RICE UNIVERSITY

A Leaky House: Haiti in the Religious Aftershock Of the 2010 Earthquake

By

Nicole Payne Carelock

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE

Doctor of Philosophy

APPROVED THESIS COMMITTEE:

James D. Faubion, Professor, Chair
Department of Anthropology

Eugenia Georges, Professor
Department of Anthropology

Edward L. Cox, Associate Professor
Department of History

Drexel Woodson, Associate Research Anthropologist at the University of Arizona

HOUSTON, TEXAS
MAY 2012
Abstract.

My research explores nation building, religious conflict and Christian democratization in Post-earthquake Haiti. Christians I spoke with blamed Vodou for the destructive quake. In Haiti, Vodouisants now require UN protection to practice their faith. The thick religious tension in Haiti post-earthquake could portend deep political riffs and dangerous religious persecution. What is more, the quake has effectively shut down government, leaving in its wake essentially an NGO Republic. Moreover, some sectors of the population, particularly the very poor in the black majority, have been converting to evangelical Christianity at very high rates. About the conversions Vodouisants say, "Kay koule twompe soley soley men li pa twompe lapil." A leaky house can fool the sun, but it can’t fool the rain. I took this notion of a leaky house from the discussion with a Vodouisant research participant who often compared the massive conversions to an incomplete and quick cover for the inner turmoils of the Haitian subject. I expanded this phrase to work as analogy for the significant evangelical/NGO infrastructure in Haiti. Can this leaky house last as the pseudo-governmental body of Haiti?

Problem: A devastating 7.0 Earthquake rocked Haiti on January 12th, 2010. By January 24th, at least 52 aftershocks measuring 4.5 or greater had been recorded (CBS News 2010). Cite’ De Soleil has turned into a devastating battleground--Vodouisants against Christians. Christian evangelicals have a carte blanche to intervene into the lives of devastated Haitians, also into the Haitian government. Struggling with insufficient capacity in the face of overwhelming poverty and
environmental disasters, the Haitian government has capsized in what many are calling a religious coup d'état. At least 10,000 religious non-governmental organizations (NGOs) are operating in Haiti.

Against this background, the actual hypothesis to be tested in this research is that the conversion from Vodou to most sectors of evangelical Christianity and the subsequent violence against Vodou practitioners is, in the case of some of my research participants, actually a modality for expatriation from, or incorporation into, the New Haitian body politic.
Table of Contents

ABSTRACT .......................................................................................................................... II
TABLE OF CONTENTS ....................................................................................................... IV
DEDICATION ....................................................................................................................... VI
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS ........................................................................................................ VII
LIST OF FIGURES ........................................................................................................... VIII
NEEDEFUL THINGS .......................................................................................................... IX
INTRODUCTION ................................................................................................................ 1
  Delineation –not just a river in Egypt ............................................................................. 6
  Rapture and Rupture ......................................................................................................... 10
LITERATURE REVIEW ..................................................................................................... 16
  Trauma .............................................................................................................................. 17
  Ethics ................................................................................................................................. 23
  Haitian Nationalism and History ...................................................................................... 28
    Nationalism in a broader context ................................................................................... 37
  Conclusion ......................................................................................................................... 39
METHODS ........................................................................................................................... 40
  A note on Methodological (and Actual) Agnosticism: .................................................... 40
  Forgive me Father- in which I will divulge two cardinal sins of objectivity ..................... 42
  Ordering My Steps ......................................................................................................... 44
  Research Design and Methods ....................................................................................... 47
  Answering Research Objectives .................................................................................... 55
    Field consultant/ translator .......................................................................................... 61
    Data analysis ................................................................................................................. 63
    Methodological problems ......................................................................................... 64
CHOKING UP BLOOD ....................................................................................................... 66
  The NGO Landscape .................................................................................................... 69
  A New Thing .................................................................................................................. 78
  Class and the Battle for Haiti ........................................................................................ 82
  Winning Haiti For Jesus ................................................................................................. 88
  That Vodou That You Do ............................................................................................... 89
  Blood on the Ground ...................................................................................................... 97
  Conclusion ....................................................................................................................... 102
EVANGELIZATION NATION ............................................................................................ 105
  A Star Is Born ............................................................................................................... 107
  Strongholds and Principalities: Ethical work to Nationalist Ends .................................. 117
    Race to the top ............................................................................................................. 145
    Blonde Jesus ................................................................................................................ 150
  Conclusion ...................................................................................................................... 151
THE BELL OF THE BALL: HAITI AS THE IDEAL TYPE ................................................ 154
| 9/11 FLEETING FEVER | 155 |
| Things you can tell just by looking | 158 |
| HOW TO LOSE FRIENDS AND ALIENATE PEOPLE: WCM IN INDONESIA | 161 |
| What’s Good for the Goose | 164 |
| The Devil vs Allah | 165 |
| Women + Men = Fail | 166 |
| Follow the Money | 167 |
| NARRATIVIZING THE DISASTER | 169 |
| MEN ARE FROM MARS: GENDER DIFFERENCES IN CONVERSION | 178 |
| CONCLUSION | 180 |

CONCLUSION ................................................................. 182

THE CONSTANT GARDNER .................................................. 185

METHODOLOGICAL CONSIDERATIONS .................................. 186

SIGNIFICANCE AND DIRECTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH ......... 187

LIMITATIONS ........................................................................ 188

Significance, or A Cautionary Tale: Uganda in Brief .................. 189

NOTHING NEW UNDER THE SUN ......................................... 191
DEDICATION

To my amazing mother thank you for spending your days working long shifts and your nights letting your youngest child talk you to death. To my Loving Daughter Zonë - a kick in the pants if I ever needed one, and my infinitely supportive husband Heath F Carelock
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS.

This work would not have been possible without the financial support of the Rice University Provost Award, The Humanities Research Center, The Center for the Study of Women Gender and Sexuality, and the Rice University Waggoner International Travel Award.

I am especially indebted to Dr. Drexel Woodson whose witty correspondence kept me afloat during trying academic times, and Dr. Eugenia Georges, Chair of the department of Anthropology, Dr Elizabeth Vann Mentor of my dreams all of whom have been supportive of my career goals and who worked actively to provide me with the protected academic time to pursue those goals.

I am grateful to all of those with whom I have had the pleasure to work during this and other related projects. Each of the members of my Dissertation Committee has provided me extensive personal and professional guidance and taught me a great deal about both ethnographic research and life in general.

I would especially like to thank Dr James Faubion, the chairman of my committee. As my teacher and mentor, he has taught me more than I could ever give him credit for here. He has shown me, by his example, what a good anthropologist (and person) should be. It has been my herculean ethical work to form my scholarly self in his image.

I am further indebted to Dr Alexis Givvens and his wonderful family, Also amazing translators, friends and research assistants Gloria Givvens Gonzales and Franc A

Nobody has been more important to me in the pursuit of this project than the members of my family. I would like to thank my mother, whose love and guidance are with me in whatever I pursue. Most importantly, I wish to thank my loving and supportive Husband, Heath, and my wonderful child, Zonë.
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1 Island Of Hispaniola Source: CIA World Factbook ........................................... 46
Figure 2 Number and Frequency of Interviews by Social Class ........................................... 54
Figure 3 Damaged Alexander Petion Source: AP Getty .................................................... 57
Figure 4 What is Left of Haitian National Patrimony Source: Author .................................. 57
Figure 5 Girl Crossing the Street Source: Author ................................................................. 65
Figure 6 Haitian Girl being healed with the power of touch. Source Huffington Post .......................... 65
Figure 7 Interactive NGO Map. Source: InterAction.org ..................................................... 68
Figure 8 USAID NGO Map. Source: USAID ...................................................................... 72
Figure 9 Donald Watson not buying my explanation of Black poverty in the US Source: Author ......................................................................................................................... 74
Figure 10 Vodou practitioners protect their head as they practice outside. Source: Sommedevilla ........................................................................................................................................ 79
Figure 11 UN forces break up violence that erupted at a Vodou ceremony. Source: Sommedevilla ........................................................................................................................................ 94
Figure 12 Last of Vodou Practitioners Run for Cover under a hail of stones. Source: Sommedevilla ........................................................................................................................................ 95
Figure 13 The 10/40 Window Source: Joshua Project.org ....................................................... 125
Figure 14 National Prayer Meeting in front of ruined capitol. Source: Author .......................... 137
Figure 15 Perspectives Worksheet of political/social methodology ........................................ 140
Figure 16 Haitian Christians Pray openly everywhere. Source: AP Getty ............................... 141
Figure 17 White Jesus at Prayer Meeting. Source: Author ..................................................... 146
Figure 18 Rachel With "Marie" who she has given water to after a rousing Puppet show. Source Author ...................................................................................................................................... 148
Figure 19 Pastor Pierre and His Wife Bridget and I. Source: Author ........................................ 157
Figure 20 WWII poster Source: Truman Library Images ......................................................... 184
Figure 21 Men Rebuilding an Earthquake Reinforced wall. Source: Author ............................ 192
Needful Things

The Appendix is video heavy. As such, I have decided to dedicate an entire site to it Digital Appendix. (http://www.wix.com/ndp115/digitalappendix) Please consult these videos throughout the work as they add depth and richness to the analysis. Each chapter has its own page and own tab on the right hand menu.

Pseudonyms: I have changed the name of all of my informants save Jamie Holt who waived her right to confidentiality. I have tried to keep descriptions rich while keeping significant identifying detail. I have identified by photography four participants Rachel, Donald, John-Paul and Pastor Pierre all of which waived off confidentiality but did not want to use their real names for varying reasons.

Transcriptions and Translations: All of my interviews were recorded in Spanish, Creole, and English. I transcribed my interviews in Creole with assistance from Illisye P. who worked as a translator and assistant transcriptionist. Any mistakes in Creole transcription and translation are my own.

Use of Vodou

Through out this document I use the academically acceptable spelling of the word. Though I cringe at such academic posturing and contortions, I will pick my battles. When writing about religion in Haiti, I found myself inevitably confronted with the exoticism racism and othering inherent in the term Voodoo. Many of my participants were aware of the exoticism and negativity their religion was associated with but they attributed that (as they well should have) to racism-- not spelling. When writing an ethnography that includes a word laden with meaning negatively and positively charged for both the ethnographer and the interlocutors, do you sacrifice ethnographic complexity and “thick” description to ensure that everyone has a pleasant time reading it? The tension in the word, its seductive repulsion is exactly the juncture in which I find some of my interlocutors simultaneously compelled and repelled. As new Christians they struggle with Voodoo with all of its implications and connotations. It provokes my skepticism to think the Creole orthography of the word changes the power structure, denotation, or popular imaginings of the religion. This, academic legerdemain lends nothing to the larger discussion of racism and Judeo-Christian hegemony. It is as if scholars have made a tacit agreement to not challenge the western racist imaginary and have simply decided to call it (that is, voodoo the proper English transliteration of the Haitian religion) something different. Have we given up on speaking truth to power?
Introduction

The Rev. Clinton Rabb was trapped in darkness under the rubble of the
Hotel Montana in Port-au-Prince, his legs crushed under a concrete pillar that
collapsed during the Jan. 12 earthquake that rocked Haiti. As a rescue team worked
to free him more than two days into his ordeal, he managed to eke out two messages
for a London reporter: That he loved his wife very deeply, and that Haiti made a deal
with the devil and God was the only way out of this mess. (CBC NEWS)

My research explores nation building, religious conflict and Christian
democratization in Post-earthquake Haiti. Christians I spoke with blamed Vodou for
the destructive quake. In Haiti, Vodouisants now require UN protection to practice
their faith. The thick religious tension in Haiti post earthquake could portend deep
political riffs and dangerous religious persecution. What is more, the quake has
effectively shut down government, leaving in its wake essentially an NGO Republic.
Moreover, some sectors of the population, particularly the very poor in the black
majority, have been converting to evangelical Christianity at very high rates. About
the conversions Vodouisants say, "Kay koule twompe soley soley men li pa twompe
lapil." A leaky house can fool the sun, but it can’t fool the rain. I took this notion of a
leaky house from the discussion with a Vodouisant research participant who often
compared the massive conversions to an incomplete and quick cover for the inner turmoils of the Haitian subject. I expanded this phrase to work as analogy for the significant evangelical/NGO infrastructure in Haiti. Can this leaky house last as the pseudo-governmental body of Haiti?

Problem: A devastating 7.0 Earthquake rocked Haiti on January 12th, 2010. By January 24th, at least 52 aftershocks measuring 4.5 or greater had been recorded (CBS News 2010). The Haitian government reported that an estimated 230,000 people perished in the quake, 300,000 had been injured and 1,000,000 made homeless (BBC news 2010). The entire world's eyes rested on the most destitute country in the western hemisphere. And what they saw was conversion to charismatic Protestantism in droves (Baptist Press 2010). Tiny cinderblock churches were being built at breakneck speed; pastors and ministers reported that they were four or five times over capacity. What followed were violent attacks on Vodou practitioners, lynchings, maiming and stonings (ABC news 2010). Cite' De Soleil has turned into a devastating battleground--Vodouisants against Christians. Christian evangelicals have a carte blanche to intervene into the lives of devastated Haitians, also into the Haitian government. Struggling with insufficient capacity in the face of overwhelming poverty and environmental disasters, the Haitian government has capsized in what many are calling a religious coup d'état. At least 10,000 religious non-governmental organizations (NGOs) are operating in Haiti.

Against this background, the actual hypothesis to be tested in this research is that the conversion from Vodou to most sectors of evangelical Christianity and the subsequent violence against Vodou practitioners is, in the case of some of my
research participants, actually a modality for expatriation from, or incorporation into, the New Haitian body politic. Theoretically these conversions can be understood as a “process of subjectification” (Ong, 1999: 7) as they allow individuals to transform themselves into proper subjects of the reimagined post-earthquake Haitian state. More specifically, I focus on these practices in order to realize three major research objectives:

- Religion and Nationalism: To understand how these religious transformations can also be mechanisms of citizenship.
- Conversion and Cultural context: To discover the racial, political and economic complexities of Christian conversions in Haiti.
- Conversion and ethical work: To determine the ethical tools missionaries deploy and that converts employ to justify both religious violence and vigorous self-reformation.

Using a multifaceted methodology that encompasses traditional ethnography, media studies and storytelling, my research will examine how a subset of the population cultivate religious criteria to gain the rights and privileges of a Haitian national, and productively relate concrete individual practices of belonging to more abstract notions of nation building.

I do not mean to create a monolithic missionary or a one-dimensional convert. Potential converts differ widely in status, gender, and social identity (e.g., Beidelman 1982; Comaroff and Comaroff 1986; Spear 1999). Approximately 70 percent of my Haitian interlocutors were blacks from low socioeconomic backgrounds while 25 percent were black middle class, and five percent mulatto--all
living in Port-au-Prince. As a result most of my findings will represent a subset of Haitian Ideology--urban, displaced or dispossessed, and invested in Haitian nationalist narratives. Missionary societies as well differ in their social and cultural background, in their interpretation of Christianity, in strategies and methods, and in their attitude toward political administrations. My missionary interlocutors were largely middle class (over 90 percent). A large number of them resided in Little Rock Arkansas (60 percent) while the remainder lived all over the world. First, the success of the Christian mission is intimately related to the conflicts between social classes in Haiti, which carry with it racial overtones1.

Everything is Haiti is more complex than it seems. I explore in this project the intersection of forms of state sovereignty and the experience of citizen agency. I thus hope to illuminate how citizens understand and experience changing configurations of state power as enabling conditions of their own moral and ethical capacities. The desire for stability is one expression of particular forms of state power as they are lived and experienced by a portion of the black population. A rapturous shift in the Haitian state's ability to contain or maintain its own sovereignty reveals the intimate links between research participants sense of self as moral and agentive subjects and the conditions that structure state power. This desire to "remake Haiti" illuminates how some seek out and express a desire to be subject to disciplinary “regimes of power and truth”2.

---

1 as the elites tend to be lighter skinned the converts tend to be darker and the missionaries tended to be white
2 Foucault defines 'regimes of truth' as the historically specific mechanisms which produce discourses which function as true in particular times and places.
In light of nationalism and its ties to agentive capacity, the idea of being a viable state also has a key moral dimension in Haiti. The talk of Haitian nationalism within lower and middle class blacks typically started with discussions of lifestyle and policy but often ended with a language of moral decay, corruption, and political ineptitude. They attributed others’ lack of will or ability to realize goals to moral failure brought on by a corrupting environment. Interestingly, the mulatto participants similarly linked the instability of material life in Haiti directly to the disintegration of a system of values; the difference perhaps lies in whom each group ultimately blames for this moral decay. Given this particular understanding of ethical positioning that correlates an inner state with outer actions, it is not impossible to make the leap between creating a morally upright inside to actively transform the nation. For example, on an interminably hot and humid afternoon I was sitting with a pastor and his wife. It was after a packed church service where he “brought the house down” with his sermon on seeking God for spiritual answers. He told me “the problem with Haiti is that it has no moral center.” I asked if he meant the people or the country and he immediately answered “both. I mean one type of soullessness begets another right?” It is not a surprise given the information detailed above and the world domination (not hyperbole, as illustrated in later chapters) of NGOs like the World Christian Movement, that Haitian citizens I spoke with would focus on a set of moral practices as central to the reconstitution of Haiti as a viable international operator. In turn, citizen agency is bound in important ways to state health and sovereignty.
**Delineation – not just a river in Egypt**

First let us define what we mean by conversion. Let us immediately clearly discriminate between conversions. Social-science discussions have frequently considered systematic reorganization of individual beliefs and meaning systems and radical personal change to be characteristics of conversion processes (Nock 1933; Horton 1975; James 1982; Snow and Machalek 1984; Rambo 1999;). However, this conceptualization is based too strongly on the Christian idea of conversion, limiting its usefulness for cross-cultural comparison. The change from one religious community to another does not necessarily imply a change in fundamental convictions, "ultimate grounding" or "root reality." Vodou is a perfect example of African root reality surviving conversion. Numerous continuities with pre-conversion religious ideas and practices can be detected in African Christianity (cf., e.g., Bond 1987; Ranger 1987; Pels 1993; Giblin 1999 Hodgson 1999). The typical missionary perception of Christianity and indigenous religions as discrete systems of belief was not always shared by indigenous people (Comaroff and Comaroff 1991; Landau 1999). Moreover, there are several perspectives present in any one-conversion situation: those of the convert, the adherents of the new religion, and the group from which the convert has come. It is obvious that these perspectives can vary (Merrill 1993). Finally, conceiving conversion primarily as a radical change in personal beliefs runs the risk of neglecting the social context in which individual religious change takes place.

It seems more promising to conceptualize conversion as a social process encompassing "an adjustment in self-identification through the at least nominal
acceptance of religious actions or beliefs deemed more fitting, useful, or true” (Hefner 1993). In contrast to the absolute juxtaposition of believer and heathen so typical of Christianity, this does not preclude the possibility that several moral authorities and identities can coexist, each having only local or situational validity (e.g. Bond 1987).

Christian mission has a long history as both a form of internationalization and as a force that has been tied to other forms of spatiotemporal phenomena. In addition, there have been close (though complicated) connections between Christian missions and other globalizing forces like commerce and colonialism. I however will not travel down that oft beaten path of Christianity and globalization theory. Globalization has taken on a life of its own, scholars make the argument that it presides over the many varieties of cultural imperialism whether that be identified with American culture (Smith 1990), the West (Giddens 1990), or core countries (Hannerz 1990). Most political/institutional orientations, emphasizes either homogeneity or heterogeneity. Meyer et al. (1997), for example, focuses on the nation-state, more specifically, the existence of worldwide models of the state and the emergence of isomorphic forms of governance. Keohane and Nye (1989) focus on the global influence of a multiplicity of institutions. Hobsbawm (1997) and Appadurai (1996) see transnational institutions and organizations greatly diminishing the power of both the nation-state and other, more local social structures to make a difference in people's lives. This is the phenomenon that Barber (1995) has termed "McWorld," (MacDonald’s being a ubiquitous symbol of US global domination) the antithesis of which is "Jihad”—localized, ethnic, and
reactionary political forces (including "rogue states") that involve an intensification of nationalism and lead to greater heterogeneity (Barber 1995; also Appadurai 1996).

I shy away from a discussion of globalization because it strikes me as a totalizing discourse that oversignifies spatiotemporal relations and deemphasizes the power and vitality of the nation. Consequently, I feel explanations of social phenomena that claim to be based on globalization analyses are always beset by one of two problems. Either they are indifferent to the qualitative form of specific social relations (e.g. why did MacDonald’s fail in Jamaica? The US’ own back yard?)-- which render them incapable of explaining the sources of power and causation of specific social phenomena (which strikes me as the point of ethnography); or, alternatively the explanation turns out to have included these other sources of causality all along, in which case its designation as a specifically globalized explanation is largely unnecessary.

A second reason why globalization theory will not figure prominently in my research is essentially because the major tenets of that theory, despite all of the literature devoted to them, have yet to prove itself as at least a possibility. The real-world basis on which globalization theorists erect their arguments is the rising volume of transnational flows and relations in the contemporary international system — and the idea that these must at some point qualify, transform or even spell the end of the territorial principle of political sovereignty and/or its supposed economic, sociological, cultural and philosophical corollaries (Weiss, 1999, 64). This, quite frankly, has never happened and continues to not happen. After all, the
course of events in the real world has radically diverged from the historical expectations associated with the idea of globalization. “Through a process of progressive, incremental change,” predicted David Held and Anthony McGrew in 1998, “geo-political forces will come to be socialized into democratic agencies and practices” (1998, 242). If anything, however, recent international developments — including the stymieing of international initiatives, the crippling of the international criminal court, and the multiple crises of the international organizations (UN, NATO, EU) in the governance of international wars like Libya and Afghanistan — have been dominated by the very opposite process: a vigorous reassertion of national interests. Globalization is the great ghost in the anthropological machine. She is the telephone psychic with the put on Jamaican accent who turns every event into evidence of herself and her power, yet portends nothing.

However, the World Christian Movement, as the name suggest, is a global phenomenon, and I do not mean to suggest that there is no relationship between world and local phenomena. This work, however acknowledges that the meanings of such practices are still significantly mitigated by important institutions that continue to exist between the global and the local (i.e. the state).

Further delineation forces me to discuss religion itself. The nature of religion itself poses both a conceptual and empirical problem. It is out of the scope of this dissertation to discuss the definition of religion. Better scholars than I have tried and failed at even a cursory definition. But I will make a slight delineation. I have made a decision to step away from the intertangling of magic and religion especially with respect to Vodou. I am purposely not including particular literature on magic
and culture for two reasons: 1) It conjures up images of voluptuous assistants, fake tans, and pet tigers, 2) the uses of that word is also a bit of a wink to one’s community of readers. It is a nod to feigned objectivity that borders on the patronizing. It indicates that the ethnographer is privy to an intricate knowledge that the subjects of ethnographic inquiry will never know: that it is all smoke and mirrors, that the voluptuous assistant is in fact not sawed in half but crammed uncomfortably in the anterior cabin. This ethnographer with knowledge of the way the world “really works” has summed up an entire people’s complex belief system into a 60-dollar show on the Vegas strip. There will be no nudges to the audience here. I take my participants experience at face value because their truth is what I am actually seeking. I am in no rush to prove my Boasian objectivity. Magic is not a neutral word. It is laden with colonial presuppositions about whence power and knowledge.

**Rapture and Rupture**

Anthropology has long been concerned with the ethics of its own practice. But a new field is emerging that sees the exploration of a people's ethical life (How people create themselves in specific contexts and parameters) as an indispensible anthropological task. A growing consensus, even beyond anthropology, has it that people’s commonplace styles of reasoning, everyday linguistic competencies, and range and density of emotion and sensibility all express a palpable ethical dimension that is ripe for ethnographic exploration.
It is conventionally understood that ethics is fundamentally related to freedom. Without some degree of freedom from external coercion, without some level of self-mastery over the passions of the kind involved in the cultivation and exercise of virtues, ethical agency would seem impossible. So entrenched is this understanding that even Foucault, who did so much to critique the subject–agent of liberal freedom, nevertheless saw freedom as intrinsic to, and an indispensible condition for, ethics. One question raised in my research, however, by this emphasis on freedom is the place of authority within, as part of, ethical action. This question of authority becomes all the more acute if it is acknowledged—as it is by many especially anthropologists—that orientations, behaviors self-styling rituals however rationally universalizable they may be, are nevertheless historically acquired, rooted in inherited traditions.

The critical method of this project proceeds by way of historical juxtaposition and narrative flow. I am not trying to present a historical teleology but one of eruptions of Evangelical Haiti, of earthquake shaken Haiti, of nascent Haiti.

This work is divided into seven parts. The first is a literature review in which I sketch out my theoretical framework as well as introduce issues in the relationship between the anthropology and psychology of trauma, the burgeoning field of anthropological ethics and Haitian nationalism. I argue that the anthropology of trauma, including some psychological work, seems to point to the importance of community building after disasters and to how governments and NGOs can have the wrong strategy of social renewal. I show that WCM has implemented a unique social needs-based community restructuring that has resonated with thousands in black,
impoverished communities and precipitated massive conversions in densely populated areas. I also discuss the ethical turn in anthropology. I contend that Faubion’s model of ethical engagement with the anthropological subject handles complexity much better than the standard Foucauldian model. In the discussion of Haitian nationality, I try to create a landscape where hurried conversions, loss of nationalism and herculean “ethical work” are all intrinsically reasonable reactions post earthquake.

In the Chapter two, I grapple with and explain my methodology. I take on my positionality as a black, pregnant, female even Christian anthropologist in the field. My troubled perspective on conversion and the entire evangelical project will also be developed in this chapter. John and Jean Comaroff have questioned the usefulness of conversion as an analytical category. They believe that, given the mounting evidence of the shallow-rootedness of the new faith, the meaning of conversion itself became debatable. In this section I want to reintroduce the notion of conversion as a much more wide-ranging set of activities that questions the one-way orientation usually associated with conversion. The converter imparts revelatory spiritual wisdom on the converted and voila! I wish to show that conversion is a process of examining one’s life and physical body and changing it for both the missionary and for manipulation of one’s outside life. Whether these conversions are shallow-rooted or not is underneath my anthropological interest. How they employ Christianity for the betterment of their nation or of their own social standing has captured my attention.
In the next chapter, I recount the ambiguous intersections of Christianity and Vodou together with place, island, and nation in a modern Haitian state. I do so through a series of "snapshots," mostly of mundane settings, which chart the powerful, mobile interplay of individual and community in the self-representations and actions of conversion. I attempt to map out the messy NGO landscape in Haiti, as well as bring into focus the class-mediated struggle for Haiti's future. The snapshots juxtapose local and wider aspects of early convert past and present lives as Christians and Haitian citizens, locating them successively in the international cosmopolitanism of World Christianity and in national contexts.

The fourth chapter is a historical analysis of the World Christian Movement--its ubiquitous presence in Haiti and around the world and its particular and controversial social justice approach to evangelization. I discuss at great length the process of NGO-ification of Haiti and the means by which a particular NGO - the World Christian Movement (WCM) is able to take up the governmental processes of the nation. How does its “proxy” status effect citizens’ concept of the real seat of Haitian power? How does the softening of Haiti's borders to international aid workers and the relaxing of state systematicity imperil state sovereignty? Jansen’s (2009) notion of an everyday geopolitics captures the ways in which the negotiation of state power and sovereignty becomes simultaneously an intimate and state-making experience produced by civil examinations, questioning (or not questioning), and review of citizenship or naturalization documents. I argue that NGO’s have enacted processes with the Haitian government that cede national power from Haiti. Taking from Scott’s (1999) Seeing like a State, I argue that secular
and non secular NGO’s “read” citizens with the intent of determining applicability. These processes are enabled by a bundle of institutional, personal and ideological relations that are both produced and signaled in the act of “Aid” or “Help.” Deciding who gets aid, deciding who will gain favor with international groups, and determining one’s level of Christian faith all -are important metrics used by organizations to single out “leaders” and “good examples”.

In this chapter, I also discuss the ethical dimensions of conversion, and explore the concept of the “regime of living” as a tool for mapping specific sites of ethical problematization – that is, situations in which the question of how to live is at stake. What tools have the WCM and the targets of conversion used to recreate themselves and transform their circumstances? How do we reconcile the notion of individual freedom with circumscribed “regimes of truth” this particular brand of Christianity advocates?

The fifth chapter seeks to unpack the evangelical strategy of choosing an ideal country to evangelize and the problems that ensue when that strategy goes wrong. When complicated by race and economic disadvantage, evangelical altruistic missions tend to mirror World Bank, IMF and other large development organizations’ development goals-- even though the line between world in “need of evangelization” and the world with “less need” is negligible. In this chapter, I also talk about the gendering of disaster with respect to nationhood. The language of a “ruined and ravaged country” conjures up imagery of defiled women, ripped clothing gathered at their breast in the darkened alleyway of a Victorian London
street. This gendering of the state’s disaster works to propel masculinist narratives like evangelical Christianity to savior status.

In advancing the case for an ethical approach to conversion, I hope to unwrench formally dichotomized paradigms like radical self-choice versus traditional modalities of identity formation like nationalism.

In the conclusion, I contend that the WCM with its sociopolitical focus was aptly situated to take over the nationalist narrative in Haiti. As trauma disintegrates old narrative structures, new ones have to be built. In disaster interventions, lofty ideas about salvation and renewal are worked out in small-scale and frequently messy interactions among people. Anthropological attention to these encounters help scholars and understand the limits and possibilities of development and international intervention and state building after a potentially all-encompassing disaster.
Literature Review

I have yet to see any problem, however complicated, which, when you looked at it the right way, did not become still more complicated. -- Paul Alderson (1926-...)

