INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. Each original is also photographed in one exposure and is included in reduced form at the back of the book.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6” x 9” black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

UMI
A Bell & Howell Information Company
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor MI 48106-1346 USA
313/761-4700 800/521-0600
“LASS UNS DAS LIED DES SCHILLER”: MUSICAL AND PHILOSOPHICAL UNITIES IN LUDWIG van BEETHOVEN'S NINTH SYMPHONY.

by

ROBERT STILES

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE MASTER OF MUSIC

APPROVED, THESIS COMMITTEE

Walter B. Bailey, Associate Professor
Shepherd School of Music

Marcia J. Citron, Professor
Shepherd School of Music

Richard A. Lavenda, Associate Professor
Shepherd School of Music

Houston, Texas

May 1996
ABSTRACT

“Lass uns das Lied des Schillers”: Musical and Philosophical Unities in Ludwig van Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony

by

Robert Stiles

The Ninth Symphony of Ludwig van Beethoven is unified by both musical and philosophical monothematic ideals. The “Ode to Joy” melody of the Finale is found in every movement, providing melodic, harmonic, and structural cohesiveness. Philosophical unity is provided in the text to the “Ode” and its reflection on Beethoven’s own inner struggles and his desire for the unity of humanity. These separate entities combine to create a work of oneness, both in musical content and meaning. A fresh look at the work provides an opportunity to examine the validity of older interpretations and compare them with new research and concepts. This comparison suggests new ideas about the work’s meaning.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The completion of this document has been possible only because of the efforts of many wonderful people who have guided, shaped, advised, and supported me throughout this process. Though words have a limited capacity to express my deepest gratitude, I will try.

First and foremost, I wish to acknowledge the unending support and friendship of Dr. Walter Bailey. Patience, kindness, and wonderful advice top the list of never-ending assistance he has given to me during the past two years. Thank you for allowing me to create and recreate.

The support of the faculty and staff of the Shepherd School of Music has been a large part of why I have been able to complete this project. I am indebted to the faculty of the Musicology and Theory Departments, as well as Professor of Double Bass Paul Ellison and Director of Orchestras Larry Rachleff, who have helped mold me into a student of learning and knowledge. I would especially like to thank Paul Ellison and his wife, Linda Gilbert, for all the wonderful advice, friendship, and support over the years—without your influence, my life would be shaped much differently. I should also note the contribution of Dr. Samuel Jones, who has offered wonderful musical advice over the years and enlightened me to the "words" of the recitatives.
I would also like to thank the faculty and staff of my undergraduate institution, Southern Methodist University, for starting my journey in higher education in the right direction. The nurturing help of Dr. Donna Mayer-Martin, Dr. Carol Bailey Hughes, Dr. Herbert Turrentine, Dr. Martin Sweidel, Dr. Kevin Hanlon, Dr. Norman Wick, and Dr. David Mancini were instrumental in the development of my scholarly life. But most importantly, without Tom Lederer, who let a kid from West Texas have a chance at a being a double bassist, none of what I have accomplished during my collegiate days would be possible. Thanks to everyone at SMU.

Perhaps the most important support in my life has come from my parents. There is really no way I can ever do enough to show my appreciation for what you have allowed me to do and for the unending support you have shown. Any child would be proud and lucky to call you mom and dad. This paper is dedicated to you and your love.

I have no idea where I would be where it not for the many wonderful people I have had the opportunity to call friends. I really believe in the support and bonding one finds in a relationship, and without my many friends, I would be lost. I would like to especially thank David Meek, Ruth Anne Shinn, Matt Underwood, and my other classmates from SMU for their cherished friendships. From the Rice crew, Chris Windham, Sandor Ostlund, Charles De Ramus, Brian Doyle, John Urness, Alice Miller, Krista Austin, along with many others, are just a few of the friends that have a special place
in my life. I would also like to thank Angela Marroy for her help with Tables 2 and 4, which appear at the end of this document. The support, advice, and love shown by these and other individuals have helped me through a difficult two years, as I have realized much about myself, others, and why we all do whatever it is we do.

I must also mention the people who started me along the road I have traveled from San Angelo to now. Included among these would be Jane Hays Smith, Gene Chartier Smith, the late Joe Kreklow, David Phillips, Donald Lummas, and the late David Fennell. Thanks for allowing me to participate in music at a young age and for your nurturing guidance and friendships.

Others who contributed to this project include: Larry Greer and Scott O'Neil, both of whom read this document and offered wonderful advice; the staff of the Rice Student Center; my sisters Kathy, Nancy, Linda, and their families; my cousin Carol Kellum and her husband Randy; Sting (who gave me musical and philosophical inspiration); my roommates Victor Sheen (who helped me devise the musical examples as they now appear) and Caryl Deitrich; and Mike Squires for his valued friendship.

