 to rehearsal 38 (oboe only)

---

\(^{130}\) Crist, 385.
Example 11.2 Version Comparison of the Theme from Aaron Copland's Third Symphony, II. Allegro molto ($=108$), Rehearsal 37

The Third Symphony, which lasts roughly forty minutes, is of the same grand scope as Benton's mural The Sources of Country Music and represents a culmination of Copland's effort to forge a middle ground between art and folk material. Copland's musical aesthetic is shaped by the politics of the New Deal and the overt patriotism of the Second World War and, although he felt pressure to move away from his populist style and compose what was considered more serious music, he found a way to combine his interest in audience appeal with his passion for art music.

The efforts of Lomax, Seeger, and Copland to connect with a wider audience often resulted in the same stigma that Bartók and Stravinsky experienced as they

---

131 Sketch quoted from Crist, 386.
incorporated folk elements into their compositions. That being said, it is not accurate to imply that modernist and popular aesthetics were exclusive of one another, as some may insinuate. As evidenced in the work of Copland, Benton, and Pollock, one can see how many composers and visual artists of the time strove to combine elements of each into their work in a meaningful way. As we will see in the next chapter, composers more closely associated with popular music, like Duke Ellington, George Gershwin, and Gil Evans, often made a similar effort and experienced a similar push back. The collective effort of all of these musicians to bridge this imaginary divide and bring seemingly contrasting aesthetics together contributed to the eventual rise of post-modernism, the musical environment in which Golijov was raised.
Chapter Three -
The Library Card

Rock ‘n’ Roll is the most raucous form of jazz, beyond a doubt; it maintains a link with the folk origins, and I believe that no other form of jazz has ever been accepted so enthusiastically by so many.132

- Duke Ellington in the article “Where is Jazz Going” (1962)

The influx of outside influence on any given style of art, popular, or folk music creates an ever-evolving definition of the characteristics of that style. In the epigraph of this chapter, Duke Ellington, arguably one of the greatest jazz musicians of the twentieth century, acknowledges this evolution when he defines the term jazz broadly by noting the connection between swing music and rock and roll while implying that jazz is simply a term to denote popular music. Defining the term jazz—or for that matter classical, folk, or popular—is subjective and therefore leads to a number of competing definitions. For some, especially those who value authenticity and stylistic purity, Ellington’s inclusive definition may not satisfy. But for popular music composers like Ellington, Gershwin, and Evans, who each have combined elements of various traditions in inventive ways, a broad definition like this was freeing, even if it also provoked the type of censure experienced by Bartók, Stravinsky, and Copland. By widening one’s view to include works from the popular tradition that fuse elements of different styles, one can gain a greater appreciation of the popular music elements in Golijov’s style. In the case of Ayre, where he includes both folk songs and electronic instruments into his otherwise classically structured song cycle, this type of comparison will lead to interesting discoveries.

Ellington’s Appropriation of European Musical Traits

Manhattan, the densely populated island at the center of New York City, is home to a racially and culturally diverse population. In the early part of the twentieth century, many African-Americans moved onto the island as part of a larger movement known as the Great Migration, in which approximate 1.6 million African-Americans moved from the rural South to portions of the North East and the Midwest. This influx of new residents coincided with the rise in popularity of swing bands and the Harlem Renaissance in the 1920s. It was here that one could experience a great variety of musical styles within blocks of each other. The Cotton Club, where Ellington’s band began to play in 1927, was within ninety blocks of Carnegie Hall. This close proximity meant that musicians and audiences, who were often segregated during the first half of the century, were peripherally aware of the latest trends in both worlds.

The boundaries between classical music and jazz often blurred and occasionally led to spirited discussions regarding the essence of both styles. John Hammond, an established jazz critic at the time, responded to Duke Ellington’s premiere performance at Carnegie Hall on January 23, 1943 in the magazine Jazz with an article entitled “Is the Duke Deserting Jazz?”. Hammond expressed his concern that Ellington had abandoned the traditions of jazz in favor of a classical aesthetic in his latest work, Black, Brown, and Beige by saying:

133 For more information regarding the Great Migration, see Eric Arnesen, Black Protest and the Great Migration: A Brief History with Documents (Boston: Bedford/St. Martin’s Press, 2003).
134 For more information regarding the Harlem Renaissance, see Nathan Huggins, Harlem Renaissance (New York: Oxford Press, 1971).
'Black, Brown, and Beige,' Duke's panorama of Negro life in America, sprawls along for more than three quarters of an hour. In it are many exciting ideas, some penetrating wit, and several marvelous tunes, but all are lost in the shuffle because they are not woven together into a cohesive whole. In was unfortunate that Duke saw fit to tamper with the blues form in order to produce music of greater ‘significance.’

He sums up his point by stating:

The conclusion that one can draw from this concert is that Duke is dissatisfied with dance music as a medium for expression and is trying to achieve something of greater significance. No one can justly criticize him for this approach if he keeps up the quality of his music for dancing. My feeling is that by becoming more complex he has robbed jazz of most of its basic virtue and lost contact with his audience.

This was not the first time that Hammond had weighed in on Ellington’s evolving style. Eight years earlier, he had written another article entitled “The Tragedy of Duke Ellington,” which noted that, having received praise from a number of European classical composers, Ellington “felt it necessary to go out and prove that he could write really important music, far removed from the simplicity and charm of his earlier tunes.” The offending composition at that time was Ellington’s Reminiscing in Tempo. Lasting thirteen minutes and filling four sides of a record, it was much longer than Ellington’s more popular dance hits like East St. Louis Toodle-Oo, which typically filled only a single side of a record. Spike Hughes, another critic who had formerly supported Ellington’s work, called Reminiscing in Tempo a “long, rambling monstrosity” and threatened to stop reviewing his music “until Duke

135 Tucker, 172.
136 Ibid., 173.
137 Ibid.
realizes it is not ‘smart’ to write this sort of music.” But Ellington’s purpose was not to compose another dance hit; rather, he composed *Reminiscing in Tempo*, a melancholic eulogy, in response to the death of his mother. It is stunning that even critics who generally championed Ellington’s music, like Hughes, did not feel that it was appropriate for Ellington to experiment in longer forms more commonly found in classical music for his emotionally important works.

It is impossible to ignore that a primary reason for their concern may have been driven by race. In the same article that Hammond wrote off *Reminiscing in Tempo*, he praised Ellington as “probably the most gifted and talented” native popular composers, but continued by saying, “[u]nlike so many of his contemporaries, Ellington is a hard-working, ambitious individual”—a backhanded compliment, praising Ellington while implying that African-Americans jazz musicians had generally poor work ethics. The comments by Hammond and Hughes implying that Ellington should remain in his established place in society, in Harlem composing dance tunes and out of Carnegie Hall, seem to evoke racial undertones.

Bob Thiele, an editor with the magazine, responded to Hammond’s latter article “Is the Duke Deserting Jazz?” by discussing the essence of jazz:

> Jazz music springs from folk music and still contains many of its qualities. It is spontaneous, full of improvisation. It is music that springs from the *soul* of musicians. It represents America: Negro spirituals, marches, Tin Pan Alley. It is living American music. It is

---

138 Tucker, 118.
139 Ibid., 118.
140 Ibid., 119.
hard music, beat out for hard dancing. It is free music. It is comparatively new and different. It is rough and exciting.

I feel that jazz must always contain many if not all, of these fundamentals or it is not real jazz.¹⁴¹

Thiele’s concern for the authenticity of a particular musical idiom echoes others discussed in earlier chapters, but is this concern necessary or even helpful? Does Ellington’s inclusion of rock and roll as a type of jazz match Thiele’s understanding of jazz? What do we gain by categorizing music into distinct, authentic idioms?

Ironically, although he considers jazz “living American music” and notes a number of musical styles which were appropriated to create what was known as jazz at the time, he seems content to limit the evolution and the growth to what knows is jazz at that moment and no longer accept new influences into the genre.

While discussing the essential qualities of jazz, Thiele defines it along racial lines by incorporating both the influence of Negro spirituals and the music of Tin Pan Alley, which was dominated by composers like Irving Berlin and George and Ira Gershwin, who each had direct ties to the Russian Jewish immigrant community. Edgar Varèse, a modernist composer of the time, was less gracious in describing the racial implication of jazz as “a negro product, exploited by the Jews.”¹⁴²

Leonard Feather, a jazz pianist and music journalist, in another rebuttal to Hammond’s 1943 article stated “it is a dirty rotten, lowdown no-good shame that somebody like John Hammond, who had done so much to eliminate race prejudice in

¹⁴¹ Tucker, 177.
music, should be so completely befuddled by personal prejudices himself.”¹⁴³ Were some of the commentators in Jazz, who were all clearly fans of jazz music, simply questioning whether Ellington had abandoned jazz or were they implicating that he had crossed racial barriers, raising concern that the social function of his music had changed from dance music to music for a concert hall?

**Gershwin’s Appropriation of African-American Musical Traits**

Concerns of blending jazz and classical aesthetics were voiced against white composers as well. Following the premiere of Gershwin’s *Porgy and Bess*, an article in the magazine *New Theater* written by Edward Morrow claimed to contain Ellington’s reaction to Gershwin’s use of an African-American subject for his opera. An elegant and kind man by nature, the representation of Ellington in the article is strikingly different from other sources. In the article, Ellington is portrayed as deriding Gershwin’s free use of Negro music (both in *Porgy and Bess* and Gershwin’s earlier *Rhapsody in Blue*) and expressing disappointment in the effectiveness of the opera.¹⁴⁴ On behalf of Ellington, Richard Mack responded to Morrow’s claim. He noted that Ellington had felt that “though grand, *Porgy and Bess* was not distinctly or definitely negroid in character.”¹⁴⁵ Although this statement is not radiantly glowing, it does not resemble the negativity of Morrow’s depiction of Ellington, and Mack goes on to claim that Morrow “proceeded to add pet notions of his own and credited them to Duke, finally appearing with a so-called statement by Ellington

---

¹⁴³ Tucker, 174.
¹⁴⁴ Ibid., 114-7.
¹⁴⁵ Ibid., 117-8.
accusing Gershwin of being everything from a bad musician to an obvious plagiarist."¹⁴⁶ It is impossible to corroborate the account in the initial article, but, regardless of its authenticity, the notions raised in Morrow’s article underscore the delicate balance of relationships between the white and black communities in New York City at the time.

_Porgy and Bess_ is not only an interesting case study in racial issues, as a work composed by a white composer utilizing African-American themes and music, but it is also an interesting study of a composer who is generally known for his popular tunes and Broadway musicals experimenting with operatic scope and style. Fusing these styles was not a new concept, as Paul Whiteman, a violist and bandleader, had previously led an effort to combine jazz and classical aesthetics in a series of commissions for the project “An Experiment in Modern Music.”¹⁴⁷ Gershwin’s _Rhapsody in Blue_, a concerto for piano and expanded jazz band¹⁴⁸ was the most successful work to come from the project. Gershwin would continue to work on fusion works like _Concerto in F_ (1925), _An American in Paris_ (1928), _Second Rhapsody_ (1931), and _Cuban Overture_ (1932) concurrently with his popular works...

---

¹⁴⁶ Ibid., 118.
¹⁴⁸ The orchestration of the work relied heavily on the multi-instrumental abilities of Whiteman’s band members. Gershwin provided Grofé with an orchestral sketch and a two-piano version and Grofé completed the orchestration based on the abilities of individual band members, many of whom had previously worked for major symphony orchestras and had been lured away by Whiteman’s ability to compensate them well above the typical pay for an orchestral musician. The original orchestration of _Rhapsody in Blue_ reflects the hybrid style of, what some term, Symphonic Jazz. For more information regarding Gershwin’s _Rhapsody in Blue_, see Pollack, _George Gershwin_, 294-315.
for musical theater including *Strike Up the Band* (1927), *Show Girl* (1929), *Girl Crazy* (1930), and *Of Thee I Sing* (1931).

Although at the time he was most well regarded for his works for musical theater, Gershwin had long been affiliated with the classical community and was exposed to composers like Claude Debussy, Maurice Ravel, and Arnold Schoenberg through his early teachers Charles Hambitzer and Edward Kilenyi. In fact, it was Kilenyi who encouraged Gershwin to pursue popular music rather than classical composition so that he could reach a broader audience.\(^{149}\) Ira Gershwin, his brother, described that:

... from the age of 13 or 14 [George] never let up in his studies of so-called classical foundations and that by the time he was 30 or so could be considered a musicologist (dreadful word) of the first degree besides being a composer.\(^ {150}\)

Gershwin's interest in classical music remained strong and he was known to have attended many concerts—including a recital by the mezzo-soprano Eva Gauthier of songs by Ravel and Stravinsky in 1922 and the American premiere of Schoenberg's *Pierrot Lunaire* in 1923.\(^ {151}\) He first met Ravel while attended a party in 1928 that Gauthier hosted to celebrate Ravel's fifty-third birthday. That same year, he traveled to Europe where he met with Ravel, Stravinsky, Boulanger, and Alban Berg.\(^ {152}\) In fact throughout his life, Gershwin made attempts to study with several

\( ^{149}\) Ross, 144.

\( ^{150}\) Pollack, *George Gershwin* 135.

\( ^{151}\) Ross, 145.

well-known musicians including Ravel, Boulanger, Stravinsky, Cowell, Jacques Ibert, Edgar Varèse, Alexander Glazunov, and Schoenberg.  

During his trip to Europe in 1928, Gershwin visited Berg in his home. Having recently heard Berg’s piano sonata, he seemed hesitant to perform for the Austrian composer when asked, but Berg insisted by saying, “Music is music.” His time with Berg seems to have left a great impression on him as he studied the scores of both Berg’s Lyric Suite and his opera Wozzeck.

Having composed Rhapsody in Blue and several other works, Gershwin surely understood Berg’s truism, but the synthesis of styles would grow stronger in Porgy and Bess. In discussing the opera, Nikolaus Harnoncourt, a conductor famous for recordings that utilize period-performance practice, presumed that it was actually Gershwin who encouraged Stokowski to give the American premiere of Wozzeck in Philadelphia in 1931, which Gershwin was in attendance. Although Porgy and Bess and Wozzeck utilize very different musical languages, the musicologists Allen Forte and Christopher Reynolds convincingly draw parallels between the operas in their respective articles “Reflections upon the Gershwin-Berg Connection” and “Porgy and Bess: ‘An American Wozzeck.’” These similarities, taken together with Gershwin’s own description of Porgy and Bess as a “cross between [Richard

---

153 Pollack, George Gershwin, 118-123 and 135.
154 Ibid., 144-5.
155 Gershwin, liner notes to Porgy & Bess, 10.
Wagner’s] *Meistersinger* and [Giacomo Puccini’s] *Madama Butterfly*,\(^{157}\) clearly show that Gershwin viewed his work as an outgrowth of the operatic traditions.

Regardless, *Porgy and Bess* seemed to defy categorization from critics, who often debated whether it was an opera, a folk opera, or a musical.\(^{158}\) In describing the research that went into determining his musical interpretation for his 2009 recording of *Porgy and Bess*, Harnoncourt identifies possible reasons why most performances of *Porgy and Bess* did not convince the audience that it belonged to the operatic tradition. In Harnoncourt’s opinion, Alexander Smallens, the conductor of the premiere and subsequent performances after Gershwin’s death, “found the work too long and arguably too ‘operatic.’”\(^{159}\) In an effort to eliminate the elements of opera, Smallens cut passages and whole numbers, reorchestrated the work, and replaced Gershwin’s tempo indications with faster, more upbeat tempo markings posthumously. The cuts he made were generally accepted until 1976 when the Cleveland Orchestra and the Houston Grand Opera both performed the complete score, which reinstated its operatic scope and broadened its appeal as an authentic opera.\(^{160}\) Even so, many of Smallens’ faster tempi continue as part of the accepted performance practice of the work. For example, although Gershwin marks the

\(^{157}\) Reynolds, 2.

\(^{158}\) Ross, 149.

\(^{159}\) Gershwin, liner notes to *Porgy & Bess*, 11.

\(^{160}\) Ibid.
introduction at \( \mathcal{J}=112 \), most conductors choose a tempo within a range of \( \mathcal{J}=132-144 \) (see Table 4 and compare with Example 12).\(^{161}\)

**Table 4** George Gershwin's *Porgy and Bess* (Introduction tempo)\(^{162}\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Conductor</th>
<th>Orchestra</th>
<th>Tempo</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1963</td>
<td>Henderson</td>
<td>RCA Victor Orchestra</td>
<td>( \mathcal{J}=136 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1975</td>
<td>Maazel</td>
<td>Cleveland Orchestra</td>
<td>( \mathcal{J}=132 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1978</td>
<td>Ormandy</td>
<td>Philadelphia Orchestra</td>
<td>( \mathcal{J}=132 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988</td>
<td>Dutoit</td>
<td>Orchestre Symphonique de Montréal</td>
<td>( \mathcal{J}=138 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989</td>
<td>Rattle</td>
<td>London Philharmonic Orchestra</td>
<td>( \mathcal{J}=144 )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009</td>
<td>Harnoncourt</td>
<td>Chamber Orchestra of Europe</td>
<td>( \mathcal{J}=114 )</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{161}\) The debate regarding whether *Porgy and Bess* should be conceived of as either a musical or an opera continues today. Three years after Harnoncourt’s operatic interpretation of the work a new version directed by Diane Paulus known as "The Gershwins’ Porgy and Bess" premiered on Broadway. The Paulus version is described as a musical adaptation for contemporary audiences and cuts the original four-hour opera down to a two-and-a-half-hour musical. For more information, see Hilton Als, “A Man and a Woman: ‘Porgy and Bess’ Reimagined,” *New Yorker*, 26 September 2011. http://www.newyorker.com/arts/critics/atlarge/2011/09/26/110926crat_atlarge_als?currentPage=all (accessed August 10, 2013).