Complexity is hard to demonstrate. The academic landscape is vast and this literature review does not pretend to be exhaustive. I have chosen three disparate literatures because they give me the most insight into the events in Haiti after the earthquake. It contextualizes Haiti’s fraught relationship with missionaries and foreign para-colonial powers and delineates a new framework for understanding the complexities of religious conversion. This review brings into conversation three essential literatures: the mutability of Haitian nationalism, the ethics and self-care, and the anthropology and psychology of trauma. These three literatures highlight the dynamic tension and cosmic collision of the traumatic collapse of the Haitian state, and the modernist ethical self-renewal in the form of Christian nationality. Through the interweaving of these topics, one may understand
the precariousness of Haitian nationhood with respect to the World Christian Movement.

**Trauma**

We entered the 21st century inhabiting a world of wars, occupations, destruction, insurgency and survival that affect collective existence as well as the most intimate dimensions of personal life. Traumatic experience is at once ever present as a contemporary dimension of life and death. The individualized, biographical and visual representations of violent and traumatic events have become central pieces in the construction of evidence and of cultural and political reality. A debate rages over where the notion of trauma actually belongs. Is it housed in psychology, being primarily a function of the mind, or can it be anthropological? My literature review does not choose a side as I draw from psychological and anthropological texts to understand the phenomena in Haiti. A distinction is often made between a traumatic event and “psychological trauma,” the impact on the individual when experiencing a traumatic event. Frequently, the word ‘trauma’ is used as shorthand for both. In addition, the term ‘trauma’ can designate the impact of traumatic events on individuals. Thus ‘trauma’ designates both events and their impact, in part because the experience of death disease and the assault that experience poses to sense of self, safety, belonging, and connection are intertwined.

I left out the word ‘psychological’ as a descriptor of the word ‘trauma’ on purpose. Calling the impact that traumatic events have on individuals “psychological trauma” fits nicely with the biomedical model with its sharp division
between body and mind and its erasure of the spiritual or religious; it also fits nicely with the individualizing tendency of Western culture in general and of biomedicine in particular (Conrad, 1975; Farmer, 2004; Scheper-Hughes & Lock, 1987; Zola, 1972). Perhaps partially because the word ‘trauma’ is embedded in the diagnosis but also for other complex reasons, “psychological trauma” is too often equated solely with Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD). Research on the effects and results of tragedy and natural disaster focuses too heavily on PTSD. For example, psychological interventions, focused on PTSD, have played an increasingly prominent role in the response to political violence in the former Yugoslavia (Weine et al. 1995), in disaster relief following Hurricane Mitch in Central America in 1998 and Katrina in New Orleans (Caldera et al. 2001; Goenjian et al. 2001) and the Kobe Earthquake in Japan (Breslau 2000), and in studies of refugee populations (Mghir and Raskin 1999; Sack et al. 1997).

In omitting this term I do not deny the existence of PTSD, but mean to underscore that not every impact of trauma is psychological in the sense of mental health diagnoses or labels. If trauma is seen in exclusively psychological language, our questions will be framed in psychological terms and the answers gleaned from those who experience trauma will be framed in that way. Ashraf Kagee, a South African psychologist, demonstrated this in his qualitative study of the impact of torture on men and women imprisoned during the Apartheid era. Wary of “the effect of demand characteristics,” which is just a technical way of saying that questions shape answers and therefore shape what we learn, he chose not to administer a standardized clinical checklist, questionnaire, or structured interview
tied to diagnostic criteria. Instead he asked a series of "open-ended questions to learn participants’ understandings of the ways that their experience of abuse has affected or is presently affecting their lives" (Kagee, 2004, 627). Unprompted by specific questions, study participants mentioned symptoms 11 times that can be construed as psychological and, indeed, meet PTSD diagnostic criteria. Much more frequently, however, they spoke about “[g]eneral health concerns,” current “economic concerns,” and “dissatisfaction with the present political situation in South Africa,” all of which they related to their experience of trauma and all of which would not have been revealed had the interview been restricted to clinical questionnaires (Kagee, 2004, p. 627-628). What Kagee did but was unable to admit was a mini ethnography of trauma. He utilized the tools of anthropology to get a contextualized look at devastating events in his patients’ lives.

New ethnographies of social experience and subjectivity are remaking theory and scholarship. Scholars have examined studies of illness, violence, and cultural responses to other forms of human problems as well as to other human conditions. In most of these works, emphasis is on the methodology and style of writing experience-oriented ethnographies as well as on studies of changes in subjectivity and moral experience in times of social transformation, and the contribution they make to social theory, moral theory, and policy. Through the literature of trauma, I am interested in rethinking human experience as a social process. In my research, I focused on the constant renarration of Haiti’s earthquake as a potential for refounding the nation. I wanted to investigate these notions of trauma as somehow
being for the people’s own good, and the political employment and deployment of
suffering as a call to action against secular government.

I have found most useful Didier Fassin and Richard Rechtman’s (2009) fascinating work *Empire of Trauma.* They are concerned with the ways in which the category of the victim is shaped in debates about moral legitimacy. Their book is determinedly neutral on the much-debated question of whether trauma is best understood anthropologically, as a culturally determined response to stress, or, as many now argue, neurologically, as a lesion in the brain caused by inassimilable memories. Working in a Foucauldian tradition, they are interested in the way professional communities, through their daily practices, the internal standards of their disciplines and their interactions with the state and with clients, construct certain subject positions (categories of being in the world, like ‘trauma victim’ or ‘homosexual’), which those communities then regulate, benignly or otherwise.

Governance, Foucault argues and Fassin and Rechtman agree, works as much, if not more, through the production of truth as through the imposition of laws. The question is not whether someone actually is a victim of trauma but how the criteria for deciding who is a victim come into being and who manages them. Particular aspects of ‘Governmentality’, as Foucault calls this process of determining how truth and falsehood are regulated and brought to bear, is what concerns these authors. The construction of trauma in the different areas of mental health, and the political implications of that process for assigning who can or cannot claim the rights of victimhood, form the subject of their book.
The emergent religo-political system in Haiti creates victimhood subjectivities based on one’s level of repentance. One is a suffering Christian Brother or a Sister in Christ, or one is a Vodouisant, toiling under unfortunate—but self-invited--physical and social conditions. Trauma and subsequent Christian conversion have become the arena in which Haitians I spoke with can acquire their status as victims and find treatment for their suffering; the status of the ‘Christian Brother’ has given the victims of the quake a tool in their struggle for recognition and compensation however, it has conversely created new avenues for exposing the reality of persecution and prejudice.

Disasters, whether natural, man made, or a combination of the two, can be traumatizing to anyone and, to those many individuals who have already experienced trauma, retraumatizing. As Farmer (1992) has shown with respect to the AIDS pandemic, disasters reveal the “fault lines” of society(9). In destroying lives, buildings, and communities, Katrina laid bare inequalities – along axes of race/ethnicity, geography, health, wealth, and opportunity – that in the US today are both enduring and enlarging. One fault line consistently revealed in disasters is gender inequality. Enarson (2004) has meticulously detailed and documented with data from around the globe, including the US, that “gender matters” from initial warnings, which women may be less likely to receive, to the aftermath of disaster, when girls and women face increased risk of sexual and domestic violence, expanded care giving responsibilities, and reduced access to relief vis-à-vis boys and men.
Anthropological studies have highlighted what those who have lived through disasters already know: there are two dimensions of experiencing a disaster, both of which can be traumatic. The first is the disaster itself, which, as with the earthquake, includes danger, destruction, and death. Anyone who survives the disaster event is then left in a changed world, one in which destruction of the physical environment, disruption and even rupture of the social environment of family and neighborhood, and often displacement destabilizes or even destroys one’s sense of self, safety, and normalcy (Kleinman and Das 1997; Kleinmen and Das 2000; Kleinmen Das et al 2001). In his work about a flood in Appalachia, Erikson (1976) draws on the words of survivors to discover the disconnection and dislocation they felt both immediately and long after the waters had receded. Individuals withdrew from family members, friends, and neighbors, numbed and disoriented; “even the closest family groups had trouble maintaining their old intimacy in the wake of the flood” (Erikson, 1976, p. 145).

In Port-au-Prince, Haiti, everything crumbled to the ground. Without familiar places and rhythms, even those who have not previously experienced trauma have difficulty sustaining internal equilibrium and external relationships. In the wake of disaster, domestic violence, child neglect and maltreatment, drug and alcohol use, suicide, and divorce all increase (Enarson 1999, 2000, 2004; Erikson 1976). This research is not an attempt to make sense of the disaster in political and social means; I am not recreating patterns out of tattered lives. Instead I am minding the gap, paying attention to the “confusions and ambivalence’s that arise” (Throop 2010) between “victim” and “convert” between “missionary” and “savior” (78).
After the immediate danger of a disaster is over, aid seems to focus on meeting the most basic needs, namely, food, water, and shelter. While these are obviously crucial, disaster planning might take a lesson from religious practitioners in the international arena providing relief to refugees. When refugees fleeing whatever horror engulfed their homes arrive at the site of a refugee camp, Christian relief workers and aids from the World Christian Movement, immediately ask about family and other social connections so that the disoriented and distressed refugees can be settled close to those with whom they have bonds of kinship and community. This is exactly where the WCM succeeds when traditional aid organizations fail. It easily handles the basic needs but it takes the crucial further step of establishing relationship and community. Re-establishing connections is especially important for those who are suffering from the disconnection that is perhaps trauma's deepest damage. Everyone feels powerless in the face of the destructive might of nature. By minding social relationships as well as basic human needs, organizations like the World Christian Movement are positioned to be the restorer of a new kind of Haitian subjectivity. We will talk more about what that means in subsequent chapters.

**Ethics**

This part of the review addresses the literature on ethics and how newly converted mostly poor, black Haitians drew on understandings of ‘ethics’ in order to make sense of their individual and collective selves post earthquake. Christian identities are theorized as being constituted within discursive regimes while notions of ethics are conceived as discursive resources on which individuals and groups may draw in their attempts to author versions of their self and
organizational narratives. I want to use this literature to show conceptions of ethics were a rich vein on which both new converts and missionaries drew to elaborate narratives that legitimated dangerous forms of antichristian violence and which united an otherwise quite disparate community of individuals. Prior work has shown how power is enacted in ethical discourses and how concertive control may be sought and resisted in values-based communities (J.R. Barker, 1999, 2002; Willmott, 1993; Fleming & Sewell, 2002). The anthropological field on ethics—conceived as explicit codes of conduct—is well rehearsed from Ruth Benedict’s *Patterns of Culture* (1934), Richard Brandt’s *Hopi Ethics* (1954), and Gregory Bateson’s *Naven* (1958) to Clifford Geertz’s *Religion of Java* (1960). Anthropologists have written about the strong moral codes that regulate Russian understandings of social networks and public assistance (Caldwell, 2004), or the moral worth acquired by Nepalese women who live within the gendered restrictions of their villages (McHugh, 2004). The problem with many of these works is that they too often conflate morality and ethics. Related to this is the fact that we have had in the past no theoretical or methodological foundation for a systematic approach to the study of ethics (save for James Faubion’s, (2001b) erudite apologia for the Foucauldian approach to ethics --one of the first crucial steps toward a methodology). There is even a sense that anthropology has been all about the study of ethics all along (Parkin 1985) due to the discipline’s Durkheimian origins (Laidlaw, 2002; Robbins, 2005), and his attempt to replace moral philosophy with a science of moral facts.

Other anthropologists have focused their attention on a dispositional or virtue ethics (e.g. Hirschkind, 2001; Mahmood, 2005; Widlock, 2004). These studies
take more Foucauldian approaches in considering how persons make themselves into properly attuned moral persons. A brief outline of Foucault’s account of ethics will thus be helpful here. According to Foucault, ethics can be understood as the actions or practices on the self with the aim of making, developing, or transforming oneself to reach a particular state of being. In other words, ethics involves the relationship of the self with the self and the activities that create and develop identities (Foucault 1998).

Understood in this manner, ethics are not only a certain set of rules but rather consists of practices of self-transformation which may or may not be in relation to universal moral codes. Foucault describes these practices as technologies of the self, the activities which individuals undertake “on their own bodies and souls, thoughts, conduct, and way of being, so as to transform themselves in order to attain a certain state of happiness, purity, wisdom, perfection, or immortality” (Martin 225). Rather than linking freedom and truth via the concept of autonomy (or lawfulness), as Kant does, Foucault outlines a possible experience of ethics as a process that contrasts with the model of establishing codes within a conception of moral order. He does this by suggesting four aspects to how the individual constitutes him/herself as the moral subject of his or her own actions. The first aspect relates to the part of the individual that acts as the focus of moral conduct. The second aspect concerns what makes an individual recognize his/her moral obligations. The third aspect relates to the means by which individuals transform and work on themselves, and the fourth aspect concerns what sort of person an individual might want to be.
Mahmood describes this approach to ethics as “always local and particular, pertaining to a specific set of procedures, techniques, and discourses through which highly specific ethical-moral subjects come to be formed” (2005: 28). From this approach, then, one becomes a moral person not by following universal rules or norms, but by training oneself in a set of certain practices (Widlock, 2004: 59). I lean toward the dispositional approach. However, despite the notion of creating personal freedom, what I often find limiting about this approach is how little attention is paid to the fact that the practices and techniques of moral training are often themselves within oppressive and exacting systems of power creating dyads or even triads of ethical responsibility.

Thus, this approach rarely allows us to see how people are truly “made free” internally. Is one who does the bidding of the other truly one without ethics? One aspect of my research has been to bring to the surface some of the dynamics by which social actors were constituted as subjects who exercise or submit to power relations as a mode of personal freedom (Foucault, 1984). Faubion’s 2011 foray in the ethical domain *An Anthropology of Ethics* is an elegant theoretical melding of Luhman’s system theory and Foucault’s conceptions of ethics. Faubion’s theory works here, as it does the best job of reconciling freedom and power by adding much needed complexity to Foucault’s four-point model; reimagining it for anthropological use. I will list the components of Faubion’s schemata and discuss them in greater detail in following chapter.

Mode of Subjectification

Mode of Determination of Subjectivation
Recruitment

Selection

Mode of Judgment

Mode of Ethical valuation

Mode of justification

Mode of Subjectification (again)

Scope structure and priority

Telos

Substance

Askesis

Pedagogical

Reflexive

In the next chapter, I will put this coda to work for me in Haiti, as I try to make sense of the multiple ethical worlds that my research participants inhabit.

"Ladies and gentlemen, come and see," beckons novelist Lyonel Trouillot in a searing account of life in contemporary Haiti. "This isn’t a country here but an epic failure factory, an excuse for a place, a weed lot, an abyss for tightrope-walkers, blindman’s bluff for the sightless saddled with delusions of grandeur . . . Proud mountains reduced to dust dumped in big helpings into the cruciform maws of sick children who crouch waiting in the hope of insane epiphanies, behaving badly and swamped besides,
bogged down in their devil's quagmires." "Our history," he laments, "is a corset, a stifling cell, a great searing fire." 11

**Haitian Nationalism and History**

The history of Haiti is marked by rebellions, violence, challenges, changes, and other complicated phenomena. Historicization has always been a bit of an exercise in magical thinking. Zizék's work expounds on this same principle when he articulates the need to understand present events by corralling historical events. He argues that history is "not discovered, excavated from the hidden depth of the past, but constructed retroactively" (1989, 56).

No one event can be said to have caused the political and religious climate in Haiti. No one telling of history will delineate all of the dimensions of this issue. Haiti's plight, especially its failure to curb endemic poverty, is magnified in an age when regions of the world are making progress in building their capacity to meet the basic material needs of their people. Haiti stands out as the exception where stagnation or even regression is the order of the day. Haiti's story is one of amazing triumph over colonization followed almost immediately by international racism, military occupation, colonization, dictatorships, violence, and corruption (not necessarily in that order).

The French method of slavery in Saint Domingue was to work the slaves to death and simply buy new ones when the current ones “outlived their usefulness” (Abbott 1988,13). The logic of this model was based solely on economic calculations. After four to seven years, a planter could amortize his initial investment in his slave
work force. At the same time, the plantation would also provide a respectable eight to twelve percent return (Abbott 1988). It was not economically sound to keep slaves alive for more than four to seven years. As a result, even after centuries of slavery, enslaved Africans in Saint Domingue retained their languages, religions, customs and practices. Some of my evangelical informants would argue, this small “lapse in French judgment” would cost Haiti her soul.

It is common parlance in Christian evangelical communities that Haiti has a longstanding relationship with the devil. According to many of my missionary interlocutors, Haiti made a deal with the devil in the woods. But this meeting in the woods, be it with the devil or not, may not have even happened.

The Legend of Bwa Kayiman is a particularly contentious bit of Haitian history. According to such historians as Hoffmann (1990), the entire legend was manufactured by malicious Frenchmen attempting to implicate formally enslaved Haitians in savage superstition, thus undermining their right to self-rule. Though scholars hotly contest the importance or even the existence (Hoffman 2000 Geggus 2002, Dubois 2004) of the meeting, Bwa Kayiman remains an important event in the Haitian imaginary, not an article of debate but of memory (Mintz and Trouillot 1995). Historian Laurent Dubois, in Avengers of the New World (2004), remains dubious about the historical evidence of such a meeting, but sums up the importance of the event:

Thus Bois-Caïman remains a symbol of the achievement of the slave insurgents of Saint-Domingue, a symbol not of a specific event whose details
we can pin down, but rather of the creative spiritual and political epic that both prompted and emerged from the 1791 insurrection (102).

Whether Bwa Kayiman is empirically verifiable seems a task for a scrupulous historian. However I would just as soon traffic in social fact.

On August 14th, 1791, a leader by the name of Boukman called a secret meeting in a wood called Bwa Kayiman near Cap Haitian, which was attended by a large number of the enslaved. This was a call to arms; Jamaican born high priest Boukman (called so because he was able to read) thrust a black pig in the air and boomed to the anxious crowd:

The God who created the earth; who created the sun that gives us light. The God who holds up the ocean; who makes the thunder roar. Our God who has ears to hear. You who are hidden in the clouds; who watch us from where you are. You see all that the white has made us suffer. The white man’s god asks him to commit crimes. But the God within us wants to do good. Our God, who is so good, so just, He orders us to revenge our wrongs. It’s He who will direct our arms and bring us the victory. It’s He who will assist us. We all should throw away the image of the white men’s god who is so pitiless. Listen to the voice for liberty that sings in all our hearts" (Parkingson, 1978: 40)

In one fell swoop, they sacrificed that pig, drinking its blood, and wrested the fate of the nation away from the ignoble plantocracy into the hands of the people. The white god is seen as pitiless, feckless, and cruel while their true humanity would be restored through African deities- deities that would also make (for the first time in western history) black nationhood possible.
After the ceremony, Haiti became the scene of the only successful slave revolution in history. Toussaint l’Ouverture and his successors, Jean-Jacques Dessalines and Henri Christophe, empowered by their gods, “felt no pain and feared no bullets.” After 13 years of hard war, the Black Jacobins toppled the French (James 1963, Dubois 2004). However, the glory at its inception reverberated into fear all around the world. The nation in its infancy was suffocated and stymied by those who feared its example. France imposed a 150-million franc “indemnity” on the new nation. This was the price for recognition of Haitian independence and compensation for the former slaveholders’ lost “property” (Dubois, 2004). The United States, jaws clenched and knuckles white with fear of their own slave rebellion, withheld recognition of the ex-slaves’ victory and independence until 1862.

However, elites fearing negritude and negative associations came down harshly on Vodou after the revolution. Roman Catholicism prevailed in large part due to draconian methods and elite support and sympathy with the French. Louis Joseph Janvier, the founder of the Haitian nationalist movement in the late nineteenth century, saw the church as a great threat to the sovereignty of Haiti, and an oppressive colonial power. Janvier foresaw the establishment of Protestantism as one in which the temporal government would have control over the clergy, even in matters of doctrine, in what he termed, “a severely Erastian3 kind” (Nicholls 1979: 118).

3 One of the followers of Thomas Erastus, a German physician and theologian of the 16th century. He held that the punishment of all offenses should be referred to the civil power, and that holy
In his 1883 treatise on Haiti’s foreign affairs, Janvier indicated that capitalist economic development would stem from Protestantism. Moreover he maintained that Protestantism would be a great avenue through which Western culture would be introduced to the Africans (1883: 370).

The intellectual linkage created by Janvier between Protestantism and anti-colonialism was challenged in the early twentieth century by the US occupation (1915 to 1934). During the American occupation of Haiti, the U.S. government amended the Haitian Constitution to make it friendlier to foreign investment; held peasants’ land; imposed martial law; and established the corvée, a program of forced labor to build roads throughout the countryside (Renda, 2001). When the United States left, she saddled the country with another foreign debt. This extended breach of Haiti’s sovereignty did more than financially destabilize the new country. It also opened the floodgates for American missionaries. This would turn out to be a double-edged sword as American missionaries like L. Ton Evans were key in turning the brutal occupation into a matter of national, moral and political controversy (Renda, 2001).

While Protestantism flourished under US supervision, the period after the occupation was marked by the Roman Catholic Church's violent crusade against "superstition," which the state backed in 1941-42 with military force (Ramsay 2002). Roman Catholic clergy spearheaded a handful of major pushes against the religion. During these campaigns, the government outlawed Vodou services, and Catholics destroyed Vodou religious objects and persecuted Vodouisants.

---

communion was open to all. In the present day, an Erastian is one who would see the church placed entirely under the control of the State.
Catholic clergy, however draconian, had not been persistently militant in their opposition to Vodou, and they have had less impact on the religious practices of the rural and the urban poor. The clergy have generally directed their energies more toward educating the urban population than toward eradicating Vodou (Haggerty 1989).

The Catholic Church had more than Vodou to contend with in any case. Duvalier, claiming that Janvier was his ideological mentor, was considered the champion of Protestantism. Duvalier opposed the church more than any other Haitian president. He expelled the archbishop of Port-au-Prince, the Jesuit order, and numerous priests between 1959 and 1961 (Green 1993). At the same time, he welcomed American Protestant missionaries. Protestantism on a small scale has always existed in Haiti, but by the 1950s, encouraged by Duvalier, those numbers would swell to over 30 percent of the population (Desmangles 1992 Butler, 2008). Duvalier advocated for Protestantism, the same Protestantism that opposed Vodou more strongly than Catholicism. Protestant churches focused their appeal on the lower classes long before the Roman Catholics did, and churches and clergy were found even in the smaller villages. "Protestant clergy used Creole rather than French. Schools and clinics provided much-needed services. Protestant congregations encouraged baptisms and marriages and performed them free" (Haggerty 1989: sec.IV).

The triangular relationship between Vodou, Catholicism, and Protestantism began to crystallize in the 1920s, though protestant missionaries and churches were entrenched in Haiti since the early 19th century. (Jeanty 1989). Despite persecution
by the Catholic Church and a brief closure (1941-43) under President Elie Lescot, Pentecostal churches in Haiti continued to flourish in the 1940s and 1950s (Louis 1998). As aforementioned, when Francois "Papa Doc" Duvalier came to power in 1957, he began encouraging a greater influx of evangelical missions in an attempt to undermine the power of the Catholic Church (McAlister 2000, Louis 1998). Despite the persistence of the misleading adage "Haiti is 90 percent Catholic and 100 percent Vodou" (Dash 2001, 51), recent figures indicate that at the turn of the twenty-first century as much as one-third of the country self-identified as Protestant or Pentecostal (Lain 1998; Louis 1998). Catholic churches have found perhaps the stiffest competition among Pentecostal organizations, such as the various Churches of God (e.g., Church of God in Christ, Church of God of Prophecy), and independent Pentecostal churches scattered throughout Haiti. The rise in evangelical missionaries after the earthquake and the subsequent usurpation of government power by mostly protestant NGOs has changed the relationship of Protestantism, Vodou and Catholicism. Protestantism has taken a firmer hold on Haiti's national narrative of rebuilding than both of the former religious powerhouses.

Alfred Métraux (1959) describes in his work the triadinal relationship between Protestantism, Catholicism and Vodou. Métraux found that Vodouisants did not convert to Protestantism because it was somehow a more spiritual and lofty experience, but quite interestingly because they sought refuge in Protestantism against the ire of evil spirits. Protestantism represented a neutral space where one was safe from the onslaught of demon attack. Conversions were often spurred by sickness, as sickness was a major symptom of demonic activity (351-2). According
to Métraux, conversion also represented economic prosperity as Protestantism tended to prize frugality and austerity (356-7).

For many of the converts I spoke with, Protestantism represented an opposition to Vodou. A significant difference between then and now is, that when people converted to Protestantism, they usually did not reject Vodou. Métraux called it a “lack of sincerity”(357) as many chose to become Protestants merely as a way to gain an alternative form of protection from misfortune. Protestantism in Haiti also oriented the Haitians towards North America. Conway (1978), for example, has shown an unequivocal link between religion and indoctrination into the “American dream.” His cultural exploration of how local Haitians understood Protestant missionization argued that missionary Protestantism did not foster a Protestant ethic of self-help, nor did it change the notion that worldly success would be realized by a direct dependence on foreign missionaries. Similarly, Karen Richmans essay “The Protestant Ethic and Dis-spirit of Vodou” (2005) makes a compelling argument for the use of protestant conversion to unlink Haitian transnationals from encumbering Vodou rituals and remittances, and to survive hostile Florida discrimination.

In 2003, defrocked Catholic priest turned statesman Jean-Bertrand Aristide legitimized Vodou as a religion in Haiti (BBC 2003). The governing elite saw this as a cheap political ploy, but the people finally felt as if their lives and choices were respected. Mambu Racine Sumbu, an American Vodou priestess who has been practicing in Haiti for 15 years, gushed, “what President Aristide has done for us, for
which we are very thankful, is to facilitate us in obtaining the status that we need to perform legally-binding religious ceremonies" (BBC 2003).

Brodwin (1996, 2003) and McAlister (1995, 2000) are among the few scholars who have contributed insightful research on Haitian Pentecostalism. Brodwin (1996) deals with competition among the ethical systems of Catholicism, Protestantism, and Vodou as they relate to the practice of healing in rural Haiti. In a more recent essay, Brodwin (2003) explores Pentecostalism among Haitian migrants in Guadeloupe. Calley (1965), Toulis (1997), and Brodwin (2003) identify transnational issues surrounding Pentecostal practice, showing how marginalized Afro-Caribbean communities assert national, ethnic, and gender identities among dominant majority populations perceived as hostile. McAlister (2000) examines the influence of U.S. missions on both the historical development of Pentecostalism in Haiti and on contemporary debates concerning Haitian national identity. The baptism of the Holy Spirit, with the initial evidence of speaking in tongues, lies at the heart of Pentecostalism and distinguishes Pentecostal churches from mainline Protestant denominations. Although Pentecostal congregations generally share this belief, the character of musical worship in Haitian Pentecostal churches varies significantly according to the type of service and church. Most of the discussion on conversion from Vodou is of the secular analytical variety. My project, although at times all too utilitarian, and a bit more functionalist than I would have hoped, does take as its major thrust the Haitian “Crisis of Consciousness” and the subsequent ethical repositioning that religious conversion entails.
Nationalism in a broader context

Most social scientists would no doubt agree that nationalism and citizenship are some of the most important determinants of political behavior. What is less theorized, however, are the specific types of behavior that nationalism engenders. Erving Goffman’s (1963) *Stigma: Notes on the Management of Spoiled Identity* continues to be a staple in understanding the social interactions between “stigmatized” persons in society. In the Haitians case, group membership and group identity, as Christian, create new spaces for economic opportunity and leave Vodou practitioners in Haiti with limited access to certain spaces of power which is a particular tool of stigma branding and discrimination. My work will attempt to elucidate more clearly the power dynamics and historicity of religious stigma in the country.

Theorists tend to agree upon the basic characteristics that define a nation. In the most fundamental sense, a nation is a invention of modernity a hodgepodge of people who consider themselves bound together by shared language, history, cultural symbols and a set of values. (Gellner 1983). While Thomas Eriksen observes that a sense of nationhood tends to derive from shared ethnicity (Eriksen 1993). Lowell Barrington refutes this claim, contending that Americans consider themselves a nation because they share cultural features rather than a common ethnic identity. In his view, nations distinguish themselves from other social groups because of their longing for “territorial self-determination” (Barrington 1997,713). Nationalism, then, arises as members of a given social group articulate their claims to territorial control. Some theorists, such as Ernst Haas, define nationalism as an ideology that functions as “a doctrine of social solidarity based on the characteristics
and symbols of nationhood” (Haas 1986, 727). Haas analogizes nationalism to “civil religion,” for he claims that it both articulates a people’s core values and “provides a framework for social action” (Haas 1986, 709). However, others note that nationalism ought not to be placed on the same conceptual plane as ideologies such as fascism and capitalism, for the actual content of nationalism varies from culture to culture. They claim that social scientists should examine nationalism in the same manner that they would explore cultural concepts such as religion and kinship (Anderson 1983). Barrington seems to concur with this notion, for he offers a definition that depicts nationalism as a process rather than a concrete ideology. Nationalism, he claims, is “the pursuit—through argument or other activity—of a set of rights for the self-defined members of the nation, including, at a minimum, territorial autonomy or sovereignty” (Barrington 1997:714).

Barrington claims that all nationalist expression, regardless of location, evinces two defining characteristics. First, it defines the territorial boundaries within which the nation claims total sovereignty. Secondly, it defines the “membership boundaries” of the given nation, outlining the group of people who deserve territorial sovereignty and the unwavering mutual loyalty (Barrington 1997:714).

Unwavering loyalty: what happens however when that loyalty is shaken to the core? How do citizens deal with the disillusion of the national narrative and how do they create new ones. In The Sublime Object of Ideology (1997), written before the collapse of communism, Zizek refers to the universal notion of democracy as a “necessary fiction.” Adopting Hegel’s insight that the universal “can realize itself
only in impure, deformed, corrupted forms,” Zîzêk is useful for his insights into how society functions under ideology and displays that uncanny side of what we term democracy by emphasizing that “fantasy is a means for an ideology to take its own failure into account in advance” (126). Zîzêk moves beyond the political dead end of thinking of ideology as either false consciousness or escape, and moves to a complex understanding of the role of social fantasy. I’m particularly interested in his discussion of the failure of the fantasy. What happens when the veil is removed and the participant is able to see the “kernel” of truth? Zîzêk describes it as a profound revulsion. Have some Haitians rejected the fantasy of nationalism built on Vodou for a broader fantasy of Christian nationhood?