Finally, the strength, peace, and comfort I find in God has helped me deal with disk crashes and other technological disasters, but most importantly, just being alive.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ABSTRACT</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGMENTS</td>
<td>iii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PREFACE</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTERS:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. THE IMPORTANCE OF THE NINTH SYMPHONY</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical Relevance and Critical Context</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Questions of the Finale</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Musical and Structural Ingenuity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. CONTEXT: BEETHOVEN'S LATER YEARS</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. THE GENESIS OF THE NINTH SYMPHONY</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. MUSICAL AND PHILOSOPHICAL UNITIES</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. STRUCTURAL AND THEMATIC ANALYSIS</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structural Analysis of All Movements</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thematic and Melodic Analysis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. CONCLUSIONS</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDICES</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOURCES UNAVAILABLE FOR RESEARCH</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Sources for the “Ode” Theme.</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Text of the Finale.</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The “Ode” Theme and Connections to the Entirety of the Ninth</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Symphony.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Thematic Connections Between Op. 106 and the Ninth Symphony.</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PREFACE

The uniqueness of Ludwig van Beethoven's Ninth Symphony is due to more than the inclusion of a chorus and solo singers in a symphonic format. Its singularity derives from more than the passionate recitatives first introduced by the double basses and cellos in the Finale and later elaborated upon and given textual "meaning" by the bass soloist. It also stems from more than what is commonly believed to be the "rage" of the first movement, the percussive "outbursts" of the second movement, or the tender "passion" of the third movement. Instead, the Ninth Symphony requires evaluation on a larger scale. Just as Beethoven did, one must consider the whole of the piece, its cohesiveness, and most of all, its all-encompassing melodic structure. A holistic approach presents a grand monothemetic plan, beyond melodic ideals, but inclusive of Beethoven's life, the work, and its aesthetic context.

For this new look, first, one must reexamine a large portion of scholarly research on the Ninth Symphony. Second, one must take into account a variety of analytical techniques and views. Lastly, one must grasp the musical and structural importance of the recitatives of the Finale, and by understanding their importance, the organization of the work becomes clear. The synthesis of the "Ode" theme of Beethoven and the "Ode" text of Friedrich Schiller creates an idea of oneness for the piece and Beethoven's life.
itself. The result is a remarkably unified work in which a single musical theme permeates all movements, providing the best possible context for Beethoven's overriding concern (and the subject of the Finale's text) -- the unity of humanity.
CHAPTER 1
THE IMPORTANCE OF THE NINTH SYMPHONY

Historical Relevance and Critical Context

Why, one must ask in the latter part of the twentieth century, are the works of Ludwig van Beethoven still essential to the musical world and still idealized by most societies? For what reason is Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony, in particular, so revered that the European Community has now claimed the “Ode” theme of the last movement as its anthem? Although it is impossible to trace all possible sources of the Ninth Symphony’s popularity, much of its appeal stems from the musical and extra-musical associations and assumptions first made by nineteenth-century writers yet still widely accepted today.

Initial reactions to Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony varied. The critic Franz Joseph Frohlich saw the work as the culmination of Beethoven’s life, both as a composer and as a human being. The Ninth Symphony was something new—a union of poetry and music—which separated it from its symphonic predecessors, the “Eroica” and the “Pastoral” symphonies, both of which also had conveyed extra-musical ideas. Frohlich’s main concern was Beethoven’s deafness, as Beethoven had only “realized the redeeming power
of joy" after a great spiritual struggle.\(^1\) Another critic, Ignaz von Seyfried, a close friend of Beethoven, offered comments concerning the technical aspects of the Symphony and suggested that perhaps Beethoven should write a new finale for the work. Seyfried, as did most commentators, spurned the finale, disturbed by the inclusion of voices, the unusual form of the movement, and the aesthetic issue concerning the weakening of boundaries between instrumental and vocal music.\(^2\)

Standard views of the Ninth Symphony emphasized tone-painting in the work, a result of combining instrumental music, which suggests visual and poetic images, and the text itself. Problems arose as differing interpretations combined abstract and programmatic views without discussing the inherent conflicts this dual interpretation presented. Commentators seemed to find no problem with the contrast between genres (most notably, the abstraction of instrumental music) and the textual clarity of choral music. This dichotomy is symbolized by the failure of critics to see any special significance in the "melting pot" of the instrumental music and text: the bass recitatives of the finale.\(^3\)

---


\(^2\) Wallace, 88-90.