**Example 12** George Gershwin’s *Porgy and Bess*, Introduction, mm. 1 to 7 (piano reduction)

Taken together, the stories surrounding the critical reception and classification of Ellington’s *Black, Brown, and Beige* and *Reminiscing in Tempo* as well as Gershwin’s *Rhapsody in Blue* and *Porgy and Bess*, all works from the 1920’s and 30’s, suggest that some found it difficult to accept these works as a synthesis of multiple musical styles. Whether for reasons of taste or other larger racial or social concerns, these compositions struggled to gain a critical acceptance on par with more stylistically pure works, such as Ellington’s *East St. Louis Toodle-Oo* or Gershwin’s *Of Thee I Sing*. Clearly the stigma that had dogged Bartók’s and Stravinsky’s efforts to combine folk and high art idioms, as discussed in chapter one, was still in place.
The Cool Canadian

Little had changed by the time that Gil Evans and Miles Davis began to work together in the 1950s and ‘60s. Evans, a Caucasian pianist and arranger from Toronto, and Davis, a African-American trumpet player from East St. Louis, made for an unusual pairing. Davis described his initial impression of Evans’ out-of-place style:

He’d come in with a whole bag of ‘horseradishes’ — that’s what we used to call radishes — that he’d be eating with salt. Here was this tall, thin, white guy from Canada who was hipper than hip. I mean, I didn’t know any white people like him. I was used to black folks back in East St. Louis walking into places with a bag full of barbecued pig snout sandwiches and taking them out and eating them right there, right in a movie or club or anywhere. But bringing ‘horseradishes’ to nightclubs and eating them out of a bag with salt, and a white boy? Here was Gil on 52nd Street with all these super hip black musicians wearing peg legs and zoot suits, and here he was dressed in a cap. Man, he was something else.163

Their relationship was as much a cultural fusion as their musical partnership would later become. Despite their differences, these two men developed a strong relationship based on a deep respect for each other’s musical personality and worked together on a number of albums in a style of post-bebop jazz known commonly as Third Stream jazz, which blends aspects of swing and bebop with classical aesthetics.

Gunther Schuller, who played French horn with the Metropolitan Opera Orchestra and was a sideman on the album Birth of Cool with Evans and Davis, coined the term

---

Third Stream in an effort to distinguish the fusion of classical and jazz traditions from the established traditions. In an article in 1961 defining term as “a new genre of music located about halfway between jazz and classical music,”¹⁶⁴ Schuller stated:

I felt that by designating this music as a separate, third stream, the two other mainstreams could go their way unaffected by the attempts at fusion. I had hoped that in this way the old prejudices, old worries about the purity of the two main streams that have greeted attempts to bring jazz and ‘classical’ music together could, for once, be avoided.¹⁶⁵

In this statement, Schuller is fully aware of what he describes as “prejudice” and “worry” about the authenticity of musical traditions. He established the term to shield him from puritanical attacks on his music, like Seven Studies on Themes of Paul Klee, which fuses elements of the two styles of music that he admires. Schuller describes the act of fusing the classical and jazz traditions as:

... simply exercising my prerogative as a creative artist to draw upon those experiences in my life as a musician that have a vital meaning for me. It is inevitable that the creative individual will in some way reflect in his creative activity that which he loves, respects, and understands; my concern, therefore, is precisely to preserve as much of the essence of both elements as is possible.¹⁶⁶

As we have already seen, composers like Bartók or Copland could have easily uttered these words in response to public pressure to adhere to authenticity of tradition over appropriation of diverse musical styles.

¹⁶⁵ Schuller, 115.
¹⁶⁶ Ibid., 116.
The development of this style of music was made possible by the political realities of the 1940s, which created a more integrated atmosphere in the jazz scene in New York. According to Max Roach, a leading drummer in the bebop movement, although white audiences would come to Harlem to hear jazz, there were few white musicians who would come to play before 1941. That summer, President Roosevelt had issued an executive order banning racial discrimination in defense and government industries in response to a movement protesting pay inequity between white and black workers in war-related factory jobs. The executive order led to increased racial tension, and the white audiences in Harlem dwindled. In an effort to keep paying gigs, the black musicians found new venues in Greenwich Village and ultimately along 52nd Street at clubs like the Half Note, the Onyx Club, and Three Deuces.167 It was in this neighborhood that white jazz musicians, like Claude Thornhill and Gil Evans, would begin to interact with black musicians and classical musicians, like Leonard Bernstein, Stravinsky, and Schuller, would come to experience the sounds of bebop.168

Tax policy also affected the jazz scene in New York City. A twenty percent entertainment tax was levied on any venue that featured singers or dancers so there was an incentive for clubs to move away from the swing bands, like Ellington's or Benny Goodman's orchestras, to smaller instrumental groups like those that were beginning the bebop movement around the same time. Without dancing, the audience was then expected to sit and listen and therefore the music fundamentally

168 Ibid., 32 and 42.
changed. Bebop developed when soloists like saxophonist Charlie Parker and trumpeter Dizzy Gillespie began to perform more technically intricate and complex music intended for the attentive audiences that developed as a result of the tax hike, while big bands diminished in number.\textsuperscript{169}

Thornhill, who had worked with Goodman, Whiteman, and, Glenn Miller, formed his own band in 1939.\textsuperscript{170} This band was unique among the dance bands at the time for its use of timbres generally associated with orchestral music. In addition to the standard instrumentation of a big band, his saxophonists were each expected to double on clarinet and the brass section included two French horns. They often performed orchestral arrangements of classical works, like Johannes Brahms' *Hungarian Dance No. 5*, as dance numbers.\textsuperscript{171}

Evans joined the band in 1941 when Thornhill brought him to New York City after Evans' tenure as an arranger for a band in Stockton, California.\textsuperscript{172} He later moved into an apartment on 55\textsuperscript{th} Street in 1947, which would become a place where many beboppers and arrangers would come together to meet and discuss their ideas on music, including arrangers Gerry Mulligan, John Carisi, and George Russell as well as

\textsuperscript{169} Hicock, 32.
\textsuperscript{170} Ibid., 19.
\textsuperscript{171} Ibid., 21.
\textsuperscript{172} Ibid.
musicians like Parker and Davis.\textsuperscript{173} Describing the importance of Evans’ apartment, Carisi stated that:

It was a marvelous crash place. He was very relaxed about guys coming in—been up for X days, and saying, "Hey Gil, man, can I take a nap?” “Sure, man.” People had different reasons to hang out there. Gerry and myself and George Russell, to some extent we were there because we were picking Gil’s brains. At that point he was getting scores from the New York Public Library, records and scores, and studying the twentieth-century composers, seeing how they did things. So through him, we all had kind of got on to that. He was one of the first guys I knew that had a library card for that reason alone, to get to go to the music library. You could get anything, right up to the latest recordings of Bartók, and Stravinsky, and all the classics, like Beethoven. He really opened our ears to all kinds of things.\textsuperscript{174}

These arranger-composers worked closely with Parker and Davis to create innovative albums like Parker’s \textit{Charlie Parker with Strings} (1949) and Davis’ \textit{The Birth of Cool} (1957). \textit{The Birth of Cool} was the first of many successful collaborations between Davis and Evans.

Their relationship dates back to the year Evans had first moved into his 55\textsuperscript{th} Street apartment. Davis later described one of their early interactions:

[Gil] was asking for a release on my tune “Donna Lee.” He wanted to make an arrangement for a government electrical transcription of it. I told him he could have it and asked him to teach me some chords and let me study some of the scores he was doing for Claude Thornhill. He

\textsuperscript{173} Hicock, 52. Russell taught music theory at NEC and created the Lydian Concept of Tonal Organization, which was the basis for modal jazz and Miles Davis’ album \textit{Kind of Blue}. For more information, see www.lydianchromaticconcept.com.

\textsuperscript{174} Hicock.
really flipped me on the arrangement of "Robbins Nest" he did for Claude.175

Stephanie Crease, in her biography of Evans, notes the importance of this exchange. "Robbins Nest" was not a typical bebop tune, with a less frantic melody and slower-paced harmonic movement. Along with Evans’ tightly voiced harmonies, these attributes became some of the trademarks of the collaborations between Davis and Evans over the next decade.176

Following The Birth of Cool came a successful series of albums created by Davis and Evans including Miles Ahead (1957), Porgy and Bess (1959), and Sketches of Spain (1960). The later two recordings are of particular note due to their reliance on classical and folk music as inspiration. Davis and Evans’ Porgy and Bess album was notable because the opera had yet to be revived and was not generally popular aside from the hit song “Summertime,” which had been covered by Billie Holiday in 1936 as well as Louis Armstrong and Ella Fitzgerald in 1957. The album was an effort to tap into the narrative and musical pathos of Gershwin’s original and was not merely a series of arrangements of Gershwin’s best tunes. The album is conceived of as a whole and Evans freely adapts, borrows, and reorders Gershwin’s music to tell a version of the story unique from Gershwin’s original.177

In the album Sketches of Spain, these stylistic fusions become even more diverse and there was no need for Evans to hide his source material because adaptation is an

175 Crease, 152.
176 Ibid.
177 Ibid., 199.
accepted part of the jazz tradition. Evans identifies the source of each work in the
narrative that lined the back of the LP of the original release (see Table 5).

**Table 5 Source Material for Each Track on the Album Sketches of Spain**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Track</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Influence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Concierto de Aranjuez</td>
<td>*Concierto de Aranjuez, II. Adagio by Joaquin Rodrigo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Will o’ the Wisp</td>
<td>*El Amor Brujo by Manuel de Falla</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The Pan Piper</td>
<td>From a folk recording of José Maria Rodriguez playing panpipe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Saeta</td>
<td>A style of religious music associated with Spanish flamenco music, often sung during Holy Week in Andalusia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Solea</td>
<td>A specific form of flamenco music related to the sense of loneliness, follows a particular metric pattern of weak and strong beats</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>*</td>
<td>Song of Our Country†</td>
<td>*Bachianos Brazileiros No. 2, II. Aria “O canto da nossa terra” by Hector Villa-Lobos††</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These tracks rely on material from three types of sources. *Concierto de Aranjuez, Will o’ the Wisp, and Song of Our Country* are all fairly straightforward adaptations of orchestral works substituting Davis for the primary melodic material. The *Pan Piper* was based on a folk recording that Lomax had collected while in Galicia, Spain in

---


††† Although “Song of Our Country” was recorded during the Sketches of Spain sessions, it was not released until 20 years later on the album *Directions*, which was a compilation of previously unreleased material.

†° Villa-Lobos was not credited when the song was released in 1981, possibly because it was released separately from the other material from the recording session.
1952.\textsuperscript{181} \textit{Saeta} and \textit{Solea} are both based on specific forms of flamenco music found in Andalusia, Spain.\textsuperscript{182}

\textit{Sketches of Spain}, as with the other works discussed in this section, defies simple categorization as either classical, popular, or folk music. Efforts to categorize works of this type can be difficult due to the nature of how individuals define each of these terms. The music in this album incorporates classical and folk source material and Evans adapts it for an ensemble that included both classical and jazz instrumentalists. In examples like this album and other obvious works of fusion, the question of authenticity becomes less relevant because it becomes increasingly difficult to identify a single authentic source with which to compare. In many ways, it is more interesting to consider how \textit{Sketches of Spain} is authentically Evans in the way that it integrates varied musical traditions than it is to consider whether or not it treats the source material in an authentic manner. These types of work are often the result of an individual's personal interest and their ability to appropriate the musical styles that they most closely relate.

In essence, Evans and Davis are doing much the same as Johann Sebastian Bach did when he traveled to Lübeck, Germany to study with Dieterich Buxtehude in 1705-6. After completing his studies with the well-respected organist and upon returning to Arnstadt, Bach was met with a similar type of resistance that we have noted with other composers. Upon his return from Lübeck, Bach was questioned for having

\textsuperscript{182} Crease, 207-9.
extended the length of his time away without authorization. In addition to this line of question, Bach’s supervisor further reprimanded him:

... for having hitherto made many curious variations in the chorale, and mingled many strange tones in it, and for the fact that the Congregation had been confused by it. In the future, if he wished to introduce a *tonus peregrinus*, he was to hold it out, and not to turn too quickly to something else or, as had hitherto been his habit, even play a *tonus cantrarus*.\(^{183}\)

The curious variations and strange tones were surely a result of Bach’s appropriation of Buxtehude’s style of organ performance, which was unfamiliar to those in Arnstadt. Throughout his life, Bach continued to incorporate elements of a variety of musical styles—including the French and Italian dances and the Rococo style more associated with his sons. Had Bach had access to the musical styles of the Middle East or West Africa during his time or if he lived in the twenty-first century and had access to numerous musical traditions through the internet, he may have appropriated a wider variety of musical styles and his musical genius would have manifested itself much differently.

As we have seen in the examples discussed to this point, efforts to categorize music or discuss its authenticity are often fruitless because the evolution of music demands that musicians choose to appropriate or reject musical elements to which they are exposed. In this light, the folk song adaptations of Rimsky-Korsakov are no less important or legitimate than the folk song transcriptions of Melgunov or Bartók. Even if they are less true to the rural sources, they are still a result of social contexts

and personal aesthetics. Therefore, a thorough survey of a composition should address the composer’s purpose, the music’s value, and the social context of its creation in addition to an analysis of the rhythm, pitch, orchestration, and form. By taking these additional elements into account in order to understand the significance of a musical work, the boundaries between art, popular, and folk music further diminish.

As we will soon see, Golijov’s musical aesthetic is rooted in the philosophies of post-modernism, a term that is as amorphous as many of the other terms we have discussed so far. Although some view post-modernism solely as a reaction to mid-century modernism, its roots are in the types of compositions discussed to this point that feature reverential incorporation of other styles of music. Thus, it should not be viewed as a mere reactionary development. Instead, viewing composers like Golijov as belonging to a long lineage of musicians who are interested in other musical styles and cultures will aid in understanding their work within this broader historical context.
Chapter Four -
Many Modes of Modernism

The development of music history is driven by many factors. Some musicians are motivated by the idea of progress—that composers generally become more skilled and performers become more technically superior with the passing of time. This driver leads to the creation of both highly complex and virtuosic works. Others, however, are motivated by a classical or historical worldview—that composers from the past have developed distinctive musical aesthetics that can be studied, imitated, and incorporated into their musical experiences. This driver leads to the canonization of masterworks and the creation of new works that contextualize existing techniques within a modern aesthetic. Neither force operates in isolation. Recognizing that each plays a valid role in advancing the evolution of music enables one to distinguish more easily the creative contributions of individual composers.

This realization is particularly important when examining the music of Golijov, who, like many post-modern composers, is interested in integrating the traits of music that they admire into their own works. By recognizing the sources of their inspiration, one can more easily distinguish the creative elements of each composer's compositional approach.

In order to appreciate better the unique qualities of Ayre, it is important to understand how the terms modernism and post-modernism are most frequently used and how they developed in the twentieth century. The concept of modernism—and by extension the terms avant-garde, post-modernism, ultra-
modernism, formalism, New Complexity, as well as an assortment of other terms related to the concept of newness and progress—has been used to describe a number of diverse styles of music that developed in the twentieth century. The idea of evolution is hardly a new concept in music, as evidenced in the previous chapters, but its use becomes more common in the late nineteenth century to distinguish the progressiveness of the extra-musical elements in Richard Wagner’s music as opposed to the absolute music of his contemporaries and those that had come before him.\textsuperscript{184}

The term is problematic because, as Leon Botstein notes in the entry on modernism in Grove Music, “it is applied loosely to disparate musical styles” and more suited to broadly “denote a multi-faceted but distinct and continuous tradition within 20th-century composition.”\textsuperscript{185} Botstein continues describing modernism by explaining that:

Success with the established audience of one’s time was not a criterion of aesthetic merit or historical significance. Legitimate originality in art was inherently progressive, oppositional and critical. It pierced the surface of reigning tastes, undermined them and revealed hidden truths and profound historical currents.\textsuperscript{186}

Given the term’s malleable definition and its oppositional nature, it is not surprising that the term became a tool that composers and musicologists could use to distinguish or align particular musical styles, much like the use of the terms popular, 

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{185} Ibid. \\
\textsuperscript{186} Ibid.
\end{flushright}
classical, and folk music as discussed in the introduction. This phenomenon gave rise to a number of other equally malleable terms, like post-modernism, to distinguish further and align individual composers’ aesthetics. The use of these terms as they are applied to Steve Reich’s music is particularly revealing. Jann Pasler describes minimalism, a term often associated with Steve Reich’s music, as an example of a particular kind of “post-modernism of resistance” and explains that:

Composers such as Philip Glass, Steve Reich, Michael Nyman and Louis Andriessen, for example, use continuous repetition to create non-narrative works that subvert the role of longterm memory in the perception of a work’s structure.