**Conclusion**

In this literature review I have tried to first (1) illuminate the uses of trauma theory and how religious organizations, more than the government, are now in the business of creating community, which the literature points to as a major conduit of societal healing, (2) I have probed the breadth and depth of the ethics field, and I have elucidated the particular ethical paradigm I chose and why: and (3) I have discussed the socio-historical complications of nationalism in Haiti. The disaster has the effect of exposing fissures in Haiti’s religious landscape. Even as religion has served to heal the psychic and spiritual harm in the wake of disaster, a contest has emerged between Christianity and a mélange of Vodou beliefs. This contest is bound up in the very formation of Haiti itself.
Methods

There is a sensory disorder called Synaesthesia in which stimulation of one sensory or cognitive pathway leads to automatic, involuntary experiences in a second sensory or cognitive pathway.

When a person senses something, automatically, another sensation lights up. For example, patients see letters in different colors, some might see music, or taste words, days of the week have personalities, and some see time, etc. I find my time on the island of Hispaniola to be a methodologically synaesthetic endeavor. In Haiti and Santo Domingo I conducted interviews that felt more appropriately like observed performances, I transcribed data that reconfigured itself post transcription. I participated in mega church events in which I never spoke a word but still came home and wrote for hours and hours about my “other” interactions. The experience was heady amalgamating all of my senses confusing and fusing my methodological practice. I do not promise this will be a straightforward affair.

A note on Methodological (and Actual) Agnosticism:
I am relatively new to the sub genre of religious anthropology and was struck by the sheer volume of it. And yet, for all the activity, the genre suffers with creating
theologies for belief studies that are not patronizing, pathologizing, romanticizing, or reductionist. In my own work, I have expressed frustration with my model of study that seems to make religion the mere functionary of some other cultural process like nationalization. I'm not sure I succeeded in employing a reflexive methodology that is sensitive to the emic truth claims of new Haitian converts and religious believers and gives methodologically adequate purchase to the truth claims of etic scholarship. The difficulty of finding a methodology adequate to the integrity of belief is a mix of what is referred to as the “historically secular” character of the academic project. However, secularism indicates to me neither a force intrinsically hostile to religion nor a cultural space isolated in some inexplicable way from religious influence. Yet many models assume one or both of these things in order to explain the complexities involved in an academic discussion of belief as the result of antireligious bias, if not on the part of individual scholars, at least on the part of scholarly norms.

It is seductive, though somewhat disingenuous, for me to posit my project’s methodological difficulty as the development of the secular culture that Anthropology itself as a discipline helped to author and from which, in a large part, it achieved its legitimation.

For these post-Foucauldian times, most of the models so far articulated see the promise of self-reflexive and reciprocal methodologies as lying in the conscious revelation of the individual investigator’s religious predilections rather than in the disclosure of the religious and theological interests that still transverse these fields.
Forgive me Father- in which I will divulge two cardinal sins of objectivity

Sin # 1 I am a Christian. Though relatively new to the activity of Christianity, I was raised in a small Pentecostal church where exorcizing demons getting “slain in the spirit” and catching the holy ghost where guaranteed occurrences every Wednesday and Sunday. My sisters and cousins (for we were legion) were mostly underwhelmed with the spectacle of it all. We would idly chew on candy cigarettes in the foyer and adopt what we imagined were world-weary poses. And some Sundays it was all we could do to not burst into tears laughing at sister Roberts’ wig flapping rhythmically to her quick-footed spiritual foxtrot. At about twelve years old, I’d had enough and armed with my biology book and a picture of Lucy\(^4\) I eschewed my country religion for the seductive trappings of secular modernity.

This enchantment with reason, classification and order lasted for a while until little by little things seem to happen. I found my illusions of secular order tumbling around me much like the *Invisible Man’s* (1952) protagonist who found himself drawn to the brotherhood, a faction of principled scientist and unrelenting rationalists. In this excerpt while the world crumbles around them and erupts into disorder, the brotherhood has no power besides their own hollow superiority.

"Exactly," the brother with the pipe said. "It was the antithesis of the scientific approach. Ours is a reasonable point of view. We are champions of

---

\(^4\) AL 288-1, several hundred pieces of bone representing about 40% of the skeleton of an individual *Australopithecus afarensis*. 
the scientific approach to society, and such a speech as we've identified ourselves with tonight destroys everything that has been said before. The audience isn't thinking, it's yelling its head off."

"Sure, it's acting like a mob," the big black brother said.

Brother Jack laughed. "And this mob," he said, "is it a mob against us or is it a mob for us – how do our muscle-bound scientists answer that?"(114 –116)

Was the mob for us or against us? I found myself uncomfortable in that space of not knowing or never knowing. I wanted something to be sure in my life. I wanted a benevolent creator. I wanted causation and purpose, and more than anything, I wanted to finally be rid of living in the forced partiality of my agnosticism. It made the world so small, the universe so perfunctory, everything reduced to its mechanical function. I realized that what I wanted to take off was the parochial, nervous, homophobic, ritual obsessed sexism of my particular church.

Sin #2 I am married to a missionary. It is not quite the protracted yarn of strange bedfellows one would imagine. Missionaries and Anthropologist have been methodologically shaking up since the discipline was in its infancy. The relationship between Christian mission and anthropology in the past century has been (much like a long-term marriage) one of ambivalence. They shared a common interest in people, and their beliefs. It surprises none that the two groups are continuously suspicious of each other's activities. Though my husband has a zeal for the mission field, I am deeply opposed to what I called the psychological violence of missionary work.
But alas I have the double standards of a *Mafia Wife*. That is, I looked down on the dirty work but took my mink coats and gold jewelry without dilemma. I managed to benefit from my husband’s invaluable network of Christian missionaries. Though I was adamant about interviewing converts without the missionary apparatus, taking great pains to establish myself as a separate entity. Even passing out Creole translated version of my university’s letter in introduction. Trading one form of perennial authority for another I suppose, but at that time I was more comfortable with the latter. In my interviews I found myself being colder and overly professional. I was bothered by missionaries walking into neighborhoods, patting children on the head passing out t-shirts calling everyone friend, brother and sister. It created a pretense of equality that was so painfully absent as to be laughable. So I did not feign familiarity and only accepted it when it was offered. I have met people that will be in my life forever, and some that I have to glance at my notes to remember their names.

**Ordering my Steps**

My work by its very nature actively pulls into conversation over five disciplines: history, political science, religious studies, black Diaspora studies and a courageous, if not foolhardy, foray into ethics. The convergence of these bodies of knowledge only inform not encapsulate the diversity of thought present here.

Methodologically, I mix traditional anthropological techniques (interviews, participant observation) with interdisciplinary means of data gathering and analysis. I am responding to the disorder of fieldwork in post earthquake Haiti by challenging
the implicit requirement for academic writing to present structure and an analytical frame. I resist this expectation in my study, as to do so would lead me to impose order and structure upon people who describe themselves as living “in a pile of emotional rubble”. The tension of order and chaos in my writing leads to questions about how far anthropologists should rework the ‘purity’ of fieldwork experiences in order to conform to rubrics of academic analysis.

At the same time, in acknowledging the unpredictable nature of the field, I have been able to elucidate the very productive turns that my work took in response to the unexpected. My synaesthetic methods and research design follow.

In January 2010 I began a research project on the massive conversions in post earthquake Haiti, in the course of which I spent eight months of 2010 in Santo Domingo, the capital of The Dominican Republic, on the island of Hispaniola, and Port-au-Prince the capitol city of Haiti.
Determined to ground the project’s broad scope in local perspectives, I undertook a systematic program of interviews with first, new convert in the extended refugee communities in The Dominican Republic particularly Sosua, a sleepy tourist town north of Santo Domingo also a neighborhood nicknamed *Little Haiti* Just outside of colonial Santo Domingo. One focus of the interviews was new converts varied experiences of life before and after their Damascus moment,\(^5\) relations, and citizenship in a changing, weakened Haitian state.

The methodology's ethnographic depth is restricted by my reliance on lingua franca--French, English, and Spanish and Creole translators. However, I bring to the dissertation the compensatory breadth of more than a four years detailed ethnohistorical research on nation building and racial citizenship dynamics and the invaluable help and direction of Haitian intellectuals with interests similar to my

---

\(^5\) From the biblical story of St. Paul, who converted from Judaism to Christianity while travelling on the road to Damascus.
own, and comparative insights derived from an ongoing program of related discussions with neighboring country the Dominican Republic. Running through my discussion of my methodology is the argument against the romantic secularism that slights conversion events and phenomenon as simply advancing hegemonic missionary, male, and national agendas of conversion, domestication, and modernization, rather than being the result of real ethical work toward personal and communal ends.

**Research Design and Methods**

In this research, I took a multisited approach, partitioning my 14 months of fieldwork into geographic sectors. The first four months from January to late April were spent in Santo Domingo, particularly Gauzcue. The Dominican Republic’s capital is home to nearly a third of the national population of eight million, and the target of mass refugee movement out of Haiti after the earthquake. My research took me all over the country where Haitian refugee populations sprang up.

The next four months from late April to early August were spent in Port-Au-Prince. I lived at a missionary’s home in Delmas 75. Delmas is the location of much of the area’s commercial and industrial enterprise and is a short distance (if we don’t account for traffic) from the capitol building and other symbols of national importance. Port-au-Prince also serves as headquarters to most of the nearly 10,000 NGOs in the country. In addition to housing the national government, Port-au-Prince holds the cultural and historical institutions defined by the state as fundamental to the national heritage. Most of these building have been rented out
by international Aid organizations. Port-au-Prince’s state-sanctioned cultural institutions continue to exert hegemonic influence over the country and its norms of social identity.

I spent the following four and a half months Recuperating from the difficult delivery of my daughter. By January 2011, I began a six month investigation of the World Christian Movement in Arkansas. Little Rock Arkansas is part of an informal region in the south eastern United States referred to as the Bible Belt. In this area, church attendance is high. Arkansans considers themselves 86 percent Christian and of those 86 percent 78 percent are evangelical Protestants. (Butler Center for Arkansas Studies).

George Marcus suggested that when committing to multi-sited matters, the key to focusing ethnographic work is by following the people, thing, metaphor, plot, story, or allegory in order to make meaningful connections from a multi-sited cultural question (1995). In my research I chose to follow the story. I travel along established networks, landing at my three particular nodes in order to flesh-out a culture whose existence at any single point is inextricably linked to the outcomes and actions in the others. The method fits the matter, and as such it provides an illustration of the anthropologists patterns of practice.

However, my work also demonstrates how things can get lost in the multi-sited imagination. In the case of this study, I often found myself wishing I had dedicated myself to a place-based study of Haitian earthquake refugees in Santo Domingo, where my ethnographic expertise could be more fully exploited. Some anthropologists are at their best when dealing with specific locations. It is the depth
of place that often differentiates anthropological ethnography from other areas of social inquiry. Nevertheless, the story my participants wanted to tell me involved Port-au-Prince and involved missionary discipleship programs, like the one profiled in Little Rock, Arkansas. So I followed the story.

Specific sites of interest to this project were churches and bureaucratic agencies. Though seemingly disparate arenas, churches and bureaucracies, have a thread of commonality for the purposes of my research. They are both institutions trafficking in the creation and maintenance of group identity.

Finding a way to test the aforementioned hypothesis about the political and ethical meaning of religious conversion in Haiti requires a variety of different approaches, perspectives, and methods.

In my preliminary fieldwork, I was met with some suspicion about the content of my research. Haitians are sensitive to the image of the country as an exotic Vodou haven and some residents assumed I was looking for some way to prove their conversions false or worse, that I was collecting data for the US government. My decision to employ a local field assistant aided me in data collection and analysis and helped assuage interlocutor doubts about my presence and rather personal questions about private practices and socioeconomic status. He also served, in keeping with the collaborative model of anthropology as much more than an interviewer and transcriber; He was an external check on my own technical skills as a translator and validity of my ethnographic data.

Selection
All of the participants who would be affected by religious conversions in Haiti were not thoroughly identified beforehand for various reasons. As a result, I used a combination of chain-referral selection and bellwether or ideal case selection, which entails choosing informants with the maximum presence of ideal characteristics (LeCompte 1999). For the purposes of this research, individuals male or female need possess at least one of the following characteristics:

**Sample**

For the purposes of this research, individuals, male or female, were either a participant in the Haitian religious market, be they consumers or producers, e.g. new converts, evangelical missionaries, Haitian evangelicals, and some longstanding protestant Haitians. Other participants included: individuals who control certain aspects of social life and behavior (gatekeepers), e.g., police officers, employers in the government bureaucracy and low-level civil servants. My sample also includes those on the receiving end of anti-Vodou persecution, those participating in various technologies of the self and ethical transitions to achieve an appreciable social end, e.g. new Haitian converts still practicing Vodou and, Haitians attempting to rebuild Haiti via religious conversion. To add depth to my interactions, I paid special attention to the specific hierarchies of expertise (Petryana 2004) that emerge around certain ethical practices. For example, in the process of conversion Christian neighbors, low-level Christian missionaries, Christian media, and employers and loved ones all participate in technologies of the self. The result was a kind of Rashomon (multi-angle story-telling) effect, a narrative that is alive with depth, complexity, and polyvocality (Bernard, 1995; LeCompte, 1997; Marcus and Fischer,
All participants cut across socio-economic and gender lines. However, the samples were sensitive to the particular ways women and the Haitian poor are affected by and participate in these practices.

In the Dominican Republic, I interviewed 36 individuals. 13 were Dominicans whom I attempted to engage about a particular subject but was unsuccessful. I did not include many Dominican interviews because they mostly consisted of me trying to force a subject that my participants were simply not interested in discussing. Six of the interviews were longtime Haitian residents of the Dominican Republic. In this Dominican sample, 17 were displaced Haitian refugees who had come to the country after the quake and lived in a particular part of the country for less than three months. Of the 17 refugees, 13 moved because of familial connections in the Dominican Republic while four participants left family behind and sought job opportunities and a better life. Only 11 members of this subset of participants were recent converts to evangelical Christianity. All 11 new converts sited the quake as a major deciding factor.

In Port-au-Prince my sample size was 14. Of the 14 I interviewed, I had multiple interviews with six participants. All six of my multiple interviewees were native to the city. Of the five single interviews I did, all five lived in tents outside of the national palace and I was put in contact with these individuals through informants at one of Haiti’s largest Microfinancing NGOs FonKoze. Three of the five participants had plans to move back to their native provinces.

In Little Rock, my sample size was 17. Of the 17 missionaries and hopefuls I interviewed, 11 were my own classmates, taking a course from the World Christian
Movement. Five participants were prominent missionaries traveling to Little Rock to teach about the movement. One was a pastor decidedly not a part of the World Christian movement.

The social classes of my informants differed wildly. I came up with codes to differentiate the subtleties of class I found on the Island and in Little Rock. According to Norman K Denzin’s 2009 work on social science methods, qualitative studies usually offer three simple methods for determining social class:

The Subjective Method

Is one in which people are asked to define their own social class. Though this approach is direct and simple, it has a number of flaws: individuals may claim that everyone is equal or they may classify themselves according to their aspirations. (Denzin 2009) This was more the case in Little rock than in the Dominican Republic and Haiti.

The Reputational Method

Asks an individual to classify others in social classes based on the reputation of these individuals. This method allows an understanding of how people in a community see major social divisions (2009). I found this most helpful in Santo Domingo where Haitian communities though sprawling were tightly contained within certain sectors of the city and almost everyone knew the other’s social standing.

The Objective Method

Requires the researcher to rank individuals according to objective criteria such as income, occupation and prestige (2009). Some people I spoke to were
simply objectively more well off than others. In those cases where I could determine social status, such as in the case of pastor Pierre, I did so objectively.

The categories I devised are as follows

Poor and working class
P1 P2 both are essentially destitute but one is living in bleak and intractable poverty and the other in equally bleak but employed poverty. I differentiate them because of their networks. Many P2 had already found low wage jobs in Santo Domingo sweeping streets and hauling fruit or in Haiti selling goods on a popular thoroughfare.

Middle Class
The second group was M1 and M2 M3. M1 includes long-term Haitian residents of Santo Domingo. They owned small businesses, taught French or English at the many language schools, across the city. M2s are Haitian civil servants, NGO liaisons and religious officials. They were not financially more well off than our M1 group but their position in Haiti was more prestigious than an M1 position in Santo Domingo. Lastly most of the Americans I interviewed are M3s whose median income could support 10 Haitian families but are considered middle class in the United States. These were small time lawyers, full time missionaries, pastors of small to medium-sized churches, teachers, nurses, students and dentists.

Upper class
My last category is H1. This includes the elite class of the United States and Haiti, as I interviewed no elites in Santo Domingo. I have produced a chart, which should help give a sense of the frequency and depth of my interaction with each social class.

![Number and Frequency of Interviews by Class](image)

**Figure 2 Number and Frequency of Interviews by Social Class**

The chart shows that while I had the most interviews with the P1, group I had the most ethnographic depth with the M2 group, gathering life histories, conversion stories and instances of personal trauma. These individuals worked closely with NGOs and religious organizations in Haiti and some were government officials. I generally interviewed participants until I started to feel “saturation points” in the data sets. Saturation simply refers to the point at which no new information or themes are observed in the data. This usually happened after around 12 interviews although basic elements for metathemes were present as early as six interviews.
Participant Compensation

I was able to compensate some of my participants for their time. Though the level and type of compensation differed among social classes in Haiti. For the mulatto elite, my husband and I did small favors like speaking to congregations or talking to American missionaries about proper or improper behavior. For most of the members of the middle class, it was insulting to bring up financial compensation and I was admonished several times for doing so. For the destitute, financial compensation was given and received with warmth. I suppose my American slip is showing here, but these were the types of transactions that left me most at ease. The denial of compensation after I had consumed hours of participants’ valuable time felt exploitative and left me feeling constantly indebted.

**Answering Research Objectives**

My three major research objectives were addressed as follows with additional explanation of the relevance and use of particular methodological techniques:

**Objective one: religion and citizenship:** To understand how religious conversions can also be mechanisms of nationalism and citizenship.

In order to reach this objective, the following documents, images and phenomena counted as data: Historical debates about nationalism; elite and popular notions of Haitian nationhood; historical or present ordinances regulating mode and preference for religious observance, and assessment of Haitian religious activity in
specific areas; OpEd’s in prominent newspapers; political speeches; informal group interviews from those currently converting or currently actively not; news reports.

The specific methodologies attached to this data are as follows: combing of archival records; content analysis of secondary texts or visual data i.e. news programs, Interviews with practitioners

Archives: To document the recent history of elite opinions and policies on the role of religious conversion and nationalism, I collected a range of archival data including official documents, newspaper editorials and articles (Bernard, 2005). To examine the contemporary relationship between nationalism and Vodou and Christianity, my archiving was not as extensive as it could be, as Haiti’s historical documents were underneath three tons of metal and concrete. I utilized past and present political speeches and recent and past police involvement in anti-Vodou disputes.
Figure 3  Damaged Alexander Petion Source: AP Getty

Figure 4  What is Left of Haitian National Patrimony Source: Author
Group interviews: Group interviews allowed me to record and analyze group member answers and responses to one another’s answer. It was most fruitful when trying to observe how people react to one another around the conversion issue (Schensul, LeCompte et al, 1999). Since the subject is rife with controversy, I made the groups no larger than four. Group interviews also worked to acculturate me quickly to social patterns and cultural norms concerning religious discussion. I created a database of possible interviewees using social networking sites like Facebook.

Social Networking: In principle, social networks serve to communicate and collaborate. Topic-specific groups characteristically populated by networkers of a like mind provided me with a preset number of individuals from which to set up interviews. However, social networks are essentially people- rather than topic-centric and were one of the several next generation communications research and collaboration tools that included blogs, wikis and social bookmarking. Haiti is replete with inexpensive cyber cafes that enable even the more impoverished members of society to participate in the cybernetic frenzy of social networking. After the quake, it was social networking that helped inform outsiders of ongoing earthquake happenings. User-generated news from Twitter feeds and Facebook pages were for some the only line of communication with the outside world. Participants contribute to and collaborate in readily available online discussions, creating new knowledge bases that are not yet fully recognized as information sources. Social networks typically require registration but are free to join, and significantly, to search for a vast array of reference questions and research projects,
and to find experts for many types of requirements. For example, on Facebook after the earthquake several Haitian groups sprouted up dealing with either Vodou pride and denouncements of Vodou. It is an interesting and innovative approach that reinvents the classic anthropological entrée.

Objective Two: Conversion and cultural context: My second objective is to discover the racial complexities of conversion in Haiti.

In order to reach this objective, the following events, images and phenomena counted as data: conversations detailing beliefs, practices and activities; newspapers, magazines, film; digital media projects; assessments of churches after participant observation; interviews; evangelical relationships and behavior; national events. The specific methodologies attached to this data were as follows: formal and informal interviews; focus group interviews; elicitation techniques; digital media projects; content analysis of secondary texts or visual data; surveys; photographs; observation; field notes from participant and non-participant observation.

Participant Observation: There are any number of ways for a young woman to engage dynamically in religious culture in Haiti. Hubs of activity significant to my research include Haitian mega churches, the large community square in front of the capitol where Haitian students gather to discuss politics and current issues, and even makeshift churches around a family dinner table (Ossman 2002; Miller 2006). Churches aid in the creation and maintenance of personal and religious identity and are often socially segregated social spaces. The churches also openly cater to particular economic classes. Given this confluence of, class, ethical practices and
ideologies, the church is an ideal space to study technologies of the self and numerous other identity practices. I could go to specific churches and find very unambiguous social demarcations—e.g. the mulatto church, the middle class church etc.

Interviews: In the first three months, most of my interviews elicited genealogies, life histories and conversion stories (Bernard, 2005). This early process was to be productive for me, as it worked in three ways: to ameliorate the effects of extreme or idiosyncratic data (activist, government/party “representatives,” and generally disaffected temperaments); to establish the rapport and trust I need in order to introduce video recording in future interviews; and to create a social map of human interaction.

Objective three: Religion and Bureaucracy: My final objective was to determine the inner workings of the complex NGO-ification of Haiti. How often are bureaucrats forced to acquiesce to religious or evangelical NGOs? How much power do NGOs wield over the Haitian Government? I paid special attention to the processes by which individuals “bending the rules” and laws of their country for the benefit of foreign entities.

In order to reach this objective, the following documents, images and phenomena counted as data: self-reported bureaucratic claims; local news; interviews with bureaucrats and policy officials; observation of procedures for NGO agency. The specific methodologies attached to this data were as follows: formal and informal interviews with government officials and inhabitants (gatekeepers);
formal and informal interviews with agency officials. The NGO I worked with the most was Foncoze and smaller Christian entities; field notes from participant and non-participant observation; documentation from group conversation.

Access to government officials:

   My access to Government officials was at first hampered by my insistence on doing everything myself without my husband’s help. However, when I gave into my husband’s missionary network, the government networks interestingly opened up to me as well.

Field consultant/ translator

   Though I have worked toward securing a broad base of informants on my own, I employed two field consultants to introduce new networks and expand my knowledge of local communities. In addition, I found that there are some topics, that residents were reluctant, if not unwilling, to discuss with an outsider, for example, continued Vodou practice post-conversion etc. Haitianist scholars have taken such public beatings about sensationalizing and under/overstating Haitian affairs, that to many, I could represent another American scholar “getting it wrong” in Haiti. People are guarded with language about government and are especially careful about with whom they share such language and ideas. For these and other reasons, the assistant I hired played a large role in my methodology in the field. The predominant paradigm for using translators in social science research conceals the translator entirely by treating them as merely a mechanical and potentially problematic part of the research process. Translation and interpretation is thus treated as a technical act; the concern is with eliminating errors (Shklarov, 2007). In
contrast to this approach, Temple (2002) calls for a social constructionist approach to translation: translators are viewed as active producers of knowledge. She recommends that, like researchers, their intellectual autobiographies be explored and discussed, including their social location, perspectives, and specific skills and competencies. Franc was more than an interpreter but a key informant who provided information about the social setting under research and mediated between the researcher and the group under study. My translator was a middle management official at Fonkonze.

Franc also did translation work for the missionaries in my husband’s network. He is a 30-year-old man, newly engaged with a vibrant smile and stocky build. He lives in Carrefour with his 3 siblings and mother and father. Like many Haitians I spoke to, his English is self-taught. When my husband and I go to his home he and his siblings watch a worn out English VHS and copy the phrases robotically. His mother is a cook in our missionaries’ home and his father, whom we visited, was a former construction worker with terminal cancer. The only compensation he asked for was for my husband and I did talk to Anne Hastings, the CEO of Fonkoze, about considering him for a scholarship. We spoke to Anne Hastings but Franc did not end up with a scholarship to an American school. He is currently sitting in a Haitian jail for a crime he has yet to be charged with. In August 2012, he would have been in jail without trial for a year. Franc was invaluable in the gathering and even interpretation of my field data. He facilitated meetings, acted on leads and corrected my misinterpretations. He is a gentleman and a scholar and does not deserve this wrongful imprisonment.
Data analysis

Interviews, and participant observation: I engaged in several levels of data analysis. I coded the data as I collected them and took notes on any apparent patterns, connections, similarities, or contrastive points. I initially coded *in vivo* using my informants’ own words to create themes (Strauss and Corbin 1990: 68). Later I moved to a more deductive model. The computer-assisted data analysis program Atlas.ti also facilitated in coding. Once the data was coded, I tested the categories and explanations by creating a saliency chart ranging from one to five. If a point or an explanation held across several sources— for example, field notes, interviews, and/or site documents can support it - then it was ranked high (5). Triangulating among the various forms of data increased the validity of the data I collected. The field consultant mentioned above, also played a key role in data analysis as he/ she served as an external check for the validity of my claims.

In my efforts to produce “thick description” (Geertz, 1973) my empirical material – transcripts, coded observations, formal and informal documents and descriptive memos – were subject to an interpretative process in which coded categories were derived in an inductive process of interaction and integration of theory and empirical data (Putnam, 1983). “Identity”, individual and collective, and ‘refounding’ soon emerged as focal points of my analysis of ethical material and discursive practices. A recursive approach to working through this data led me to collapse and refine initial categories into integrative sets of key themes, including “second chance’, “Vodou and the devil”, “winning souls” and “conflicts and
dissonance”, which I wrote up as theoretical memos from which this entire work has been authored. See Digital Appendix

I tried throughout my research to employ a collaborative model of research—that is, research that involves research participants/collaborators as partners in the research process—(Fluehr-Lobban 1991, 2003). I like this approach to research because its methodology emphasizes multiple, polyphonic perspectives, which will leave a richer heritage of ethnography to subsequent generations of ethically conscious researchers. Others view collaborative research through the lens of the same history of anthropological research and would argue that the approach reflects an increasing decolonization of the discipline (Harrison 2010).

Methodological problems

I had true problems with mechanical forms of applying informed consent—especially as my research involved vulnerable, non-literate non-Western populations. This type of consent struck me as essentially unilateral. Signed forms are used more to protect the researcher rather than the human participants, and have conventionally reflected a one-way strategy empowering the right to conduct the research, in a formulaic way promising confidentiality and anonymity (usually without asking the "informant" if he or she desires this) and self-defining the project as involving "minimal risk." This language suits the federal regulators more than the interests of the researched and appears designed to meet the concerns of the members of institutional review boards (IRBs) over those of the research population.
My methodology was not particularly cutting-edge or novel, but it seemed as through the way of dong my project- incremental, displaced, and slowly building, encapsulated the way that I saw Haiti struggling to rebuild and struggling to make sense of its new reality.

Figure 5 Girl Crossing the Street Source: Author
Choking Up Blood

“Haiti will not die, Haiti must not die”

Former Haitian President Renée Preval

Everybody knows this. I’m talking pure historical fact here; the nation of Haiti was dedicated to Satan 200 years ago.”

Joshua taps the rickety table with his long dirty finger and the whole thing shakes. He fumbles a bit to catch his water. He is an American missionary from Tennessee. Ostensibly, he is a white man, but he wants to make sure I let my anthropologist friends know that he has some Native American blood, just in case I’m tempted to accuse him of racism. He stage whispers, as if letting me in on some great secret, “It was a blood ritual... a pact for 200 years, and guess what? Time’s up.”

The entire world’s eyes rested on the most destitute country in the western hemisphere. And what they saw were many converting to charismatic
Protestantism in droves. The general consensus among secularists, however, is that Haiti was already barely feeding its population, struggling through the effects of devastating floods and political instability. Then someone in the elevator (presumably God) pressed the “down” button.

What exactly did these people have to thank God for? Why did this country have to endure so much suffering? All of the American evangelicals, Haitian Christians, and recent converts whom I have interviewed try to answer these perplexing questions. In this chapter, I focus on my interviews with Haitian refugees in Santo Domingo post-earthquake. How did people react when they lost their faith in God, their leader and their country? How did the ideology of nationhood lose its power to elicit devotion? Through a mix of political, economic, anthropological and historical lenses, I engage these questions.

My central claim in this chapter is that post-earthquake, the Haitian government’s overwhelming inability to exert countervailing force against international “regimes of truth” expedited a kind of spiritual – and eventually physical – exodus out of Haiti. In short, people lost faith in their country’s ability to rule, protect and provide for the nation (like the Lord), as well as intercede on their behalf (like Jesus). This manifested itself in denouncement of the government and concurrent denigration of traditional Haitian religious practices, like Vodou.

The Dominican migration director, Sigfrido Pared Perez, estimated that the earthquake led to a 15% increase in the Haitian migrant population. Because most were not documented, a reliable population count doesn’t exist. The government has suggested it’s as many as one million; while researchers say that it is about
Regardless, Haitians are in a spiritual and physical transition. Those who stayed amidst the chaos or couldn’t afford to leave would be evangelized within an inch of their lives.