\(^3\) Wallace, 73-93.
Most concerts during Beethoven’s lifetime featured a mixture of instrumental and vocal works, with the latter accounting for a higher percentage of the repertoire. As noted, critics of the day were not so quick as later and present-day writers to make a strong distinction between the genres.\(^4\) This view, however, would change, as delineation between content, both musical and poetic, form and its significance, and the “meaning” of each would soon be debated. This is when the inclusion of voices and text into a symphony became viewed as radical.

The reviews of most contemporary German critics had begun to include technical analysis of music, allowing for “all-encompassing” aspects of a piece to be presented, with this style eventually becoming standard nineteenth-century “textbook” analysis. Also, Johann Mattheson’s *Das Neu-Eröffnete Orchestre* (1713) which had universal appeal in the eighteenth century, was being challenged by modern “absolutists.” These contemporary writers saw instrumental music as the key to deeper and “more inaccessible thoughts than those in everyday life.” The problem was that these writers’ views were becoming highly individualized. Music was being freed from the limits of old affections and was exploring new territory which challenged the resources of both the listener and the critic.\(^5\) Writers emphasized the idea

\(^4\) Wallace, 90.

\(^5\) This process began around 1800.
that music, more than any other art, could achieve a psychological depth in musical emotion which demanded precise description.\(^6\)

The critics of the early Romantic era began placing emphasis on poetry and music as related arts, basing the comparisons along idealistic lines. Writers of the period believed that abstract and specific interpretations were not incompatible. One could compare the technical aspects of music discovered by analysis with the unprecedented range of what could be considered musical meaning and expression. This was the basis of the work by Frohlich and Seyfried, among others. Due to these ideals, writers did not acknowledge the significance of the vocal music in the Ninth Symphony and its flexible, emotionally interpretive range, especially as compared to the preceding three movements of the Symphony.\(^7\)

The Questions of the Finale

What happens in the last movement has perplexed commentators from the 1830’s to the present. By the end of the nineteenth century, critics and scholars, influenced by the work of Gustav Nottebohm, assumed that

---


\(^7\) Wallace, 73-90.
the last movement had been added by Beethoven late in the compositional process. This assumption denies any larger connection between the Finale and the preceding movements. Nottebohm’s claims were based on the notion that the bass and cello recitatives serve to reintroduce unsatisfactory material from the past three movements in which the real “meaning” of the work had yet to be found. These writers believed that the recitatives served as a bridging device between unrelated materials and that their use allowed Beethoven to create a formal sense of unity out of material which, on the surface level, had been related only by the slightest means.

These beliefs continued to be accepted until the late nineteenth century, when scholars began reexamining the Ninth Symphony on its own merit as a work of art, not based on the comments or research of past scholars or writers. Wagner and his pupil Alexander Serov believed the idea of thematic unity is exemplified by the “Joy” theme appearing in specific instances in the earlier movements. Rudolph Retti followed in the early twentieth century with the idea that “in a wider sense . . . one thematic idea

---


10 Cook, 81.
permeates the whole work." Though Rêti's theoretical ideas have been criticized, his approach is a vindication of the coherence of the Ninth Symphony. He wrote,

"Even Beethoven's Ninth Symphony, that pinnacle of structural consistency and perfection, was not safe from the absurd insinuation that its architecture is not truly organic. Such imitations are pure nonsense."\(^{11}\)

Rêti's arguments were a response to Wagner's comments about the inclusion of voices and dramatic content, and Rêti tried to reclaim the piece for "absolute music." Ironically, this term, coined by Wagner, was a target for his opponents, especially Heinrich Schenker, whose monograph on the Ninth Symphony attempts to show how the entire piece, including the Finale, can be explained in musical, not poetic terms, thus assaulting the basis of the Wagnerian aesthetic. The ultimate aim of Schenker was to explain the work in exclusively musical terms, leaving no room for extra-musical interpretations. In essence, he was trying to "demonstrate the unity of the work and the necessity of its constituent moments, and to display it as exemplification of a theory."\(^{12}\) Wagner and his peers had published numerous literary interpretations and created as Claude Debussy saw it, a

\(^{11}\) Cook, 82.

"fog of verbiage."\textsuperscript{13} Schenker’s explanation opposed that of Wagner, who believed that the inclusion of voices spelled the end of the symphony. Schenker stated that since the vocal theme was presented first in the orchestra, the two performing forces (voices and instruments) were equal.\textsuperscript{14} It is also possible to see the inclusion of voices as a Classically-moded concerto effect, where after introductory and thematic material has been stated, the soloist enters with the same material. In this case, the thematic material takes three movements and a set of recitatives to uncover.

Opinions about the recitatives vary according to the time in which they were voiced. The listeners of 1825 had heard recitative in instrumental music, mostly in the music of C.P.E. Bach, whose fantasies for clavichord often contained passages of instrumental recitative. Thus, the idea was not a novelty to critics or audiences, though it was new in a symphonic context.