Here the application of the term post-modernism helps to highlight the newness of these composers’ use of repetitive rhythms to subjugate the role of narrative and musical development common in music before the development of minimalism. But music does not remain cutting-edge for long, and younger composers were interested in developing their own musical voices in order to establish themselves as the purveyors of even newer styles of music. John Adams, who is eleven years younger than Reich, was heavily influenced by the rhythmic repetition of Reich and the other minimalists—as evidenced in works like Grand Pianola Music. As Adams’ music style developed, he incorporated additional musical influences into his music like the long sweeping lines in Harmonielehre that are similar to the music of Richard Strauss. In order to analyze Adam’s music K. Robert Schwarz uses the

187 See page 7.
188 Botstein.
polarity of modernism and post-modernism to distinguish the difference between Reich and Adams. His argument follows that:

If modernism is understood to combine a purity and systematization of structure with an unending search for new means of technique and expression, then Reich is a child of modernism. His rationalism and precompositional planning link him with the serialists, but his insistence on clarity and audibility of structure have driven him to a radical simplification of musical means.\(^{189}\)

In an effort to set Reich's musical style up as that which is reacted against, Schwarz draws upon a different element of Reich's music, the pre-compositional process, to align him with the old guard. This allows him to continue his argument that Adams' music is new by noting:

Adams is of a different generation [than Reich], one that places a premium on neither originality nor systematization ...

[He] has moved from the rationalistic modernism of Reich to an eclectic post-modernism, an approach that freely selects and combines the relics of a variety of vernacular and historical traditions. Although attracted to minimalism's accessibility, clarity, and vernacular links, Adams has gradually discarded both its systematization of method and its purity of inspiration. Preferring to absorb a wide array of musical influences, Adams has taken the language of minimalism and, while retaining its surface gestures, shed its doctrines.\(^{190}\)

As we observed with the terms folk, popular, and classical, terms like modernism and post-modernism become tools (or weapons, depending on the circumstances) in identifying the elements of newness in individual musical trends. This free usage allows for a variety of meanings and connotations that are sometimes at odds with


\(^{190}\) Ibid.
one another, as in the case examined here, and often leads to confusion regarding the use of the terms. This situation, however, does not mean that the terms are not useful. It only means that they must be used carefully.

Returning to Botstein’s entry on modernism in Grove Music, one can see how the term modernism is useful in observing a larger historical narrative develop throughout twentieth-century music. He uses the term to trace a narrative that begins following the generation of Mahler, Debussy, Scriabin, and Strauss, through the development of five distinct strands of modernism by 1933, continuing through the Second World War, and into late twentieth century.\textsuperscript{191} Without naming the term post-modernism, he describes the historical conditions that allowed a less indoctrinated era to flourish beginning in the mid-1970s:

As the political overtones of pre-1945 and 20th-century Modernism receded from memory and rock and commercial folk music took an oppositional, political significance in both west and east Europe, the moral edge of Modernism weakened, leaving composers free to become more eclectic.\textsuperscript{192}

The modernism of the mid-twentieth century exhibited combative qualities including an “[i]ntense hostility to most instrumentalists, singers and conductors” and the idea that “conflict between the audience and the rejection of inherited conventions of musical expression became virtues and signs of authenticity.”\textsuperscript{193} It is this contentious vein of modernism that gave rise to the concept of post-modernism, which, in its name, denotes a reactionary stance against this particular type of

\textsuperscript{191} Botstein.
\textsuperscript{192} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{193} Ibid.
modernism and is more directly related to “plurality, fragmentation, [and] difference.” ⁰¹⁴

If one backs away from the more specific definitions associated with modernism, post-modernism, et al., particularly those that elicit positive or negative connotations, then a different historical narrative emerges—one that is contrapuntal and recognizes that each successful composer draws on a number of influences that are either incorporated or rejected and which yields ever-changing musical concoctions. Using this type of narrative, one can follow a unified and cohesive framework of music history that acknowledges general trends and interests without dismissing specific styles of music as superfluous or secondary.

For as long as we have a recorded history of music, there is evidence that each generation of composers assimilated and challenged the common practices of the previous generation to varying degrees. As an example, a late-twelfth century Parisian would have understood works like Perotin’s *Viderunt omnes*, one of the first examples of organum quadruplum, as a distinctly modern element of the mass in comparison to the surrounding two-voice organum or the monophonic chants. A series of similar observations throughout history yield a distinctly different historical narrative than the more common Germanic-centered narrative that places biblical importance on the lineage of music that developed from Bach, Mozart, Beethoven, Wagner, Schoenberg, and beyond. This observation is not meant to diminish the importance of this particular narrative, only to illustrate that others

---

exist. In this broader context of music history, the purpose, value, and social relevance of each musical work take on an equally important role as compositional technique and style (which certainly can and should be examined as part of the purpose and value).

**Returning to Copland**

While some composers strove to have others appreciate them solely for their creative genius, Copland also concerned himself with those who were listening to his music. The awareness of his audience demonstrates that he was cognizant of the purpose that his music served in society. In his 1933 book on American composers, Cowell links the concept of modernism “not only with the exploration of new styles and techniques but also with the desire to break from German Romanticism and imitation of past conventions.”\(^\textit{195}\) Although works like Copland’s *Music for the Theatre* (1925) do not necessarily sound progressive to audiences in 2013, Copland’s overt use of popular music was part of the modernistic trend described by Cowell. It, like the music we have examined by Gershwin, is distinct from the Romantic tendencies found in works like Richard Strauss’ *Eine Alpensinfonie*, which was composed only a decade earlier. This assertion of a distinctly American style in the 1920s is a result of the social context in which it was composed. The United States assumed a new role as an international power following the First World War and there was a general attitude of American patriotism that developed in its wake.

\(^\textit{195}\) Murchison, 152.
The social context of Copland’s music changed dramatically with the onset of the Great Depression. In the wake of the stock market crash in 1929, Copland believed that the audiences of the 1930s had changed dramatically and that they yearned for music that was more conservative. He noted that “the old special audiences [of new music during the 1920s], their curiosity satisfied, have melted away no one knows where,” and he was concerned that composers realized “that they were losing all contact with any real audience, and that this lack of contact was placing them in a critical situation.”196

In 1934 as part of his affiliation with the Composers’ Collective, Copland staged a concert of his music from his years studying with Boulanger in Paris for an audience of workers. At the start of the concert Copland issued a statement to the audience that the music that they were about to hear did not reflect his current thinking and that they should not view it from a “revolutionary angle.”197 His word of caution demonstrates awareness that his earlier compositions were composed for a different purpose and for a different audience, one that was more interested in innovation. He set out to change his style to better connect with the proletariat audience with which he most associated himself politically in the 1930s and ‘40s, as evidenced through his association with the Composers’ Collective and Seeger. The change in purpose of his music during this period is a result of the new social context that developed because of the New Deal policies that followed the Great Depression.

196 Murchison, 149.
197 Ibid., 177.
Depression and is demonstrated in works like *El Salón México*, *John Henry*, and his *Third Symphony*.

Changing the intended purpose did not mean that he had to give up composing complex music; it only meant that complexity in and of itself was not a justifiable means to connect with a broad audience, one that often lacked formal musical training. Copland quoted W. H. Auden in an article entitled “The Musical Scene Changes” by stating that:

... without an intimate relation between [a composer] and his audience, ... [a composer] finds it difficult to grow beyond a certain point. Isolation breeds an ingrown quality, an overcomplexity, and over-refinement, both of technique and of sentiment.198

It is important to establish that Copland is not deriding complexity or refinement; he is merely concerned with over-complexity and over-refinement.

Copland’s interest in the compositional techniques of Schoenberg is an often-overlooked element of his compositional output before *El Salón Mexico*. Bryan Simms examines a surprising statement that Copland made in 1967 connecting *Piano Variations* (1930) with serial techniques in his article “Serialism in the Early Music of Aaron Copland.”

It seems to me that the Piano Variations was the start of my interest in serial writing. ... Although it doesn't use all twelve tones, it does use seven, and it stays with them throughout in what I hope is a consistently logical way. Also I wrote a song in 1927, recently republished under the title “Poet’s Song,” which is quite twelve-tony and shows that I was thinking in those terms then. Schoenberg's

198 Murchison, 153.
greater fame after the end of the last war and the continual talk and writing about the technique brought the whole matter to the front of my mind again.199

Copland addressed the idea that he explored serial concepts in the *Piano Variations* and “Poet’s Song” as early as 1949 in an interview with Julia Smith, which later developed into her dissertation in 1952 and a book about Copland in 1955.200 Contemporary critics did not take to her idea that the *Piano Variations* is an example of Schoenberg’s serial technique, which Simms explains was likely due to the fact that:

[Smith’s] analysis suffers because she did not distinguish between twelve-tone composition per se, which does not exist in either work, and a non-twelve-tone serialism, which is present in both and is akin to techniques used by Schoenberg just before he embarked on the twelve-tone method.201

He further points out that her confusion was reasonable because many people at that time did not differentiate serial and twelve-tone techniques. Copland was more interested in non-twelve-tone serialism than the “ultrachromatic context of [Schoenberg’s] twelve-tone music.”202

This interest developed out of his studies with Boulanger, who had often discussed Schoenberg’s works during the early 1920s, and developed later in the decade when he analyzed Schoenberg’s *Piano Suite* Op. 25 for a lecture he gave on modern music

---

200 Ibid., 177.
201 Ibid., 178.
202 Ibid., 180.
in 1927. But he was not interested in mimicking the Germanic composer, for as we noted, American modernism in the 1920s meant breaking from the yolk of Germanic traditions. Instead, Copland appropriated Schoenberg’s technique in a manner that more suited his aesthetic. In Simms’s view:

Making tone rows relevant to tonality was apparently Copland’s “angle” on serialism, as he later put it, his way of extending the principle into varied and contrasting styles, rather than allowing serialism to dictate a uniform and unchanging atonal style—something he found to be a drawback in Schoenberg’s music.

Copland’s interest in complexity at this time includes not only the manipulation of pitch but also the intricate asymmetric music of Stravinsky and Bartók. His *Short Symphony*, which the Mexico Symphony Orchestra premiered in 1934, is less-frequently performed than some of his other orchestral works due to its rhythmic complexity. The symphony is neo-classical in nature and Howard Pollack, the well-regarded musicologist and biographer of Copland and Gershwin, views the work as a result of Copland’s interest in Wolfgang Amadeus Mozart’s string chamber music a few years earlier.

The world premiere of the symphony in Mexico City needed ten rehearsals under the capable leadership of Copland’s friend and supporter Carlos Chávez and the United States premiere was delayed several times as frequent supporters Serge

---

203 Simms, 179-80.
204 See page 105.
205 Simms, 187.
206 Pollack, *Aaron Copland*, 289-91. The *Short Symphony* features a wide range of woodwind colors, including the seldom-heard heckelphone, but it lacks the sound of trombones, tuba, and percussion which is prevalent is much of his other orchestral music. The orchestration of this symphony is leaner and more reflective of neo-classical trends in comparison to his *Third Symphony.*
Koussevitzky and Leopold Stokowski felt that they lacked the requisite rehearsal time to prepare the intricate rhythms found in the work.\textsuperscript{207} Although the tempo of the movement is not as brisk as Bartók’s \textit{Falun}, the first movement of the symphony features syncopated phrases that resemble the metrically complex passage we examined earlier (see Example 13 and compare with Example 2 on page 24).

**Example 13** Aaron Copland’s \textit{Short Symphony (No. 2)}, I. Tempo \( j=144 \) (incisivo), Rehearsal 4 to rehearsal 6 (metric reduction)

\[ \text{Example 13} \]

\[ \text{Example 13} \]

Short Symphony by Aaron Copland
© Copyright 1955 by The Aaron Copland Fund for Music, Inc. Copyright renewed.
Boosey & Hawkes, Inc., sole licensee.
Reprinted by permission.

This rhythmic intricacy is likely one of the reasons why these conductors felt that they needed additional rehearsal time to present an adequate performance of the work. As late as the 1980s, Copland continued to note that “[o]ne would think that most of the terrors of [the \textit{Short Symphony}] would have worn off by now for players as well as listeners.”\textsuperscript{208}

The \textit{Second Symphony} premiered the same year as the Composers’ Collective concert where Copland presented his earlier music with the disclaimer to the audience not to listen with a “revolutionary angle.”\textsuperscript{209} It was at that time that Copland embraced the desire to compose with the purpose of connecting with a broad popular

\[ \text{Example 13} \]

\[ \text{Example 13} \]

\[ \text{Example 13} \]

---

\textsuperscript{207} Pollack, \textit{Aaron Copland}, 288-9
\textsuperscript{208} Ibid., 291.
\textsuperscript{209} See page 106.
audience in consistency with the values of the collective. As discussed in chapter two, his populist interest did not mean a complete abandonment of complex compositional devices and forms and he returned to explore the serial techniques that he dabbled with in the 1920s after the war in the *Piano Quartet* (1950), *Piano Fantasy* (1957), *Connotations* (1962), and *Inscapes* (1967). Bryan Simms notes two reasons for Copland’s sudden return to serialism at this time. First, Copland became aware of a shifting taste in modern music after a trip to Europe in 1949 during which he spent time with Boulez. Understanding that a new audience was developing that appreciated these styles, he sought to connect with them out of concern that his music would become irrelevant. Simms also credits Jennifer Dunlaps’s theory that Copland followed these trends for political reasons in order to distance himself from the leftist politics of Shostakovich’s music following the drastic change in the United States’ relationship with the Soviet Union following the Second World War and the ensuing Red Scare.

Recognizing that Copland’s popular output in the 1930s and ’40s reflects a personal passion to connect with a proletariat audience, and that he explored complex compositional techniques throughout his career, yields a more refined understanding of both his compositional skill and the social context of the era.

---

210 Copland made many similar trips of this nature including trips in 1949, 1951, 1955, and 1960 during which he became acquainted with Boulez, Ned Rorem, Pierre Schaeffer, Luigi Dallapiccola, a groups of young Finnish, Russian, and Japanese composers. For more information, see Pollack, *Aaron Copland*, 460-6.

211 Simms, 178.
The Case of George Crumb

George Crumb, born twenty-nine years after Copland, was a part of the same generation as Boulez, yet their musical aesthetics vary greatly. Crumb’s music is often considered postmodern for his use of pluralism, stylistic diversity, and collage. In the fourth movement of Ancient Voice of Children, “Todas las tardes en Granada, todas las tardes se muere un niño,” (1970) Crumb quotes Johann Sebastian Bach’s “Bist du bei mir” in a haunting manner. The movement begins with the soprano singing a text by Frederico García Lorca that describes the daily deaths of children in Granada. The text is presented over a C-sharp major chord in the marimba, harmonica, and the voices of the percussionists. After a moment, the root of the harmony shifts a tritone and the Bach quotation is presented in the toy piano (see Example 14).

---

Example 14 George Crumb’s *Ancient Voices of Children*, IV. “Todas las tardes en Granada, todas las tardes se muere un niño,” line 2

Crumb states that his goal for this work was to:

... [seek out] musical images that enhance and reinforce the powerful, yet strangely haunting imagery of Lorca’s poetry. I feel that the essential meaning of the poetry is concerned with the most primary things: life, death, love, the smell of the earth, the sounds of the wind and the sea.²¹⁴

Crumb’s use of quotation and stylistic diversity as a musical device were part of a larger trend by composers to look towards other types of music to include within their own including George Rochberg’s *Contra Mortem et Tempus* (1965), Luciano Berio’s *Sinfonia* (1968-9), and Schnittke’s *First Symphony* (1969-74), all from the same period.

Crumb believes that the use of musical images like the Bach presented on toy piano juxtaposed against the image of dying children is possible because he was working during a period that brought a new awareness of music from different historical and geographical realms that had not been available to composers before his time. In an interview in 1980, Crumb states that:

One very important aspect of our contemporary musical culture—some might say the supremely important aspect—is its extension in the historical and geographical senses to a degree unknown in the past. To consider firstly the extension through time: in a real sense, virtually all music history and literature is now at our fingertips through both live performances and excellent recordings, whereas earlier composers knew the musics of only one or two generations before their own time. The consequences of this enlarged awareness of our own heritage are readily evident in many of our recent composers. For example, the influence of medieval music on the British composer Peter Maxwell Davies comes to mind. For many such composers, the sound of medieval music—at times harsh and raw, at times fragile and hauntingly sweet—would more closely approximate the contemporary ideal than would, say, the sound of a Brahms or of a Richard Strauss. I have observed, too, that the people of the many countries that I have visited are showing an ever increasing interest in the classical and traditional music of their own cultures. Perhaps we have come to think of ourselves as philosophically contemporaneous with all earlier cultures. And it is probable that today there are more people who see culture evolving spirally rather than linearly. Within the concentric circles of the spiral, the points of contact and the points of departure in music can be more readily found.

The geographical extension means, of course, that the total musical culture of Planet Earth is “coming together”, as it were. An American or European composer, for example, now has access to the music of various Asian, African, and South American cultures. Numerous recordings of non-Western music are readily available, and live performances by touring groups can be heard even in our smaller cities. Such influences would, of course, be felt on different levels: only a few Western composers would have a sophisticated technical
knowledge of the Indian *Raga*, for example; but, in general, the sounds, textures, and gestures of this music would be well known.215

Crumb continues on to describe Hector Berlioz’s feelings regarding both Chinese and Indian folk music, which Berlioz had encountered while traveling in London. Berlioz’s accounts are no more flattering than the Goodman’s descriptions of the African music in the Caribbean discussed in the introduction, and taken together they illustrate the difference between the insular qualities of the nineteenth century and the historical and geographical awareness that was now possible in the late 1960s and early ’70s.216 For Crumb, a global and historical awareness is one of the modern elements in his musical style.