This transition, however, has not been a peaceful one. Black Haitian Vodouisants that I interviewed feared for their lives as anti-Vodou sentiment whipped up to fever pitch. Over 45 Vodouisants have been lynched since the cholera outbreak (CNN 2011) almost a year after the quake, when such fervent Christian sentiments were supposed to have quieted. Informants with whom I have spoken lamented (or boasted) that it had actually been at least three times that amount. What has created the type of religious urgency that justifies murder?
The NGO Landscape

It is a steaming mass of people. White ankles, red and knotty with mosquito bites and scratches cross over black ankles, boney and ashy. Scientologist, Mormons, Baptist, Pentecostals, Catholics, atheist, Marxist, doctors, Anarchist Nationalist and Nihilist gather at the Iron Market. Competing PA systems blare out: “Repent or face death,” “Jesus Loves You,” “Use Condoms,” “No UN,” “Follow me, and I will make you Fishers of Men”. At this market, there are no material goods for sale. Instead these individuals shouting to be heard, forcing their way through crowds, sell Haitian futurescapes. By futurescapes I mean that they are selling possibilities of the future-Haitian post cards with imagined paradises dated 2025 that read “Wish you were here” in bold lettering across the front. This thick cloud of developers, missionaries and health workers choke the capacity of the Haitian government to interact with its citizens and creates an NGO class that reinforces old rigid paradigms of order and control. Churches, organizations, political groups, and financial groups, all have as their major goal a reimagined Haiti. The techniques and models they apply to gain followers and believers mimic techniques of government. By the producing ‘governable subjects’ and ‘governable spaces’ by means of discipline and normalization.

The NGO landscape in Haiti is a vast, pulsing, autopoietic network, working against themselves pushing and pulling and competing for meager resources. In this section, I want to discuss the presence and influence of this NGO cloud over Haiti, its internal and external political authority and the social consequences of NGO rule in the country. A US Institute of Peace policy brief entitled “Haiti: A Republic of NGOs”
confirmed that the country has in operation more NGOs per capita than any other country in the world. NGOs provide 70 percent of healthcare in rural areas and 80 percent of public services (Dupuy 2010).

Secular and nonsecular NGOs in Haiti have worked to undermine the relationship between the Haitian state and its citizens and replaced it with a kind of clientelism, particularly in the case of Christian organizations. Hallin and Mancini (2004) identify clientelism as a form of social and political organization where access to public resources is controlled by powerful ‘patrons’ and is delivered to less powerful clients in exchange for reverence and other forms of service. Clientelism can also be seen as a cultural feature of religious organizations like the World Christian Movement, profiled later in this work, for their belief that formal rules are less important than personal connections and universal truths.

NGOs in their creation of a parallel system of governance, avoid and thus undermine the Haitian state, but they are not all in collusion. Competition is fierce among NGOs and the bickering, infighting and social posturing has been much to the detriment of the Haitian state. In February 2012 Oxfam, a British NGO released a scathing briefing paper indicting the Haiti Interim Recovery Commission, led by former president Bill Clinton, as it cites “years of indecision that has left Haiti’s recovery on hold.” There is no coordination between donor agencies as they jostle for control of tent camps and no effort on the part of the Haitian government to take control of reconstruction. Oxfam argues that donors need to stop the “rampant bilateralism — and the often-contradictory policies and priorities that plague the IHRC. They should also coordinate much more closely among themselves in order to
avoid gaps and duplication in funding. For example, money has been made available for temporary housing, but almost no funds have been allocated for rubble removal” (Oxfam). (See digital appendix for entire report)

What provokes my skepticism about the Oxfam criticism is that Oxfam itself is a powerful NGO that has a vested interest in securing funds for itself. If one reads the Oxfam Progress Report (2012) you can come away with the notion that Oxfam has held Haiti up on its shoulders.

The Disaster Accountability Project also released their “One Year Report On The Transparency of Relief Organizations Responding to the 2010 Haiti Earthquake” (2011) The Disaster Accountability Project (DAP) is a nonpartisan, nonprofit organization dedicated to improving disaster management systems through policy research and advocacy. The report examined 196 organizations that solicited donations for Haiti disaster relief. It determines whether they produced regular, factual reports, the accessibility of the reports, and how the monies raised were spent.

“The fact that nearly half of the donated dollars still sit in the bank accounts of relief and aid groups does not match the urgency of their own fundraising and marketing efforts and donors’ intentions, nor does it convey the urgency of the situation on the ground. This may be a disincentive for future giving by individuals and other governments,” Ben Smilowitz, DAP’s Executive Director

The competing interests and lack of coordination between organizations with so much financial clout has left Haiti without financial recourse or the governmental capacity to do anything about it.
Though the NGO landscape is murky and immense, efforts have been made to quantify and moderate NGO activities in the country. InterAction’s Haiti Aid Map is an effort to help the humanitarian community better coordinate its response. The map so far features 479 projects being operated all over the country by 77 local and international NGOs, most of which are InterAction members. Projects can be browsed by location, sector, or organization and include information on project donors, budgets, timelines, and the number of people reached by the project.

By using this map, we can look up, for example, World Vision - a Christian development organization, and see that since the quake it has raised 193,500,000 dollars for work in Haiti, and its funding sources are 66% private, 34% United States Government (Haiti Aid Map). While InterAction’s map covers their donors’ response,
it leaves out the thousands of government and other NGO projects being conducted in Haiti. USAID recently released a map of U.S. government projects in Haiti (see below) by sector and location.
“The goal is not to rebuild Haiti but to build a different Haiti,” said Sam Worthington, President and CEO of InterAction, speaking at the map’s formal launch exactly one year after the earthquake struck in 2011. Secular and non-secular organizations peddle dreams of a new and different Haiti. The USAID NGO map is more thorough than its InterAction counterpart however it also only highlights a small sector of involvement in Haiti. What patterns we can glean now, even through the mire, is that a high percentage of NGO activity in Haiti is health related. Over 40 percent of the participants of InterAction were involved in Health related functions with a concentration of efforts in Port-au-Prince. In fact Port-au-Prince, so near the epicenter of the earthquake also serves as the NGO epicenter of the nation. We can also see that there is continued growth in the microfinance sector that is beginning to take over Haiti’s second largest NGO presence, agricultural reform.

This new and different Haiti NGO’s are anxious to bring forth, almost always excludes the government, most conspicuously by way of the “reverse aid agenda” (Hoogvelt 2001, 192). Advocated by major international entities such as the World Bank, this agenda champions the redirection of aid away from national governments towards civil non-governmental organizations. In 1999, international donors officially withdrew all funds from the Haitian state as well as from the UN mission, and channeled them through NGOs (Zanotti 2010). This lack of trust in Haitian-run institutions is in response to past corruption in the Haitian government. Haitian reporter Isabeau Doucet in a recent article entitled “NGOs Have Failed Haiti” describes in concert with the earlier Oxfam report, how twelve Haitian members of
the 'Interim Haiti Reconstruction Commission' (IHRC) presented a letter of protest to co-chairman Bill Clinton, arguing that the Haitian state has come to function only as a ‘rubber stamp’. Doucet writes:

They complain of being ‘completely disconnected from the activities of the IHRC,’ given no background information on the projects they are supposed to fund, given ‘time neither to read, nor analyze, nor understand—and much less respond intelligently—to projects submitted’ the day before they’re voted on. There is no follow up on previously approved millions in funds; they ‘don’t even know the names of the consultants who work for the IHRC nor their respective tasks.” (2011, 1).

Large aid organizations have bypassed the Haitian state. This leaves influential NGOs with the power to debate and discuss policy, determine the need for, and allocate funds in the absence of clear Haitian governmental leadership and all this without the consent of the people. Political authority that lacks a representative function necessarily lacks the accountability and legitimacy required for long-term engagement. In fact, Political Scientist Matthew Bolton remarks that, “NGOs in Haiti derive their legitimacy and power from agencies’ ability to raise funds, usually from outside the country, rather than from any social contract with the local people” (2011, 17). Mark Schuller too has noted that “NGOs are not beholden to the same logic of public, civic responsibility” as the state (2009, 89).

NGOs’ use of exclusively internal personnel when undertaking projects has given rise to the popular conception of a ‘klas ONG’ (NGO class). This is a play on the term ‘klas politik’, the self-named “political class” (Schuller 2009). Laurent Dubois
refers to it, as the “humanitarian impasse” NGOs have become “in the eyes of states and beneficiaries, a component of the elusive and exclusive “international community” (1999, 28). Indeed, in the Haitian context one can see how the average person must perceive NGO workers as merging into one big privileged global elite, who live and socialize in the same gated communities as the UN forces that provide their security. Bolton has observed how in Haiti, the international community has “fragmented Haitian space” by putting up literal barriers between the people; “dividing Haiti into highly secure compounds, surrounded by high walls with tight security which is distinctly unwelcoming to Haitians not working for the ‘system’” (2011, 30).

NGOs have transplanted a parallel system of governance, in Haiti, with horizontal instead of vertical accountability. Beatrice Pouligny argued that while pretending to work with local civil society, outsiders actually collaborate with other outsiders – with themselves.’ (2005, 501)

NGOs in Haiti are ambiguous and contradictory. In their origins, functioning, and goals, they blur the boundaries between culture and politics and between civil societies and states. No NGO is the same. They, much like the states in crisis they try to save, arise out of multiple historical and cultural pathways, involve interweavings of culture and politics, and construct authority by classifying and ordering populations. Bodies, societies, and cultures have all become objects to be ‘read’. In their attempt to bring order to the chaos of earthquake ravaged Haiti, NGOs have each carved up a piece of Haiti to mold and shape into their own futurescapes
Donald Watson was not a helpless Haitian. He wanted you to know it, too.

“All that stuff you see on television? It's propaganda. We are good people here. When the earthquake hit, you,” he pointed to me, “deployed the military as if we would kill each other! We have problems here. But we are not animals.”

Donald was on the offensive. He enters a conversation about Haiti as if someone has been contradicting him for the past 20 minutes. He works at a Christian organization that houses temporary missionaries to Haiti. My husband and I were two of the few African-Americans he has encountered. He started by chastising all of Black America: “Why are you all so angry and poor? You live in America! You have everything!” After several minutes we made a pact. I told him, “If I don't believe all the things I see about Haiti, you don't believe all the things you see about American blacks.” Our tenuous truce was short-lived as he found another angle to express his displeasure. “You all are so used to helping the poor. Haiti is changing, you know. It's not just a country of dirty poor people. There are rich parts here, better than anything you've ever seen in America.”

I must stress here that I had yet to officially open the interview with a question. This lively monologue was à propos of nothing – just something he really wanted me to know. Donald was spent, and he looked over at me, saying, “But you’re not pushing the buttons, eh?” He found commonality in what he imagined to be our shared status as black in a racially stratified country. For the rest of the interview he referred to himself and me as “we,” “our people” and “us.” Donald saw

---

6 Therefore if anyone is in Christ, he is a new creature; the old things passed away; behold, new things have come. 2nd Corinthians 5:17 NASB
and responded to my blackness as an outlet to say what he could never have said to white American missionaries – largely because he works for American missionaries. They are his livelihood.

I asked him, “Why don't you tell this to the missionaries you meet?”

He looked at me askance.

I'm getting married! I need a house! And, besides, you know when someone is helping you only to make themselves feel like they are better than you. I know you know the difference. Sometimes it is best to let them believe.

Again he reiterated, “You know.”

Figure 9 Donald Watson not buying my explanation of Black poverty in the US
Source: Author
Yes, but Haiti is being made new. This earthquake just opened up all of Haiti’s problems. We’re laid bare, right? This nation was going to the devil. I never left my house because I would hate what I saw. It’s pathetic, right? Rich and poor going to the devil. This quake showed us everything wrong with the country. It was the breakdown before the breakthrough.

To make sense of the way the majority black poor Haitian Christian converts were reevaluating their country, I propose a re-examination of Zîzêk’s (1989) Sublime Object of Idealology. Zîzêk works in this theoretical space because in Haiti there seemed to be a systematic stripping of particular symbols of Haitian nationhood. Zîzêk convincingly argues that an ideology such as nationalism “is not simply a 'false consciousness,' an illusory representation of reality, it is rather this reality itself which is already to be conceived as 'ideological'” (21). The mask is not simply hiding the real state of things; the ideological distortion is written into its very essence” (28). The sentiments of nationalism, or more appropriate here, nationalism lost are not to be relegated to the realm of a collectively experienced, vivid fantasy. The nation, and the emotions it elicits, are real. I am inspired here by Zîzêk’s (1991) discussion of the dissolution (by external intervention) of ideological formations, like nation states, “whereby the ideological anamorphous loses its power of fascination and changes into a disgusting protuberance” (140).

This goes against the wave of scholars who argue that the nation has outlived its usefulness as a heuristic device (Appaduri 2005, Carnegie 2002, Heller 2011). The nation is an object similar to the divine in its need for sacrifice ceremony and
officiates. What happens to a deity that ceases to be worshipped? A God with no
followers becomes myth, and a nation with no believers becomes a footnote.

The history of religion in Haiti is a political one. After the earthquake, the
same racism that had thwarted the young nation two centuries ago still
reverberated around the world. As the earthquake shook the country, with
hundreds of thousands of lives lost, American televangelist Pat Robertson recalled,
in a Christian Broadcasting Network broadcast, Haiti’s spurious victory over
colonization through so called allegiance to the devil:

Something happened a long time ago in Haiti, that people might not
want to talk about. They were under the heel of the French, you know,
Napoleon the third and whatever. And they got together and swore a
pact to the devil. They said “We will serve you if you will get us free
from the prince.” True story. And so the devil said, “Ok, it’s a deal.”
And they kicked the French out. The Haitians revolted and got […]
themselves free. But ever since they have been cursed by one thing
after another. (CBN 2010)

Pat Robertson’s comments, though vile, represent for most evangelicals a clarion
call to save Haiti. This is a moment of chasm for the country, and, for many, it
represented an opportunity to “refound” Haiti.

Haitians themselves, though not in any way imbued with Robertson’s bigoted,
elitist, self-righteous tenor, express a desire as well to refound Haiti.
"We’re trying to change the old mentality. It’s more profound, deeper,” said Yolette
Jeanty, coordinator of the women’s rights organization Kay Famn. “It’s not only
building things. After the earthquake, people felt the need to come together," she said. "There was an opportunity to have Haitians sit together and rethink things” (Register 2011).

Haitian expatriate Guerda Nicolas, outgoing president of the Haitian Studies Association and a professor of psychology at the University of Miami, sat down with the Catholic Register:

If Haiti is going to be refounded, the important questions are "how" and “by whom?” and “for what purpose?” There is a role for Haitian expatriates, a role for people and nations of good will and a role for the Church in refounding Haiti. If you really want to get Haitians moving, there are only two things you have to say to them. One is church. It’s really having an opportunity to connect with their priests and pastors, to hear from their priests and pastors. That has a lot of meaning for them. (Jan. 2011)

The talk, particularly of refounding Haiti, speaks to the nationalization story, as it is bound up with Vodou. Guerda’s insistence that it has to start with the church. It speaks to the ideal reformulation and methodology of rousing the people. Zizêk (1991) argues that when outside influences force adoption of such a foreign gaze upon one’s own ideological field, the result is disgust and disillusion (140). A refounding of Haiti, I could only assume, would be unlike the first. The new recipe calls for less blood, less chaos, and significantly less Vodou, particularly if modern missionaries have their way.

Class and the Battle for Haiti
Participants and I sit around a large table and peel potatoes. They ask me through the translator if blacks were poor in America, or was everyone rich. During my lengthy break down of the American class system I mentioned something about poor whites and as my translator spoke the words the women scoffed. Poor whites? I had lost my credibility, as all three women went back wordlessly to peeling potatoes. I would not convince them that the racialized system of privilege that exists in the United States somehow did not include all whites nor exclude all blacks. This fragmented dichotomous view of power relations in Haiti has grown from a constantly simmering, occasionally erupting distrust between the ruling class mulatto elite and the black working poor.

Both mulatto elites and the black majority I interviewed expressed similar hope for the rebirth of their nation. The dissemination of national symbolism came to be a central activity of the state under the Duvalier dictatorship, which lasted from 1957 to 1986. Moreover, while historical mythology and rituals of nationhood have been shared by all classes in Haiti these state building processes have not necessarily linked Haitians to one another. Class divisions in Haiti have historically been sharp and divisions between the classes were often signified through skin color and language. The dominant class, although it contained prominent black families, was identified as mulattos and French-speaking, while the poor were portrayed as black and Kreyòl-speaking (Buchanan 1980; Dupuy 1990; Nicholls 1996).

From the administration of Jean-Jacques Dessalines (1804–1806) forward, successive regimes rigidly maintained a system of social castes and hierarchies.
With despotic leadership exacerbating and manipulating racial politics and social inequalities, the conflict between the elite and the poor became increasingly more entrenched. Periods of relative peace and moderate prosperity were brief and punctuated by violent overthrows.

In the 1960s, François Duvalier had firmly established his power, rising to political prominence on a *Noiriste* platform, which advocated the rights of the Black majority. Duvalier attained the presidency promising freedom of the press, political pluralism, rights for trade unions, and most importantly, economic redistribution (Ferguson 38). Further, he was a strong proponent of *Noirisme*, which some have called a distortion of the Haitian *Négritude* movement spearheaded by Jean Price-Mars, reasserting a pride in an African heritage and the practice of the Vodou religion. By condemning the more privileged mixed-race individuals for assimilating European and French values, Duvalier declared that his agenda would promote a Haitian, educated, and Black middleclass. While Duvalier’s reign was an extreme case, it was not unprecedented for Haiti to experience a so-called reversal of power that simply maintained the existing structure and merely replaced the persons in control. Duvalier only crystallized and exploited the distrust between the classes that is still so evident today. Furthermore, he successfully crowned the black majority as the social group with “true insight” into the country’s future. One Vodouisant participant expressed a distrust of what he just called “the rich.”

Marcel is a Haitian young man living with relatives in Santo Domingo. He has been in the city for two months after “running for [his] life” out of Port-au-Prince. He paints souvenir paintings of semi-nude women, the Haitian countryside
or, he says with a wink, “anything that will sell.” He is more cynical about the religious finger pointing in Haiti:

The rich blame us because they want us out. They pretend like it is only the poor who practice Vodou, but there is a hougan in Petionville and Cité de Soliel [two vastly different neighborhoods. Petionville is upper middle class and wealthy and Cité de Soliel is extremely poor]. They want to start a new country, one that will open its legs for any white man like they do here (Dominican Republic).

The tension between Haitian elite and peasantry is a well-rehearsed, scholarly tract. Michael Dash (1988) discusses, for example, how nineteenth-century Haitian nationalist discourses privileged, "official," revolutionary histories (the leadership of Toussaint Louverture, for example, over that of the maroon rebel Boukman), and embraced republican institutions and enlightenment values in positing the elite as saviors of the black race. The disavowal of Bwa Kayiman is also an important tool in the distancing of Haitian elites from the Vodou origins of the country. My middle class and poor Haitian convert informants countered the Bwa Kayiman story not by denying its importance or existence but by acknowledging it as a moment of misplaced faith. For my informants the reclamation of Haiti’s origin story represents a change to wrest the “savior of Haiti” banner out of the hands of the mulatto elite.

Laënnec Hurbon (1987) makes a similar argument when describing the propensity for the ruling class to usurp nationalist narratives and place themselves at the helm: "[The elite] soon would take itself for the entire black race, which it
would defend and exemplify to the West” (53). Marcel represents a more typical view of 1) Haitian national relations that pitted the poor against the Haitian elites and 2) the Dominican Republic from the Haitian perspective. To Marcel Of course, it is more financially stable than its neighbor, but it also benefits from an unholy trade - the soul of the country for Western investment and economic expansion. Marcel is not so far off from the truth in his discussion of elite desires for the country. History reminds us that of the desire for a new Haiti, has spawned epic class battles in the country.

This is not the first iteration of a “New Haiti” that had elites and the Haitian underclass vying for ideological control of the nation. The idea of a new Haiti after the Haitian Revolution of 1946 figures prominently in Michael J Smith’s (2009) Red and Black in Haiti. It is a term that is used various times in the book to highlight the complex ways in which Haitian radicalism altered local and international relations and shifted perspectives about class, cultural achievement, and politics. Smith contends that the new-fangled aspects of Haiti at times were a facade, a naive "organic vision of national unity" (109); at other points, they were rich with potential to create transformative change. Nevertheless, the notion of a new Haiti exemplified the promise of the post-occupation period.

Haitian elites attempted to exploit the American Good Neighbor policy. Pan-Americanism was the language of technical, industrial, and cultural modernization that many power-wielding Haitians and US state officials and intellectuals employed in order to promote a new Haiti and development in the Caribbean and Latin
America, particularly in the realm of business, cultural exchange, education, and tourism. Haitian elites underscored "intellectual cooperation" with the United States.

Post-occupation Haitian radicalism championed by the Haitian black majority though situated within this framework of salvation, modernity, and progress was ultimately pushing up against or rather creating friction with Haitian elite discourses of economic development and modernization theory, which only seemed to encourage emulation. The post occupation zeal for a new Haiti was ultimately fruitless, as both classes became locked in a political stalemate about how to steer the country.

This failure of Haitian political actors, who were faced with domestic and international demands forces a confrontation of the current situation in Haiti. As elites and the Haitian under class once again act out this familiar scene. Who’s ideology will rule. Most of my new convert participants are extremely poor and other more expansive studies have born out the appeal of evangelical Christianity to the poor. Have the Haitian poor found an answer to the ills of Haiti that the elite are not privy to? One of my participants is a mulatto pastor; though protestant, himself he dismisses the massive conversions as “fear based and silly.” Instead he advocates a two-pronged approach that includes maintaining law and order and reintroducing tourism to the island. He accused the NGOs of hindering the Haiti’s commercial potential. Contrastly my informants who were economically disadvantaged saw NGO intervention much more favorably than did the middle class and elites. They saw NGOs providing services that the Haitian government was incapable of performing, and were perhaps performing poorly before the quake.
Winning Haiti For Jesus

There is no comprehensive count of missionaries in Haiti because so many different groups dispatch them. The number is constantly changing, not to mention the fact that each group speaks different languages, rarely communicate with each other, and yet report to foreign powers about the “progress in Haiti” (Woodson, 2007). Before the earthquake, according to the Center for the Study of Global Christianity, there were about 1,700 long-term, professional missionaries in Haiti. But this count doesn’t include the thousands of American missionaries who are going to Haiti since the quake on trips that last just a few weeks or a few months. The numbers must be staggering.

Currently the most striking feature of Haitian anxieties is the international pressure to see post-earthquake financial contributions develop into a New Haiti, free of corruption and disease and revived with a Protestant work ethic. There can be no question that one of the major goals of this missionary thrust is to reappropriate Haiti’s origin story. The majority of Haitian Protestants I have interviewed in Santo Domingo and Haiti did not view Bwa Kayiman as a libratory moment but as a moment when the fledgling nation of Haiti was “consecrated to the Devil.” Many have developed an oppositional view of Bwa Kayiman that is a key to their religious identity. This act, in turn, ensured a legacy of misery in Haiti that is evidenced by the underdevelopment that grips it today. Haitian Protestants whom I interviewed acknowledged that Vodou is part of Haitian culture and that it is “in the blood”. Donald Watson corrected me here: “The only blood in me is the blood of
Jesus. I am a new thing and soon Haiti will be as well.”

McAlister portends that the evangelical rewriting of *Bwa Kayiman* will lead to violent implications in the fight for Haiti’s future between Haitian Protestants and the rest of Haiti (2006). A group of Haitian Protestants called “Vision: Haiti” marched on August 14, 1998 to *Bwa Kayiman* with the intent of exorcising Vodou spirits to “win Bwa Kayiman for Jesus” by performing a Jericho march.7 Twelve years later, after the quake, groups of pastors marched up to Bwa Kayiman attempting to pray over the sacred space, but to significantly less fanfare and interruption. Just 12 years ago, pastors were stopped by government officials and forced from the sacred space. The ritual performed at *Bwa Kayiman* can be seen as a direct challenge to the politics of origin in Haiti and a confrontation with the Haitian state. In 1998, the Haitian government considered the evangelical ceremony an “insult to national pride” (McAlister 2006:18). But the government was in no position to halt pastors after the quake. Donald Watson stated simply, “Anyone can go there now. It’s like nobody’s watching.”

**That Vodou That You Do**

I arrived in Santo Domingo three days after the earthquake. I came down to study beauty practices and citizenship in Haiti and the Dominican Republic. Because of the overflowing Haitian refugee communities in Santo Domingo, I was still able to conduct interviews with a large number of recently converted Haitians.

---

7 In the Jericho march, a group circles a space seven times in the name of Jesus, "commanding its walls to fall down".
Their subsequent move to the relatively greener pastures of the Dominican Republic seemed to them evidence that charismatic Protestantism had propelled them into a better life. When I arrived, the only thing I heard about was this great religious revival. I heard about how the quake was God’s way of punishing the evil in Haiti. I heard how Vodou priests were being harassed, even stoned, at Christian ceremonies. The Haitians whom I interviewed in Santo Domingo and Haiti wanted to talk about their conversion stories. So I listened.

I spoke with a salon owner “Ann Marie.” She owns a place on El Conde and is a newly minted Christian. She has a huge voice and hair extensions that reached down to her slim ankles. After the first interview, she prayed for my English-accented Spanish, “It’s too funny. You look Haitian but sound gringa.” She touched my hand, “You must wake up at three am and drink water. If you do this, your accent will be gone, in the name of Jesus.” She wanted to touch my tongue. I politely refused. She offered to wash her hands but I still declined. She said dismissively, “You are a gringa.”

Despite our somewhat rocky beginning, she began to open up about her conversion. She told me:

Before the earthquake, my sister was possessed by the devil. She shot straight up and began to act crazy. This was only hours before the quake so we knew something evil was about to happen. After the quake, she walked the streets with barely anything on. She hit herself and spoke a foreign language. [...] None of my [Vodou priest] could
help her. I took her to a Christian man who prayed over her and she began to bleed from her mouth. I believe this was the blood of Jesus. He healed my sister only three days after the quake. [She elbowed me sternly for emphasis] Three days, you get that? Now, my family and me have never missed a Sunday. The quake was just the beginning of the problems. God is coming for Haiti.

This sense that God was “coming for Haiti” was repeated throughout my interviews. God had left Haiti to the devil and now He was coming to take it back. Ann Marie’s conviction that her sister bled with the blood of Jesus was ultimately a story about power lost and restored. Her first option was the traditional Haitian Vodou methods; she found, however, that no one was able to help her sister. Where the Haitian Vodou priest failed to heal her spiritually sick sister, white Christian pastors succeeded. The timing of her sister’s illness is interesting as well, for she became possessed before the quake, as if when Haiti shook, it broke something inside of her as well, and Ann Marie’s quest to find someone to exorcize her sister’s demons mirrors Haitians in Haiti’s attempt to grapple for spiritual meaning after the quake.

A young man named “Eric” is an English teacher in Santo Domingo. He is originally from Jacmel but moved to Port-au-Prince for opportunity. After the quake he could find no reason to stay in the city. He is sharply dressed in a three-piece suit despite the heat. He carries a briefcase which he admits to me later is just a fancy lunch bag. He boasted about how much he makes as an English and French teacher, and even if he was embellishing a bit – which I suspected he was – he was being
criminally underpaid. I struggled for a minute with the thought of telling him to suggest a raise, but he is Haitian, in Santo Domingo and he has a three-piece suit, so I figured I had better leave well enough alone. “Yes, I’m Christian,” he said. He continued:

I had to leave Haiti, you know. The atmosphere just got too thick, too evil, you know? The priest lost all their power too [...] right before. They would take your money, but later say “this is not a matter I can complete” or something like that. Something happened and they lost their power. [...] Everyone would be smart to convert. Jesus is the one who will not leave in times of trouble. Look around. Do you see Santo Domingo shaken? Because Jesus in here.

Santo Domingo’s status as the stable neighbor creates in many Haitians proof that it is Haiti that is cursed. “How could the whole world not feel that quake, much less the same island? There is no damage here. Explain that,” Eric maintained. After the quake, many in the Dominican Republic feared a flood of Haitian immigrants. With respect to the contentious history of the two countries, a scholar of the region will not miss the significance of a Haitian saying that, in fact, the Dominican Republic is spiritually ideal. While many migrated to the country, they were quick to delineate that they came for the economic opportunity, not because the Dominican Republic was spiritually, morally, or culturally superior. Eric stated that Haitian Vodou priests “lost their power.” If the earthquake and subsequent disavowal of the government coincide with Vodou loss of power, it begs the question: From whence Vodou power?
Many conversion stories followed this same vein. A Christian had the power to do what a Vodou contemporary could not. “If not for the love of God, we would starve! Their [those who practice Vodou] days are numbered!!! In Christ I have all power but they are corpses,” screamed Ruth, an older woman whose husband was dying of stomach cancer. She could not afford to bring him along to Santo Domingo. With her but sends money weekly. “They even told me to go get my husband healed out of Haiti! The priests are useless now. Look who has the real power... a skinny white man!” After the quake, converts connected this notion of power and possibility with the Protestant form of Christianity and Whiteness, while the Haitian government sat powerless, overrun with NGO groups, evangelicals and foreign aid workers. Had the Haitian government’s epic inability to function been a catalyst for religious conversion?

It was finally time to go to Haiti. My experience in the Dominican Republic exemplifies how circumstance, or the will of the field, may entail the necessity not only of radical shifts in approach, but also sea changes in the actual subject matter of an inquiry. The original fieldwork goals in the Dominican Republic in the wake of such a devastating earthquake seemed weak and stagnant. I felt like I had a responsibility to manage those huge contingencies that arrive unannounced. The unpredictable nature of the field requires intellectual and strategic flexibility of the fieldworker. As I moved to Haiti, fully pregnant, interminably hot and uncomfortable, I was about as flexible as any anthropologist could get. Because our living
arrangement plans literally *fell through*, I stayed at two American missionaries' homes.