The argument for what does or does not “happen” at the beginning of the last movement may also be a problem of semantics. By calling the music played by the cellos and double basses recitatives, one is making a connection to opera. It is perhaps more feasible that a connection to oratorio might be


\textsuperscript{14} Cook, 82-87.
made in examining the form and structure of the movement.\textsuperscript{15} Beethoven uses material from earlier movements to effect the transfer of instrumental to vocal, from the profane to the sacred. It could be argued that the text of the "Ode" is the equivalent of a prayer.

Paul Bekker has stated that the importance of a Beethoven symphony is found in the way that "it organizes humanity of the turn of the century as an artistic form."\textsuperscript{16} What was important was the inner humanity of the individual. Contemporaries believed that "politics must be based on morals and morals on politics," a governing principle of the idealism of which Carl Dahlhaus believes Beethoven's symphonies are musically expressive.\textsuperscript{17} By the Ninth Symphony's organizational and thematic structure, this appears to be the case.


\textsuperscript{17} Ibid.
Musical and Structural Ingenuity

Musical scholars, critics, performers, and composers have long debated the significance and meaning of the work's two largest distinguishing features: the inclusion of text and voices and the use of recurrent musical material. This recurrent material not only begins the last movement, but is central in the construction of the entire piece. One could consider the recurrent material as providing diversity to the new elements, and through this, a concept of unity is achieved.

The inclusion of text and voices is historically important for many reasons. The Ninth Symphony was the first piece to incorporate text and vocalists in the symphonic genre. While other forms, such as oratorio and opera, had combined these forces, no composer had yet integrated them into what had been hitherto an exclusively instrumental medium. After his initial hearing of the work, Wagner declared that the genre of the symphony was dead, and that Beethoven had taken the next logical evolutionary step in the development of music by including voices and text into the Finale of the Ninth Symphony.¹⁸ Although Wagner's assertion was self-serving, justifying his own preference for opera, many people accepted it as a truth, and many still do so today. For Beethoven, it was not so much a matter of

¹⁸Cook, 76.
choosing one style of musical composition over another or of making a statement on the values of different media, but a conscious choice about how to best express his thoughts regarding what he considered to be an ideal humanity. His choice of text and the manner in which he set it within the unique formal design of the movement supports this conclusion.

If one understands the Ninth Symphony as a product of the eighteenth-century ideals with which Beethoven was familiar, the compositional uniqueness becomes more intelligible. It was not unusual for concerts during his time to include a wide variety of music, often with individual movements or sections of works performed separately. Including voices and text in one piece and as a part of the symphonic genre, though unique, was not that far from what would normally occur during some concerts.¹⁹ But most commentators of Beethoven’s day preferred to think of the Ninth Symphony as “arbitrary, eccentric, and tasteless,”²⁰ a result of Beethoven’s deafness and personal problems.²¹ Questions arose whether the Symphony was of such dimensions and unusual form that it could not be

---


²⁰ Cook, 39.

²¹ Cook, 38.
reconciled to the aesthetic sensibilities of its first audiences. The answer was two-fold: many were moved by the beauty of the work and the excitement of the final movement, while others were unable to grasp the expansion of form and musical thought.\footnote{22

The form of the last movement of the Ninth Symphony is not conventional, and it is structured in such a way that the text is highlighted by the formal design of the movement and that of the Symphony as a whole. For critics, the problems with the Finale are historically centered around two main points: the inclusion of "wordless" recitatives by the cellos and basses (where the main melodic material from the previous three movements as well as the overall thematic goal of the work, the "Ode," is presented); and secondly, the inclusion of text and voices into the symphonic context. Instead of attempting to decipher the compulsion Beethoven had felt in making this compositional choice, writers focused on the repetition of the previous movement's thematic material in the lower strings at the beginning of the movement. Most writers viewed the Symphony as a search for "something," the culmination of which is the "Ode" theme, presented after the six orchestral recitatives at the beginning of the Finale.\footnote{23

\footnote{22} Cook, 22, 38.

\footnote{23} Cook, 65-70.
In part because of the myths and heritage surrounding the work, Beethoven's "Ode" has become an ideal; elevated initially by its first audiences and critics, and then by later Romantic composers, critics, and idealists. Because of its stature among the masterpieces of Western Art Music, the "Ode" is a monument, both of thought and music.
CHAPTER 2

CONTEXT: BEETHOVEN'S LATER YEARS

The creation of the Ninth Symphony stretches across many decades, artistic styles, and stages of Beethoven's musical and personal growth. The work stands as a testament both to Beethoven's greatness as a composer and his faith in the union of people in an idealistic state. As Beethoven approached the culmination of his life's journey, several factors coalesced and led to the creation of what many consider to be his greatest work. Understanding the importance of these events will shed new light upon the structure of the Ninth Symphony, on its meaning to Beethoven personally, and on its meaning to modern performers, scholars, and audiences.