Another example of Crumb’s use of a musical image to relate his music to his audience is the use of a whale’s song in *Vox balaenae*. In this work for flute, cello, and piano, Crumb utilizes many extended techniques on each of the instruments to produce effects to create a musical abstraction of a whale’s voice. The sonic images that Crumb conjures in this and many other works function similarly to Copland’s use of folk songs by providing audience members a means of understanding the musical material even if they do not choose to examine the work more analytically. This type of music does not demand musical training to be appreciated; yet, it explores new elements of music like the sound effects that are elicited by the extended techniques that Crumb has carefully constructed.

---


216 See page 4.
This type of music, which aims to connect with its audience, can be understood as a new type of folk music, one that is not intended to be performed by communities of people as with the folk music Bartók loved, but a type of music that easily relates to its audience regardless of their formal training. This assertion is not meant to imply that the modernism of Boulez and the Darmstadt School is necessarily unintelligible to a general audience, but instead, it is meant to show that the musical complexity of the Darmstadt School was never intended to connect with a broad audience. Its value lays not in its accessibility, but rather its exploration of new compositional techniques and sound worlds. Milton Babbitt gives a spirited defense of the role of what he calls a composer of “‘serious,’ ‘advanced,’ contemporary music” in his essay “Who Cares if You Listen?” when he notes that:

... this [type of] composer expends an enormous amount of time and energy—and, usually, considerable money—on the creation of a commodity which has little, no, or negative commodity value. He is, in essence, a “vanity” composer. The general public is largely unaware of and uninterested in his music. The majority of performers shun it and resent it. Consequently, the music is little performed, and then primarily at poorly attended concerts before an audience consisting in the main of fellow professional. At best, the music would appear to be for, of, and by specialists.217

Like Copland, Babbitt is aware of the importance of understanding the intended audience and purpose of each of his compositions; the distinction is that the audience he and his like-minded colleagues are most interested in reaching comprises only a small fraction of the larger population.

His thesis makes the convincing argument that although the music has little commodity value, it is nevertheless important and therefore should be supported.\textsuperscript{218} What he fails to note in the essay is that a middle ground can exist. In the same way that Bartók struggled with uniting what he initially viewed as incompatible genres of folk and art music, Babbitt left an impression that composers could either adhere to his understanding of what modernity meant at the time or cater to a larger, more populous audience. I do not mean to imply that it was his duty to make this distinction, as his goal in writing the essay was to establish a place where composers who shared his aesthetic goals could compose without concern for popular opinion, but by omitting the possibility that a middle ground exists, he tacitly claims ownership of the concept of modernity and fuses it with the idea that in order to be considered modern one should not be concerned with reaching a broad audience.

This issue becomes immediately obvious by the designation of his music as “serious,” implying that other music is not. This distinction is one of the elements of modernism in the middle of the century that precipitated the reaction of postmodernism. It is impossible to imagine artists who are not serious about their art. Reich, who as we saw earlier is considered a postmodernist in comparison to composers like Babbitt, drew upon years of experimentation and focused attention

\textsuperscript{218} Babbitt, 1310.
on groundbreaking technology as well as a rejection of past aesthetics to develop works like *Music for 18 Musicians*.\(^{219}\)

These concepts extend to popular music as well. Freddie Mercury, the lead singer and songwriter for the band Queen, surely took the act of composing songs like *Bohemian Rhapsody* seriously. This song is groundbreaking in rock music for its unusually free and rhapsodic form. The band took their efforts to record the work seriously and spent four weeks perfectly the recording, needing 180 overdubs to achieve Mercury’s desired effect.\(^{220}\) With these examples in mind, Babbitt’s procedurally complex *Partitions*, which was composed one year before he wrote his essay, can be understood as no more or less modern or serious than Reich’s *Music for 18 Musicians* or Mercury’s *Bohemian Rhapsody*.

Although I argue that the music of the late twentieth century should be viewed within one common context of modernity, I do not believe that this unified understanding leads to a conclusion that all music is universal or should be considered as belonging to one lump genre. Furthermore, I do not believe that we should dispense with terms like popular, folk, classical, modern, or postmodern, which all have important uses and connotations which can aid people trying to understand the relationship between various musical traditions. Rather, I hope to

---

\(^{219}\) In 1978, two years following the premiere of the work, Reich released a recording of *Music for 18 Musicians* on the record label ECM, a label known for recording jazz. That recording was reviewed by *Billboard* and *Rolling Stone* and sold more than 10,000 copies. Reich’s music influenced a number of popular artists as well including Brian Eno, David Bowie, and the band Tangerine Dream. (Tim Rutherford-Johnson, “The Influence Engine: Steve Reich and Pop Music,” *New Music Box* (blog) March 27, 2013, http://www.newmusicbox.org/articles/the-influence-engine-steve-reich-and-pop-music/)

recognize the different connotations associated with each term and focus on how each term describes elements of any given musical work.

In the case of Ayre, isolating the parts of the composition that are indebted to others, including his use of existing folk material and established classical forms, frees one to recognize the origins of the material and makes it possible to understand Golijov's unique contribution to the work. More generally, the creativity of any given composer should not be judged solely on their use of specific musical language or techniques. Instead, their creativity can be judged on how they utilize existing material to create new art. Viewing Ayre in the historical context presented in this section, as opposed to a more progressive context, allows one to better distinguish the key elements of the work.
Part the Second:
Osvaldo Golijov’s Ayre
Chapter Five - Different Soups

The pot gets filled with different soups, and that’s good.221

- Golijov on bringing together the diverse musicians for the premiere of *Ayre*

New York City had undergone considerable cultural transformation between 1943—the year when Duke Ellington first performed *Black, Brown, and Beige* at Carnegie Hall—and 2004—the year *Ayre*, a work for soprano and chamber ensemble, premiered at the same storied concert hall. This transformation spanned the Civil Rights Era, the Vietnam War, and the 9/11 Attack on the World Trade Center, and the cultural changes that occurred are reflected in Golijov’s music.

*Ayre* was commissioned by The Carnegie Hall Corporation through the Maria and Robert Skirnicky Fund for New Work to feature Dawn Upshaw and as a companion work to Luciano Berio’s multi-lingual *Folk Songs*. The plurality of cultures represented in the work of both Berio and Golijov is indicative of the post-modern trends that developed in the late twentieth century as discussed in chapter four. But to appreciate fully the newness of each work, one should view both as belonging to a long lineage of music—dating back to the nineteenth century—that is indebted to the study of folk music, to the history of composers exploring the boundaries between art, popular, and folk traditions, and to the general interest of many composers to incorporate elements of music that they are passionate about, while

---

rejecting others. New York City, one of the most racially diverse in the nation, was the home to the musical fusions of Ellington, Gershwin, Copland, and Evans and therefore an appropriate venue for the continuation of this musical heritage.\textsuperscript{222}

One of the principal reasons behind the commission of \textit{Ayre} was to provide Dawn Upshaw a vehicle to express her virtuosity. Golijov observed that when people talk about folk music, they note that each village often has one great singer.\textsuperscript{223} For Golijov, that singer is Upshaw, who he compared favorably to several notable folk singers including Fairouz, a Lebanese singer; Ofra Haza, an Israeli singer; Savina Yannatou, a Greek singer; and Montserrat Figueras, Jordi Savall’s wife and collaborator on a number of historically informed recordings by their group Hespèrion XXI.\textsuperscript{224} The partnership between Golijov and Upshaw began in 1999 when Golijov was commissioned to compose \textit{Lúa Descolorida} for her and pianist Gilbert Kalish.\textsuperscript{225} That commission led to other collaborations including Golijov’s \textit{Three Songs for Soprano and Orchestra} (2002) and the opera \textit{Ainadamar} (2003).

In an interview discussing his appreciation for Upshaw’s voice, Golijov notes that although most people knew her for her recordings of Gorecki’s \textit{Symphony No. 3} and Messiaen’s \textit{Saint François d’Assise}, which feature a pure and angelic tone, he discovered that she had many more vocal colors that could be explored.\textsuperscript{226}

---


\textsuperscript{223} Schaefer, 6.

\textsuperscript{224} Ibid. Hespèrion XXI is an early music ensemble that is noted for their scholarly approach.


\textsuperscript{226} Schaefer, 2.
choosing the folk songs to be included in *Ayre*, Golijov often looked for ways to feature Upshaw's versatility. Golijov describes Upshaw's multifaceted performance of *Ayre* as sounding "like a wounded animal in number three ... [then] coming back as this almost celestially beautiful voice in number five. It's a kind of theatrical effect to say: Oh look what she can do!"\(^{227}\)

Golijov sees a connection between the virtuosity of Upshaw and that of Cathy Berberian, the wife of Berio, for whom Berio composed *Folk Songs*.

> I think that Cathy Berberian was Dawn’s ancestor in the sense that she wasn’t simply a mezzo-soprano—she was all those different voices. In her records you hear the many voices of Cathy Berberian. Both in classical and popular music there are very few people who have that gift of being multi-voiced.\(^{228}\)

The similarity between vocal muses is not the only correlation between the works. In the preface of the score, Berio states his general purpose for composing *Folk Songs*:

> I have always sensed a profound uneasiness while listening to popular songs performed with piano accompaniment. This is one of the reasons why, in 1964, I wrote *Folk Songs*—a tribute to the artistry and the vocal intelligence of Cathy Berberian.\(^{229}\)

> ... It is an anthology of eleven folk songs of various origins (United States, Armenia, France, Sicily, Sardinia, etc.), chosen from old records, printed anthologies, or heard sung from folk musicians and friends. I have given the songs a new rhythmic and harmonic interpretation: In a way, I have recomposed them. The instrumental part has an important function: It is meant to underline and comment on the

\(^{227}\) Schaefer, 18.  
\(^{228}\) Ibid., 3.  
\(^{229}\) The term *canzone popolare* in Italian refers to the concept of both popular and folk music. This interchangeability accounts for Berio’s statement that “his uneasiness while listening to *popular songs* performed with piano accompaniment” led to the composition of *Folk Songs*.
expressive and cultural roots of each song. Such roots signify not only the ethnic origins of the songs but also the history of the authentic uses that have been made by them.  

The unease that Berio felt when listening to folk or popular songs performed with piano accompaniment likely comes from the many folk songs arranged for voice and piano dating back to the time of Haydn and Beethoven, many of which compromise the original qualities of the folk material. In fact, Berio had himself composed works for voice and piano featuring folk material in the late 1940s while studying at the Milan Conservatory, including Due cori popolari (for choir, 1946), Tre lirichi greche (for voice and piano, 1946), and Tre canzoni popolari (for voice and piano, 1947). Two of the songs from Tre canzoni popolari—“Ballo” and “La donna ideale”—were recontextualized in Folk Songs.

In an interview with Bálint András Varga, Berio further discusses his interest in folk music:

I am interested in taking possession of that treasure [the authenticity of the original folk song] with my own means. I return again and again to folk music because I try to establish contact between that and my own ideas about music. I have a Utopian dream, though I know it cannot be realized: I would like to create a unity between folk music and our music—a real, perceptible, understandable continuity between ancient, popular music-making which is so close to everyday work and our music.

---

In another interview with Rossana Dalmonte, Berio further clarifies his feelings regarding the incorporation of folk techniques into his own compositions:

I’m not an ethnomusicologist, just a pragmatic egoist: so I tend to be interested only in those folk techniques and means of expression that I can in one way or another assimilate without a stylistic break and that allow me to take a few steps forward in the search for a unity underlying musical worlds that are apparently alien to one another.  

Taken together, these statements illuminate Berio’s purpose for composing his *Folk Songs*. Like Bartók, Berio identifies the banality of folk arrangements for voice and piano and strives to fuse elements of the folk songs with the aesthetic of modernism of the Darmstadt composers. Although his interest in folk material is not ethnomusicologically driven, as it is with Bartók, it is still fueled by a passion for expanding his musical language, as is the case with Golijov.

We previously discussed Bartók’s belief that musicians should study folk music in its traditional element to understand its nuance. There are several instances throughout the work where Berio uses classical instruments to imitate folk instruments that could have accompanied these songs in their original incantations. (see Examples 15.1-4).

\[233\] Dalmonte, 106.
**Example 15.1** Luciano Berio’s *Folk Songs*, I. “Black is the color,” beginning to rehearsal 1 (viola only) – Viola performed like a fiddle

![Viola music notation]

Like a wistful “country dance fiddler”

Viola performed like a fiddle

Luciano Berio „Folk Songs|für Mezzosopran und 7 Instrumente“
© Copyright 1968 by Universal Edition (London), Ltd., London/UE 34112

**Example 15.2** Luciano Berio’s *Folk Songs*, II. “I wonder as I wander,” beginning to m. 4 – Harp imitates a guitar (the harp part can also be performed by a guitar per Berio’s instructions)

![Harp music notation]

I wonder as I wander out under the sky how

Luciano Berio „Folk Songs|für Mezzosopran und 7 Instrumente“
© Copyright 1968 by Universal Edition (London), Ltd., London/UE 34112
Example 15.3 Luciano Berio’s *Folk Songs*, III. “Loosin yelav,” beginning to rehearsal 1 – Harp imitates an oud

Example 15.4 Luciano Berio’s *Folk Songs*, VII. “Ballo,” Rehearsal 7 to rehearsal 8 (strings only) – viola and cello strummed like a guitar

Instrumentalists who are familiar with the music that Berio references in these passages may choose to incorporate subtle inflections of Berio’s score. For example, in the section that Berio indicated to perform “like a wistful ‘country dance fiddler,’” a violist who is familiar with the American fiddling tradition may incorporate microtonal pitch and rhythmic nuances, manipulate the bow pressure and contact points to change the timbre of the instrument, or alter the phrasing in order to create Berio’s desired effect (see example 15.1).
As stated earlier, Berio composed *Folk Songs* as a tribute “to the artistry and the vocal intelligence of Cathy Berberian.” Berio and Berberian were married at the time, and elements of their relationship were infused into the work through his choice of the national origins of each folk song in the cycle. For example, Berberian was born in America to Armenian parents and Berio was born in Oneglia, Italy, only eighty miles from Nice in the south of France; and all but one of the songs are affiliated with those countries (see Table 6).\(^{234}\)

**Table 6** Region of Origin by Movement in Luciano Berio’s *Folk Songs*\(^ {235}\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Movement</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Region of Origin</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Black is the color</td>
<td>United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>I wonder as I wander</td>
<td>United States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Loosin yelav</td>
<td>Armenia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Rossignollet du bois</td>
<td>France</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>A la femminisca</td>
<td>Sicily (Italy)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>La donna ideale</td>
<td>Italy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Ballo</td>
<td>Italy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Motettu de tristura</td>
<td>Sardinia (Italy)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Malurous qu’o uno fenno</td>
<td>Auvergne (France)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Lo fiolaire</td>
<td>Auvergne (France)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Azerbaijan Love Song</td>
<td>Azerbaijan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^{234}\) The final song comes from Azerbaijan, a Republic of the Soviet Union that neighbored Armenia, and Berio transcribed it from a record that Berberian discovered. (Luciano Berio, liner notes from *Epifanie / Folk Songs*, Unknown: RCA Red Seal, 1971, LP.)  
\(^{235}\) Compiled from Berio, *Folk Songs*. 
The multitude of languages referenced in the work—including English, Armenian, French, Siculu, Italian, Sardu, Occitan, and Azeri—is typical of the plurality associated with the rise of post-modernism in the late twentieth century. In this case, however, it less likely a result of a reaction against modernism than it is a result of Berio's long interest in folk material and a reference to the multicultural background of the couple.

**Folk Songs: Golijov’s Point of Departure**

Golijov used Berio's work as a model for *Ayre* and as a result, both works feature a specific leading soprano, are eleven movements in length, and use a multitude of languages as a vehicle for the soloist's virtuosity (see Table 7).
Table 7 The Comparison of the Use of Various Languages in Luciano Berio's *Folk Songs* and Osvaldo Golijov's *Ayre*\textsuperscript{236}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Movement</th>
<th><em>Folk Songs</em></th>
<th><em>Ayre</em></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Ladino</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Ladino</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Armenian</td>
<td>Sardu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>French</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Siculu</td>
<td>Ladino</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>Arabic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Sardu</td>
<td>Arabic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Italian</td>
<td>Arabic and English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Occitan</td>
<td>Spanish</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Occitan</td>
<td>Hebrew and English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Azeri</td>
<td>Ladino</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Neither Berio nor Golijov collected his folk material as Bartók had, but both drew on a wealth of personal experiences. Golijov was born in Argentina to an immigrant family from Russian and Romania. Growing up Jewish in a predominantly Catholic country meant that he had first-hand experiences living as a minority, and these experiences are evident in his understanding of the lives of exiles in *Ayre*. Ara Guzelimian, the Senior Director and Artistic Advisor at Carnegie Hall, wrote the liner notes for the commercial recording in which he quoted Edward Said, an American citizen born in Jerusalem that was known for advocating for the rights of Palestinians throughout his life, as saying:

Most people are principally aware of one culture, one setting, one home; exiles are aware of at least two, and this plurality of vision gives rise to an awareness of simultaneous dimensions, an awareness that—to borrow a phrase from music—is contrapuntal.\textsuperscript{237}

At the age of twenty-three Golijov moved to Jerusalem to study composition with Mark Kopytman at the Jerusalem Rubin Academy. His three-year study in Israel enriched his knowledge of Middle Eastern traditions and broadened his awareness of the cultural counterpoint that exists throughout the world.