In Haiti, the anti-Vodou fervor reached fever pitch when Christian fundamentalists took to the streets in an attempt to stone Vodouisants. Many were injured and feared for their safety. In many instances, United Nations police were called to the scenes. (See photos below)

![Figure 10 Vodou practitioners protect their head as they practice outside. Source: Sommedevilla](image-url)
Figure 11 UN forces break up violence that erupted at a Vodou ceremony. Source: Sommedevilla

Figure 12 Last of Vodou Practitioners Run for Cover under a hail of stones. Source: Sommedevilla
“It will be war – open war,” Max Beauvoir declared. He is a Sorbonne-trained biochemist and a popular representative of the religion. He sat down with Agence France Press (AFP) to talk about the events in Haiti. It is worth reproducing most of the interview for simply Beauvoir’s charisma and trickster posturing: “It’s unfortunate that, at this moment where everybody’s suffering, that they have to go into war. But if that is what they need, I think that is what they’ll get.” He accused evangelical denominations of using post-quake aid supplies, such as food and medicine, to try to "buy souls." Beauvoir said, "I would like to see each one of them tied up in ropes and thrown in the sea, and I hope the best of them will be able to catch a plane and run away and leave in peace because this is what we need right now – peace."

It seems as though Beauvoir is not far from the truth on his shocking “food for souls” claim. Commenting on tensions between Vodou practitioners and Christians, Frank Amedia of Touch Heaven Ministries made the shocking statement that “we would give food to the needy in the short term, but if they refused to give up Vodou, I’m not sure we would continue to support them in the long term because we wouldn’t want to perpetuate that practice. We equate it with witchcraft, which is contrary to the Gospel” (Touch Heaven ministries.org).

During the interview Beauvoir was asked whether he would encourage Vodou followers to respond with the same kind of violence. Beauvoir said that he would. "They have not been aggressors. I think they are aggressed (attacked), and they will have to answer with the same type of aggression. I don't mean for
(evangelicals) to die. I am not out to kill them." Speaking of evangelical leaders in Haiti, Beauvoir declared that most of them studied in places like Alabama and Mississippi, "where they have learned hatred and fear."

Beauvoir believed that the government brought the earthquake onto itself by denying the country’s roots in favor of the beliefs and habits of "settlers." He continued, “I consider myself fortunate. Vodou temples have fared better than the churches and the cathedrals. They are still standing. I presented my condolences to the Catholic and Protestant representatives who have suffered so much.”

This marvelously tongue-in-cheek interview speaks to the tension among Haitians about the perceived future of the country. Vodouisants say it was the failure to bury Dessalines properly that has caused the quake, while Christians and the newly converted say that it was the blood pact that, in fact, caused the horrible disaster. They want Haiti to be “refounded, re-branded and remade.” (More on this fascinating leader in appendix)

**Blood on the Ground**

The newly converted Christians I spoke to in Santo Domingo struggled to see Vodouisants as part of their world. Ann Marie, the salon owner, suggested that the violence is “the natural rooting out of evil that has to take place." I offered, “did rooting out evil have to mean killing?” She did not pause to think but shot straight back, “They were already dead.”

In “Religion Violence and the Vitalistic Economy” James Faubion addresses this vital shift, when murder is not murder and death is not death. In every religion there is an “apparatus for the legitimization of violence” (5). The level and degree of
violence one feels justified in committing depends on one’s sense of one’s
metaphysical world or vitalistic economy:ii

The evidence suggests that a good many of the people who oppose one
another’s very existence so vehemently and unconditionally these days, in
the Middle East and elsewhere, do so not merely because they are being
denied of their property or their mobility or the prospect of a satisfying
future but also because they understand themselves to belong to one or
another vitalistic economy that it itself is in peril and under assault. The
evidence suggests that what is at issue for many of them is not in fact just life
and death — these familiar parameters of biopolitical order — but instead
Life and Death (14).

New converts’ tenuous grasp on biblical concepts may always seem under attack by
the mere presence of Vodou practitioners. How is it murder when you have
safeguarded Christianity for you and others around you?

In Haiti, no matter the place or time, one could always hear a church service
in the all-too-familiar vocal athleticism attributed to southern Protestantism. In fact,
I heard Kompa iii refashionings of old Christian hymns more than the national
anthem.

“Pastor Pierre” is a Christian pastor whom I interviewed about six months
after the quake. He and his wife “Bridgette” have a large church in Port-au-Prince
that has expanded considerably since the earthquake. He has a congenially world-
weary air about him, and he seems to have in good measure, what I am starting to
suspect is the sole province of pastors, overactive sweat glands. He sweats profusely throughout the interview. After discussing some generalities, we got down to the particulars. He is mulatto. He and his wife studied in the United States, and somehow I could sense it – not just in their crisp clothes but also in their liberal use of black American idiomatic speech. For example, Bridget leaned over to hit my hand, admonishing me on my posture, “Girl, give that baby room to breathe.” I congratulated Josef on his bustling church, which elicited from him a self-conscious grin.

“We are happy for truly converted souls, sure, but some of these people have salvation all wrong. They offer me money for prayer and healing. I have to teach them the Bible. This isn’t the market.” He leaned in conspiratorially. “Anyway, I don’t know how long they’ll be here. Some are just here for them,” he gestured to the large group of white missionaries handing out bracelets and Creole bibles. “When they see white men they want to join.” He wiped his brow. “In the end, it’s all about what they can get.” He said all these things in the hushed tones of a stern librarian.

I get this a lot in Haiti, this conspiratorial lean in, especially when the conversation is about whites. I am a black woman, dark with locked hair, so my Americanness is often subsumed under my Haitian-like somatic features. Informants would say, “Yeah, you’re American, but we’re brother and sister.” Though I am, of course, implicated in structures of power as an American academic, I look like I could be Haitian. As a scholar of Hispaniola, I do not underestimate the importance of looking the part. In many cases, Haitians in the Dominican Republic
would demand to know why I pretended to be American (denying Haitian ancestry is a real issue in the Dominican Republic) and I would be summarily cursed at in Spanish, Creole, and English. All of this to say I looked the part of a sisterly sympathizer no matter whom I engaged. This yielded a refreshing frankness and candor from my informants. It is also important to note that I was visibly, painfully pregnant, which went far in establishing trust, particularly with my female interlocutors, and elicited a kind of protection in the form of constant warnings and admonitions from my male interlocutors.

Pastor Pierre expressed anguish and disgust at his congregation’s curiosity and expectation of charity with respect to whiteness. While the social implications of the missionaries’ charity and the Christian aid organizations’ giving may result in filled churches and saved souls, the economic implications of this charity are more ambiguous. In the context of Haiti, these charitable acts create economic assurances that are embedded with a particular form of Christianity. Political scientists Kenneth Scheve and David Stasavage (2006) discuss the implications of widespread charity on one’s sense of salvation and redemption:

Charity amounts to a form of communal insurance and can be efficient, if the society has a lot of uncertainty. The link between salvific merit and charity would be particularly productive, if the society lacks formal structures, such as insurance markets and government welfare programs, to deal with individual uncertainties. (267)
Haiti is such a government. Haitian recipients of water and rice see themselves as saved and redeemed by evangelical missionaries. As government officials stand powerless, in whom do Haitians put their “faith”?

Lillian is a Vodou priestess, or she certainly claims to be. She leaves room for doubt, because I have seen her just about everywhere in the city doing everything, particularly with shady expatriates. She is rumored to be a prostitute, but only by my informants who saw her way of life as threatening to their own salvation. Whatever she was, we could add enterprising to the list. Whatever I said I needed, she happened to be, or at least knew a person who could help me – for a small fee. It was like a running joke of the tourist in a small town who keeps bumping into the same man under different auspices: chief of police, handyman, and real estate agent. Lillian was the small town woman of many hats.

We sat down for the interview and she took off her jacket. She told me matter-of-factly that the unborn child I was carrying is a girl and then straddled a nearby wooden chair. Her shirt was completely see-through and she had on no bra. She asked me for money straightaway, and I spent twenty minutes convincing her that I just wanted to talk. She slid her jacket back on warily.

“What do you want to know?” She rolled a homemade cigarette as I told her about the conflict over Vodou. She let out a derisive snort, saying:

You're asking the wrong question, “Why are people leaving Vodou?”

Nobody ever leaves Vodou. It's not a hat. You can't take it off. Vodou is mental. Once you have a Vodou mentality, you have it forever.

That's the reason for the violence; that's why they burn altars, because
they still feel its power within them. You came in, saw the altar, and it
didn’t move your heart, but if you were Haitian, it would move your
heart. They cannot fight it. When times get hard again, they will beat
down our doors. You’ll see, a Vodou Revival! *Kay koule twompe soley
soley men li pa twompe lapil.* “A leaky house can fool the sun, but it
can’t fool the rain.”

Lillian’s conclusion that Vodou is not to be cast off suggests that it is
understood to be an integral part of Haitian personhood. The leaky house she spoke
of is the new persona of Christianity Haitians have adopted. Describing the Haitian
Christian as the building with a poor infrastructure is an interesting inversion of
common conceptions about Haiti. I suppose there is still time to see which structure
holds.

**Conclusion**

I have attempted to show how refugees in Santo Domingo have lost faith in
the Haitian national project, while at the same time elucidating how American
missionary intervention is attempting to rebrand and remake Haiti into *a new thing.*
Woodson (2009) would caution us about the heavy investment in grand narratives
of “failed states,” and it is exactly this moniker that serves as a beacon to colonial
forces.

Missionaries and NGOs have taken over almost every aspect of Haitian
government; the result is a ubiquitous fusion of power and economic forces that
reinforce and intertwined anew-old associations of whiteness, progress and
Protestantism with the future of Haiti. In this research about Haitian conversion, I arrived at many conclusions. I found that:

1. Many black converts I interviewed believe that the maintenance of their religious identity contributes significantly to the maturation of Haiti itself.

2. The rationalization of violence has very little to do with fear of loss of life or property, and more to do with converts’ radical changes in religious ontology. The old and the new cannot share the same space at the same time; they invalidate each other.

3. These conversions could represent a corporate disavowal of the Haitian government as capable or powerful. Borrowing from, and adding to, Kenelm Burridge’s (1969) argument, I contend that conversions arise when assumptions about power are challenged. Vodou is as much a national symbol as it is personal. Therefore, drifting away from such a strong symbol to join crowded Protestant churches with charismatic, often white, leaders can be read as more than just a change in faith. More appropriately, it is a loss of faith in the meaning, the power and the future of a particular type of Haitian nationhood. The Deity has lost it worshipers, and the object of ideology has essentially lost its sublimity. Only to be incrementally replaced by Christianized nationalism that shuns Haiti’s origin story.

4. The internalized foreign gaze supplied by endless cascades of missionaries and NGOs has disenchanted aspects of Haitian nationalism as an ideology. For some, what it means to be Haitian is forever changed. My Haitian Christian informants claim that they have yanked away the curtain, only to
find a thin, impish man pulling an endless amount of pulleys and ropes.

The work is inchoate, but offers the hope of useful findings. What’s emerging is a clearer picture of how citizens react to a nation in chaos, or how religion can be used as a symbol of one’s nationalism or disavowal of the nation. On seemingly abstract concerns like theology – sometimes on quite nuanced points of belief, like the delivery of fresh water – for my participants, faith in their nation is hinged on its capacity to “act out” the collective national ideology in times of upheaval. Theorizing social change thus requires a drawing out of the connections between people’s changing life experiences and the cultural means with which people have made sense of these experiences. The earthquake set in motion a process of reconstituting the “Haitian nation” on various levels.

Lillian the Vodou priestess continues to reprimand the Haitian converts’ confused ideology. “These people know that Vodou is who they are. It’s in the blood.” She pats her chest. “You don’t choke up blood unless you are wounded! They are blaming the blood, but it is them who are doing the coughing.”
We're watching a video of the triumphant conversion of a group in Papua New Guinea. Their brown skin and threadbare clothing are sharp contrast to the missionaries’ khaki shorts and striped shirts. After a near endless narration of the gospel, the entire village has come to Christ. The villagers are overcome with the gravity of God's sacrifice and are released from the tyranny of ancestral demons and curses. They all collectively wail at the import of this knowledge. After they are all converted, they hoist the missionary up and bounce him around, weeping and laughing for hours. The scene ends like a 90's sitcom where there is a freeze frame of the Missionary being exalted and brassy music begins to play. Jittery credits roll.

9 The gospel is a written account that describes the life, death and resurrection of Jesus of Nazareth. According to the bible, the "gospel", is also defined as the "word" that comes forth, out of the mouth of God. 1 Peter 1:25
When the lights came on, there is hardly a dry eye in the house. (See appendix). I am fairly comfortable admitting that this is what I imagined to be the missionaries secret desire- to go somewhere and be coveted, worshipped and cosseted by the darker brother. Missionary expeditions always seemed a bit too self-congratulatory for my taste. And this introductory video to the missionary class, Perspectives on The World Christian Movement, confirmed all of my disdain for the entire endeavor. The organization has produced a study course on missions entitled Perspectives on The World Christian Movement, which is used by hundreds of organizations to train their missions’ leaders. I took this class from January to May 2011. It was six months of prominent missionaries coming to Little Rock Arkansas to talk about, and give encouragement to, future missionaries. The class was full, brimming with hopeful Christians young and old. During this time, over 6,000 classes were starting all over America. Because of its depth of influence as the primary source of these organizations’ missions’ philosophy, the course forms the basis for much of this section of my research, and will be cited often. Sitting in a
Perspectives class for six months allowed me see the important discerning principles that make WCM primed to engulf Haiti’s nationalist narratives and produce Evangelization Nations.

This chapter is divided into three parts; the first part details the evolution of the WCM’s controversial missional radicalism: Their alignment with social justice as equal to spirituality; the interventions into issues of the secular state in Haiti; and the manipulation of secular notions of ethics and freedom to expedite conversion. The second part of this chapter will extend the ethical focus to Haiti and the socio-political effect that its own ethical project of "self care" has on its citizens. I will utilize Faubion’s model of ethical reckoning to better understand the multifaceted ethical pulls recent converts contend with. The third part of the chapter will highlight the racial and economic elements of conversion. I will draw from my own experience enrolled in a missionary course for six months as well as my interviews with World Christian Movement evangelicals, decidedly Non-WCM evangelicals and Haitian evangelicals in Haiti.

A Star is Born.
The World Christian Movement began as a wildly original concept; a young Christian man, Ralph Winter, saw earlier missionary endeavors as anachronistic, colonialist and lacking a true missional corpus. The story of how this organization came into existence is in itself a story of clashing civilizations. The WCM’s wide-
ranging attempts to create an unattached missionary and a post national disciple have ignited a firestorm of theological critique.

The re-branding of the missionary experience, and the sociopolitical aims of the organization are the setting Haiti afire (however unintentionally) with a renewed theocratic nationalism. Among Haitians there is a spoken desire to refound the nation on Christian principles and doctrines. The implications of WCM’s spiritual thesis on evangelization in Haiti are as yet unfolding. And what I found here could be the beginnings of a reviverist movement in the country that could last for decades and encroach on all sectors of Haitian national identity (however disjointed).

Historically, missionaries availed themselves of western colonial expansion, allowing the metropole to act as custodian to evangelical ambitions. At the same time, the colonial powers saw the missionaries as allies in their attempts to civilize the people. However, after the tumultuous 1960s and 1970s the motives of colonialism were called into question. Missionaries begin to turn against governments; totalitarian regimes accused missionaries of subversive rabble-rousing.

The first modern conference of missionaries took place in 1966 in Berlin to confront the changing role of missions in the world. On November 1971, Billy Graham convened a meeting at which he inquired about the advisability of holding another international congress on world evangelization as a follow-up to the 1966 World Congress on Evangelism in Berlin. The Congress met from July 15 to 25 in 1974 under the theme, "Let The Earth Hear His Voice." The global, ecumenical
World Christian Movement's aim was the "Christianization of all the world by means of traditional missionary work combined with social and political action." (Dam, 1987) The conference also coined a new word in the Christian world: Evangelization.

To most secularists, there is no distinction between evangelism and evangelization. But to the conference participants and later to the founders of the World Christian Movement there is a distinction. Essentially, evangelism involves the saving of souls, while evangelization means the saving of whole nations or "people groups spiritually and temporally through political and social action" (Winter 2009: 19).

In addition to the major plenary addresses (including the open and closing addresses by Graham), the conference culminated in the signing by a large number of the participants of the Lausanne Covenant (see appendix). The Covenant was a statement intended to define the necessity, responsibilities, and goals of spreading the Gospel. Moreover, the LC was a manifesto for a new type of missionary experience free from colonial pairing and national boundaries. The complicity with colonialism left an unsavory taste in the mouths of young “followers of Christ.” A Pastor interlocutor described these students as “bearded and turtle-necked revolutionaries with dog-eared Communist Manifesto copies under their arms” (but more about that later). They wanted Christians to be responsible for the spiritual and physical needs of the community---so they drafted a charter. The LC added the element of legal responsibility that compelled missionaries to intervene socially and politically in the lives of those they served. Article five of the Covenant states:
...Although reconciliation with man is not reconciliation with God, nor is social action evangelism, nor is political liberation salvation, nevertheless we affirm that evangelism and sociopolitical involvement are both part of our Christian duty. For both are necessary expressions of our doctrines of God and man, our love for our neighbor and our obedience to Jesus Christ.

(Lausanne Covenant Emphasis mine)

One of the drafters of the LC and a plenary speaker at this conference was Ralph Winter, an anthropologist, theologian and mathematician. The young Ralph Winter would deliver a fiery speech that forever changed the goals and content of missionary endeavors. His wife Roberta Winters wrote in her autobiography I Will Do A New Thing (1987) of the import of Robert’s speech at the Lausanne Conference. Her account of his speech gives credence to how revolutionary his idea of evangelization was at the time and how heavily ‘traditionalist’ lobbied against it:

Ralph’s address was one of only two or three that had scheduled responses from the platform. His responders were three well-known mission leaders working in different areas of the world. They were critical of his first paper. One had missed his point completely and the other assumed that if we appeal to strategy, we ignore the crucial role of the Holy Spirit. I was troubled by the criticism, especially of the second. "It is true," I thought, "that in relying on a specific strategy we may be relying on man’s best wisdom without reference to the Holy Spirit. But it does not have to be this way. [...]I do hope this man’s negative comments don’t confuse people so that they will fail to understand the importance of what Ralph has to say!
Obviously they too had missed his point. How could he make them understand?(17)

Roberta was troubled by the poor reception of Ralph’s Plan. Winter, however, (fellow anthropologist and as such most assuredly a peddler of rebellious idealism) would not need a coalition of the traditionalists to begin his evangelical movement. He simply needed a handful of believers young enough to not see or not care about the impossible enormity of his goals.

From there, Ralph and Roberta Winter went on to found the US Center for World Missions, the first fruit of the WCM tree. To be clear, the World Christian Movement is not a single organization, but rather a network of organizations working toward the same goal. A large segment of the WCM is youth oriented, whereby churches working with Christian youth organizations send teenagers to accomplish the task of evangelization. This is in place of evangelism, which many traditional churches feel needs to be commissioned to elders known as evangelists. It is a divisive missiology. Church pastors take issue with the fact that, in most cases, these youth are high school or college age young adults who are “not actually ministering the Gospel, but rather employing crazy tactics (These methods include miming, puppets, movies such as the Jesus Project etc.) to gain peoples' attention for the presentation of a watered-down gospel” -as one of my informants hotly put it. (More on Pastor Young later). This is a young movement. But its popularity and ubiquity has left traditional evangelicals with a bitter pill to swallow: “Get hip or get lost.”
Even as a subsidiary of the much larger WCM, the extent of the USCWM’s influence is vast. Yet the average believer has been aware only of its influence, not of its presence. I compare it to Unilever, that ubiquitous multinational corporation that produces everything from skin lightening cream to iced tea. Once you notice Unilever in the bottom corner of a household item, you can never unnotice it. Similarly the USCWM is an umbrella for hundreds of Christian missionary organizations, Christian publications, and educational curricula all over the world.

“Oh That Hippie Crap” on the Uses of Social Gospel

There are a few things that differentiate the WCM from other Christian movements. First, is the insistence that social and political action is as much a part of the Great Commission\(^\text{10}\) as is preaching the Gospel. In the *Reader for Perspectives on the World Christian Movement*, C. Peter Wagner, calls social and political action "the cultural mandate" of the Gospel.

I was speaking with “Pastor Young,” a small and wiry man in his early 60’s. He has a remarkable head of shoe-polish-black hair and bright teeth. We were in Arkansas and he was kind enough to sit down with me though he mentioned intermittently throughout our conversation that he was a busy man. He is a pastor of a medium-sized Baptist church in North Little Rock. He is no stranger to WCM and its mission so he and a collection of other pastors in the area are trying to fight the spread of “wrong headed gospel.”

\(^{10}\) The Christian Great Commission is the command of Jesus Christ to his disciples, that they spread his teachings to all the nations of the world.
“So now we not only have hippies in the White House; they’re in control of world missions, too!” He joked. He would be interested in our classes; we started a particular class chanting Indian mantras to bongos, and writing our dreams down. It’s not your typical American evangelical fellowship. Or at least it is trying desperately not to be. Our classes are filled with faux shocking headlines like “Jesus isn’t American” and “Indigenous missionaries are people too!” I suppose this speaks to the level of ethnocentrism that the newer missionaries have mediate in order to arrive at some sort of détente between conservative and liberal Christians. The class is full of all types, college students and retirees, liberals and conservatives and those off the political grid. To most, the ideas presented in the class are novel. I was talking with a 43-year-old mother of three who was flirting with the idea of quitting her job as a masseuse and moving to Nepal:

“It’s easy to see these people as just the masses in need of salvation. This class I think humanizes them for me. They have their own culture your own way of seeing the world and in some ways it can be better than ours!”

“This movie is weird right?” Loretta is also a classmate of mine. She is a black woman in her fifties. Her hair is wrapped in severe black wrap with a large bun in the back. We just finished EE Toaw, and she struggles with the language to describe the movie we were watching. I think she is nervous to say it is a bit racist because she genuinely believes in missionary work and the progressiveness of the class. I say:

“ Weird like how?”
“Well where’s the video of their missions to white places? I get what they’re saying I mean it’s an important moment when people come to Jesus it just...” she trails off here. I finish her thought.

“-Always seem like we (those of African decent) need Jesus the most?” She slaps my shoulder in mock outrage

“Girl You silly!” But she is content with the conversation. She has allowed me to say what an older black woman born and raised under the specter of white supremacy in Little Rock, Arkansas would not dare say in a room full of southern whites, that perhaps this is all a bit more of the same.

Had Pastor Young been a party to our Perspectives class he would have found a great deal more to take issue with than the tired “little brown babies” trope. He was genuinely nervous about it getting out that he and other pastors are against this movement.

“You just don’t want them to know you are their enemy. I don’t hate the people. My problem is they stress the socio-political mandate over the evangelistic mandate and it’s just plain wrong.” I argue here that both sides have some areas of agreement. Both argue that a more humane social order and a more just distribution of resources are important concerns of the Church.

“Yes, but they don’t give equal weight to these issues.” Back in Perspectives class, I brought these concerns to a presenter who offered a passage to me in response to Pastor Young’s claim:

The degree to which they [traditionalists] have stressed a personal-social salvation to the exclusion of the political-social dimensions of the Kingdom is
the measure to which they have narrowed the nature of the Kingdom and made it less than what Jesus proclaimed. (Winter 2009:32)

Pastor Young is not impressed and puffs out a breath, ready for the next question. In the foreword of the Perspectives Reader, Leighton Ford, Chairman of the Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization states:

“Across every continent are emerging ‘World Christians’-young women and men with world horizons, committed to Exodus lifestyles, possessed by the goal of disciplining the nations to Jesus Christ the Lord.”(xii) I ask Pastor Young about the exodus lifestyle and how flashiness in international communities is frowned upon.

I ask, “Isn’t there something to this Exodus lifestyle in creating trust in believers?”

“Ok” Pastor Young shifts in his chair; he wants me to understand this. “When someone says the "Exodus lifestyle,"-he air quotes here- “It’s just a bunch of hippie crap. They’re talking about the Israelites being prepared to leave Egypt with nothing but their staffs in their hands and bare feet. I don’t like it, "Exodus lifestyle"' again he air quotes. “Is a buzzword. It suggests that Christians should not possess anything but the basics of life. But the fact is, the Egyptians gave the Israelites tons of cash to take with them. An exodus lifestyle if we’re talking biblically should mean we’re all loaded.”

Pastor Young continues, “They’ve misinterpreted everything! I mean take the great commission.11 The one you better get right as a Christian. The WCO has

---

11 Matthew 28:19-20:
committed to ‘disciple the nations,’ they are literally out there speaking to
government officials! The WCM teaches that it is not just people that Christ wants
us to convert, but entire nations. This is a political power, they are grabbing for.
Which was never given to the Church by Christ. So the whole point in evangelism is
to be the moral bully to force unregenerate men to act right? And government go
along with it because governments want moral citizens, too, right since it best
serves the governments’ interests."

“Well I ask blankly (in retrospect it was a question that suggested I was a
skeptic and I wished I had asked it differently) what’s wrong with using a social
system to get people to act morally. It’s what they are there for, right?”

“What? No, society can’t ‘make you’ do anything.” He sighs; he is disappointed
in me for some reason. "You academics are so awed by the deeds of men you spend
your whole live in reverential amazement at your own shadow. It’s not something I
can make a person like you understand. I mean we all want to see a moral and just
society, true believers trust in Christ to accomplish this when He returns. We do not
trust men,” He rattles of an impressive list of bible verses.\[^6\] He is done with
questions and does not respond to my further inquiries. The WCM agenda does not
end with social and political action. It also wars against debilitating mindsets
referred to as strongholds.

---

\[^6\] Go ye therefore, and teach all nations, baptizing them in the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of
the Holy Ghost: Teaching them to observe all things whatsoever I have commanded you: and, lo, I am
with you always, even unto the end of the world. Amen
To pass from estrangement from God to be a Son of God is the basic fact of conversion.

That altered relationship with God gives you an altered relationship with yourself, with your brother man, with nature, with the universe.

E. Stanley Jones

Strongholds and Principalities: Ethical work to Nationalist Ends

When Satan is not busy influencing people through idolatry and corruption, he controls them through detrimental thought patterns. In evangelical communities, a stronghold is a point of operation from where Satan can keep the unbeliever unemancipated or the believer incapacitated. Paul, the Bible’s persecutor turned proselytizer, defines strongholds as an “argument or high thing that exalts itself against the knowledge of God.” Evangelists in the WCM communities see strongholds as not just barriers to an emancipatory relationship with Christ, but as political blockades that preclude the possibility of national power and authority. In the Perspectives Workbook Francis Frangipane describes the effect such mental blockades have on people and nations:

There are satanic strongholds over countries and communities; there are strongholds that influence churches and individuals.... These fortresses exist in the thought patterns and ideas that govern individuals... as well as communities and nations. Before victory can be claimed, these strongholds

---

12 3 For though we walk in the flesh, we do not war according to the flesh. 4 For the weapons of our warfare are not carnal but mighty in God for pulling down strongholds, 5 casting down arguments and every high thing that exalts itself against the knowledge of God, bringing every thought into captivity to the obedience of Christ,

2 Corinthians 10:3-5
must be pulled down, and Satan’s armor removed. Then the mighty weapons of the Word and the Spirit can effectively plunder Satan’s house. (Frangipane in Winter 2009; 39)

This notion of conversion as an emancipatory movement, a person’s choice for freedom, within the slavery of sin and degradation summons a Foucauldian approach to understanding the motivations behind religious conversions. According to Foucault, ethics involves the kind of relationship one has to oneself. The essential condition for the practice of ethics is freedom, the ability to choose one action, not another. Foucault claims, for example, that the slave has no ethics (1984 286) being unable to make a decision outside the auspices of his master. One who is unable to make his/her own choices is one without ethics. Foucault makes a distinction between moral codes (which are simply collections of rules and precepts) and ethics. He suggests there are four aspects to how the individual constitutes him/herself as the moral subject of his or her own actions. Faubion expands these four aspects and adds complexity to the ethical model by including new frames of reference and new components to evaluate in the search for anthropological weight to ethical arguments. It would be useful to briefly list Faubion’s schemata discussed in the introduction as a placing reference and quick reminder.

**Mode of Subjectivation**

**Mode of Determination of Subjectivation**

*Recruitment and selection*. This refers to the way in which a participant is recruited and selected into a particular subject position.
**Mode of ethical valuation.** How is it determined that one falls underneath the lens of ethical regard? Who determines this?

**Mode of justification:** The defense of ethical evaluation

**Mode of Subjectivation (again)**

*Scope structure and priority.* Allows for a kind of nesting of ethical priorities.

Faubion writes “subject positions are variably expansive. They have variable logic profiles.” (Faubion 66) This acknowledges the myriad ethical dynamics determining action.

**Telos:** The end result of these ethical strivings

**Substance:** The stuff, body, thing, or idea that requires reconditioning

**Askesis:** A particular work that a subject must perform to achieve desired result

*Pedagogical* what direct actions are employed in the creation of the ethical subject?

*Reflexive* What direct actions does the Participant apply to himself to begin or maintain the subject position.

I have adapted Faubion’s model but not perfectly, as WCM is not itself an ethical subject but more of an exhorter of ethical pedagogy. My project in the following section is twofold. I will elucidate my own process of Subjectification as a christian into the “World Christian” worldview while also discussing the modes and models the WCM employs to evangelize non Christians. This is a much more flexible approach to understanding not just the implementation of ethical subjectivities but their deployment as well. This modular framework inherently supports this meta-analysis because each category can be extrapolated to discuss not just the individual
who is moved toward a new ethical subjectivity but also the apparatus producing a particular ethical paradigm. This also makes it possible to effectively mix and match the ethical pedagogy a particular organization to the ethical concerns of its target population. I posit that WCM attempts to create in Christians-typically American Christians- a expanded view of their responsibility to God and the world, while in this particular instance in Haitians, a specific ethical subjectivity that sees Christ as their only salvation with varying degrees of success. I use this schema to reveal and translate the specific aims and tools of the World Christian ethical pedagogy and how some of my participants navigate and employ this to make sense of their new reality. The examples I use in this section are mostly success stories, but I do not want to give the impression that the World Christian Social Mandate enterprise is or has been universally successful. The next chapter entails this pedagogy’s abysmal failure in other milieus. What I want to bring to the fore here is the production and consumption of this Governmentalistic paradigm.