Partly because of turmoil in his life, Beethoven did not complete a new symphony for over eleven years after finishing his Eighth Symphony in 1812. Although he was trying to complete a work in the symphonic genre, other compositions and a variety of complications in his personal life kept him from finishing a symphony. But each work that Beethoven completed between the eighth and ninth symphonies in some way prepared him for his final symphonic creation, as did numerous tragic events in his life.

The first misfortune which deeply affected Beethoven during this period centered around family matters. Upon the death of one of his brothers, Karl Kaspar, a series of court cases between Beethoven and Karl
Kaspar's widow, Johanna, ensued over the child of Johanna and Karl Kaspar, Karl. At first joint custody was awarded, which allowed Beethoven to have some influence in his nephew's life. Troubles with Karl soon developed, however, and they were a source of great angst for the composer.²⁴ Beethoven desired above all to wrest guardianship away from Johanna, whom he believed to be an unfit mother. A series of trials and fighting among all the parties involved ended in 1820, when Karl was returned to the guardianship of his mother.

Recent speculation suggests that Karl's mother was the source of another problem faced by Beethoven, unrequited love. The film Immortal Beloved portrays Beethoven's life-long anxiety concerning love and presents the idea that Beethoven's anger over his nephew's care centered around Beethoven romantic involvement with Karl's mother. A series of miscommunications between the two ended their relationship, and she became involved with Beethoven's brother, Karl Kaspar. After this break, Ludwig could no longer tolerate Johanna and deemed her unworthy of his brother. Eventually, his brother and Johanna married, with a baby born soon after. It is implied in Immortal Beloved that the baby was Ludwig's and not

Karl Kaspar's. If this were true, then perhaps it would explain a great deal about Beethoven's anger concerning Karl's custody. In one letter from 1818, Beethoven's feelings are aptly stated,

God, O God, my Guardian, my Rock, my All, Thou seest my heart, and knowest how it distresses me to do harm to others through doing right to my darling Karl. Hear Thou unutterable! hear Thy unhappy, most unhappy of mortals.

Near this same time, he said to a friend, "I have no friend and am alone in the world." It is clear that the entire situation was consuming for Beethoven, both personally and compositionally, as he was not able to focus his energies on creating music.

There were other problems for Beethoven, including the deaths of three of his biggest financial supporters: Prince Carl Lichnowsky, who died on April 15, 1812; Prince Kinsky, who died on November 3, 1812; and Prince Lobkowitz, who died on December 16, 1816. Beethoven spent much time in the courts suing the heirs of Prince Kinsky in efforts to maintain his

---

25 Bernard Rose, Immortal Beloved. Columbia Pictures, 1994. This point is disputed in Maynard Solomon's book, Beethoven (Schirmer, 1977), 158-189. Solomon offers his own proof on the mystery of the Immortal Beloved, stating it to be Antonie Brentano. The reference to Rose's film is offered to show that Beethoven's feelings about the subject were quite extreme; this is the latest in a series of answers to the mystery, much in the same way that there have been many different answers to the mystery of the construction of the Ninth Symphony.


27 Grove.
annuity, and his income was reduced by one-third upon the death of Prince Lobkowitz. The money Beethoven received from nobility was in recognition of his importance as a composer and musical figure. Each of Beethoven's supporters expected music dedicated to him in return for his financial support. As efforts to maintain his own financial stability worsened, Beethoven wrote to his legal adviser, "Such things exhaust me more than the greatest efforts in composition."

Political developments in this period affected Beethoven as well. Most important among these was the Congress of Vienna, held after Napoleon's defeat. Beethoven had initially been a loyal supporter of Napoleon, but he soon realized the tyranny that Napoleon would bring to Vienna. During the peaceful time after Napoleon's departure, Beethoven held private concerts to raise money, and he also continued to receive money from private sources. Having regained some emotional peace, Beethoven commemorated the defeat of Napoleon with a celebratory work,

---


29 Grove, 312-316. Beethoven received five payments from Lobkowitz.

30 Grove, 313.
Wellington's Sieg, oder die Schlacht bei Vittoria [Wellington's Victory, or the Battle of Vittoria], which occupied his time in the fall of 1813.  

In addition, Beethoven had quarrels with two of his closest friends, Stephan Breuning and Johann Mälzel, and the dispute with Breuning was not resolved until 1826.  