This knowledge prepared him for his doctoral studies in the United States with George Crumb, who had only three years earlier discussed the newfound importance of contemporary musical culture's expanded awareness of historical and geographical realms.\textsuperscript{238} Just as Crumb juxtaposes the music of Bach’s “Bist du bei mir” against Lorca’s dark text in \textit{Ancient Voices of Children} in the passage discussed in chapter four, Golijov juxtaposes many dissimilar styles of folk music and texts in order to create an overarching meaning in \textit{Ayre}.\textsuperscript{239}

Golijov uses the instrumentation of Berio's \textit{Folk Songs} as the starting point of \textit{Ayre}, but expands the ensemble to incorporate many new colors, some of which were unavailable to Berio in 1964. The ensemble that premiered \textit{Ayre} included many of Golijov's friends with whom he had previously collaborated, each a virtuosic performer in their own regard (see Table 8).

\textsuperscript{237} Golijov, \textit{Ayre}, 4.
\textsuperscript{238} See page 113.
\textsuperscript{239} See Example 14 on page 112.
Table 8 Instrumentation of Luciano Berio's *Folk Songs* and Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre* (including a list of musicians who premiered *Ayre*)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Folk Songs</th>
<th>Ayre</th>
<th>Golijov’s Musicians</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Soprano</td>
<td>Soprano</td>
<td>Dawn Upshaw</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flute</td>
<td>Flute</td>
<td>Susan Palma Nidel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clarinet</td>
<td>Clarinet</td>
<td>David Krakauer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>—</td>
<td>Horn</td>
<td>Eric Ruske</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guitar or Harp</td>
<td>Guitar</td>
<td>Gustavo Santaolalla</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>—</td>
<td>Harp</td>
<td>Ina Zdorovetchi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>—</td>
<td>Hyper-Accordion</td>
<td>Michael Ward-Bergeman</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>—</td>
<td>Laptop and Sound Design</td>
<td>Jeremy Flower</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Percussion (2 Players)</td>
<td>Percussion (1 player)*</td>
<td>Jamie Haddad</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Viola</td>
<td>Viola</td>
<td>Ljova</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cello</td>
<td>Cello</td>
<td>Priscilla Lee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>—</td>
<td>Contrabass</td>
<td>Mark Dresser</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* not used for the premiere, but used subsequently for the tour and the recording

Knowing the musicians for whom he composed, Golijov tailored each part to their strengths, allowed them the freedom to interject elements of their personalities, and brought their unique voices together to weave a distinctive tapestry of sound—much like composers in the jazz tradition. In this way he functioned collectively as a composer, arranger, and impresario, managing how each of the unique and talented musicians in his ensemble interacted. Ellington used a similar approach to create his signature song, “East St. Louis Toodle-Oo,” which features his lead trumpeter.

---

Bubber Miley. Miley took the framework of Ellington’s chord changes and fused it with his own distinctive style to help create the sound that made the band famous in its early days. Similarly, as Evans wrote for Davis, he knew what framework to provide in order to allow Davis the freedom to soar in and out of the orchestral textures, which he created by expanding a typical bebop ensemble to include alto flute, bass clarinet, French horn, and tuba.

The uniqueness and brotherhood of Golijov’s ensemble is evident in the fact that Golijov even named the band, something usual for a pickup group in the realm of classical music. Golijov dubbed the band for the premiere Los Suavitos, an invented Spanish word that is likely a diminutive of suave. Following the premiere, the band expanded to include a percussionist and they changed their name to the Andalucian Dogs for the subsequent tour and recording.

One of the unique differences between the instrumentation of Folk Songs and Ayre is the presence of electronic elements—including parts for laptop and electric accordion. Relating the incorporation of these electronic instruments to the notion of folk music, Golijov stated, “I have [added] the [hyper-]accordion, laptop and so forth because I feel that the concept of folk music is changing. Folk today is not the same as folk in 1968.”241 Whereas Bartók viewed folk music as a purified type of music related to rural culture, Golijov relates it to the popular music found in dance clubs, on the radio, and through the Internet. Golijov’s unified understanding of folk and popular music is in line with Berio’s use of the term canzone popolare, which

241 Schaefer, 5.
refers to either tradition as well. The distinction between urban and rural musical traditions has softened as the evolution of technology between the time of Bartók and Golijov has enabled greater access to diverse musical styles. Therefore, Golijov views electronica and the electronic manipulation of live sound as symbols of folk music in the twenty-first century.

Although Ayre was built upon Berio’s Folk Songs, Golijov composed it for a different purpose and therefore elected to tackle a much broader theme. Berio composed his work to create a showpiece for his wife; therefore, he chose songs that pertained to his relationship with Berberian. Golijov, on the other hand, was commissioned to write a work for Upshaw and he used the opportunity to select folk material that pertained to the lives of people exiled from their homelands; the historical relationships between Christians, Jews, and Muslims; and the current political drama in the Middle East.

---

242 See page 122. The similarity between these urban and rural styles is depicted in the artwork of Benton. Although he focused predominantly on folk culture throughout his life, he later portrayed the energy of popular music as well. Comparing I Got a Gal on Sourwood Mountain (1938) with The Twist (1964), one can see the connection between the spirit of folk and popular music through Benton’s eyes. To view Benton’s I Got a Gal on Sourwood Mountain, visit http://www.loc.gov/pictures/item/2003652397/. To view Benton’s The Twist, visit http://www.artfixdaily.com/artwire/release/debra-force-unveils-new-gallery-space.

243 Schaefer, 16.
Chapter Six -
A Journey from Andalusia to Jerusalem

Ayre serves as a vehicle to present the virtuosity of Dawn Upshaw, as homage to
Berio’s Folk Songs, and as a statement about the political tensions between the
Israelis and Palestinians through a historical and cultural examination of sacred and
secular music and texts from around the Mediterranean Sea. The work exhibits
the cultural pluralism associated with post-modern music, but also belongs to a
longer narrative that encompasses aspects of classical, popular, and folk music
traditions that extends into the late nineteenth century.

Golijov’s role as a composer does not fit the typical model of a person who composes
in solitude and is solely responsible for the genesis of the work. Of course, his role
as the composer of Ayre covered composing and adapting the musical material, but
it also included bringing together and coordinating the creative effort from the
group of unique musicians in the Andalucian Dogs. Because Golijov expected the
musicians to integrate their own mannerisms into the music, the recording also
serves as a primary source of study—one that exhibits the unique contributions of
individual members of the band.

Gustavo Santaolalla, the guitarist who premiered the work, played a special hybrid
role as both a performer and guest composer, contributing the music used in two
movements of Ayre. Santaolalla and Golijov had previously worked together on the
premiere of Ainadamar. Santaolalla is well-regarded as a film composer—having

244 For historical background on the Israel-Palestine conflict, see James Gelvin, The Israel-
received the Academy Award for Best Original Score for *Brokeback Mountain* and *Babel*—and as both a performer and composer of what is known as electrotango, as evident in his work with the Argentine band Bajofondo.\footnote{For general information regarding Santaolalla’s career, see en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Gustavo_Santaolalla.} We will address his contribution as a composer as part of a linear examination of the work.

The study of Golijov’s *Ayre* will examine the surface characteristics of the music; the role of individual performers, like Upshaw and Santaolalla, in bringing Golijov’s vision to light; as well as the historical context for the source material. Although the music and texts from each movement may appear multifaceted and disjunct on the surface, each contributes to an overarching theme, which unifies the work. Because Golijov bases the musical material from each movement on a wide variety of cultural traditions, he does not attempt to unify the work through musical motives as is common in the tradition of Beethoven. Instead, it is the distinct historical and cultural context of each movement that unifies the work, as if each song presents a unique point of view of a cohesive narrative that would otherwise appear unrelated. To help identify a larger structure, I have divided the work into four sections that correspond to a series of subthemes (see Table 9).
### Table 9 Division of Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre* into Four Sections

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Movements</th>
<th>Subthemes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>I - V</td>
<td>The Turmoil and Innocence of Al-Andalus and Sardinia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>VI – VII</td>
<td>Christian and Muslim Commonality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>VIII – X</td>
<td>Modern and Medieval Counterpoint</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>XI</td>
<td>Reflection and Conclusion</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Section One: The Turmoil and Innocence of Al-Andalus and Sardinia

**No. 1 – “Mañanita de San Juan”**

Golijov describes the first movement of the work as “more of a dramatic situation” than a song.\(^{247}\) It is a series of four Sephardic *pregones*,\(^{248}\) or street calls presented over pedal tones that tonicize C-sharp. As Upshaw strikes a pair of Indian Crotales and the ensemble begins to create an undulating texture over the tonic, Golijov immediately draws the listener into the drama unfolding in a chaotic street market in either Morocco or Andalusia. In preparing the work, Upshaw was told by Golijov to imagine “standing on a soap-box to get attention, to make people listen to [her] story” and that she is “shouting the story out to a crowd ... so it’s intentionally shrill and very declamatory.”\(^{249}\) There are four statements of the call (beginning, ...

---

\(^{246}\) This division is based on the subject matter and musical content of each area and is not reflected in the score or recording.

\(^{247}\) Schaefer, 10.


\(^{249}\) Schaefer, 9.
rehearsal A, rehearsal D, and rehearsal F), and each follows the same general shape, which Golijov varies through embellishment (see Example 16.1-4).

**Example 16.1** Osvaldo Golijov's *Ayre*, I. "Mañanita de San Juan," beginning to rehearsal A (soprano only)

Example 16.2 Osvaldo Golijov's *Ayre*, I. "Mañanita de San Juan," rehearsal A to rehearsal C (soprano only)
Example 16.3 Osvaldo Golijov’s Ayre, I. “Mañanita de San Juan,” rehearsal D to rehearsal E (soprano only)

Ayre by Osvaldo Golijov
© Copyright by Imagem CV.
Administered by Hendon Music, Inc., a Boosey & Hawkes company.
Reprinted by permission.

Example 16.4 Osvaldo Golijov’s Ayre, I. “Mañanita de San Juan,” rehearsal F to rehearsal G (soprano only)

Ayre by Osvaldo Golijov
© Copyright by Imagem CV.
Administered by Hendon Music, Inc., a Boosey & Hawkes company.
Reprinted by permission.

The movement is based on a traditional Sephardic romance, which Samuel Armistead and Joseph Silverman discuss in their collection, *Judeo-Spanish Ballads from Oral Traditions*. The text itself is known more commonly as “El coutiverio de
Guarinos” and exists in many forms due to its roots in an oral tradition. The romance has medieval French antecedents and is found in print in Judeo-Spanish sources dating back to the sixteenth century and, although it is likely to have been very popular, it is now rarely found in the oral tradition. Most of the versions that Armistead and Silverman examine originate in the oral tradition from Tetuán, Morocco.

The text refers to battles between the Moors and the Christians during the period known as the Reconquista, beginning in the early eighth century with the invasion of the Iberian Peninsula by the Umayyad Caliphates; the establishment of Al-Andalus, the medieval Muslim state; and ending with the fall of Granada in 1492. Golijov uses this period as the reference point for his drama, when Christians, Jews, and Muslims coexisted on the peninsula with varying degrees of harmony and strife. The story centers on Rondale, an admiral of the seas whose wife remains in Paris. He is defeated, taken captive, and begins to lament. A Moorish princess takes pity on him and offers to marry him and supply him land and money, but he refuses her offer and spites her. The text ends as the Princess has Rondale executed.

Although it mentions only Christians and Moors, Golijov injects a Jewish element into the movement through the inclusion of Sephardic mannerisms in the musical interlude between rehearsal C and D. This vocalise for clarinet and soprano, representing Rondale and the princess respectively, floats over an extended

---


251 Ibid, 61.
dominant chord and dramatizes the exchange between the characters. Rondale’s lament is illustrated by the descending grace-note motive, which is reminiscent of weeping, and is similar to ornaments from Judeo-Spanish music (see Example 17).

**Example 17** Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, I. "Mañanita de San Juan," rehearsal C to rehearsal D (clarinet and soprano only)

David Krakauer, the clarinetist in the Andalucian Dogs, is a longtime collaborator with Golijov and familiar with both classical traditions and traditional Jewish music. The two collaborated on *The Dreams and Prayers of Isaac the Blind*, a work for klezmer clarinet and string quartet, in 1994.²⁵² Krakauer’s understanding of the mannerisms of Jewish music allows him to bring this part to life. Listening to the Dawn Upshaw’s recording, one can hear the musical nuances Krakauer brings to the performance that are not notated in the score.²⁵³ Golijov could certainly try to notate these nuances, but it is his preference to allow the performers the freedom to bring their personality into a performance of the work. This embrace of the

---

²⁵³ Upshaw, CD, tracks 1-11.
performer’s freedom to ornament and embellish the music stands in stark contrast to highly determinant qualities of mid-century musical modernism.

The resolution to C-sharp after rehearsal F marks the beginning of Rondale’s rebuttal of the princess. Golijov captures the dramatic character of the text with the harsh sound of horn fluctuating between open and stopped timbres and by asking the clarinet to imitate the bright and nasally sound of the zurna (or zorna), an Arabic reed instrument that is commonly found in the streets of Arabic countries (see Example 18).²⁵⁴

Example 18 Osvaldo Golijov’s Ayre, I. “Mañanita de San Juan,” rehearsal F (clarinet and Horn only)

The princess coldly orders Rondale’s execution and a short coda commences with a guitar and cello duet that imitates the sound of Moroccan street music (see Example 19).

²⁵⁴ Golijov, Ayre, 7.
Golijov uses the pregones, Sephardic mannerisms, and unique timbres of the opening movement to create a dramatic rendering of the traditional Sephardic romance to introduce the audience to the themes and setting of the work.

No. 2 – “Y Una Madre Comió Asado”

The musical character of the second movement is serene and stands in contrast to the energetic pregones from the first movement. The instrumentation alludes to the second movement of Berio’s Folk Songs by opening with a duet for voice and harp (see Example 20 and compare to Example 15.2 on page 123).
Example 20 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, II. “Y Una Madre Comió Asado,” mm. 1 to 12

This movement is an adaption of a traditional Sephardic song after Jeremiah’s Lamentations in simple binary form (as observed in Example 20). Golijov presents the melody four times, each time adding a new layer to the texture—beginning with the low strings, followed by the ronroco (discussed in greater detail in the analysis of the fourth movement), and concluding with the winds (see Table 10).

Table 10 Formal Structure of the Second Movement of Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Accompaniment</th>
<th>First Statement</th>
<th>Second Statement</th>
<th>Third Statement</th>
<th>Fourth Statement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Soloist</td>
<td>Dawn Upshaw</td>
<td>Dawn Upshaw</td>
<td>Paul Dresser</td>
<td>Dawn Upshaw</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accompaniment 1</td>
<td>Harp</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accompaniment 2</td>
<td>—</td>
<td></td>
<td>Low Strings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accompaniment 3</td>
<td>—</td>
<td></td>
<td>Ronroco</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accompaniment 4</td>
<td>—</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Winds</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Ayre* by Osvaldo Golijov
© Copyright by Imagem CV.
Administered by Hendon Music, Inc., a Boosey & Hawkes company.
Reprinted by permission.
The folk song originates in Tetuán, Morocco, just like the Sephardic romance from the first movement. The text is horrific and describes a mother roasting her son and eating him while he pleads with her to stop. Unlike the secular nature of the opening movement, this text is sacred and is from the Book of Lamentations 4:10.

With their own hands, tenderhearted women
Have cooked their children;
Such became their fare,
In the disaster of my poor people.

The tradition of creating texts that incorporate this verse dates back to the sixteenth century when the Jewish poet Israel Naraja wrote a ballad for the Jewish Holy Day of fasting known as Tisha b-Av, which also detailed the roasting of their children. The grotesque imagery of this text and others, where mothers would eat their offspring, is commonly found in Jewish traditions and is derived from the Hebrew Bible.

The juxtaposition of the peaceful music with the gruesome poetry is this movement’s most compelling element. The tranquility of the folk song is reinforced by the unique timbre of the bass solo by Paul Dresser. Dresser performs the melody using a special glassy timbre, which Golijov refers to in the score as the “Dresser technique” and is created using a wide range of bow pressures and contacts to

---

257 Renaissance Players, liner notes, track 7
create other pitches in addition to the fingered pitches.\textsuperscript{258} This distinctive timbre underscores the juxtaposition of the terrible text with the peaceful music, which I interpret as an older generation, represented by the mother, unaware of the terrible things that they are doing to their innocent children through war and injustice.

The movement ends with another reference to the second movement of Berio’s \textit{Folk Songs} though the use of what I call the “Holy-Spirit texture.” That texture occurs in “I wonder as I wander” where the color of the clarinet and quiet harmonics in the viola and cello create a halo around the sound of the voice singing the words “Jesus Christ our Savior did come for to die” (see Example 21.1).

\textbf{Example 21.1} Luciano Berio’s \textit{Folk Songs}, II. “I wonder as I wander,” mm. 5 to 6 (clarinet, strings, and soprano only)

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{example.png}
\caption{Luciano Berio, \textit{Folk Songs}, für Mezzosopran und 7 Instrumente}
\end{figure}

\begin{center}
\copyright Copyright 1968 by Universal Edition (London), Ltd., London/UE 34112
\end{center}

\footnotesize\textsuperscript{258} Golijov, \textit{Ayre}, 10.
In *Ayre*, this texture is mimicked in the flute, clarinet, and horn when they accompany the final phrase of the vocal line: The wafting *pp* chords move in parallel motion in a similar register (see Example 21.2).

**Example 21.2** Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, II. "Y Una Madre Comió Asado," mm. 51 to 57 (flute, clarinet, horn, and soprano only)

The inclusion of the Christ references in this otherwise Sephardic song contributes to Golijov’s goal to show the commonalities between Christianity, Judaism, and Islam. I also interpret this as a subtle reference to the redemption that Christians find through Christ even in dark situations—like those discussed both in the text of this movement and the contemporary political situation in the Middle East, which will emerge as a theme later in the cycle.