**Mode of Subjectivation:** The process of subjectivation into the World Christian Movement is one of achievement and aspiration. No one can bestow upon you the moniker of World Christian, and no one taps you on your shoulder, hands you a flyer and says come to this World Christian meeting. There is a level of entrenchment into Christian ethos that seemed a prerequisite to taking the course. The sets of knowledge, such as, where the class is being held, more information about the organization etc can only be attained within proper avenues.

My husband was asked to speak at a mega church in Kansas City and as a “thank you” they paid for two Perspective courses (around 500 dollars per person).
My husband and I, both pretty active in the black church at least had never heard of
the class, or a World Christian. So already we see the process of selection and
recruitment carries with it standards of information access and financial flexibility
that may preclude a large number of Christians’ involvement. One of the main
tenets of the World Christian view is missional giving or going. If one is unable to
participate in these ways, it significantly impairs their ability to strive toward this
particular ethical subjectivity. I argue that ascribing to the World Christian position
is a process of achievement for two reasons: First, there is a significant financial
exchange if one counts the cost of the class, plus books (about 90 dollars per person)
the loss of three hours every week, the cost of gas, and perhaps babysitting, the
expected donations to missions around the world, and the eventual cost of picking
up and moving to say, Guatemala for six months. The World Christian worldview
seems to have as its target a certain type of American Christian: financially stable
overwhelmingly white and with an enormous amount of requisite self-efficacy.
Christians enroll in a six month-long class where they are confronted with the
hierarchy of Christian responsibility; tested and quizzed over Christian knowledge;
taught how to pray; and taught which “unreached people groups” are most
vulnerable. Just to be clear I should note that, World Christians know the bible
before they are World Christians. The WCM simply teaches its missionaries how to
“read” the Bible and its mandates properly. Faubion argues that the ethical
pedagogue is essential to the ethical domain. The teachers and presenters from the
perspectives class created a space to communicate about the “true gospel.” Faubion
reiterates the importance of this kind of instruction:
The ethical scene of instruction is a scene of talk, of communication and hence of a language not *per impossibile* as a “private” but instead once again as an intersubjective and social phenomenon. As such, its terms require being provisioned with or attached to criteria of its proper and improper use” (68).

Once the participant has been trained in proper World Christian Pedagogy, the process of *selection and recruitment* when they are in the field (in this case Haiti) is ostensibly in the eye of the missionary. Followers who actively seek missionaries help, followers who seem “at peace” during service, receive special notice and are often picked out to lead jobs or work as translators or community liaisons. I should say here that according to most evangelical denominations it is naught but a three part prayer that acknowledges oneself as a sinner and acknowledges that both Jesus is God in the flesh and that Jesus’ sacrifice on the cross was the ransom for man’s sins that ensures ones’ salvation. 13 So the selection of *who is saved* is out of the hands of the Evangelical project. However, who gains access to the spoils associated with foreign power is entirely subjective and wholly dependent on one’s display of earnestness, devotion and trustworthiness. These traits are often determined by close proximity and appropriate care with the missionaries’ children or children in general, 14 one’s level of sincerity during church service (eyes closed, arms wide, preferably a single tear sliding down a weather-

---

13 One must of course believe with all ones’ heart that this is so.
14 This has gender implications as well and could lend some explanation to the high ratio of Haiti women to men in positions of missionary leadership. More could be said about this connection between Care and Christian worthiness.
beaten brown face) and one’s handling of finances. (But one generally doesn’t get around to this part if you have not appropriately passed levels one and two). Jamie Zumwolt missionary, artist, writer and Perspectives speaker comments on knowing who is sincere:

You can tell the ones where the Holy Spirit is moving in them. At these alter calls there are people who are looking around to see who else is coming up and then there are those who just have this face of peace, you know, palms up eyes closed. They feel the spirit. God moves in each person differently. Some are moved by the music and another will come and offer to fix something around the building. Don’t believe what you see on TV about chaos in Haiti. We’ve had more people offer to help us for free! For nothing! This is God moving. People want to rebuild- they want their country back on track (Zumwalt).

It is interesting to note here that many missionaries tie this notion of Christian earnestness to a desire to see their nation changed. Whether it was expressly stated or not, many missionaries see the conversion to Christianity as a rebuke of Haiti’s past and a desire for a new future.

The mode of **ethical valuation**

For the would-be World Christian the mode of ethical valuation lies in a popular notion of the *heart*. The intensity and extent of one’s affective designs on a particular country or project will often determine one’s qualification to go. Many Evangelicals explain their commitments in this very specific language: "I have a
heart for this or that." "Having a heart" has been used to evoke a passion that goes beyond mere preference: it suggests an unplanned moment of revelation about an issue that leads the believer to an understanding of God’s purpose for her. Having a "heart for" something is usually God-given and but the logic is that this particular person has been given a life history, a set of emotional tools, a mental capacity to respond to God’s call.

The World Christian Movement has constituted the enabling cultural logic that makes the world available, in specific ways, to the "hearts" of US evangelicals. This notion of having a heart is at once a stance toward others and an expectation for the self, and this model of thinking about affect and commitments directly link the would-be World Christian to his or her country and particular type of mission. The World Christian, once he has decided where his heart lies, becomes part of an "intimate public." Lauren Berlant (2008) has argued that certain kinds of publics are constituted by their promises of intimacy: the linking of self, society, and sentiment. Berlant argues that an "intimate public" is lived by people who never know each other personally, but who believe themselves represented by and through cultural products that circulate among them. "What makes a public intimate," Berlant argues, "is an expectation that the consumers of its particular stuff already share a worldview and emotional knowledge that they have derived from a broadly common experience" (viii).

The mode of Ethical Valuation once the missionary is indoctrinated is a simple enough equation: human misery large enough non-Christian element =
Unreached people (evangelical terminology for those not exposed to the gospel).

The mode of ethical valuation is both a large and broad project—on the micro scale Christians striking up a conversation with that one perennially sad co-worker to the macro scale of large groups of people going to hitherto unknown places on the globe and transcribing the bible in an obscure language. As evinced mostly in the next chapter, aside from the general “all are sinners and have fallen short of the glory” rhetoric, Christians don’t see other Christians and Christianized nations as a major evangelization priority. WCM has quite specific measures for ethical valuation outside of Christianized nations. One of them being, operating in what is referred to as the 10/40 Window. This is a term used to define those regions of the eastern hemisphere located between 10 and 40 degrees north of the equator, a general area is purported to have the highest level of socioeconomic challenges and least access to the Christian message and Christian resources on the planet. (Winter, 2009)

![Figure 14 the 10/40 Window Source: Joshua Project.org](image-url)
The Window forms a band encompassing Saharan and Northern Africa, as well as almost all of Asia (West Asia, Central Asia, South Asia, East Asia and much of Southeast Asia). Roughly two-thirds of the world population lives in the 10/40 Window.

The WCM also uses sophisticated metrics like the Joshua Project, a research initiative seeking to highlight the “ethnic people groups” of the world with the fewest followers of Christ. They have fairly accurate, regularly updated “ethnic people group” information that many missionaries all over the world depend on for critical cultural understanding. They offer up statistics and facts concerning:

Who are the ethnic people groups of the world?
Which people groups still need an initial church-planting movement in their midst?
What ministry resources are available to help outreach among the least-reached?

*See Appendix.*

The **Mode of justification** for both a World Christian and that World Christian's implementation of his pedagogy strikes me as within everyone's interpretation of the great commission. The Joshua project is quite clear about their justification in their 2011 status of World Evangelization report:

Why are we to complete the task?

*Not because it is our duty,*

*Though it is.*

*Not because it will bring eternal life to many,*

*Though it will.*

*Not because it will improve the living conditions of the poor,*
Though it will.

Not because it will improve stability in the world’s institutions,

Though it will.

Not because it will improve environmental stewardship,

Though it will.

Not because we will be rewarded,

Though we will.

We should disciple the nations because

Jesus is worthy to receive their honor, glory and praise. (Joshua Project.org 2012)

They go on to offer biblical confirmation of their missional action:

“After these things I looked, and behold, a great multitude, which no one could count, from every nation and tribe and people and tongue, standing before the throne and before the Lamb.” Rev. 7:9

“Worthy is the Lamb, who was slain, to receive power and wealth and wisdom and strength and honor and glory and praise!” Rev. 5:12

This brings us back to Second Mode of Subjectivation, which seeks to delineate the scope, priority and structure of this new ethical subjectivity. John Piper, prominent evangelical, is famous for saying that there are three types of World Christians: There are GOERS, there are Senders, and the DISOBEDIENT.” But any types of World Christians can have their subjectivity compromised by competing ethical positions. In a few examples from my class, there was the mother of three who would pack up and leave to Nepal but she had school-aged children. Any
potential threat to their safety or education made her uncomfortable. Her admission
that she would probably “do it after the kids left” implies that her new subjectivity
was superseded by her countervailing ethical position as a mother. Roberta, who
expressed disdain for the missionary movie EE Toaw was very excited about
missionary work and the prospect of being a World Christian, however not when the
enterprise crept into familiar racist tropes. The identity politics of American
blackness mitigated the extent to which she would fully engage this new subjectivity.

Then there’s Mark, who we will encounter in the next chapter. He is a college
student who “doesn’t buy” the need to evangelize in European countries. He argues
that no one would take that kind of mission seriously, because Europe is not
culturally different enough. He also yearns to do work as a World Christian but the
competing pull of the liberal arts “self-cultivation via exposure to difference”
framework has an effect on his desire to be a World Christian everywhere at all
times.

The scope structure and priority of ethical subjection in Haiti carries with it
much of the same concerns. Evangelical denominations have wildly different
approaches to divine law: As a result many Haitian converts have taken on the new
ethical subjectivity like a “whore late for church” That is, hastily shedding the
clothes of her night profession smudging away the deep red lipstick with the back of
her hand and hopping into the modest garb of a churchgoing woman--In the
sincere hope that this moderate pantsuit will obscure the events of a sordid night.
So this new subjectivity may for some be an earnest desire but there are
countervailing forces of nationalism, self-preservation and status changes that turn
this newfound Christian subjectivity into a tool of approximation- approximation of normalcy\textsuperscript{15} approximation of power and an approximation even of whiteness.

With regard to telos, for World Christians the missionary enterprise is singularly related to striving toward the will of God. Once it had been established by the many training classes and Perspectives Readers, that the hierarchy of Christian engagement has its pinnacle in missionary work, and it is near impossible to engage in missionary work without some disruption of your comfort and personal will, --the ethical work became the telos. One’s ability to craft, accrue and trade testimony becomes the currency of the World Christian. Though her work focuses on Muslim Women in Beirut, Lara Deeb’s (2006) Enchanted Modern speaks to the telos of the World Christian Subjectivity. Similar to Deeb’s a community of Muslims, World Christians consider themselves deeply pious but also modern, young and urbane, Deeb’s understanding of modernity is rooted in both material and spiritual progress. Thus the World Christian’s striving toward the perfect will of God creates in his strivings the evidence of a life lived for religious perfection. The Habitus of religious striving is the true gold, so that one may go on and be a testimony to someone else. The entire Perspectives class is about testimony and the ability to tell your story of religious work to Christian and non Christians all over the world.

Dutch Evangelical Corrie Ten Boom summed up the telos of the WCM: World Christians are tramps for the Lord who have left their hiding places to roam the Gap with the Savior. They are heaven’s expatriates, camping where the kingdom is best served. They are earth’s dispossessed, \textit{who’ve journeyed forth}

\textsuperscript{15} Read national stability
to give a dying world not only the Gospel but their own souls as well (Winter 2009: 465 emphasis mine)

In "traditional" Vodou terms, one’s ultimate goal or Telos was to be a “person of the society.” Bellegarde-Smith and Michele 2006: 120). In Most variants of Vodou there is no concept Heaven or Eden and one must live well now to ensure a blessed life. By contrast, the aim of moral action for evangelical Christians, of course, is salvation(heaven) and abundant life. Hence, unlike the Vodouisant telos, the Christian one promises more than the sum of the outcomes of the individual moral acts that go into reaching it. It decisively links the entire Christian moral system to their expectation of the eventual arrival of the millennium and more immediate financial and spiritual boons. The Rapture absolutely enthralls Evangelical particularly Pentecostal Christians. The rapture is a supernatural event, taking place at a date and time no one knows. The first Thessalonians verse mentions a trumpet and a shout, but those who are not “being called” will not hear these noises. For these, they will simply be going about their day, perhaps talking directly to a bible-believing Christian, and the believer will simply cease to be in the material world. The Rapture is often confused with Jesus’s Second Coming. In that supernatural event which takes place at the end of the Tribulation (7-year period of judgment on earth), He will physically arrive on earth at the end of the Tribulation to finish the transgression and put an end to sin Himself. The rumbling of the earthquake and unfurling of the ground beneath their feet had many Haitians believing that they were in fact witnessing the end of the world, that a moment of reckoning had come
and they were the wretched souls left behind. Though Vodou is a dynamic religion with many variants, for many practitioners I interviewed one’s blessings come through the community, and there is the idea that one is eternally linked to one’s community (Bellegarde-Smith and Michel 2006). Since Vodou has such a community orientation there are no "lonely hunters" in Vodou, as a person without a relationship of some kind with elders is part of no community and has no Vodou to practice. Something of the old world must persist in Haitian converts, as we will discuss below. How can these intractable links between the individual the community and nation as a whole turn to violence and social breakdown?

Substance. So what is the object of ethical disciplining? For World Christians, it is the mind. In the *Perspectives Reader* David Bryant’s famous 1974 essay spells out the mental orientation of a world Christian:

Some Christians are stunted by selfishness and petty pre-occupations or by a cautious obedience and love reserved for the closest and easiest to care about. How shall we distinguish the others whose growth in discipleship is unmistakable, with a vitality that comes only to those who help bring lost sinners from many nations home? What shall we call this distinct group of Christians who have taken a stand that says:

We want to accept personal responsibility for reaching some of earth’s unreached, especially from among the billions at the widest end of the Gap who can only be reached through major new efforts by God’s people. Among every people-group where there is no vital, evangelizing Christian
community there should be one, there must be one, there shall be one.

Together we want to help make this happen.

A World Christian isn't better than other Christians. But by God's grace, he has made a discovery so important that life can never be the same again. He has discovered the truth about the Gap, the fact that he is already in it, and the call of Christ to believe, think, plan, and act accordingly. By faith he has chosen to stand in the Gap as a result.

World Christians are day-to-day disciples for whom Christ's global cause has become the integrating, overriding priority for all that life is for them. Like disciples should, they actively investigate all that their Master's Great Commission means. Then they act on what they learn.

By taking three steps we become World Christians. First, World Christians catch a world vision. They see the cause the way God sees it. They see the full scope of the Gap. Next, World Christians keep that world vision. They put the cause at the heart of their life in Christ. They put their life at the heart of the Gap. Then World Christians obey their world vision. Together they develop a strategy that makes a lasting impact on the cause, particularly at the widest end of the Gap.

An enterprise which aims at the evangelization of the whole world in a generation, and contemplates the ultimate establishment of the Kingdom of Christ, requires that its leaders be Christian statesmen with far-seeing views, with comprehensive plans, with the power of initiative, and with victorious faith. (in Winter 2009 :456)
This was a watershed essay in 1979 and *Perspectives* still uses it as the foundation for understanding what a World Christian must do. A World Christian must think differently.

What is the body, process, thing, or idea that demands ethical realignment in Haiti? The answer follows from the distinction I have made above about traditional Haitian cosmology and the relationship between the individual and the society. I have referred above to the ethical system in which individual and *Sosyete/* the nation are inextricably linked. Since in the Evangelical view there are no situations in which the practice of Vodou is deemed legitimate, a primary goal of Christian self-formation must be its communal renunciation. And in making this its aim, Haitian evangelical Christian informants condemn as immoral the willful destruction of the community (read practicing Vodou) This conflict and conflation between the Christian and the Vodou view of ethical self-formation is an important ground of my participants experience of themselves and others as sinners and dangers to national stability.

To the newly converted I spoke with, salvation and freedom are tied to a close affinity with the political community. So by engaging in these particular practices of conversion they are acting upon both their body and the nation. This notion of ethical substance mediates the tension between this emphasis on freedom and the place of authority within, as part of, ethical action. Under this understanding susceptibility to authority is not necessarily antithetical to true ethical agency. This question of authority brings to the fore the reality that ethical orientations, however rationally universalizable they may be, are nevertheless historically acquired and
rooted in inherited traditions. To Haitian Christians I spoke with the tension between choice and authority negates the possibility of new converts making any “real” progress:

“When I became a Christian a whole world opened up to me.” I was speaking with a young Christian girl who works at a large microfinancing NGO. She has large eyes and a bright smile. She studied in the United States in X ray technician but could not find a job that complemented her degree. She continues:

Variola: So here I am. Helping women in rural villages gain some kind of financial independence. When I became a Christian I was less concerned with finding a job in a hospital but I still wanted to help people.

Me: Why didn’t that matter to you anymore?

V: As a Christian, the goal is the same but God gives people many ways and means to achieve this goal. I have access to more people and have the support of a successful company. It adds more weight to what I tell them.

Me: You feel like you are more successful spreading the gospel this way?

V: I wouldn’t know, I never spread it any other way. But this is working.

Me: When did you become a Christian?

V: Oh ages ago. Before the craze.

Me: This feels like a craze to you?

V: Like a swarm of bees. Everyone here already knew about Christ. Why all of a sudden is He the light and the way?

Me: Oh?
V: Yeah I don’t think people are making these choices on their own. It has become fashionable. [...] They think they are free and secure but when the clouds come their house will leak.

Me: What does that mean?

V: That there are holes in their faith, their understanding, you have to make a choice for Jesus in your right mind not out of fear, or it’s not a choice.

Variola calls into question the legitimacy of many Haitian converts because of the concept of freedom and choice expressed earlier. How can they make a choice when their lives are circumscribed by a.) fear of the violence against Vodou practitioners, b.) the social control of their neighbors and c.) the fear of being left behind when the Rapture (which is imminent) finally takes place? How can ethical choice happen in the face of all these social controls and authorities?

This is precisely the juncture of Christian intervention. This is the place where the nation and the body become object of askēsis. The pedagogy of this physical and mental training is housed in the concept of the stronghold. By using the biblical analogy of the stronghold, evangelical pastors create an ethical struggle in which you must choose your destiny. This battle is personal and existential but the stakes are public and reverberating. The mental stronghold holds the unsaved soul captive spiritually. They are without choices and Apostle Paul writes, “For we overthrow arrogant ‘reckonings,’ and every stronghold that towers high in defiance of the knowledge of God, and we carry off every thought as if into slavery--into
subjection to Christ” (2 Corinthians 10:5). This and another passage in the Bible justifies the strategic pedagogy of loosening strongholds and emancipating souls:

“It is for freedom that Christ has set us free. Stand firm, then, and do not let yourselves be burdened again by a yoke of slavery” (GAL 5:1)

The stronghold represents a personal ethical dilemma in which one must choose his destiny. For the WCM the direct action employed in the creation of the ethical subject involves for the most part “loosening strongholds and emancipating souls” In the Perspectives workbook, C. Peter Wagner describes the evangelical work of loosening strongholds as having three levels:

Ground Level: Person-to-person, praying for each other's personal needs.
Occult Level: deals with demonic forces released through activities related to Satanism, witchcraft, astrology and many other forms of structured occultism.
Strategic-Level or Cosmic-Level: To bind and bring down spiritual principalities and powers that rule over governments. (in Winters 2009; 467)

The strategic warfare designed to bring down principalities and powers involves corporate prayer gatherings. Nations have had such prayer gatherings to bring
down the spiritual powers over them.

They are led by Christian leaders from all over the world, affiliated with various organizations, such as Intervarsity Fellowship, Campus Crusade for Christ, YWAM, etc. During national gatherings, flags of the nations are carried in procession to invoke God’s power over the nations.

I started an interview talking to a newly married woman about her former use of Vodou, but as most interviews did, it came back around to Haiti as a nation:

“I admit there is guilt there.” Sula is a small quiet woman. She is nearing forty and recently married. She reveals that she had been afraid she would never be married. I was also recently married and we shared in a moment of feminine delight in the universal form of girlish squeals. Formal introductions now over, I set about our business. She has told me that she felt guilty for practicing Vodou when she was brought up as a Protestant.
"I used it for everything. I was so desperate to be married. I wanted children before it was too late. I was so desperate. But my situation was only worse. If you look around you see people are like this. They work with evil forces and are surprised when it makes evil. After the quake my [then boyfriend] and I went to a Christian meeting. It was so hot outside, but even the elderly withstood it so who was I to leave? [The pastor] came right up to me, but there were hundreds of people there he came right up to me and said ‘you are not living right’. Michel and I were so convicted we gave ourselves to Christ right then.” She paused, waiting; I believe a congratulations was in order. I praised her commitment and that seemed to move along the conversation.

“And two days later he proposed to me. I had everything I needed I just had to accept God into my life.

Her husband walked in then and made a joke about being neglected so I told him a bit more about my project and he agreed to be interviewed. He is a thin and affable man with a steady gaze and a sure grip. He feels much the same as his wife to his wife accept he insists on the notion of Haiti herself needing its people to stand in unison.

“We all need to come together. Haiti is done with corruption we are done with greed, we are done. When pastor Dan came up and said to me ‘you are not [living] right,’ I knew it was not just for me but the whole of Haiti. We were condemned. But God is creating a new Haiti we have to Rache manyok bay te a blanch (Uproot the manioc to clear the land). But it starts in
ourselves. We are the country.” His wife adds, “just like with us, once we recommitted ourselves, our lives fell in order. The country will do the same. God will order our steps.”

Sula and her husband felt trapped under a cycle of fear and constant desire. They were able to “free” themselves and create the life they wanted by recommitting themselves to Christ. They made the intellectual leap that if the nation followed suit, it would also be “free” from man-made strongholds.

In addition to the deployment of the notion of national and personal strongholds, there are many modalities of ethical training that the WCM subscribe to in order to create ideal converts. The World Christian Movement’s reflexive practices are both systematic and thorough. A missionary must constantly discipline self and even others to maintain personal and societal order. Transformative Development is a methodology of personal and national recruitment promulgated by the WCM. It emphasizes four basic approaches to alleviating poverty and leading people to Christianity, and does so by regulating the comportment of the missionary. In the Perspectives Workbook, strategies are compared by setting two methods against two basic foci of action.
**Strategy I:** Economic Growth. WCM economic strategies often involve microeconomic development. In the Perspectives class we learned that, “time after time it has been demonstrated that when determined people are provided with training and a small amount of capital, they can achieve economic success in their local context” (Voorheis in Winter 2009: 600). Missionaries must teach and encourage financial independence.

**Strategy II:** Political advocacy. This form is normally quite antagonistic to local government and social and economic policies. A missionary caught in the fight for human rights endears himself to local communities where he can become an important foreigner giving international purchase to a local struggle. This strategy calls for direct interface with government at local, national, and international levels.

**Strategy III:** Relief. Relief aims to address the emergency needs of a converted population. Voorhies writes “In such disastrous circumstances of war and famine, relief carried out unconditionally by Christians can be a powerful gospel witness” (601).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Help from without</th>
<th>Help from within</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Structure</td>
<td>Strategy I Economic Growth</td>
<td>Strategy II Political Advocacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Needs</td>
<td>Strategy III Relief</td>
<td>Strategy IV Transformational Development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Finally Strategy IV: Transformational development. This addresses the causes of poverty with on a spiritual level. Focusing on “values and vision,” WCM melds the values of Christianity onto community values and social and political relief. “Approach development in a way that seeks to communicate Christ through […] Deed-- serving as Christ would bringing healing and exemplifying righteousness and Sign-- working with God’s help so that Christ kingdom Life is demonstrated” (602)

For my Haitian informants particular the poor, the reflexive practices of Askēsis centered on community engagement. One participant claimed to corral her neighbors into a Bible study against their will. “I can tell some of them want to say no, but since the quake I have helped many and they are grateful. (Ruth)” Once you have converted it becomes your duty to ensure that people all around you hear about God. So an important aspect of reflexive ethical practice is prayer for others and for one’s self.

Figure 17 Haitian Christians Pray openly everywhere. Source: AP Getty

“I pray for my country everyday when I wake up, and when I go to sleep I pray for it.” (Variola). But what about the violence? Could some Christians have
incorporated it in to their reflexive practice to maintain hostile and volatile relations with Vodou Practitioners? I ask all of my participants about the violence surrounding the conversions and I get a broad spectrum of answers. Many participants condemned the attack saying that not loving your neighbor negates the entire mission of Christ. Still some others felt that intolerance for evil and righteous anger was what Jesus was all about. “He flipped over the gambling tables in the temple. He called out the Pharisees for what they were. Yes even our Jesus was angry” (Ann Marie).

In effect, the missionaries and those they worked with were preoccupied with the elements that made up the striving to be an ethical subject, with the interface between the technology of the self and the technology of domination, with subjectivity. In the long term, many of my participants may settle back into old familiar religious syncretism but if this is long lasting, what could it mean for the future of national development and the next generation of Haitian leaders?

*You can be up to your boobies in white satin, with gardenias in your hair and no sugar cane for miles, but you can still be working on a plantation.* ~Billie Holiday

**Part 3: More of the same: Race and Economic structure in the New Haiti**

The conflation of political action and religious action has sanctioned government intervention by Christian organizations and NGOs in Haiti. A
government customs worker “James” laments the Christian organization’s ability to change the taxation laws for incoming items into Haiti.

“How can they just say we will not pay customs? Our laws mean nothing to them. Let me ask you, can a Haitian come to America and say ‘change this law?’ Never! But an organization comes in here and says we shouldn’t have to pay, and the poorest country in the world agrees? This is craziness.”

“What if they are bringing in medical supplies?” I ask.

“They are bringing in their laptops and Ipods and comfort items! These people are not doctors. The custom charges will help more than their first aid kits” (James)

Christian organizations have also been allowed to discriminate in the Haitian job market, something that the Haitian government expressly forbids. In Religion and the Rise of Capitalism, economist Richard Tawney (1998) rightly points out that the issue is not which religious movement introduced a new paradigm, “but what elements of a religious movement successfully undermine traditional normative patterns and institutional authority so as to initiate change” (Ch.4, footnote 32). The elements of Pentecostalism and charismatic Protestantism that sufficiently undermine Haitian government authority abound. Large Christian organizations and NGOs have undermined the authority of the Haitian government and usurped the job market in the name of Jesus. In an August 25, 2010 letter to Harry Reid, Senate Majority Leader, World Vision President Richard Steans wrote:

We respectfully urge you to oppose any effort to amend the Religious Freedom Restoration Act (“RFRA”), to amend Title VII of the 1964 Civil
Rights Act, or otherwise to dilute the right of faith-based social service organizations to stay faith-based through their hiring, including when awarded a federal grant... We want to continue to serve the poor and victims of injustice [including] earthquake victims in Haiti... We intend to continue working effectively with government in a constitutionally sound and proven manner, but only if we can stay faith-based in mission, which means remaining faith-based in those we hire. (Worldvision.org)

A multilevel Christian organization which received 11.5 million dollars from the US government to assist in rubble clearing, rebuilding, and sanitation, is working closely with the Haitian government and is allowed to determine the level of one’s Christianity in order to obtain a job. In a country whose economy has essentially collapsed, the emergence of Christian job markets that are linked to government projects like infrastructure building and water distribution can easily engender conflation of Christianity, government, and power. This form of clientism has replaced traditional methods of civil interaction in Haiti.

The Haitian government has also enacted a myriad of new laws. In his speech at the United States Institute for Peace on February 12th 2011, Minister Magloire quoted the saying of the 19th-century Haitian King, Henri Christophe: “I am reborn from my ashes.” From the ashes, the Haitian population rose, and even though struck by grief, joined together in the spirit of brotherhood and sisterhood and began their journey to recovery. Minister Magloire also stated, “life goes on and justice cannot stop.” And it did not. The government became entrenched in recovering the “rule of law,” policy-jargon for some semblance or order. However
many missionaries and government officials tell you that the months following the quake did not see mobs and looters and general lawlessness. However, most of the new laws that have been implemented in Haiti post earthquake are significantly associated with establishing judicial and juridical control over vulnerable populations. The issue of “restaveks” for example, a centuries long practice of sending children to work for families in exchange for food and shelter and child labor have become paramount even as people starve in the streets and rot under tons of cinderblock. A recent documentary on PBS entitled Restaveks: Child Slaves of Haiti (2010) shed light on this Haitian practice, and now the government, in a quick realignment, has cracked down on the practice. Is Western outrage responsible for the crackdown on restaveks at the expense of what many Haitians would argue are more pressing matters? Either way one could say the Haitian government and subjection to the ever-changing outrage of (mostly) white American benefactors mirrors the predicament of its evangelized population.

Race to the top
At the same time there is a sense of bringing the gospel to Haiti that has with it the accompanying racial implications of progress and modernity via white agency. This section, concomitant with the entire work, is about foundational shifts and crashes; the missionary project detailed here is unique but not so different that it does not carry with it harbingers of the old White Savior model--things that, as
stated above, Haiti has seen since its inception.

![White Jesus at Prayer Meeting. Source: Author](image)

When I met Rachel, she was handing out silicone bracelets to children. She had three multicolored ones around her own wrist. She is arrestingly beautiful, the kind of face you would most likely see rendered in oil over a roaring fireplace, not covered in SPF 70 in the wake of a natural disaster. She is a member of Campus Crusade for Christ, the largest Evangelical organization in the United States. And yes, a subsidiary of WCM. They have an international presence in nearly 200 countries, and have an evangelical methodology often used by smaller evangelical groups and churches. Rachael is on a summer Hope for Haiti Mission trip, and among other things, she is charged with distributing bibles, bracelets and putting on youth-oriented dramas in an orphanage. She agreed to sit down with me and talk about her mission.
R: We’re winning people for the kingdom. And Christ is really working here.