Beethoven's despondency is evident in the following remarks from an entry in a conversation book:

Grief sharpens the understanding and strengthens the soul: Joy, on the other hand, seldom troubles itself about the one and makes the other effeminate or frivolous....My musical works are the offspring of my genius and my misery; and what the public most relish is that which has given me the greatest distress.

Among all this turmoil, which does not even account for Beethoven's continuing problems with his worsening deafness, he somehow managed to begin and complete some of his finest music. These works included the Piano Sonatas Opp. 90, 101, 106, 109-111, the Diabelli Variations, the opera Fidelio in its ultimate form, the song cycle An Die Ferne Geliebte [To the Distant Beloved], and the Missa Solemnis.

Sketchbooks for the Ninth Symphony show that Beethoven had begun sketching a variety of ideas for the Symphony while still composing

---

31 Grove, 311.

32 Grove, 317.

33 Grove, 319.
these other works. This practice was well in line with his standard compositional process, which included the working out of several compositions simultaneously. His creative efforts were not focused exclusively on the Ninth Symphony until after the completion of the Missa Solemnis in 1822. It was only after the experience of composing this work, which was important to Beethoven for religious and personal reasons, that he was musically and emotionally able to face the task of composing a new symphony, a work of various influences shaped into a cohesive whole.

Not coincidentally, the works completed while Beethoven sketched ideas for the Ninth Symphony exerted specific influences on the Symphony itself. For instance, in the Hammerklavier Sonata in B-flat Major, Op. 106, Beethoven experimented with multiple progressions in chains of thirds and instrumental recitative, compositional structures which are used in the second and fourth movements of the Symphony. And in the Diabelli Variations, Beethoven created an idea of “unity through diversity (disunity),” an organizing principle of the whole of the Ninth Symphony.³⁴

---

³⁴William Kinderman, “Beethoven, Schiller, and the Synthesis of the Rational and the Sensuous,” paper delivered to the American Musicological Society convention in Minneapolis, Minnesota, on October 27, 1994. Kinderman was making the point that through a variety of differing senses of diversity, both musical and personal, including nature, art, freedom, materialism, classicism, and the sublime, Beethoven created a logical succession within diversity in the Diabelli Variations and in the Ninth Symphony. His main point was that the synthesis of the rational and the sensuous is more than possible in art.
These two works become important in the structural and harmonic plan of the Ninth Symphony.

Another work, the Piano Sonata in A-flat Major, Op. 110, composed between 1821-22, exerted a specific cohesive thematic and structural influence on the Ninth Symphony. The piano work contains a melodic fragment similar to that of the main cell of the "Ode" theme.\(^{35}\) Ironically, as Jürgen Thym has noted, in Op. 110 Beethoven's use of the "instrumental recitative serves a twofold function of mimesis and gesture that may be elucidated along either structural or less specific interpretive lines."\(^{36}\) In essence, the Ninth Symphony shares the shape and similarity of themes and the overwhelming feeling of monothematicism from Op. 110 (see Example 3 and 4 in Chapter 5) and the recitative concept from the Sonatas Op. 106 and Op. 110.

The series of saddening and depressing events in the years from Beethoven's letter to the "Immortal Beloved" (July 1812) to the completion of the Ninth Symphony (1824) marks a period which saw a sharp decline in

---

\(^{35}\) At the time of my own discovery of the Ninth Symphony's monothematicism I was taking a Beethoven seminar at Rice University, where at that point in the semester, an investigation of Beethoven's late quartets was underway. I began hearing a logical rhythmic connection between Op. 130 and the Ninth Symphony, and I felt that some sort of connection existed not only among the movements of the Ninth Symphony but among a number of the late works in general.

the quantity of his work. The three big works which consumed him, the Missa Solemnis, the Diabelli Variations, and the Ninth Symphony, were products of a man desperate to express himself, with each work becoming more personal. Beethoven’s work on the Missa Solemnis grew out of his desire to be remembered as a composer of religious works, but the Missa Solemnis was not able to “encompass the personal, non-clerical nature” of the composer’s personal beliefs. Indeed, as Maynard Solomon suggests, it was “necessary and inevitable” for Beethoven to return to Friedrich Schiller’s “Ode to Joy,” a work which Beethoven had known since its original publication in 1792, to express his faith in the future of humanity.