There are many commercial recordings of this folk song available—including recordings by The Renaissance Players, directed by Winsome Evans; Esther
Lamandier; Cinco Siglos; and Savina Yannatou—and each of the recordings features a similar kind of texture and serene mood.\textsuperscript{259} I believe that it is most likely that Golijov referred to Yannatou’s recording of “Y Una Madre Comió Asado” on her album \textit{Mediterranea: Songs of the Mediterranean} or may have seen her perform it live due to the previous connection that he drew between her and Upshaw’s voices.\textsuperscript{260}

\textit{No. 3 – “Tancas Serradas a Muru”}

The third movement shifts the focus from Andalusia and Morocco to the Mediterranean island of Sardinia, now part of Italy. This shift is likely in homage to Berio’s inclusion of a Sardinian folksong in his set. Berio’s Sardinian folksong expresses the sadness over the loss of a loved one, but Golijov’s choice reflects his interest in exploring the tensions in the Middle East. In discussing the meaning of this movement, Golijov states that the text “‘Walls are encircling the land’ relates perfectly to the situation of Israel and Palestine.”\textsuperscript{261}

Although, he identified only one source, he divided the translation at the end of the movement to reveal that it is actually a hybrid of two different poems translated by different translators.\textsuperscript{262} Melchiorre Murenù wrote the first poem in response to the \textit{Editto delle chiudende} (Edict of enclosure) of 1823, and Francesco Ignazio Mannu

\begin{footnotesize}
\footnotesize
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{260} Schaefer, 6. See page 121.
\item \textsuperscript{261} Schaeffer, 16.
\item \textsuperscript{262} Golijov, \textit{Ayre}, 21.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
wrote the second poem in the mid 1790s in response to the Moti rivoluzionari sardi (Sardinian revolutionary insurrection). Both of these events involve the struggles of a native, peasant class against their often-foreign rulers.

A feudal system of land rights was imposed upon the island in the late fifteenth century with the advent of Spanish rule, much later than it had developed in many other parts of Europe during the Medieval Era. From the early eighteenth century through the middle of the nineteenth century, the island was a semi-autonomous state ruled by House of Savoy within the kingdom of Piedmont-Sardinia.

The Savoyard King, who ruled from Turin, Piedmont on mainland Europe, did not form an army to protect the island of Sardinia from an impending attack by the French Revolutionary forces in 1793. Therefore, a volunteer Sardinian army assembled and successfully repelled two attacks by the French, which happened to include the young lieutenant Napoleon Bonaparte. Although the King promised the volunteers rewards for their successful victories against the French, those awards never arrived. Having endured centuries of foreign domination and misrule under the Spaniards, the Sardinians quickly grew frustrated with their new Piemontese rulers. Popular discontent with the government led to a series of uprisings in 1794 and 1795 known as the Moti rivoluzionari sardi. Inspired by these uprisings, the

---

263 Francesco Ignazio Mannu, Su patriottu sardu a sos feudatarios (Cagliari, Sardinia: Condagheres, 1991) 43-68.
poet Francesco Ignazio Mannu composed the revolutionary song *Su patriottu sardu a sos feudatarios*, which is still considered a local anthem of Sardinia today.\textsuperscript{264}

Nearly thirty years later in 1820, the King of Sardinia decreed that chosen landowners could fence large tracts of previously communal land in the *Editto delle chiudende*. This declaration made public land inaccessible to the peasants and shepherds by fencing off large tracts of land to promote the land use for agriculture. The act favored large landowners over smaller landowners and shepherds who used the communal land for grazing, and led to widespread discontent. The blind poet Melchiorre Murenu (1803 – 1854) wrote *Tancas serradas a muru* in response to the initial edict in 1820. Murenu is said to have improvised it upon hearing the sounds of construction and the explanation that a local wealthy landholder was building walls around his pastures.\textsuperscript{265}

Golijov combines these two revolutionary poems, each a reaction by the people of Sardinia against an unjust and foreign government. *Tancas serradas a muru* is only four lines in length and is fully incorporated in the third movement of *Ayre*, and the first eight lines of *Su patriottu sardu a sos feudatarios* follow. Although it is unclear whether the source of the melody is of unknown folk origins or by Murenu himself as Golijov stated, the source of his melodic material can be heard accompanying the text of Murenu’s *Tancas serradas a muru* on the 1974 recording *Pascoli serrati da*.

\textsuperscript{264} Mannu.

\textsuperscript{265} Melchiorre Murenu, *Poesie in lingua sarda* (Macomer: Cartolibreria M. Pugioni Pinna, 1955), 7.
muri by the Sardinian folk group, Coro del Supramonte di Orgosolo. On that recording they sing the text of the four-line poem over a single repeated melodic cell (see Example 22).

Example 22 Transcription of the repeated melodic cell from “Tancas serradas a muru” on Coro del Supramonte di Orgosolo’s Pascoli serrati da muri

Golijov uses that cell to create the melodic material that accompanies both poems in the movement as well as in the central instrumental interlude (see Table 11).

| Table 11 Form and Source Material for Osvaldo Golijov’s Ayre, III. “Tancas Serradas a Muru” |
|---------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------------|
| **Introduction**    | **A**           | **A’**          | **A**           | **Coda**        |
| **Soloist**         | Electronica    | Soprano         | Bass Clarinet, Horn, and Hyper-Accordion | Soprano         | Electronica    |
| **Text Source**     | —               | Murenu          | —               | Mannu           | —               |
| **Melodic Source**  | —               | Tancas Cell     | Tancas Cell     | Tancas Cell     | —               |

By comparing the melodic cell that accompanies Murenu’s text in the Coro del Supramonte di Orgosolo’s recording to Golijov’s melody, one can see how Golijov

---

266 Coro Supramonte Orgosolo, Tancas Serradas a Muru, Edizioni Frorias, 1974, LP.
simply created the melodic material by applying a traditional harmonic structure to the cell (see Example 23).

**Example 23** Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, III. “Tancas Serradas a Muru,” mm. 21 to 36 (soprano only)

It is difficult to tell if Coro del Supramonte di Orgosolo’s recording of “Tancas Serradas a Muru” is Golijov’s source, but this version is an interesting point of comparison because it features a folk ensemble from the Sardinian town of Orgosolo and incorporates many effects that may have inspired Golijov—including shouting, whistling, and tongue trills. Golijov uses a number of special effects and electronic elements to recreate these sounds. His instructions throughout the movement, include “as a mob approaching” and in “chaos and anarchy” and encourage the
musicians to connect with the hysterical character of this folk music.\textsuperscript{267} He specifies unusual performance techniques to achieve this character:

- A snare drum effect on the guitar
- Glissandi and a “Jew’s Harp” effect with metal rods on the harp
- Overtone filtering in the hyper-accordion
- Scraping the bass strings with a serrated stick
- “Whipping the Horse” sounds, which include exclamations and barking followed by throat singing in the vocal part
- Carnavalesque improvisation in the piccolo and overblown harmonics in the flute
- The vocalist “losing [her] mind” through acoustic overtone manipulation within the mouth\textsuperscript{268}

Golijov also encourages the musicians to include “dog barks, horses and horse-whipping, cars honking, pots banging, chicken in fear, etc.” to provide the sense of “chaos and anarchy” at the conclusion of the movement.\textsuperscript{269}

Jeremy Flower, the laptop artist and sound designer for the work, and Michael Ward-Bergeman, the inventor and performer of the hyper-accordion, work together to supply the electronica elements, which underpin the anarchic quality of the movement. The hyper-accordion is a concept instrument that ”unite[s] the accordion with dynamic signal processing, playing them together as one.”\textsuperscript{270} In the most general terms, the hyper-accordion is an outgrowth of the types of electronic

\textsuperscript{267} Golijov, Ayre, 21.
\textsuperscript{268} Ibid., 12-21.
\textsuperscript{269} Ibid., 21.
effects that Jimi Hendrix made famous with his rendition of the *Star Spangled Banner* at Woodstock, and the laptop is now a ubiquitous tool of DJ’s at dance clubs around the world.

As noted earlier, Golijov understood that the concept of folk music is constantly evolving and that folk music from the time of Berio’s *Folk Songs* in the 1960’s was not the same as the folk music from the time of *Ayre* at the turn of the twenty-first century.\(^\text{271}\) He sees this change manifested through the increased use of electronics and computers in dance music, which is why he chooses to feature the laptop and hyper-accordion prominently in his set of folk songs.\(^\text{272}\)

*No. 4 – “Luna”*

The fourth movement is unusual because it is the only movement without voice and it is the first of two movements that Golijov did not compose himself. Golijov credits this and the ninth movement to Santaolalla, as alluded to earlier. The peaceful character of the movement acts as an interlude between the turbulent chaos of the previous movement and the following lullaby. It features the ronroco, a larger version of a charango, a guitar-like instrument that is native to the Andes Mountains in South America.\(^\text{273}\) Golijov is probably not trying to make a direct connection

---

\(^\text{271}\) See page 134.

\(^\text{272}\) The connection between people and electronics has only grown stronger since the premiere of *Ayre*. In past eras, access to technology and the means of production was generally limited to those in power. With the proliferation of personal computers, handheld devices, and the Internet, the working class now has increased access to technology that enables them to yield greater influence.

\(^\text{273}\) The ronroco is larger than a charango and smaller than a guitar and has a range that is more similar to a violin. For more information on the charango, see Thomas Turino, “Quechua and Aymara,” in *Garland Encyclopedia of Music*, Vol. 2, *South America, Mexico, Central America, and the Caribbean*, ed. Dale Olsen and Daniel Sheehy (New York: Garland Pub., 1998), 213-4.
between the Andean instrument and the religious comingling around the
Mediterranean Sea. Instead, he is featuring Santaolalla’s artistry on a unique
instrument that is connected to the Iberian diaspora, and in doing so he is
introducing two important symbols.

Santaolalla previously had recorded an album featuring the ronroco in 1998 entitled
*Ronroco*.\(^{274}\) The murmuring textures that Santaolalla establish in “Luna” are similar
to those he composed in “Zenda” from that album.\(^ {275}\) Golijov also establishes the
moon and guitar as important symbols, both which will return in the third section of
*Ayre*. In “Luna,” the absence of the vocal part portrays a sense of isolation and could
be viewed as a moment in the narrative where an exile sits alone with his guitar
playing in the moonlit night far from his homeland.

The form of the movement is in three sections: theme, theme repeated, varied
repetition of theme. The movement opens with Santaolalla introducing the theme
alone on the ronroco (see Example 24).

---

\(^{275}\) Santaolalla, track 7.
The theme is repeated with an atmospheric accompaniment created by the hushed alto flute, the harp using a bisbigliando effect, and the harmonic tremolo in the viola and cello. The movement concludes with a variation by Santaolalla (see Example 25).

The entrance of the bass six measures before the end introduces the low register, which was absent throughout the movement, to set up the half cadence on the F-
sharp major chord that gracefully leads the listener to the following movement (see Example 26).

**Example 26** Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, IV. “Luna,” mm. 49 to end (bass only)

![Example 26](image)

No. 5 – “Nani”

The nocturnal imagery of the fourth movement elides with the fifth movement through an attacca transition—the half-cadence created by the bass entrance at the end of “Luna” resolves directly into the beginning of the fifth movement. The musical material in this movement is derived from a traditional Sephardic lullaby entitled “Nani Nani,” which is found in a sixteenth-century manuscript compiled by Francisco de Salinas. As with “Y Una Madre Comió Asado,” many versions of this folk song exist, including classical arrangements in *Seven Sephardic Romances* (1968) by Yehezkel Braun, and *Cuarto canciones sefardies* (1965) by Joaquin Rodrigo, and a number of historically informed recordings by Hadass Pal-Yarden, Accentus Ensemble, and Hespèrion XXI featuring Jordi Savall and his wife Montserrat Figueras. Although I cannot say with certainty that Golijov used any of these

---

recordings as a source for this movement, it is likely that he may have consulted the Hespèrion XXI recording because of his earlier comparison of Upshaw’s and Figueras’ voices.\textsuperscript{279}

Figueras’ recording evokes a peaceful, improvisatory quality common in lullabies and is about fourteen minutes in length. Golijov’s adaptation explores the same mood and melodic material as Figueras’ recording, but distills the material to create a more-concise, three-minute version, thus maintaining the flow of the work as a whole. The opening vocalise in Golijov’s version first occurs around two minutes into the recording by Hespèrion XXI (see Example 27).

\textbf{Example 27} Osvaldo Golijov’s \textit{Ayre}, V. “Nani,” mm. 1 to 14 (soprano and flute only)

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{example27.png}
\caption{Ayre by Osvaldo Golijov \copyright Copyright by Imagem CV. Administered by Hendon Music, Inc., a Boosey & Hawkes company. Reprinted by permission.}
\end{figure}


\textsuperscript{279} Schaefer, 6.
Following that line, which descends through the F-sharp Freygish scale, Upshaw and Susan Palma Nidel, on the alto flute, weave in and out of each other’s melodies much as Figueras did with the flute-like instrument in the Hespèrion XXI recording.

Like “Y Una Madre Comió Asado,” the text is darker than many would expect in a lullaby. This dark quality is common in Sephardic lullabies as is discussed in detail by Lorca in his lecture entitled *On Lullabies*. Lorca is an important figure for Golijov. Just one year before composing *Ayre*, he wrote his first opera *Ainadamar*, which explores Lorca’s life story. In the commentary that accompanies the commercial recording of the opera, Golijov explains how Lorca is tied to the drama that he examines in both the opera and *Ayre*.

*Ainadamar* means *fountain of tears* in Arabic. It’s a real fountain that witnessed beautiful harmony in the twelfth century. It’s a fountain to which Arab poets, quoted by Lorca, wrote poems to the beauty, to the peace, to the inspiration that the fountain provided to people when these three cultures coexisted in the soil of Spain—the Muslim, the Jewish, and the Christian. And it’s a fountain that eight centuries later witnessed the murder of this great poet. So that’s why we called [the opera] “The Fountain of Tears,” it’s a fountain that is the witness of harmony and the witness of barbarity.

Lorca’s execution in 1936 during the Spanish Civil War in front of this fountain, which Golijov connects to the period of Al-Andalus’s history when the three religions coexisted, ties Lorca to the overarching theme of *Ayre*. In his lecture on

---

280 The Freygish scale is similar to a major scale with a lowered second and sixth scale degree, which creates the augmented-second interval between the second and third scale degrees. The distinctive sound of this mode is often associated with Sephardic folk music.


Andalusian lullabies, Lorca describes the first moment he became cognizant of the darkness of the cradle songs:

Some years ago, as I was strolling through the outskirts of Granada, I heard a village woman singing her child to sleep. I had always been aware of the keen sadness of our country’s cradle songs, but never so vividly as then. As I approached the singer to take down the words, I saw that she was a pretty Andalusian, a happy woman without the slightest twinge of melancholy. But a living tradition was at work in her: she was faithfully obeying an order, as though listening to the ancient, imperious voices that went skittering through her blood. Since then I have tried to collect lullabies from all parts of Spain. I wanted to know how the women of my country put their children to sleep, and after a while I found that Spain uses its very saddest melodies and most melancholy texts to darken the first sleep of her children.\textsuperscript{283}

He continues to discuss how these Spanish cradle songs are unique throughout Europe for their melancholic qualities and, with the help of Manuel de Falla, Lorca completed a study of these songs and discovered that they unite all of the regions of Spain through common modes and meters. Lorca describes the commonality as:

We could make a map of Spanish melodies and note on it a fusion of regions, an exchange of bloods and juices alternating with the systoles and diastoles of the seasons. We would see clearly the skeletons of unbreakable air that unites all the Peninsular regions—a skeleton held in suspension over the rain, with the naked sensibility of a mollusk, swallowing in the smallest invasion from the outside world and emitting, unthreatened, the most ancient and complex substance of Spain.\textsuperscript{284}

Lorca’s poetic description of the Spanish lullabies is similar to Bartók’s understanding of the purity of folk music. For Lorca, it is the melancholic

\textsuperscript{283} Lorca, 9.
\textsuperscript{284} Ibid., 22.
essence of these tunes that unites its people. In the next section of Ayre, Golijov will examine a similar “exchange of bloods and juices” between Christian and Islamic sacred music by applying different mannerisms to sacred songs from the Christian tradition in the Middle East.

Section Two: Christian and Islamic Commonality

The folk songs in these central movements include transcriptions from the album Good Friday - Eastern Sacred Songs by the Lebanese singer Fairouz. Golijov states in his article that Upshaw masterfully incorporated the sound of Fairouz’s voice in her performance of his work. This reference to Upshaw incorporating Fairouz’s sound implies that Upshaw studied this specific recording and internalized Fairouz’s mannerisms in these Christian Arab Easter songs.

No. 6 – “Wa Habibi”

Golijov presents two statements of Fairouz’s “Wa Habibi” that serve as interludes between three statements of raucous instrumental music that is reminiscent of the street music found in the first movement. The A sections prominently feature the hyper-accordion and the laptop—the electronic elements of the band—in a musical rendition of an Arabic dance club that is juxtaposed against the calm and sacred music from Fairouz’s “Wa Habibi” in the B sections (see Table 12 and Example 28).