We had such an amazing [prayer] meeting last night you could just feel the strongholds being lifted from this city.

Me: What do you mean by strongholds?

R: Well like the enemy wants to destroy this city- this country. It wants to keep Haiti in poverty wants to keep people hopeless so they can’t look to their true strength.

Me: Jesus?

R: Christianity. Really you can’t call what these people do here Christianity. They are getting by trying to appease wooden statues. We serve a Living God.

Me: Have you seen people praying to wooden statues?

R: No but we had a training before, where we were like briefed about the culture here.

[There is a pregnant pause and I change the subject.]

Me: So what are your responsibilities here?

R: I mostly work with little kids. We do Christian puppet shows and hand out shirts and shoes.

Me: How do the kids react to you?

R: Oh, they love me; I’m the bracelet lady. [she laughs heartily here] “No seriously, I’m really good with kids. They want to braid my hair and play. When they see me they run to me! They are so hungry for God’s word. Rachel is white- as is her entire team. Brown hands pull at her bracelets and she relents and takes one off and hands it to a smiling boy. As we speak, for brief
moments, we are united in our Americanness. She touches my belly and wants to pray over the baby. At the end of the interview she hands me t-shirts and bracelets. “Take as many as you want.”

Missionaries rarely come to the field empty-handed, and Campus Crusade for Christ is no different. The Campus Crusade model is one of spectacle. They put on shows, give away toys, jewelry, and clothes, all in a dazzling display of the abundance available to Christ's followers. They gain followers by creating consumer desire. Protestantism's spiritual ideals provide the ideological tool(s) through which adherents have understood and subsequently controlled the material world. Max Weber broached the theory in 1905 with *The Protestant Ethic and the Spirit of Capitalism*. Protestantism lacks the absolution of sins provided by the Roman Catholic Church. Accordingly, Protestants depend upon outward and visible signs of salvation: diligence, sobriety and financial success for example. Weber quoted Methodism's founder, John Wesley: "Religion must necessarily produce both industry and frugality, and these cannot but produce riches." (175) Campus Crusade for Christ is so effective in particular because of their message of God's abundance for those who choose to worship. One of the most effective pieces of gospel
literature is the Campus Crusade’s Four Spiritual Laws. It shows evangelicals step by step how to present the gospel in the most effective way. (See Appendix) Law one focuses on God’s love and God’s plan for you:

God’s Plan

Law 1 "I came that they might have life, and might have it abundantly" [that it might be full and meaningful] (John 10:10).

“Why is it that most people are not experiencing that abundant life” (4 Spiritual Laws)?

When a new Haitian convert is asked such a question, the answer almost always implicates Vodou or evil ways. How easy is it to look around, see toppled buildings, fragments of bone, bleached white from the sun, poking out of cement piles? How easy is it to say, “Not only am I not living abundantly but neither is anyone around me?” How easy is it to condemn the whole block, the entire city or even the country?

Law 4 highlights the necessity for individual salvation:

LAW 4 We must individually receive Jesus Christ as Savior and Lord; then we can know and experience God’s love and plan for our lives.

We Receive Christ Through Personal Invitation

"Behold, I stand at the door and knock; if any one hears my voice and opens the door, I will come in to him" (Revelation 3:20)

Just to agree intellectually that Jesus Christ is the Son of God and that He died on the cross for our sins is not enough. Nor is it enough to have an emotional
experience. We receive Jesus Christ by faith, as an act of the will (4 Spiritual Laws).

The focus on individual effort gives agency and choice to many who felt vulnerable to the whim of nature. John and Jean Comaroff (1992) argue that modern protestant conversion, of course, is itself an ideological construct framed in the bourgeois imagery of rational belief and the reflective self; of a moral economy of individual choice that echoes on a spiritual plane, the material economics of the free market (262).

The employment of individual choice in a world that seems black and white serves a purpose of indoctrination into capitalist modes of interacting with the world.

Blonde Jesus
Children are following Rachel in the street now, and she absent-mindedly doles out bracelets as if she has a thousand more where they came from (and she does). The children play with her russet waves and her bracelets for she herself is evidence of Christianity’s power. Her whiteness, her abundance, the quality of her clothes all serve as indicators of triumph over the spiritual and physical world. She is a commodity as well in this marketplace of religion in Haiti. History illuminates the cultural construction of Whiteness (e.g. the case of Irish and Italians once being denied the moniker of Whiteness) (Morrison 1992, Frankenberg 1993, Ignatiev 1995) Consequently White supremacy is based less on racial Whiteness (as evidenced by skin color) than it is on ideological Whiteness – the exclusive value
assigned that involves “a series of immunities, privileges, rights, and assumptions [...] This [value is] not inherent, natural, or biologically determined. Rather [it reflects] artificial beliefs created by social, economic, and political conditions” (Ross, 1995).

These mass conversions to largely white foreign evangelical missions in the face of broken government could actually be a tool of approximation, as Haitians seek to gain access to the privilege that has historically been afforded to those with lighter skin. Ideological whiteness is bulwarked by larger than life social systems like Capitalism and Christianity. It is a bit like an M.C. Escher painting, White Supremacy, in that it encompasses within it diaphanous folds both denial of its own existence and an overt justification of a social order that betrays its existence.

**CONCLUSION**

In this chapter, I attempted to elucidate the rhizomatic intersections of race, politics and ethics, in post-earthquake Haiti. When disaster strikes, it is the state that is identified as the appropriate agent to respond. When the state fails, non-secular NGOs and organizations like WCM employ a distinctive form of reasoning that rests on the liberal principle that it should act on behalf of the “values” of Christianity as a whole, which in their modified definition includes significant personal, political and economic pressure. This principle, in turn, presents an ethical challenge: how to make citizens behave in a way that is conducive to exhaustive degrees of nonsecular intervention? (some missionaries have outlawed the color red). I understand the problem in this situation for Haitian nationals as
involving competing values about the intervention of foreign power and the desire for solidarity, nationhood and, stability. Accordingly, WCM sees its task as the resolution of conflicts among these values through an appeal to a universal value—freedom. This approach places WCM activities within the domain of “ethics” in the term’s more contemporary usage i.e. the application of values or moral rules to specific situations. But it also presents an ethical response in the classical sense: it is a form of reflection and practice concerned with the question of how a particular kind of ethical subject, the Haitian Citizen, should live. Deploying narratives of abundance and race and armed spiritually with the biblical thesis of the stronghold, evangelical are able to mediate the conflicting ethical pulls and create manifold conversion experiences.

The missionaries and their converts spoke a great deal about the relation between political power or kinds of knowledge that we can call the technology of power and their other interest, which was in learning how to govern the self—conversion—or the technology of the self.

Faubion’s ethical tools makes great strides in negotiating that vexed problem of competing values in ethical reconditioning. It is the problem not of freedom but of authority, of how selves are maintained and advanced within the traditions to which they bear a sense of obligation (e.g. nation or state). I propose in this chapter that the religious conversions be understood as a mode of the care of the self—extended out to a preoccupation with care of the community, as a practice by which spiritual selves are maintained and cultivated as part of Haiti’s nationalist reimagining. It
becomes imperative to Haiti’s future as a nation that its citizens, particularly its black majority, align themselves to the right spiritual authorities. Evangelicals in Haiti embark on a kind of ethical cultivation both of Haiti, as a nation-- its narratives, its public image, its heritage and its unity as a collective.
The Bell Of the Ball: Haiti as the Ideal Type

Rarely did events play out as imagined, in any case. The order of future events was transient. In the same way that the past was reconfigured by selective memory, future events, too, were moving targets. One could only act on instinct, grab hold of an intuited perfect moment, and spring into action.

— James Luceno,

The neighborhood was poor but close to the city. All around town now, you saw four-story town homes sprouting up next to liquor stores and dilapidated homes. The streets themselves even seemed to resent the new residents - as they furled bunched and recoiled unforgiving at the curbs of these extravagant homes. There was a crack in one of the pristine windows. I could imagine a grade-schooler on his way home from school (no doubt carrying a note home about his poor behavior) picking up a rock and hurling it angrily at the bright and expensive building. But for all the child’s effort, the pitiful result was a tiny fissure in the double-sided insulated windows. Alas, his weapon of choice was not formidable enough to thwart the steady encroachment of “development.” Riding in some areas of Little Rock Arkansas looks exactly like a war-torn country. Poverty, displacement and abandonment on this scale just didn’t seem like it could exist in this country. After coming back from Haiti I thought, this place needs some evangelization. But
the churches are like statues here, cold monuments of what ought to be. Communities die under their care. No one is thriving here. This chapter is about many things but mostly it is about ordering, prioritizing and deciding. Who is the perfect object of evangelical ordering and who is not? By comparing Haiti's evangelistic efforts to the mostly failed evangelical effort after Indonesia's catastrophic tsunami, I hope to create a picture of how evangelical organizations decide who and where is worthy. In section two, I discuss the remaking of personal and national narratives after trauma, and in section three I talk about the gendering of convert responsibilities and of disaster itself.

9/11 Fleeting Fervor

The emotional pain and search for answers after Sept. 11 had many flocking to religious services. A surge of spirituality occurred as Americans examined perhaps the fragility of life. I can only suppose answers were hard to come by in the months that followed the attacks, and many sought solace in a “higher” power.

"After 9/11 we had 20-some odd thousand people show up," said Senior Pastor Ed Young in a USA Today article (2001). "The largest crowd in the history of Fellowship Church...and when I walked on stage I looked around and said, 'Where have you guys been? It takes something like this for you to show up to church'"(USA)?

Perhaps it was the stress that turned them to God, because studies showed that people who were not even present in New York were exhibiting high stress symptoms. In a 2001 *New England Journal Of Medicine* article, psychologists and
doctors in the Massachusetts Medical Society assessed the immediate mental health effects of the terrorist attacks on September 11, 2001. They found that 44 percent of the adults not directly connected to people or happenings at Ground Zero reported one or more substantial symptoms of stress; 90 percent had one or more symptoms to at least some degree. Respondents throughout the country reported stress symptoms. They coped by talking with others (98 percent), turning to religion (90 percent), participating in group activities (60 percent), and making donations (36 percent)(1507).

This was it. This was the moment to “seize” the country. People were psychologically and spiritually ready. But nothing happened. In fact later on in that interview with USA Today Ed Young commented: “I was disappointed somewhat that more didn’t stick because we dropped to 16 or 17 thousand the next weekend and then the weekend after that to about 14,500,” he said.

According to Barna Research, a polling firm that specializes in religious data, religious activity is back to just about what it was before the attacks. 42 percent of Americans polled said they attended services and 84 percent said they prayed before Sept. 11. And now, 43 percent said they attend services and 83 percent said they pray (Barna 2006). Nothing happened. In the past, the resurgence of the reviver spirit in times of crisis has renewed the church and helped it to serve its own generation. But revival on the scale of the Great Awakenings seen in the country in the past is no longer a part of the contemporary scene. Is the traditional evangelical project – that is to brown and black countries- truly the only game in town? Europe also is seen by most missionaries to be Godless and hopeless,
and yet missionaries leave to over-evangelized countries like Uganda and India while countries known to have “spiritual deficiencies” are left alone.

In the chart below, Americans listed, “unreached people” Hindus, Muslims, and Buddhists as their top evangelical priorities.

---

**Priorities for Evangelization in Your Country**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Religions</th>
<th>Top priority</th>
<th>Very important, lower priority</th>
<th>Somewhat imp</th>
<th>Not too imp</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Non-religious</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>19 6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Muslims</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>59</td>
<td>27 10 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hindus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>39</td>
<td>30 18 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buddhists</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>39</td>
<td>28 20 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jews</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>27</td>
<td>32 25 17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-evang Christians</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>26</td>
<td>23 25 26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catholics</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>20</td>
<td>28 30 23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Q6a-g. Based on total answering. Respondents who said a question was not applicable in their country or did not answer are excluded.

PEW RESEARCH CENTER’S FORUM ON RELIGION & PUBLIC LIFE

---

**Figure 20**

Erica Bornstein's discussion of both World Vision\(^{16}\) and Christian Care (Protestant NGOs in Zimbabwe) highlights the starting point for Christian development: "There are two categories of people: those who have been evangelized, and those who are

---

\(^{16}\) World Vision is a Subsidiary of World Christian Movement.
unevangelized or unreached (who have not had the gospel preached to them)"
(Bornstein 2005:46). These two categories converge with a binary division of the
world in developmentalist terms: evangelized/developed and
unevangelized/undeveloped (46). As such, Christian evangelization attempts to
alleviate two types of "poverty" assumed to characterize the underdeveloped:
material and spiritual poverty. Thus, while "relief is a major objective" of evangelical
groups like WCM, development is also understood to apply "to the whole person:
the full human, material and spiritual" (49). I put forth here that the reason the
American "moment" was largely ignored--the reason why secular Europe is not the
object of evangelical evaluation--is because of this quasi-connection between
physical poverty and perceived spiritual poverty. I do not mean the good type of
spiritual poverty where one is made aware of his or her inadequacy before God,17
but the other kind of spiritual poverty, that is, lacking knowledge of God and his
goodness. The saying the poor will always be with us need not apply in the
American case as poverty became more and more a symptom of an inadequate
spiritual life of and inadequate work ethic.

*Things you can tell just by looking*

Aside from this notion of poverty there is also the ingrained normativity of
whiteness that makes America and Europe not ideal objects of evangelical inquiry.
Against this center of whiteness and Americanness, in the past, cultured or ethnic
"others"—from Blacks to Irish to Jews—were differentiated and thus denied such

17 Mathew 5:3 “Blessed are the poor in spirit, for theirs is the kingdom of heaven.”
"Poor in spirit" here means to be humble. One’s humility should come from the realization that all
your gifts and blessings come from the grace of God
status and privileges, although the latter two groups eventually won the status and rights of "new white" ethnics. WASP dominance and normativity was accorded actual legal status. As Cheryl Harris (1998) asserts, in America "[the] law’s construction of whiteness defined and affirmed critical aspects of identity (who is white); of privilege (what benefits accrue to that status); and of property (what legal entitlements arise from that status)" (1725).

Accordingly, DuBois (1920) could validly assert three decades later: "The discovery of personal whiteness among the world’s peoples is a very modern thing—a nineteenth and twentieth century matter whiteness is the ownership of the earth forever and ever" (497-98) Much more recently Baldwin reminded us that "no one was white before he/she came to America. It took generations, and a vast amount of coercion. White men—from Norway, for example, where they were Norwegians—became white ... and we—who were not Black before we got here either, were defined as Black by the slave trade" (Baldwin and Kennan 1998: 119). Thus WASP whiteness and Americanness operated interchangeably in the history of this nation as locations of cultural—and specifically racial—dominance and normativity.

Lest anyone doubt the ongoing relevance of this history or its reverberations to this day in the cultural space of international religious politics in the Unites States, a participant, a classmate in my six month Perspectives class, sat to talk with me about how surprised he was that there were missions in the Czech Republic.
Mark: I mean, what do they need? It’s hard I guess to think of Europe as a place in need of evangelization

Me: Why?

Mark: Yeah right if you told someone you were on a mission trip to Europe they would think you’re out backpacking in the Alps and kissing French girls. I don’t think people would take it seriously.

Me: Do people only take missions to Africa seriously?

Mark: Maybe, I think it has to do with real cultural immersion. I don’t think I would be getting a real cultural anything in Europe. You can go on Netflix and watch a British TV show or a French movie. I don’t think there’s any need for cultural understanding.

Me: Well [I use his word here. He has been calling the country Czechoslovakia for the entirety of the interview. I am aware the country has since split into two countries and has been such since before my informant was born, but I see no way to correct him without sounding supercilious] Czechoslovakia is no France.

Mark: I know but it’s still Europe and that stuff is just a train ride away.

Mark’s assertion that people would think he was backpacking in the Alps and making out with French women gives away his conflation of whiteness and privilege. He also says that there would be no cultural immersion. What does he mean? He’s neither French nor Czech nor Slovakian, But an American teenager who has never seen the outside of Greater Arkansas. Mark’s suggestion that a trip to Europe would
be culturally bereft could come from an American if not purely aesthetic notion of whiteness that carries with it all of the privileges of the First World. Europe was not a fit destination because the specters of privilege and whiteness are constantly present—overwhelmingly so until it feels like your little hometown of Maumelle, Arkansas, and what then, is the point of that?

**How to lose Friends and Alienate People: WCM in Indonesia**

In 2004, one of the largest earthquakes in recorded history (measuring 9 on the Richter Scale), struck just off Sumatra, Indonesia, in a fault line running under the sea. The rupture caused massive waves, or tsunamis, that hurtled away from the epicenter, reaching shores as far away as Africa. Some 230,000 people were killed and the livelihoods of millions were destroyed in over ten countries (PBS 2004). This has been one of the biggest natural disasters in recent human history.

The humanitarian organizations that took part in the relief effort were legion. It was one of the largest humanitarian mobilizations in the world. These organizations are diverse,
operating on a variety of scales and within disparate organizational types and sociocultural frameworks. In the wake of the Asian tsunami, one such group was the World Christian Movement provided a distinctive form of relief aid, focusing on predominantly Muslim Indonesia.

In Indonesia, for obvious reasons, there was a failure of local and national government relief channels that necessitated international help. A central feature of the 2004 Asian tsunami disaster was the limited, confused, and ambiguous role played by the central and local governments in the relief process. The void left by the government’s weak coordination of the relief process was largely filled by the local international NGO’s, which assumed a major, influential role.

In Perspectives class, a missionary, Mr. Thomas who had spent six years in Indonesia, called it an “incredibly tough place to evangelize.” He wipes his wispy blond hair. He strikes me as happy to be home. I do not mean this in any negative way; he was simply wan-looking with rounded shoulders and a thin frame, but he spoke and acted with such gusto you were left to wonder if you were not trapped in a Cyrano de Bergerac moment where some robust man is backstage feeding the speaker his lines. He ate though the entire presentation, biting into apples loudly into his microphone. I had never seen anyone enjoy an apple so robustly.

“In Indonesia I just don’t know. The Christian rate of growth is about five percent there. Those are admirable numbers. But their hearts seem so

\[18\] is this sounding familiar yet
impenetrable." Another bite. "The Gospel is really needed there, but I want to stress the importance of cultural competency classes. Learn by my stripes, or trust me you will fail."

Why had missionaries found Indonesia so difficult? There are more than 25 million Christians in Indonesia. However, Christians are threatened and their churches are bombed. Throughout many parts of the country, thousands of Christians have been forced to undergo Muslim conversion rituals. Those who refuse to embrace Islam are often beheaded, and their heads are paraded through the village to strike fear into the hearts of other Christians (BBC 2010). Pastors have even gone so far as to say that Indonesian Missions are cursed. (See Appendix)

By law, Indonesians may choose to follow any of five religions, including Christianity. In practice, however, Muslims receive preferential treatment. Islamists have pushed through a number of measures in recent years that could have serious long-term implications for religious freedom and minority rights. Religious radicalism has found converts in Indonesia, leading to sectarian violence and terrorism. Recently, local governments have closed evangelical churches and imposed restrictions on church expansion. In addition, according to a UN Refugee Agency report in 2011, extremists have forcibly closed churches, sometimes with the tacit approval of local or provincial officials. Under a Joint Ministerial Decree issued in 1969 and revised in 2006, all religious groups in Indonesia must apply for permits to establish and operate places of worship (UNHCR). Part of this law
stipulates that a majority of neighbors in the area must sign a statement allowing the church to operate. In February 2011, a Christian was convicted of blasphemy against Islam. Thinking the sentence too lenient, a Muslim mob attacked three churches, destroying a church-run orphanage and medical center (UNHCR).

*What’s Good for the Goose...*  
WCM evangelicals assumed that government intervention would endear tsunami-torn Indonesians to the missionaries. The government in Indonesia first has less pretense to democracy and is fond of repressive measures to ensure social control. Haiti, operating in The US’s backyard, cannot afford such liberties with out the threat of being occupied by US and UN forces. Haitian government officials are much more likely to acquiesce to missionary demands than Indonesia. Indonesia also struggled with the failed state moniker. However, the country never descended to the depths of full state failure. The concept of the “failed state” had been applied to several countries, in particular in Africa and Haiti, in the 1990s where governments barely existed and civil conflict became ubiquitous (Failed State Index 2011). In his 2010 book *Political Reform in Indonesia After Soeharto*, Harold Crouch disagrees with the theory of state failure to describe Indonesia in transition. Crouch reveals BJ Habibie—President Soeharto’s successor—as an ‘accidental’ president who lacked a strong political base outside the discredited New Order regime and had been thrust unexpectedly into a position for which he was inadequately prepared.”
Nonetheless, the writer acknowledges what Habibie did. President Habibie was able to propose the release of political prisoners, he reformed the anti-subversion law, lifted restrictions on the press, developed new political parties within a multi-party system, held new general elections, carried out the drastic decentralization of regional government, and freed East Timor from Indonesia. All of these things kept Indonesia from complete failed state status. At around this same time (1994), Haiti was occupied by US forces.

So Indonesia’s government had experience corralling the government during times of severe crisis. After the tsunami the Indonesian government was able to rebound relatively quickly. Though it teetered on the brink, it was still able to maintain considerable amounts of control over its populace and government functions.

The Devil vs Allah

Any effective cross-cultural work requires deep respect for one’s hosts and their culture. This begins with their language and extends to all of their customs, worldview, values, everything about their way of life. Missionaries in Haiti saw Vodou as evil, as worshiping the Devil, and as such adapted a spiritualist, passionate, charismatic church model. The Devil is within the pantheon of Christian characters and is rebuked within nearly all denominations with ferocity and zeal. Missionaries see Islam as at worst violent and repressive and at best just wrongheaded. The belief in Allah is taken to be superficial, and Allah Himself is not always recognized as the Creator God, because Islam is naturally legalistic in its ethics. As a result
missionaries disavow Islam as a shallow and superficial belief system (Parshall in Winter 2009: 667). The diminishing of Islam by Christian missionaries has been their undoing in Indonesia.

Christian treatises on Muslim doctrine often emphasize how wrong it is. They talk about philosophical mistakes (e.g. not understanding the Trinity), theological mistakes (e.g. works instead of grace), and ethical errors (superficial versus inner obedience to God). The admixture of superstition and animism characteristic of village religions throughout the world (including the Christian parts) is taken as a peculiar result of Islam (e.g. Zwemer 1920, still a standard reference). Evangelization is done by giving reasons why “Isa” is not Jesus, why there are errors in the Koran, why Mohammed was a bad man (Parshall in Perspectives, 2009). But no one has ever become a Christian by being out-reasoned. Choosing to believe in what is unseen is the height of enlightenment irrationality. However, the tools of Christian persuasion have the look and smell of the Rational Actor Model.

Women + Men = Fail

As a progressive Christian movement, WCM believes in the equal treatment of women and their right to worship. Consequently in Indonesia, where Islamic mores rule social etiquette, women and men worshiping together sitting side by side in the same pew, struck many culturally Islamic would-be followers as inappropriate. It would be as if the department suddenly required that women sit on men’s laps during classes. The level to which Muslims were physical uncomfortable many progressive missionaries see as sexism and take it as an opportunity to “stand with women.” But when they get to the protest site they are
the only ones hoisting up the neon sign. This failure of cultural translation has held back missionary efforts in Indonesia.

*Follow the Money*

Furthermore, many societies have been attracted to Christianity precisely as a way to westernize. It was not that they were quick to abandon ethics for western wealth. Rather, their worldview held that wealth and power come from moral uprightness. Therefore, the wealth of westerners showed that their strange lifestyle must be morally right, and of course the wealth was desirable in itself. The WCO “Exodus lifestyle” described as evangelizing with nothing but the clothes on your back, significantly dialed down the western *accoutrements* of wealth. Other displays of western wealth, like distribution of movies, bracelets, clothes and literature, are grounds for fatal offenses in Indonesia. Thus the link between western wealth and western ethical positioning is weakened.

With respect to this financial discussion Haiti was also made more vulnerable to international influence after the earthquake by the sheer magnitude of monetary damage done to the gross domestic product. The chart below details the damage to the GDP done to Indonesia after the 2004 tsunami.

**Chart 3: Contributions to GDP growth**
Notwithstanding the terrible cost in human lives and damage to infrastructure and homes in the province of Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam (Aceh), the tsunami had only a small impact on Indonesia’s economic growth in 2005. This reflected the fact that Aceh accounts for only 2 per cent of Indonesia’s GDP, and that the reduced agricultural production in the region has been largely offset by reconstruction spending. According to a World Bank study, the direct impact of the tsunami lowered the national GDP growth rate by 0.1-0.4 percentage points in 2005. The bank concluded that, when the offsetting effects of reconstruction activities were taken into account, the net economic impact of the tsunami on nationwide growth in Indonesia was likely to be close to zero.

Compare this to Haiti, which incurred damages well above its ability to repair. In 2010 there was negative GDP growth.
Indonesia not only bounced back but was in a much better position to chart the course of their own recovery because of the minimal damage done to it GDP. Haiti’s situation was atrociously unsustainable.

Evangelization in tsunami-ravaged Indonesia, for a variety of reasons, has not gone according to plan. Missionaries are still there, but many express futility and hopelessness (Mr Thomas). What makes one country ripe for evangelization and another country struggle with missionary influence? Haiti and Indonesia are different countries with different historical trajectories, but the comparison stands. Even if a country is a victim of unspeakable crisis, a strong government, a strong anti-Christian foothold and a reasonable financial rebound can keep missionary overreach from realigning their entire government apparatus.

**Narrativizing the Disaster**

The Haitian earthquake was a devastating tragedy that destroyed the lives
and the livelihoods of thousands of people. In the aftermath of the disasters, survivors, the media, and government officials struggled to explain the suffering and loss that people experienced. In response to these circumstances, many people asked “Why did this happen?” and “Why did this happen to me and not other people?” This section utilizes survivors’ accounts of the disaster to examine how people explain their disaster experiences and more importantly how lives are reknitted together. Why do some of my interlocutors, but not others, see God as the causal force underlying their disaster-related experiences? Prior research suggests that demographic factors such as educational attainment and race/ethnicity play an important role. Specifically, people with lower levels of educational attainment and people who identify as racial/ethnic minorities (e.g., African-Americans) report higher levels of religiosity than people with higher levels of educational attainment and people who identify as European Americans, respectively (Levin, Taylor, & Chatters, 1994; Pew Forum on Religion and Public Life, 2009a).

Religious meaning-making, however, is not simply a product of demographic factors, such as education or race/ethnicity, or whether individuals identify as religious people. Instead, I argue that it is a dynamic, ongoing process of, among other things, reinscribing human action and agency back into the national narrative. The production of biographical narrative, life history, oral history, and testimony in the aftermath of ethnocidal, genocidal, violence occurs within specific structural conditions and cognitive constraints. As Hayden White (1975) argues, biography emerges as a narrative medium within state structures. "Hegel insists that the proper subject of such a record is the state," White writes: "When there is no rule of
law, there can be neither a subject nor the kind of event that lends itself to narrative representation." Neither "historicity" nor "narrativity" “are possible without some notion of the legal subject that can serve as the agent, agency, and the subject of historical narrative" (1975; 12-13). Confessional trauma narratives are themselves technologies of personal archiving that serve as personal “place holders” in the course of nationalist history. Do you know where you were when Kennedy was shot? Or for a younger generation when the first plane came hurdling into the Twin Towers? By retelling these stories participants renarrate the history of Haiti, placing themselves and their experience as uniquely Haitian ones. By examining modes of diffusion, circulation, and reception, I want to see how the universalization project of writing down and telling these survival narratives create perhaps a new creature. ¹⁹

I will start with Denise. She is a Haitian teacher with a full face and round eyes. Though she is 37, her face was such that I could easily imagine how she looked as a child.

I was sitting in my apartment when Oh My God the building started to rock. Everyone describes the earthquake so roughly, but my building swayed like it was blowing in the wind. I tried the door. It was jammed shut! I could not open it. Just in that moment I prayed to God, "Dear God don’t let me die like this.” And pop! the door came open. I ran for my life. Do you know that I was barely spared? My building crumbled after I got out. It crumbled. But my

¹⁹ 2nd Corinthians 5:7 Therefore if anyone is in Christ, he is a new creature; the old things passed away; behold, new things have come.
question now is this-- What must I now do? When you are saved there is this burden like you were saved for some reason. I must find out why God has chosen me.

Denise’s experiences mark her as chosen and she feels a sense of responsibility to at least the people in her building who were not lucky enough to escape. She is no longer a teacher but works full time for missionaries as their children’s tutor. She attends the missionary’s church because it “brings me closer to my purpose.” She never voiced what her purpose was, but I think it was a powerful notion to suddenly have one at all.

Explaining one’s life experiences as an act of God as opposed to the random chaotic whim of the universe can be useful for transforming a seemingly random or
uncontrollable life experience (e.g., a natural disaster) into something that has meaning and purpose, which vicariously gives the witnesses meaning and purpose. I asked most of my interview participants what they were doing when the earthquake started because I wanted to capture a specific memory--that moment when something their life is over or has just begun. In asking these questions, I was also iterating and reiterating their traumatic memories. The relationship between trauma, violence and memory has been given wide attention in the social sciences, partly reflecting an ongoing public concern with the disturbing "presence of the past," and the question of how to properly deal with it (Huyessn 2003). In The Empire of Trauma, Didier Fassin and Richard Rechtman examine the history of trauma and explore the transition of the victim from a marginalized to a respected role, and trauma itself, once considered a personal defect, to a moral category. Fassin and Rechtman argue that while trauma allows victims to gain society's support, it has also become a politically charged, moralizing force that decides who qualifies as a victim. Moreover, personal experience and individual history are erased and replaced by the universalizing force of trauma. I myself am implicated in the minimalization of their personal lives, instead interweaving a larger story about nationalism.