---


CHAPTER 3
THE GENESIS OF THE NINTH SYMPHONY

Beethoven was confused for quite a long time as to what he wanted to do with his latest symphonic writings. He had been commissioned to write two symphonies for the London Philharmonic,\textsuperscript{39} and in 1812 he had even written to the publisher Breitkopf about "three new symphonies," i.e. "beginning with the seventh, the third in D minor."\textsuperscript{40} The creation of the Ninth Symphony was also clouded because Beethoven typically wrote symphonies in pairs, and as he began formulating ideas, he was thinking of two different symphonies. In an 1818 sketchbook he wrote, among studies for the \textit{Hammerklavier} Sonata:

Adagio cantique; sacred song in a symphony an old mode (We Praise Thee, O God--alleluia), either to stand alone, or as introduction to a fugue. The whole second symphony to be based, perhaps, on its melody. The singing voices enter in the last piece, or as early as the Adagio. Orchestra, violins, etc., to be increased tenfold in the last piece. Or the Adagio repeated in a certain manner in the last piece, the singing voices, being the first introduced little by little. In the Adagio the text of a Greek myth-Cantique-Ecclesiastique--in the Allegro, festival of Bacchus.\textsuperscript{41}


\textsuperscript{40} Denis Matthews, \textit{Beethoven} (London: J.M. Dent and Sons Ltd., 1985), 176.
The names for these symphonies were to be “The English” and “The German.” Beethoven contemplated the possibilities of these separate works and eventually modified the plan. The idea for two symphonies melted into one, and the Greek myth-Cantique and the Festival of Bacchus were used in the completed portions of the unfinished Tenth Symphony. The old mode and the sweeping Finale tune were reserved for future use in the Quartet in A minor, Op. 132. Various reminiscences of earlier works began replacing these early ideas, and after the clearing of his musical palette, the definite form of the real Ninth Symphony began to take shape.

Scholars have long believed that the main body of the last movement of the Ninth Symphony was in no way related to the three movements that preceded it. It was speculated that the recitatives were composed only to “bridge” the other movements to the choral finale. Indeed, Beethoven himself admitted that the recitatives were necessary as connective material, incorporating the themes of the previous movements and framed by two statements of a temperamental outburst, the “Schreckensfanfare,” [Horror fanfare] (as Wagner called it) which begins and ends the recitatives. By July 1823, the thought of constructing a musical bridge by some form of recitative

---


42 Schauffler, 159.
was etched in his mind. After returning to Vienna in 1823, Beethoven excitedly announced to Anton Schindler "Ich hab's, Ich hab's!" (I have it, I have it!), and showed him a sketchbook with the words, "Lass uns das Lied des Schiller" (Let us sing the words of Schiller). A prolonged series of sketches in one of the drafts for the Symphony illuminates the whole procedure. Above the sketch for each successive recitative, one of the following texts is found: (here in English translation)

1) This is the day of jubilee, worthy to be sung
2) Oh no, that won't do; I want something more pleasing
3) That is no better, merely rather more cheerful
4) This is also too tender. Must find something more rousing like the...
5) I'll sing you something myself.
6) That will do! Now I have found something to express Joy.

The meaning of these texts is obvious. As each theme is presented, Beethoven indicates why each is unacceptable. He recalls the themes of the previous movements in order to propose, reject, and finally accept an idea.

---

43 Irving Kolodin, *The Interior Beethoven* (New York: Alfred K. Knopf, 1975), 278-79. One of the problems Beethoven faced with his new work was how he could connect the entirety of the work, realizing he would again be extending the symphonic format, and still provide a sense of unity for the whole composition.


45 Mies, 145.
suitable for singing. As Beethoven approaches the end of the fourth recitative, he is ready to present his final project.\textsuperscript{46} Finally, Beethoven presents the musical “theme” of his Ninth Symphony, the thematic climax of the preceding three movements.

The final clue in reconstructing the origins of the Ninth Symphony concerns Beethoven’s decision to set to music Friedrich Schiller’s poem “Ode to Joy.” As far back as 1792, Beethoven had made it known that he intended to set this text strophe by strophe, and he even sketched a setting of the words “Muss ein lieber Vater wohnen” in a sketchbook in 1798. In this early setting, there was no indication of a symphonic context, but it was possibly intended for a religious project.\textsuperscript{47} The “Ode” was significant to Beethoven for many reasons, including its revolutionary aspects and its emphasis on freedom and brotherly love.\textsuperscript{48} The spirit of the Symphony is also linked to the French Revolution, the Napoleonic wars, the dignity of the individual, and the sufferings and hopes of mankind, including Beethoven. His return to the “Ode” text in his later years recalls the idealism of his youth and his hope for a more perfect humanity.

\textsuperscript{46} Ironically, Beethoven presents the “new” theme between recitative four and five, but because of the nature of this introductory section, the listener is not yet aware of its thematic importance.

\textsuperscript{47} Kolodin, 278.