285 Fairouz, Good Friday Eastern Sacred Songs, Brussels: Voix de l’Orient, 1990, CD.
286 Schaefer, 6.
**Table 12** Formal Structure of Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, VI. “Wa Habibi”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Form: A B A B A Coda</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A Section:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Instrumental</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Up-tempo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Prominently features electronica</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Reference to the street music from the first movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B Section:</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Transcription of Fairouz’s version of “Wa Habibi”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Slow tempo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Voice and strings (harp joins on the second statement)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Thematic connection to the seventh movement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Example 28** Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, VI. “Wa Habibi,” mm. 1 to 5 (winds, soprano, and electronica only)
Golijov makes his first reference to the struggles of modern Palestinians in a subtle way through his use of the hyper-accordion and the laptop. The movement opens with an extended improvised solo by Michael Ward-Bergeman—lasting ninety seconds in the recording and incorporating swooping pitch bends and other sonic effects on the hyper-accordion. This material foreshadows the use of a “Doppler effect” in the hyper-accordion part in the short coda (see Example 29).

**Example 29** Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre, VI. “Wa Habibi,”* mm. 132 to end (electronica only)

This effect presumably represents the sound of ambulances racing to and from the scene of a skirmish between the Israelis and the Palestinians because the laptop part presents sampled sounds from a Palestinian funeral. An audience member would not necessarily know the source of the sampled sounds and may not understand where the metaphorical ambulance is racing, but Golijov’s inclusion of these references in connection with the sacred Good-Friday songs implies a larger context to the meaning of this section. He directly links Christ’s crucifixion and the Christian concept of a collective sacrifice for the sins of mankind to the struggle between Israelis and Palestinians. Taken together with Golijov’s general comments
referring to religious coexistence in Medieval Spain, the subcurrent of this section seems to imply that he wishes that the Israelis and the Palestinians can forgive each other for their mutual transgressions and move beyond them into a spirit of cooperation and coexistence.

In the B sections, Golijov exploits Upshaw’s ability to perform these songs using the authentic Arabic mannerisms by instructing Upshaw to sing each one in a different manner. In the first statement of the melody at rehearsal B, Golijov marks the melody “dolce, legato” and contrasts it with the “extremely Arabic” version at rehearsal D. Golijov leaves room for variety between each performance by allowing the singer to freely incorporate Fairouz’s mannerisms into the second version. Juxtaposed against one another, the first implies the purity of Gregorian tradition and the second to the more florid Arabic tradition, thus representing one of the core messages of the work. Golijov describes this juxtaposition by saying:

> With a little bend, a melody goes from Jewish to Arab to Christian. How connected these cultures are and how terrible it is when they don’t understand each other. The grief that we are living in the world today has already happened for centuries but somehow harmony was possible between these civilizations.287

This quote explains the connection between this song and the subcurrent of the work by demonstrating the commonalities of the Christian, Jewish, and Islamic cultures. The idea that these religions are distinct yet similar is the unifying concept for incorporating seemingly unrelated folk songs throughout Ayre.

---

287 Upshaw, liner notes, 5-6.
No. 7—“Aiini Taqtiru”

The juxtaposition of Christian and Arabic vocal mannerism returns in the next movement, “Aiini Taqtiru.” Golijov transcribed both the melodic and accompanimental elements of the music from the song “Torok Ourashaleem” from the same recording by Fairouz.²⁸⁸ Although Golijov sets Fairouz’s “Wa Habibi” within a larger musical structure in his similarly named movement, this movement is a straight adaptation of both the responsorial opening section and the solo vocal section that closes the movement.

In “Aiini Taqtiru,” Golijov uses the hyper-accordion in place of the organ-like instrument in Fairouz’s recording and the instrumental ensemble in place of the male and female choirs. The alto flute and bass stand in for the male choir while the French horn, viola, and cello do the same for the female choir, all of which are marked in the score to be performed “like a Gregorian litany” (see Example 30).²⁸⁹

²⁸⁸ Fairouz, track 2.
²⁸⁹ Golijov, Ayre, 35.
Example 30 Osvaldo Golijov's *Ayre*, VII. “Aiini Taqtiru,” mm. 1 to 12

In contrast to the previous movement, Golijov does not describe how he would like the melody presented in the score, but in the recording, presumably following Golijov's instruction; Upshaw incorporates the mannerisms of Fairouz's version. By
adding this detail to the performance, the Gregorian mannerisms in the responsorial section are once again juxtaposed against the Arabic mannerisms in the solo vocal section, which emphasizes the commonalities of Christian and Arabic styles just as he had done in the sixth movement.

**Section Three: Modern and Medieval Counterpoint**

Golijov describes these three movements as a “descent into darkness, into an interior place.” This section is very personal and intimate because Upshaw performs alone or joined by a single band member. The text of “Be a string, water, to my guitar” from Mahmoud Darwish’s poem *Eleven Planets in the Last Andalusian Sky* is first presented in the eighth movement, is interrupted by the ninth movement, and concludes in the tenth, creating a formal arch that unites this section. Darwish is a Palestinian poet who rose to prominence following the Israeli-Arab June War of 1967 when he published four poems in a literary journal in Beirut that were dubbed “Palestinian resistance poetry.”

**No. 8 – “Be a string, water, to my guitar”**

This movement is simply a dramatic recitation of the eighth poem from *Eleven Planets in the Last Andalusian Sky* and includes no pitched material. Darwish explores many of the same issues in his poem as Golijov; therefore we will examine elements of the text that Golijov did not select for inclusion in the work in order to

---

290 Schaefer, 27.
292 Coincidentally, Darwish’s poem is like *Ayre* in that it also has eleven sections and Golijov selected the eighth poem, “Be a String, Water, to My Guitar,” for the eighth movement of his work.
gain a more thorough understanding of his overarching theme. The last two lines of the eleventh section, “Violins,” allude to the misery associated with displaced people and clearly place the poem as a whole in the same context as Ayre.

Violins weep with Arabs leaving Andalusia
Violins weep with Gypsies on their way to Andalusia\(^293\)

"The Adam of Two Edens" by Mahmoud Darwish
Copyright © 2000 by Syracuse University Press
Syracuse, New York, Syracuse, New York, 13244-5290

This sentiment is related to Golijov’s examination of the expulsion of the Jews from Andalusia, the Sardinian peasants from the communal land, and the Palestinians from Israel.

In the first section of his poem, “The Last Evening in this Land,” Darwish describes memories of the exile’s former wealth in the following lines:

Enter, O invaders, come, enter our houses
Drink the sweet wine of our Andalusian songs!
...
Our tea is hot and green -- so drink!
Our pistachios are ripe and fresh -- so eat!
The beds are green with new cedarwood -- give in to your drowsiness!
After such a long siege, sleep on the soft down of our dreams!
Fresh sheets, scents at the door, and many mirrors!
Enter our mirrors so that we can vacate the premises completely!\(^{294}\)

"The Adam of Two Edens" by Mahmoud Darwish
Copyright © 2000 by Syracuse University Press
Syracuse, New York, 13244-5290

\(^{293}\) Darwish, 170.
\(^{294}\) Ibid., 149-50.
The conclusion of this section draws into question the reality of their former homeland to subsequent generations:

Later we’ll look up what was recorded in our history about your faraway lands.

Then we’ll ask ourselves, 
"Was Andalusia here or there? On earth, or only in poems?" 

"The Adam of Two Edens" by Mahmoud Darwish
Copyright © 2000 by Syracuse University Press
Syracuse, New York, 13244-5290

In the third section, “A sky Beyond sky for Me,” Darwish makes a direct reference to Lorca who is used as a symbol for the cultural heritage that remained following their exile, an intangible kind of wealth that was left behind:

I’ll shed my skin and from my language
words of love
will filter down through the poetry of Garcia Lorca
who’ll dwell in my bedroom
And see what I’ve seen of the bedouin moon.

...

I’m the Adam of two Edens lost to me twice.
Expel me slowly. Kill me slowly

With Garcia Lorca
under my olive tree.

"The Adam of Two Edens" by Mahmoud Darwish
Copyright © 2000 by Syracuse University Press
Syracuse, New York, 13244-5290

295 Darwish, 150.
296 The Bedouin are a nomadic desert-dwelling Arabian ethnic group who live throughout the Middle East.
297 Darwish, 153-4.
In these examples, Eden, the utopian garden from the book of Genesis from which God expelled Adam and Eve following Eve’s transgression, becomes a symbol of the homeland that they have lost—both historically in Andalusia and more recently in Jerusalem.

In the eighth section of his poem, the section that Golijov includes in Ayre, Darwish uses the guitar as a symbol of cultural memory. In the following lines Darwish alludes to the idea that with each passing generation the exiles’ knowledge of their homeland fades, and that although they gave up their wealth, they have not lost their music, which alone serves as their collective memory.

Be a string, water, to my guitar.
Conquerors come, conquerors go...

It’s getting hard to remember my face in the mirrors.
Be memory for me
so I can see what I’ve lost.298

"The Adam of Two Edens" by Mahmoud Darwish
Copyright © 2000 by Syracuse University Press
Syracuse, New York, 13244-5290

Collectively, these allusions, which are found throughout the complete text of Darwish’s Eleven Planets in the Last Andalusian Sky, reinforce the subcurrent of Golijov's Ayre.

298 Darwish, 163.
No. 9 – “Suéltate las Cintas”

The ninth song in Ayre, a love song that features only soprano and standard classical guitar, transitions directly out of the line “Be a string to my guitar, water, be a string.” The music comprises three statements of a lilting melody with an unassuming accompaniment that reflects a calm sense of nostalgia (see Example 31).

Example 31 Osvaldo Golijov’s Ayre, IX. “Suéltate las Cintas,” mm. 1 to 12

Like the fourth movement, it was composed by the guitarist, Gustavo Santaolalla, but rather than using the ronroco as he did earlier, he now uses the modern guitar. I believe that the inclusion of the guitar is a subtle reference to the fusion of Christian, Jewish, and Islamic influences on Spain during the time of Lorca and is a reference to Darwish’s use of the guitar as a symbol of the exile’s memory. By allowing this song
to grow out of the previous movement, Golijov implies that the guitarist and the vocalist are the exiled characters from Darwish’s poem, possibly singing about a distant memory of their homeland or about an exchange between two exiles in an attempt to show that life continues and overcomes hardship.

One of the complexities in analyzing the text of Ayre is that Golijov offers a number of differing texts and translations among the printed words in the song, the front of the score, the end of each movement, the liner notes to the official recording, and his own website. Most of these differences are subtle, but one substantial difference occurs in this movement and may illuminate the development of one of the important symbols in the cycles. In both the score and at the end of the movement an excerpt of the text and translation reads:

In Spanish:  
In English:  

\textit{No necesitamos cielo}  
\textit{si vos tenés a mi espalda}  
\textit{y la cintura enlazada}  

\begin{tabular}{ll}
& In Spanish: \\
No necesitamos cielo & In English: \\
\textit{si vos tenés a mi espalda} & \textit{We don't need the sky} \\
\textit{y la cintura enlazada} & \textit{when you have my back} \\
\end{tabular} 

and your waistline embraced.\textsuperscript{299}

However, in the recording and the liner notes, the texts reflect the following changes:

On the recording:  

\textit{No necesitamos cielo}  
\textit{si vos tenés a mi espalda}  
\textit{y yo la luna enlazada}  

From the translation in the liner notes:  

\begin{tabular}{ll}
& On the recording: \\
No necesitamos cielo & From the translation in the liner notes: \\
\textit{si vos tenés a mi espalda} & \textit{We don’t need the sky} \\
\textit{y yo la luna enlazada} & \textit{when you have my back} \\
\end{tabular} 

and I embrace your waist of moon.\textsuperscript{300}

\textsuperscript{299} Golijov, Ayre, v and 39.  
\textsuperscript{300} Upshaw, CD, track 9; and Ibid., liner notes, 12.
I believe that the addition of the word *luna* to the lyrics accomplishes two things. First, it establishes a clear connection between this movement and “Luna,” the fourth movement, which featured the solo ronroco. Secondly, and more importantly, it develops the symbolism of the moon. For some exiles, and similarly the Bedouin people in Darwish’s poem, the moon in the night sky is their home and shelter. Some also consider it a symbol of the feminine essence and fertility because the moon cycle closely matches that of the menstrual cycle. In the lyrics, the moon specifically refers to the crescent shape of the young girl’s waistline and the embrace of her moon-shaped waist is surely a sexual reference. Therefore, the moon in *Ayre* represents rebirth and a fresh opportunity for each generation to overcome the fighting that has forced people from their lands. This symbolism builds on that of the second movement text where the mother eats the flesh of her son even though he is innocent and pure. Golijov has faith that a new generation may have the strength to overcome the obstacles they inherit.

*No. 10 – “Yah Annah”*

Following “Suéltate las Cintas,” Darwish’s poem returns and is completed in the tenth movement “Yah Annah.” This movement features only Upshaw and Flower. To enrich the texture, Flower has processed recordings of her voice for live playback, which allows her to simultaneously speak the poem and sing Yehuda Halevi’s twelfth-century sacred poem in three-voice counterpoint. It mentions in the front of the score that the music is based on Sephardic calls to prayer, and Golijov’s setting of Halevi’s text is set in the style of singing that traditionally occurs during a
mourner’s Kaddish as part of a sacred Sephardic service. For six months following
the death of a loved one, the mourner will stand during synagogue and sing their
Kaddish. In the following excerpt, the music represents a typical scene from a
Jewish service where the chazzan begins to sing and is followed by the mourners’
prayer (see Example 32).

**Example 32** Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, X. “Yah Annah,” excerpt

These responses usually begin strongly and die away, just as Golijov indicated with
the diminuendo. His use of heterophony, which is a result of dissonant clashes that
occur between the recorded parts that are out of sync with each other, recalls the
moments when more than one mourner responds to the chazzan’s initial call.  

Following this spiritual scene, the words “I know I’ve died,” from Darwish’s text, are processed and played back through the laptop part, reinforcing the reference to death and mourning in this movement.

Yehuda Halevi is considered a representative figure from the so-called Golden Age of Sephardic culture in Andalusia during the twelfth century. He is an appropriate reference in the work because the pilgrimage he took in 1140 from al-Andalus to Jerusalem follows the same path Golijov journeys on in Ayre. In his study of Halevi’s poetry from the time of his pilgrimage, Raymond Scheindlin notes that Halevi’s struggled to understand the duality of where God is located—both in the distance, requiring one to search him out, and close, within one’s heart. This duality is represented in Halevi’s pilgrimage to find God in the Holy Land far from al-Andalus, while knowing that God dwells nearby within the hearts of mankind.

This struggle is played out in Halevi’s text, which Golijov selected for Ayre:

Where can I find you, Lord?—  
Your place is high and hidden.  
But where can I not find you, Lord?—  
Your glory fills the world!

In the subsequent stanza, which Golijov did not set to music, Halevi further describes the duality of God’s existence:

301 Conversation between the author, Ivette Azagury, and David Azagury on June 19, 2013.  
303 Scheindlin, 44.  
304 Ibid., 43.
You created the world, yet reside in man’s heart.
Protector of men, refuge of angels,
You dwell in the Temple, yet dwell in the heavens.
Praised by Your hosts,
yet far above praise;
too great for the spheres,
yet contained by a chamber.  

In order to question the reality of where God resides, Halevi chose to set out from the Al-Andalus and head towards the distant Holy Land. Three hundred and fifty-two years after his pilgrimage, the Edict of Expulsion of 1492 forced Sephardic Jews from Andalusia to travel along the same path through Northern Africa to the Holy Lands. The symbolic reference to Halevi’s long pilgrimage through the deserts of Northern Africa also serves as a smooth transition into the final movement, which explores the ideas of labyrinths and wandering.

**Section Four: Reflection and Conclusion**

*No. 11 – “Ariadna en su Laberinto (Por Qué Llorax, Blanco Niña)”*

The final movement of the cycle is about ten minutes in length—about a quarter of the entire work. It returns the listener to the sound world of the fifth movement, both in its use of a Freygish scale (this movement centers on A rather than in the F-sharp tonality of the fifth movement) and in its return to the use of the Ladino language. By recalling the earlier material, Golijov recapitulates the Sephardic themes and frames the work with references to Andalusia, Darwish’s proverbial Eden where Christians, Jews, and Muslims all lived together for a period of history in relative peace.

---

305 Scheindlin, 43.
The source material for this movement is “Por Qué Llorax, Blanco Niña,” which has been recorded by a number of ensembles including Capilla Antigua de Chinchilla, Speculum Ensemble, and Hespèrion XXI. Each version of the work is a meditation on the melody first presented in Ayre in the horn and bass clarinet and is then sung by Upshaw (see Example 33).

Example 33 Osvaldo Golijov's Ayre, XI. “Ariadna en su Laberinto,” mm. 15 to 23 (soprano only)

This melody has two parts, which are subjected to embellishment and extension throughout the movement (labeled A and B in Example 33). The structure of the movement is provided by statements of the A theme by the viola and cello with additional timbral coloring by the flute. They introduce this theme, often with embellishment, at ten structural moments throughout the movement (at measure 30, 42, 54, 74, 86, 102, 118, 146, 166, and 174). Over this base structure, an improvisatory-like duet unfolds between Upshaw and the instrumental combination of horn and bass clarinet (later joined by the hyper-accordion). Although Golijov

---

fully notates the embellished melody in the score, he encourages Upshaw to
embellish the melodies more freely than he indicates.\footnote{Schaefer, 29.}

One of the most striking points of departure between Golijov’s version and the
recordings that utilize historical performance practice is that Golijov’s version is in \( \frac{3}{4} \) with the beats unevenly grouped \((\uparrow + \uparrow + \uparrow + \uparrow \, \uparrow \, \uparrow \, \uparrow \, \uparrow \, \uparrow \, \uparrow \, \uparrow \)\). Coupled with the highly syncopated bass ostinato and the increasing amounts of embellishment, the melody seems to wander rhythmically and float above the instrumental accompaniment, as if meandering through a labyrinth without a secure point of reference (see Example 34).