In Haiti there were essentially two schools of thought about the earthquake. The first has had to do with the idea of God's divine retribution for the sins of Vodouisants and Haitians more broadly. The second has been that the quake was a singular natural disaster; tectonic shifts not God, were responsible for it. These two
conflicting ideas reveal a lot about Haitian society. For one, they reveal the uneasy tension that exists in the political life in Haiti between the elite upper class and the poor. The combination of the two sentiments also reveals a great deal about how the country has responded to the disaster and the underlying poverty that made the consequences of the disaster so terrible.

Pierre is an upper class pastor from the capital city. He has spent a large part of his life in New York so his English is crisp and quick. He is a religious man but sees the hysteria to convert as a fool’s errand.

These people don’t understand science. I survived the earthquake in prayer. I built my house to withstand this kind of thing. Do you see me, there was NO FEAR. Do you know that the difference in creating an earthquake sustainable home is one extra rebar in the building process? One scrap of metal! All of this you see will be over in a few weeks let me tell you. It’s all fake. They are only letting their fear and materialism guide them. They think that just being in the room with a white person will get them water. And these missionaries here are just lapping it up. We should be talking about how to handle the next disaster but instead we’re clamoring for bracelets and trinkets. None of these missionaries would dare tell these people the truth that while we can pray and reflect on our life and changes we need to make after a disaster, the disaster itself was a natural occurrence.
The division between those who believe the quake was an act of God and those who think it was a natural occurrence can be divided, though not as neatly as one would think, between the poor and the elite ruling class respectively. Ted Steinberg, author of *Acts of God* (2000), notes that after the major earthquake in Charleston in 1886, the blacks in the city saw the earthquake as God's judgment and responded with incredible panic, while the white ruling elite insisted upon viewing the earthquake as a “natural disaster” (10-13). In doing so, Steinberg argues, they “may have implicitly suggested the reverse [of a morality tale], that something was right, that the prevailing system of social and economic relations was functioning just fine...ultimately, a view of the seismic shock as only a natural disaster amounted to little more than a thinly veiled attempt to return the poor back to the city’s economic treadmill” (19). Steinberg essentially argues that throughout the course of
the twentieth century, interpreting natural disasters as beyond the control of humans, but not as deliberate acts of God, has allowed developers and government officials to radically change the landscape of the country. People have filled in and built on marshes, destroyed barrier islands, and built in earthquake zones and on floodplains, without any degree of culpability for the increasing deaths and damage that has resulted from storms, floods, and other “natural” disasters. Seeing hurricanes and the like as acts of God implies divine displeasure at something that humans have done, but a simple “natural” disaster allows us to go about the business of maintaining the prevailing social and economic order.

John-Paul is a young man, only nineteen. He has his own truck, which is rare for a young man his age. Turns out, he gets paid to run errands for the church, and they gave him an inexpensive jeep.

I was praying the whole time. I was even praying to Allah, I mean at this point they could all be right. All we know is that we’re wrong. I started going to this church because they made a collection for my mother’s house. It was nothing to them from their pocket change my mother could build another house. It was so amazing to me. [...] Yes I still practice [Vodou] a little, everybody does, if not everybody lies.”
John-Paul was hedging his bets, ensuring that whatever the outcome he would be taken care of. That was the experience of many Haitians that I spoke to. They made moves to ensure their economic and social well-being. Evangelical groups not only provided the congregants with spiritual and emotional relief, but also assisted them in a material sense. Because donations were frequently distributed at the religious services—such as school supplies, toys and clothes donated by the many evangelical missionary groups that visited Haiti—attendance could be interpreted as an attempt to improve the material—as well as the spiritual—well-being of their
families. "The hungry man has no ears." says an African proverb (Shorter 1994). In other words, “[o]ne cannot expect someone who is starving, or numbed by pain, for example, to be convinced by verbal argument” (7). Material needs have to be tended to first before the evangelical message can be understood. Evangelical interest in helping the victims of wars and natural disasters, however, has sometimes led to a form of bribery, promising material advantages to those who embrace the Gospel. Such a strategy may even be justified in certain fundamentalist circles on the grounds that material prosperity is a reward of faith (Shorter 1994). Two of the best known sociologists of Protestantism in Latin America, Emilio Williams (1967) and Christian Lalive D’Epinay (1969), agree that interest in Evangelical Protestantism is frequently related to how uprooted the population is, a finding that seems to predict the success of “disaster Evangelism.” For example, colonizers of frontier areas and recent migrants to cities are known to be particularly receptive to evangelization efforts.

**Men are from Mars: Gender Differences in Conversion**

Traditionally, most disaster research and management efforts have rarely given priority to the role that gender relations play in shaping the interaction of human groups and their environment, and the differential constraints and opportunities that women and men face in disaster. There is evidence indicating that patterns of religious conversion are also gender-differentiated (Bowen 1996).

In Haiti, both men and women were to disassociate themselves altogether from Vodou and read the Bible daily. But for some men in Haiti, conversion and
commitment entailed a radical break with the social norms and traditional behavior associated with masculinity: drinking, violence, transience, gambling, avid interest in sports, and social life organized around bars—all practices considered unacceptable behavior by evangelical standards. Although women were expected to change as well, the typical transformation required of them was not as dramatic as that expected of men. Nor were transgressions of the female “vices” of gossip and vanity considered as serious as the predominantly male “sin” of fathering children with numerous women for instance. Given these differences, fewer men than women converted to evangelical Christianity. For Haitian men, conversion to evangelical Christianity meant a reworking of their ideas about proper male behavior, placing an emphasis on individualism, personal success and ascetic practices, that is, rejection of “worldly pleasures,” which raised the question of whether evangelical affiliation really was related to economic and social improvement.

The general consensus among most of my male participants was that conversion to evangelical Christianity might result in greater accumulation of wealth through less spending on “vices,” as well as to increased literacy because of the evangelical emphasis on Bible-reading. It is important to note that Haitian men did not generally associate “worldly pleasures” and “vices” with Vodou—even though evangelical pastors frequently did in their sermons. The ways women and men cope with overwhelming destruction and change are effected not just by the nature of the catastrophe, but also by the efforts of powerful religious and humanitarian institutions.
The narrative of destruction and ruin was constantly being understood in terms of rape and loss. What is more easily ruined, after all, than a virtuous woman's reputation? And what are the stakes if that virtue is indexed to the moral fiber of that nation? It has not been until the emergence of feminist analysis that the gendered nature of imagined political identities has been uncovered and deconstructed (Enloe, 1983; Yuval-Davis & Anthias; 1989 McClintock et al. 1997; McClintock 1995; Mayar, 1999; Blom et al., 2000; Enloe, 2000). But how precisely does gender play itself out within forms of nationalisms? Usually, a nationalism is gendered in that it draws on socially constructed ideas of masculinity and femininity to shape female and male participation in nation building. As Julieann Ulin (2010) has argued, the ruined woman is a familiar motif in narratives of imperial conquest and colonial domination, from Devorgilla in Ireland to Malintzin/La Malinche/ La Chingada in Mexico. The woman's body is deployed to represent the political and geographic integrity of the nation. And if it was indeed God who did the ruining, it is no wonder many new converts see Haiti as pregnant with possibility.

**Conclusion**

For a while, destruction was everywhere. In the wake of Hurricane Katrina and the subsequent collapse of the levees protecting New Orleans, the tsunami in Southeast Asia, the earthquake in Haiti, the floods in Pakistan, the Japanese tsunami and nuclear plant crisis, the tornadoes in the South and Midwest of the United States, and the flooding of the Mississippi river, it seemed that catastrophe was the only prerequisite for evangelical intervention. The events in Indonesia show that the
ideal landing spot for World Christian Movement’s teaching is the result of more complex matrices than simply “follow the misery.” As a feminist, I was also struck by how little gender analysis accompanied considerations of disaster and its ruins. How do enormous social and environmental changes alter gendered relationships, let alone the intersecting hierarchies of race, ethnicity, gender, class, and sexuality?

The reasons for conversion to evangelical Christianity in post-earthquake Haiti are not easily generalizable. They include economic reasons, being persuaded by the pastors, and rejection of vices. Some of the new conversions could be understood as survival tactics in a context of dislocation and catastrophic loss. For instance, the economic assistance provided by the evangelical groups in Haiti helped to reduce the immediate material vulnerability of the population. Evangelization, however, might have been contributing to increase the vulnerability of Haiti at a deeper, ideological level. Evangelical Christianity, as it is preached in most parts of Haiti, promotes the idea that one can change the course of history by changing belief—in contrast to a perspective that considers that material conditions shape consciousness—and therefore justifies the perpetuation of inequitable social systems. Evangelicals encourage their followers to concentrate on improving themselves rather than working for structural change. The Gospel, they preach, can liberate Haitians from the “chains of sin.” Advocates for social justice, however, might argue that the chains that restrain poor Haitians are not those of sin, but the chains of misery, discrimination and oppression.
Conclusion

When you sign up for a class with World Christian Movement in the title, you expect it to be about world domination even millennialism. But there is something about actively campaigning for the end of times that seems a bit vulgar to me. Surely one can desire the coming of the lord and reign with him on that glorious day of Rapture but after a horrendous flood or a cataclysmic earthquake one doesn’t scream to the bruised and battered masses “give me more!” And yet there I was in Santo Domingo at a huge revival the pastor Rodney Howard-Browne is a South African by way of Florida. He said God had come to “shake up this island. You thought you had a shaking but you should be praying for more! Pray until His Kingdom comes!” This riles the crowd and my neighbors commence to call on the Holy Spirit. This island is experiencing a great awakening. While I am from a country (and region for that matter) where religious awakenings abound, I still find this a wholly different animal. I am too entrenched to be bothered by the fact that the stage looks like a Kiss concert and I won’t feign concern or surprise at the dozens of people writhing on the cold floor or being struck down by the Power in “Fuego!”

All of these things escape my notice as particular or extraordinary. It is just how “Church” is done. But it unsettles me that this pastor, probably rich beyond any
of these worshippers wildest dreams, should take up an offering. Equally upsetting
is the fact that we have yet to crack open any biblical text. Though I am probably
breaking every good anthropologists rule in the book by judging this man, it became
clear to me in that illuminated stadium that this man was a wolf. This is what I
struggled with most in Haiti quieting my own moral code in the face of hucksters
and charlatans.

Conversion has always been a topic that arouses, if not inflames, our human
emotions. After all, the missionary is trying to persuade a person to change his
religious belief, which concerns the very meaning of his existence. And this is
usually at the expense of the person’s current belief, which in the case of Haiti
represent a strong familial political and cultural tradition. It is difficult to imagine a
more symbolically violent human encounter. Missionary activity always holds an
implicit psychological violence, however discreetly it is conducted. It is aimed at
turning the minds and hearts of people away from their native understandings to
one that is generally unsympathetic and hostile to it. Though I am Christian and
have admitted many times my distaste for missions, my Perspectives course took
great pains to be inclusive and “church revolutionary.” And I must admit my
surprise at their amazingly laid-back style of social and spiritual interactions. But I
still find the project of missions to be an inherently racist and ethnocentric endeavor.

What is being created in Haiti is a spiritual state in both senses of the term--
an apparatus of political regulation and a condition of being. The truth is the WCM
and it subsidiaries are huge transnational networks of secular, nongovernment
organizations, which can legitimately undermine national sovereignty. They carry
with them the cosmopolitanism of nearly unlimited economic capital and the political and social capital of whiteness. These are powerful forces alone even without “The Gospel.” There is so much more about this organization that requires delineation such as the World Christian Kaleidoscopic Global Action Plan of the Global Evangelization Movement. The Plan includes listing opposition to the world evangelization movement, making it difficult for them to continue; massive international economic reform; international environmental concerns; support of U.N. social agencies; and many other huge ideas. This project is just the beginning of what could be an entire body of work on this organization.

Aside from the world dominance of the WCM, I was struck by the actions, like religious conversion, that could be counted as nationalistic. During WWII there was much talk of what you can do for your country. All kinds of regular activities became embedded with patriotic meaning: A woman gets her first job; a small family plants a victory garden; a child turns in scrap metal. What turns a personal practice into a national one? Who determines whether an idea is undertaken for the thing itself or for grander means? Haiti’s religious

Figure 28 WWII poster Source: Truman Library Images
conversions do not spell the end of nationalism for the country. This Haitian crisis of consciousness can be compared to a victory garden or a ration coupon. My interlocutors are making personal ethical changes to save the nation speared on in part by fears that the events at Bwa Kayiman a crystallizing moment of black agency, have damned the country for the past 200 years. My research participants, in the black majority in particular, want to take charge of Haiti’s national reimagining perhaps reconsecrating Haiti with a similar moment of black agency. These conversions could represent the Haitian black majority’s constant attempts to reassert that revolutionary moment.

In this project I wanted to discuss the various policies and practices that transform the meaning of nationalism and belonging. My focus on ethical frameworks highlights the process whereby religious conversion could represent a psychic reknitting of jagged and torn pieces of the Haitian national tapestry. By tying an ethical discussion to a structural analysis of social change I am able to disclose the ways in which culture gives meaning to personal action and how culture itself is transformed by these overawing metanaratives of God and Country.

The Constant Gardner

Throughout the project I took away a variety of conceptions that can guide my future work. I treat religious conversions as a contingent scheme of meanings tied to power dynamics. While I don’t rigorously problematize natives’ claims about their own conversion, I still acknowledge that ethical “choices” can be embedded in
strategies of positioning and control. As a morality tale, the present metaphor of the earthquake has enormous force and utility for the evangelical community. It also works as a visual tableau of what evangelicals imagine to be the spiritual destruction and degradation already at hand in Haiti.

I take religious conversion to be both a condition of personal transcendence and a product of human effort, since it is rooted both in the natural world of experience and practice and in the transcendence of self. Understanding religious conversion as a materialist metaphysics (Alter, 2004) provides the basis for a more profound and encompassing critique of these practices. Using Faubion’s ethical schemata For example, I found that multiple ethical considerations create complex realities for the participants that are both personally transcendent and politically and socially expedient. That religious conversion influences people’s goals, strivings, and identity is a given, but can it transform the meaning and uses of secular structures?

**Methodological considerations**
As argued throughout this work, I believe that emic distinctions (i.e. structural parameters used by the population in question) are more insightful for determining who holds political power than etic or externally imposed distinctions (such as the concepts used in political science and sociology literature). The Haiti project impressed upon me how important it is to use triangulating research methods. Had I only conducted ethnography, I would have concluded that the Haitian elite have more political influence than those missionaries and NGO officials
who have settled in Haiti more recently. But analysis of new laws and media has shown that missionaries and foreign aid workers were having an enormous impact on the government and the structure of post-earthquake society. The historical analysis gives meaning to events that are striking many people as new or novel. The Haiti of today cannot be understood without knowledge of its complex and often tragic history. This knowledge takes away the sense of synchronism that can affect the analysis of research after a disaster.

**Significance and Directions for Future Research**

The results of my research suggest that a careful re-evaluation of the notion of failed statehood and non-secular nationalism is in order. Many of the worst conflicts in modern history have been based upon nationalism and on the ideological use of religious symbolism. This research could aid in a comparative exploration of explosive combinations of religion and politics in movements such as the Islamic Iranian revolution, the Islamic Palestinian movement, Jewish fundamentalism in Israel, Hindu nationalism in India, and Christian religious nationalism in Bosnia and the United States.

The research also examines political upheaval under conditions of religious and national liberalization. In much of the world, religious struggles were waged and public culture forged upon the notion that popular piety would diminish, if not cancel, the violent arbitrary functions of the state. While theocratic transitions in the late 20th and early 21st centuries have constituted new relations between states and citizens, both locally and globally, prerogative power has not so much been
destroyed as redeployed with new mechanisms of force and consent. Through contemporary political theory and ethnography, we can examine distinct forms of technologies of power and domination that religious nationalism engenders.

**Limitations**

There are several “scope conditions” as well as limitations of the research presented within this thesis which should be clearly identified. My measures of conversion were not indicative of all forms of conversion, nor even of all forms of religious change. I defined conversion loosely and most of my participants were chosen through self-selection. I employed no special technique to determine who the “truly converted” were. All participants were snowballed from very specific networks established through my own missionary connections.

I was challenged also in my reliance on a translator. I speak Spanish, English and some French, but no Creole. A translator can create a symbolic barrier of communication and compromises rapport on some level. However, I often felt that my choice of local translator created comfort and trust that I would not have been able to elicit alone and with so little advance communication.

And despite a powerful wave of popular participation in the past decades, the country's political structures remain largely unaccountable and impermeable to the demands of the majority of Haitians. I did not pay elaborate attention to the notion of social class here. This may prove to be a mistake. My measure of the power wielded by NGOs is, after all, a measure of authority within the social context, and
one would expect structured relationships of authority even within foreign organizations. I didn’t delve enough into issues of class in this instance, but I hope to have a chance to expand my research. The project suffered from weak or weakly contextualized measures of political influence. As discussed in Chapter IV, power is an extremely complex concept that applies to a wide range of social behaviors and outcomes; e.g., the racial, economic, and governmental power wielded by the WCM. It is entirely true that social class is often a better predictor of influence within restricted economic spheres. The deep division over what Haiti’s future should be has shaped the entire political history of the country. This same epic struggle manifests itself in the NGO republic as well. But what does it say about Haiti’s perennial class division? The NGOification of Haiti has led to a circumvention of some elite power structures in the country. In the past two centuries, this stalemate between the ruling class and the broader population has led to a devastating set of authoritarian political regimes. What will be the effects of a foreign often non-secular para-government on the ruling class's perceived authority to rule?

*Significance, or A Cautionary Tale: Uganda in Brief*

These are independent states in which US evangelical interest rules the political and social landscape of the country. Fundamentalist evangelical Christian congregations in the US have played a key role in radicalizing Anglican and Protestant communities in Africa, in particular Uganda and Rwanda. A three-day seminar held in Kampala in March 2009 by the US extremist Scott Lively called "Exposing the Truth behind Homosexuality and the Homosexual Agenda" was to have a great impact on politics in Uganda.
Attended by leading Ugandan politicians and religious leaders, the seminar laid the foundations for Uganda's controversial --now stalled--anti-gay legislation, which foresaw the widespread use of the death penalty for sexual minorities. It also led to a great public witchhunt against homosexuals in Uganda and the public acceptance of calls to kill gays and lesbians.

In 2003, when the openly gay priest Gene Robinson was elected Bishop of the Episcopal Diocese of New Hampshire, African Anglican churches were urged to start the protests against him. To have the anti-Robinson rebellion started in Africa was rather elegant legerdemain. The Archbishops in Uganda and Nigeria were given the opportunity to stand out as proud and autonomous, rejecting further funding from the Anglican central church. While US evangelical organizations in turn filled their coffers and as a result controlled their policy.

The US fundamentalist group at the heart of Uganda's anti-gay law is originally known as The Fellowship, an international organization founded in 1935, today it is known as “The Family”, an ultra secretive organization, under the reclusive leadership of Douglas Coe, is described by prominent evangelical Christians as one of the most, or the most, politically well-connected fundamentalist organizations in the United States. The intrepid conspiracy theorist would immediately jump to the significant overlap in WCM and “Fellowship leadership,” but I was informed quickly and abruptly that "that organization has nothing to do with us," followed by a terse “let’s move on.” I spent the better half of a month searching for anything more than similar names on a list, but my desire to move on superseded my investigative curiosity, because, in fact, they don’t have to be
connected to be working toward similar political and social goals. They become different than missionized countries and all of the *benign colonialism* that suggests. These Evangelization Nations become displaced and misplaced Battlegrounds, proxy combat zones in which “the other” sheds blood in the name of US culture wars.

**Nothing new under the sun**

I don’t want to give the impression that foreign control is a novel issue in Haiti. Over the course of the nineteenth century, foreign governments gained more and more control over the country’s economy and politics. Military officials of the United States considered Haiti strategically important, while American entrepreneurs were eager to build new plantations in Haiti as they had elsewhere in the region. In 1915, the marines landed in Haiti, ostensibly in order to reestablish political order after a bloody coup. They stayed for twenty years.

The U.S. occupation transformed Haiti in ways that are still playing out today. The U.S. occupation also deepened Haiti’s economic and political dependence on outside powers. During the second half of the twentieth century, the extent of foreign support has often been one of the most important factors determining the political destiny of Haitian rulers, frequently more important than popular support within the country. After the earthquake, Haitians noted with little surprise that Bill Clinton, in his role as co chair of the international commission overseeing Haitian reconstruction, often seemed to hold more power over the country than did Haiti’s elected president.
All these factors for some of my interlocutors have contributed to a powerful sense of political exhaustion surrounding Haiti’s future. A succession of military regimes has left the country with almost no functioning social infrastructure. Ever since popular president Jean-Bertrand Aristide was violently overthrown in 2004, Haiti has been policed largely by foreign troops under U.N. command. The erosion of the government power and subsequent belief in government as a political authority was slow-going, but I believe this surge in religious activity is a hallmark of decreased faith in Haiti’s national project which was itself socio-religious lore.

After the quake, it was not the government but the networks that crisscross the country—neighborhood organizations, religious groups— that tended the injured, set up camps, fed one another, sang and prayed and mourned together.

Against visions of Haiti that see it only as a place of disaster and failure, a country lacking democratic principles and civil society, the pages that precede this
conclusion also highlight Haiti’s legacy of political struggle in the country, and Haitians’ constant insistence on fashioning a way of life predicated on equality and autonomy. In expressing this view I want to avoid a prophetic or visionary rhetoric about the future of Haiti, but amid all of the chaos, I see hope and rebuilding.

Figure 30 Men Rebuilding an Earthquake Reinforced wall. Source: Author
Endnotes

1 1962 In separate incidents, rebels in the Congo kill missionaries Paul Carlson and Irene Ferrel as well as Maiming missionary doctor Helen Roseveare; Carlson is featured on December 4 TIME magazine cover

• 1966 - Red Guards destroy churches in China; Berlin Congress on Evangelism;

• 1967 - Missionaries expelled from Burma; God’s Smuggler published

• 1969 - OMF International begins "industrial evangelism" to Taiwan’s factory workers

• 1971 - Gustavo Gutierrez publishes A Theology of Liberation

• 1975 - Missionaries Armand Doll and Hugh Friberg imprisoned in Mozambique after communist takeover of government

• 1976 - Islamic World Congress calls for withdrawal of Christian missionaries

1. Nevertheless when the Son of man cometh, shall he find faith on the earth? (Luke 18:8b)

2. For many are called, but few are chosen. (Matt 22:14)

3. For ye see your calling, brethren, how that not in any wise men after the flesh, not many mighty, not many noble, are called: But God hath chosen the foolish things of the world to confound the wise; and God hath chosen the weak things of the world to confound the things which are mighty; And base things of the world, and things which are despised, hath God chosen, yea, and things which are not, to bring to nought things that are: That no flesh should glory in his presence. (1 Corinthians 1:26-29)

Beheaded girl In Indonesia. Her body was left on the side of the road on the way to a Christian School. (AsiaNews.it)

The Graeff family, including father David Ray, 41, mother Georgia Rae, 41, and children Benjamin David, 12, and Daniel Earl, 14, were evacuated on Sunday.
evening reportedly after locals had begun to question the family’s presence in the region. Locals then burned the family’s car after they were evacuated.

Palu Police Chief Adj. Sr. Comr. Deden Granada said that David Ray Graeff, who had been in Kabonena for two weeks, was a teacher at Uwera Theological School in Marawola, Sigi regency, Central Sulawesi.

A local resident, Habib Saleh Alaydrus, told The Jakarta Post on Monday that the day before he had received information from his pupils at Majelis Dzikir Nurul Khairaat boarding school and local residents that there were foreigners preaching Christianity in the area.

A Christian aid organization demanding conversions in exchange for food seems not only morally wrong but it’s bad theology, (see Luke 6:30) bad missiology, and impractical.

Faubion- “The widespread configuration of thought and practice, a transcendental physics or economics of the vital, in which religious violence has its most widespread and systematic rationale.” (9)

Haitian Musical Genre also spelled Compas
Bibliography


A, Denise. 2010. Interview by Nichole Carelock Tape Recording. April 4. Port-au-Prince, Haiti

A, Donald 2010. Interview by Nichole Carelock Tape Recording. April 10. Port-Au-Prince, Haiti


AFP. 2010. “Christians raid voodoo service in Haiti | The Australian.” February 26

AFP. 2010 “Voodoo leader strikes back at Evangelicals.” Brisbane Times


Aldershot, England: Ashgate.

Anon. 2004 “NOVA | Wave That Shook the World | PBS.”

Anon. 2009 “UN Special Rapporteur accused of Pro-Missionary Bias - Christian Aggression.”


Anon. 2011b “Samaritan’s Purse | Haiti | Help for Haiti | Haiti Revisited: A Surgeon’s Diary Day 4.”


AP. 2003. “Haiti makes voodoo official.” BBC, April 30


Asamoah-Gyadu, J. (2010). ‘The evil you have done can ruin the whole clan’: African cosmology, community, and Christianity in Achebe’s Things Fall Apart. Studies in World Christianity, 16, (4), 46-62


Barna Group “2006 Five Years Later: 9/11 Attacks Show No Lasting Influence on Americans’ Faith” Barna Report


Beidelman, Thomas Colonial Evangelism; A Socio-historical study of an East African Mission at the Grassroots. Indiana University Press. 1982


Bowman, Laura. 1938. The Voice of Haiti; Original Native Ceremonial Songs, Voodoo Chants, Drum Beats, Stories of Traditions, Etc., of the Haitian People. [New York: Clarence Williams music].


C Marcel. 2010. Interview by Nichole Carelock Tape Recording. February 20. Santo Domingo


Dam. A. Jack 1987 Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization, The Lausanne Story Charlotte, NC: Lausanne Committee for World Evangelization,


Doucet, I., (2011), ‘NGOs Have Failed Haiti’, in The Nation’ Available at:
http://www.npr.org/2011/01/13/132884795/the-nation-how-ngos-have-failed-haiti


-------------------


---------------------


---------------------


F "Eric". 2010, Interview by Nichole Carelock. Tape Recording. April 3rd Santo Domingo, Dominican Republic

Fischer, Michael 1991 *Anthropology as Cultural Critique: Inserts for the 1990s: Cultural Studies of Science,*


H Joshua. 2010 Interview by Nichole Carelock. Tape Recording. January 24 Santo Domingo, Dominican Republic


Haney, L. (1999) ‘“But We Are Still Mothers”: Gender, the State, and the


Holt Jamie 2011 Personal Communication with Nichole Payne Carelock March 19 Perspectives Class, Little Rock Arkansas


*Child Abuse & Neglect, 30*, 75-86.


Matsunaga, Motoki. *Keishin Sūso Ittai Ron*.


Rabinovich, Itamar. 1977. *Religion and Nationalism in the Middle East: The Case of Lebanon*. Tel Aviv: Shiloah Center for Middle Eastern and African Studies, Tel Aviv University.


Ramsay Kate. 2002 *Without One Ritual Note: Folklore Performance and the Haitian State, 1935-1946* _Radical History Review_ 84:7-42


Reed, B. G. (2006) Rationales and principles for trauma-informed evaluation and services research: An overview.


Stagave David Kenneth Scheve 2006 "Religion and Preferences for Social Insurance",
Quarterly Journal of Political Science, 1 (3) pp.255-286,


T. Lillian 2010, Interview by Nichole Carelock Tape Recording. June10 Port-au- Prince Haiti


Young, Philip Norton Frushard. 1920. India in Conflict. London: Central Board of Missions and Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge.


Endnotes

iv 1962 In separate incidents, rebels in the Congo kill missionaries Paul Carlson and Irene Ferrel as well as Maiming missionary doctor Helen Roseveare; Carlson is featured on December 4 TIME magazine cover

• 1966 - Red Guards destroy churches in China; Berlin Congress on Evangelism;

• 1967-1 Missionaries expelled from Burma; God’s Smuggler published

• 1969 - OMF International begins "industrial evangelism" to Taiwan’s factory workers

• 1971 - Gustavo Gutierrez publishes A Theology of Liberation

• 1975 - Missionaries Armand Doll and Hugh Friberg imprisoned in Mozambique after communist takeover of government

• 1976 - Islamic World Congress calls for withdrawal of Christian missionaries

v Just a small sampling: Fuller Theological Seminary, Billy Graham Evangelistic Association, Campus Crusade for Christ, Catholic Renewal Movement, Celebrate Jesus 2000, Concerts of Prayer, Evangelicals for Social Action, Gathering of the Nations, InterVarsity Christian Fellowship, Jesus Film Project, King’s Kids, Lausanne

vi 1. Nevertheless when the Son of man cometh, shall he find faith on the earth?

(Luke 18:8b)

2. For many are called, but few are chosen. (Matt 22:14)

3. For ye see your calling, brethren, how that not in any wise men after the flesh, not many mighty, not many noble, are called: But God hath chosen the foolish things of the world to confound the wise; and God hath chosen the weak things of the world to confound the things which are mighty; And base things of the world, and things which are despised, hath God chosen, yea, and things which are not, to bring to naught things that are: That no flesh should glory in his presence. (1 Corinthians 1:26-29)
Beheaded girl in Indonesia. Her body was left on the side of the road on the way to a Christian School. (AsiaNews.it)

The Graeff family, including father David Ray, 41, mother Georgia Rae, 41, and children Benjamin David, 12, and Daniel Earl, 14, were evacuated on Sunday evening reportedly after locals had begun to question the family’s presence in the region. Locals then burned the family’s car after they were evacuated.

Palu Police Chief Adj. Sr. Comr. Deden Granada said that David Ray Graeff, who had been in Kabonena for two weeks, was a teacher at Uwera Theological School in Marawola, Sigi regency, Central Sulawesi.

A local resident, Habib Saleh Alaydrus, told The Jakarta Post on Monday that the day before he had received information from his pupils at Majelis Dzikir Nurul Khairaat boarding school and local residents that there were foreigners preaching Christianity in the area.