\textbf{Example 34} Osvaldo Golijov’s \textit{Ayre}, XI. “Ariadna en su Laberinto,” mm. 26 to 29 (bass only)

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{example34.png}
\caption{Ayre by Osvaldo Golijov \copyright\ Copyright by Imagem CV. Administered by Hendon Music, Inc., a Boosey & Hawkes company. Reprinted by permission.}
\end{figure}

Golijov states that “Solea” from Davis’ and Evans’ album \textit{Sketches of Spain} was one of the models for the movement.\footnote{Ibid., 30.} Although “Solea” does not feature the same meter, it is based on a traditional form of flamenco music called soleares, which uses a twelve-beat phrase with irregular accents on beats three, six, eight, ten, and twelve (see Example 35.1).
Example 35.1 Metric emphasis of traditional flamenco soleares

\[ \text{Soleares: } 1 \ 2 \ 3 \ 4 \ 5 \ 6 \ 7 \ 8 \ 9 \ 10 \ 11 \ 12 \]

Evans uses the snare drum in his version to play a bolero-like rhythm, which, along with the ostinato accompaniment of the band, produces a metric underpinning that is related to a traditional flamenco soleares (see Example 35.2).

Example 35.2 Gil Evans' “Solea,” reductive rhythmic transcription with appropriate accents indicated

The resulting effect allows Davis the freedom to improvise over the accompaniment, just as Golijov allows Upshaw in his version of “Por Qué Llorax, Blanco Niña” in an unevenly grouped $\frac{3}{4}$. Because the initial statement of the melody in Golijov’s version is without rhythmic accompaniment, an audience member would likely comprehend the melody in a standard $\frac{4}{4}$ time signature with a sense of rubato. As the rhythmic groove is established in the percussion in m. 22, the additional eighth note in the last beat gives it a particular lilt, which implies the sense of someone lost, wandering through Ariadne’s labyrinth.

The labyrinth is the final symbol introduced in the song cycle. Golijov is silent on its meaning, so I will propose a few theories. It may be simply an allusion to the

---

journey of Sephardic Jews after they were expelled from Andalusia and many
wandered the deserts of Northern Africa. But this symbol may also refer to
Argentina, Golijov’s homeland. In an interview with Habitus, Golijov states that his
Argentina was not the Argentina of the majority, but rather the “Argentina of
Borges.”

Jorge Luis Borges is an Argentine poet of Castilian descent who uses labyrinths as
symbols frequently in his works. In his short story, *The Two Kings and Their
Labyrinths*, Borges explores two distinctly different mazes, one of complexity built
by man, and one of simplicity built by God.

In the short story, the Babylonian King invites the Arab King to explore his complex,
man-made labyrinth. When the Arab King becomes disoriented and lost, the
Babylonian King mocks him. Upon finding his way out with the help of God, the
Arab King does not openly express his humiliation but instead states that he wishes
to someday show another labyrinth to the Babylonian King. Upon returning home
he assembles an army, attacks Babylonia, kidnaps the King, and takes him into the
desert where he releases him, free to roam in what he refers to as a labyrinth with
no stairs, doors, or walls. It is there that the Babylonian King dies of hunger and
thirst.

---

January 16, 2013).

The two types of labyrinths can both be related to Golijov’s song cycle. The blasphemy and complex labyrinth of the Babylonian King is like the complex political realities of the people displaced by mankind’s wars and the simple, yet vast desert labyrinth of the Arab King is the search for a new homeland by these displaced population, whether they are Jewish, Sardinian, or Palestinian.

In explaining to Schaefer why he decided to end the work with a long vocalise, Golijov states, “...when you are singing these [Jewish] spiritual songs, [or] any songs[,] the deepest moments come when the words disappear and a singer just says ‘Oh’ or ‘Oh Yeah’ or whatever” and that whether the music is Evan’s “Solea” from Sketches of Spain, Figureas’ “Por Qué Llorax, Blanco Niña”, a Jewish spiritual song, or his own “Ariadna en su Laberinto” it is in these moments that one is “climbing towards ecstasy over this repetitive process.”

Golijov allows the audience the time and space to reflect on the aspect of the work with which they most closely associated here at the end of the work.

The last statement of the A-theme at m. 174 is its final structural statement. The music unwinds from this point to the end of the work and concludes with the viola alone, just as Berio began his Folk Songs, further connecting the two works (see Example 36 and compare with Example 15.1 on page 123).

---

312 Schaefer, 30.
Example 36 Osvaldo Golijov’s *Ayre*, XI. “Ariadna en su Laberinto,” mm. 194 to end

Afforded the musical space to reflect on the journey, some will awe at the virtuosity of Upshaw and the members of the Andalucian Dogs, others may reflect on the nature of technology and evolution of folk music, while others may contemplate the literary and cultural connections that hold the work together.
Conclusion
When I first heard Upshaw's recording of *Ayre* several years ago, I was struck in equal measure by the inherent beauty of the songs and the uniquely colorful orchestration. The juxtaposition of brutal and serene images in both the text and the music drew me in and inspired me to examine the traditions of the numerous cultures Golijov explored. It also led me to question the historical context of the work itself.

In the first part of this document, I presented a historical narrative that places Golijov in a lineage of esteemed composers, including Bartók, Stravinsky, Copland, Gershwin, Ellington, Evans, Crumb, and Berio. I incorporate an alternative view of twentieth-century music history that places importance on how composers either incorporate or reject elements of the music and culture that is around them. This type of narrative is often overshadowed by the more typical, progressive view of music history where composers are valued for creating a new musical language or techniques. It is important not to dismiss either narrative, for each is but a single perspective on the complex and compelling evolution of music. Comparing the two narratives provides insight into the social pressures that I believe are evidenced in the work of Bartók and Stravinsky, as discussed in the first chapter, and continue to exist today.

Examining *Ayre* in the context of these narratives leads to interesting points of discussion. For example, just as Cage led many to question the nature of music in the middle of the twentieth century with his composition 4’33”, *Ayre* leads one to question the role of the composer at the beginning of the twenty-first century. In
the majority of classical compositions, the composer’s most important tasks are creating melodic and harmonic material. In the case as *Ayre*, however, Golijov makes it clear in the score that most of the pitch material of the work is derived from existing folk songs or was contributed by his friend and colleague Santaolalla. If that is the case, what was his role as a composer? Dismissing the work as nothing more than a series of arrangements or adaptations does not acknowledge his creativity and skill. Like the terms classical, popular, and folk, the labels composition, arrangement, and adaptation are often used to elevate or devalue the role of the person who assembles the musical elements of a work. As exemplified by compositions such as Berio’s *Folk Songs*, it is clear that a composer can rely heavily on pre-existing material and still be valued as a creative artist.

Although we often focus on pitch as one of the most important elements of composition, a composer’s creative energy can be steered in a number of other directions—including elegant voice leading (Bach), motivic development (Beethoven), expansive forms (Mahler), unique timbers (Crumb), and the embrace of indeterminacy (Cage). In the case of *Ayre*, I believe that two creative elements of the work stand out among the others.

The first is Golijov’s selection of specific folk materials and his engagement with the cultural context of each to comment on a larger issue. Outside of Berio’s *Folk Songs*, there are few examples of classical music that incorporate as many diverse styles of culturally identifiable music. The most famous example of a composer utilizing an example of culturally identifiable music may be the final movement of Beethoven’s
Ninth Symphony. There he incorporates the sounds of Turkish janissary music through the inclusion of the bass drum, cymbals, and triangle. These instruments make no other appearance in his symphonies and I believe the use of the Janissary percussion at this point reinforces the theme that “Alle Menschen werden Brüder” (“All men [both the Viennese and the Turks] become brothers”) from Friedrich Schiller’s text.

Golijov’s use of culturally identifiable music to create extra-musical meaning is similar to Beethoven’s but is distinctive for its breadth. Golijov draws on many historic cultures—including Andalusia, Sardinia and the Middle East—and weaves the material together in a compelling way to comment on the conflict between the Israelis and the Palestinians. Additionally, Golijov’s combination of the seemingly contradictory Christian, Jewish, and Islamic elements ultimately lead to an appreciation of their similarities.

The second is Golijov’s role as a bandleader or impresario. Like Ellington and Evans, Golijov excels at knowing his musicians and creating a framework to feature their strengths, thus utilizing their skills to create remarkable timbres. His familiarity with each musician is evident in the numerous examples that were discussed in the sixth chapter, from the way that he explores the many colors of Upshaw’s voice to the use of Krakauer, Dresser, Bergeman, and Flower as distinctive soloists throughout the cycle. This type of collaboration is not unique within the classical music world, but is more common in the realm of popular music. It allows the performers an unusual amount of freedom to interject themselves into the music, as
compared to some of the more highly determined qualities of music by composers like Boulez and Stockhausen, and demands a fine balance between providing a framework for the performers and specifying the details of each performance.

Although *Ayre* can be easily parsed using traditional means of harmonic analysis, these analytical tools yield little value. One must examine the cultural context of each individual movement and explore the themes that emerge in order to gain a greater appreciation for these creative elements of the work as we did in the final chapter. Because the cultural elements of the music are important in defining the meaning of the work, coming to terms with them presents unique challenges for performers who may not be familiar these styles of music or cannot work directly with the musicians from Andalucian Dogs to gain insight into the nuance of each part.

**An Approach to Performing the Work**

In composing *Ayre*, Golijov relied on the input from members of the band—as a composer in the case of Santaolalla, an improviser in the case of Bergeman, or an interpreter of the particular mannerisms needed to convey the meaning of each movement as with Upshaw and Krakauer. Observing the differences between the score and the recording and knowing the role that each of the original band members filled may even lead one to question whether the work is performable by anyone other than the group of musicians for which it was intended. However, an examination of the performance records available through Golijov’s publisher Boosey and Hawkes demonstrates that it has indeed become a popular work
throughout the world and has been performed by numerous sopranos and ensembles beside Upshaw and the Andalucian Dogs.\textsuperscript{313}

In light of this discussion, a strong performance of the work must be a result of more than simple virtuosic display. It will demand that the performers all study and understand the essence of the folk styles that they are appropriating so that the musical subtext shines through. Although Upshaw’s recording of the work may serve as an excellent starting point for study, I believe future performers will best reflect the essence of the work by internalizing the folk traditions and freeing themselves to approach the music in a highly personal style. This approach, as opposed to the act of imitation, will lead to a spirit of performance that echoes that experienced by Seeger when he first heard Jackson sing Appalachian folks songs for the Composers’ Collective and lead to a performance that more closely connects to the spirit in which the work was composed. Nevertheless, as would be the case with any composer or performer, once Golijov and his collaborators began to explore the music of other cultures and appropriate those musical traditions for the benefit of their careers, many issue arise.

\textbf{On Issues Surrounding Cultural Appropriation}

The act of borrowing musical elements from other cultures is common. We already explored these issues as they related to Ellington and Gershwin and one continues to find them in the popular music of Elvis Presley, Michael Jackson, Paul Simon, and Eminem. On Broadway, Disney’s production of \textit{The Loin King} repackages numerous

\footnote{\textsuperscript{313} http://www.boosey.com/pages/cr/calendar/perf_search.asp}
African folkloric traditions to wide popular appeal. In fact, without these cultural exchanges the popular musical styles of Argentine tango, Brazilian samba, Cuban son, and American jazz would not exist. But where does the boundary exist between acceptable musical fusion and exploitation?

I have limited my discussion thus far to an analysis of *Ayre* as a work of art, but I feel that it is important to note that this work raises possible concerns about the issues of cultural and religious appropriation in art music from an ethnomusicological perspective. While sharing the work with Sephardic friends, for example, I came to understand that they were highly impressed with Golijov’s technical and spiritual use of the Sephardic Jewish musical traditions. They seemed surprised and validated that their musical tradition was included in the work and demonstrated a sense of pride. Yet, when they listened to the tenth movement, which features the setting of the sacred text by Halevi and the musical portrayal of the Kaddish, they were concerned that it featured a woman singing.314 In the orthodox tradition, the text would normally only be sung by men, and they were concerned that some might find a woman presenting the music of the sacred service offensive.

The questions that arise from this issue and others found in the work are complex and worth noting, but do not yield simple answers. Was it right for Golijov to use sacred music to discuss subject matter that is at times secular in nature? Is it right that the Andalucian Dogs would tour and earn their living performing the sacred music of traditions other than their own for purposes for which the music was not

---

314 Conversation between the author, Ivette Azagury, and David Azagury on June 19, 2013.
intended? Was it acceptable for Golijov to use the Sephardic music from Andalusia because he is Jewish himself and had lived in Israel for three years, or is he too far removed from that tradition because he was raised within the Eastern-European Jewish immigrant population in Argentina?

There are many possible valid, yet contradictory answers to these questions. How Golijov's audience decides to answer them and what they take away from his work will determine whether it will outlive this generation. From the larger historical perspective, it is common for one generation to fashion its own values and aesthetics by appropriating or rejecting those of its predecessors, and discussions of this nature are thus the important and necessary means for the further evolution and development of musical traditions. In the case of tango, samba, son, and jazz, the specific details of these fusions are left to anecdotal accounts at best and little is known about the individuals who brought the musical styles together, which helps to diffuse any concern of individual abuse.

In this specific instance, I believe that the value of the work outweighs the concern. As evidenced by his knowledge of each of the cultures represented in *Ayre*, Golijov has demonstrated that he is genuinely interested in each tradition. Unlike the Iberian and Middle Eastern exoticism found in French opera in the late nineteenth century (Camille Saint-Saëns's *Samson et Dalila* or Bizet's *Carmen*, for example), Golijov's music accurately represents its models—a situation made possible by increased access to quality ethnomusicological research and authentic recordings available on the Internet. Although Upshaw and the Andalucian Dogs have toured
the work presumably as a commercial venture, the artistic and idealistic purpose of
the work is strong. Golijov’s disappointment in the current situation between the
Israelis and the Palestinians and his desire to highlight the common cultural
heritage of the three religions predominantly found around the Mediterranean Sea
appear genuine. In my personal situation (and I suspect in those of many others),
Ayre has inspired me to study new cultures and histories. In a time when
information is now readily available, works of art that inspire exploration have
great value. Of course, the concerns surrounding why and how to use sacred texts
and music will remain an issue, but as long as they are treated with respect and
deferece, one can make the decision to perform it on a case-by-case basis.

**Final Thoughts**

*Ayre* is a collage of folk songs and cultural references related to the region around
the Mediterranean Sea. Seemingly disconnected at first, each song offers a unique
perspective on the larger subject matter. Golijov juxtaposes historical references to
the Reconquista, the political turmoil of Sardinia in the early nineteenth century,
and the current conflict between Israelis and Palestinians, with love songs and
lullabies. This approach enriches the context of the work. The combination of these
historical and humanizing songs creates a framework to explore the commonalities
between Christianity, Judaism, and Islam, and by doing so Golijov exposes his hope
that although one generation may inadvertently harm future generations through
wars and injustice, hope and redemption are still possible.
Golijov credits many of the translations in the liner notes to the album and on his website to Hamete Benengeli, the fictional Moorish chronicler from Miguel de Cervantes’ *Don Quixote*. Since these same translations are credited to Golijov himself in the score, it is likely that Golijov is using the pen name in other locations for poetic reasons. By choosing Benengeli as a pen name, Golijov seems to align his role as the composer of *Ayre* with that of the fictional Benengeli, whom Cervantes describes as “the scrupulous investigator of the minutest details of this true history” and who recounts the tale of Don Quixote and Sancho. Cervantes opens Chapter 53 of the second part of *Don Quixote* by quoting Benengeli. Beyond the context of the novel, this quote is apropos for describing the historical narratives Golijov references through *Ayre*: cultural conflict gives way to greater understanding and the cycle begins again.

To think things in this life will endure forever in their current state is to think the unthinkable. It seems rather that life is circular, I mean, goes round and round. Spring pursues summer, summer harvest time, harvest time the fall, and fall winter, and winter spring, and time thus revolves on this ever-moving wheel. Only human life races to its end, even swifter than time itself, without any hope of renewing itself, but rather it’s in the other life where time has no limits to curb it.

---

316 Cervantes, second part, chapter 50.
317 Ibid., chapter 53.
Bibliography

Grouped by:

Books
Journal Articles
Dictionaries and Encyclopedias
Newspapers and Magazines
Dissertations
Websites
Musical Scores
Recordings
Visual Art

Books


**Journal Articles**


Crist, Elizabeth. “Aaron Copland’s Third Symphony from Sketch to Score.” *Journal of Musicology* 18, no. 3. (Summer 2001): 377-405.


Dictionaries and Encyclopedias


Newspapers and Magazines


Segal, Lewis. "Playing Detective with Stravinsky: By juxtaposing the composer’s 'Les Noces' with Russian folk music, the Pokrovsky Ensemble is bringing an international debate over the masterwork’s origins to Brentwood." Los Angeles Times, January 28, 1996.


Dissertations


Websites


The Silk Road Project. www.silkroadproject.org.

Musical Scores


**Recordings**


Hespèrion XXI. *Diáspora Sefardí*. Barcelona: Alia Vox, 1999. CD.


Visual Art