\textsuperscript{48} Winter, 177.
By 1812, Beethoven had decided that a setting as he had originally intended would not be possible. In the years between Beethoven’s first association with the “Ode” and his completion of the Eighth Symphony, Schiller had revised the text of the poem and changed its revolutionary nature, but Beethoven was still using the early edition of the poem as the basis of his musical settings. Among the sketches appears a C Major setting of “muss ein lieber Vater wohnen,” which Nottebohm showed to be the basis of the Namensfeier Overture, Op. 115.49 The thematic history of the Ninth Symphony and the structural aspects of the work were two different entities which only came together in 1823. It is in the Engelmann sketchbook of April – May 1823, which was unknown to Nottebohm, that the Ninth Symphony began to take shape.50 Earlier sketches for what became the Ninth Symphony and other works are spread over thirty years, and an examination of these sketches answers numerous questions about the evolution of the work.

In early 1819, Beethoven ceased preliminary sketch work on the Symphony, not taking it up again until 1822. In these intervening years, he completed the Missa Solemnis, the Piano Sonatas Opp. 109, 110, and 111, the

49 Winter, 178.

50 Winter, 181.
Diabelli Variations, and the overture Die Weihe des Hauses [The Consecration of the House]. One may speculate that Beethoven knew he was to face a giant task in his Ninth Symphony and felt it was necessary to clear his mind of all other works before he could begin the complicated endeavor of creating his next symphony, which he had been planning for over a decade. In truth, the Symphony, with all its various phases of design, musical and extra-musical ideas, and intricate process of composition, was over thirty years in the making.

As noted, the melody that holds the Symphony together is the theme for Schiller's text "Ode to Joy." The creation of this theme dates back to a song of 1794-95, "Gegenliebe," where in the second part, a variant of the ultimate result of Beethoven's exhaustive sketching is found.\textsuperscript{51} This older theme is also similar to the melodies of the Choral Fantasia, Op. 80 (see Table 1). What led Beethoven to return to this melody and use it as the basis for Schiller's text is unknown.

The Ninth Symphony is based on one ultimate ideal—the unity of humanity. Beethoven accomplished this with a singular musical concept which was a result of a variety of musical and non-musical influences. These significant contributions, which span many years, lead to the synthesis

\textsuperscript{51} Cooper, 572.
of a literary work with a musical counterpart. These works were destined for unity, as their combination grew from their reflection in Beethoven’s life.
CHAPTER 4
MUSICAL AND PHILOSOPHICAL UNITIES

Beethoven's Ninth Symphony is based on a single, but universal idea. This monothematic concept applies not only to the musical material of the piece, but also to the work's philosophical message. The first three movements anticipate the grand choral finale, and all of the movements' themes are directly related to the "Ode to Joy" theme of the Finale. The "Ode" theme had to be created first in order for Beethoven to construct the remainder of the work, and without it, the piece could not have been composed. This theme provides not only melodic unity, but harmonic and structural cohesiveness. Beethoven's desire to embrace millions, as so emphatically stated by the chorus in the last movement,\(^\text{52}\) could only be accomplished by unifying the entire composition with this intense monothematicism. With the use of an omnipresent musical ideal, Beethoven makes an ethical and philosophical statement concerning his belief in the unity of mankind. The growth of this monothematic ideal was possible only after decades of planning, both conscious and subconscious, and after Beethoven's full maturation as a composer and of his Romantic spirit.

\(^{52}\) See Chorus 1 in Table 2.
Beethoven's thematic unity in the Ninth Symphony, which was a clear plan for the composer, reveals itself to the careful listener. Various scholars have also discussed this aspect of the piece. In "The Ninth Symphony: A Search for Order," Maynard Solomon discusses one of the predominant features of the work, the "triumph" of D Major over D minor. In his discussion, Solomon makes note of melodic similarities and references among movements. He also mentions that as early as 1851 Wagner had commented that the "Ode to Joy" melody was formulated in Beethoven's mind "from the beginning." Wagner continued by saying that Beethoven "shattered it into its component parts" at the beginning, and in the rest of the Symphony "set his full melody before us as a finished whole." Wagner's pupil Alexander Serov further elaborated upon this procedure as the "transformation of a single idea through a 'chain of metamorphoses,' without departing from the main image." He also believed

---

53 This is a theory that the present author formulated while exploring the harmonic implications of the recitatives of the last movement. As I began to analyze these recitatives, the structural continuity of the Symphony became more obvious. After investigating the themes of the preceding three movements and the second theme of the last movement, my initial observation proved to be true: in essence, the entire work is built from one basic motivic and melodic fragment, augmented and assisted by other melodic intervals which help supply the structural framework for the entire piece. Soon after this discovery, in November 1993, it became necessary to research my theory. The first document I discovered which mentioned the melodic cohesiveness of the work was "The Ninth Symphony: A Search for Order," by Maynard Solomon.


55 Solomon, 14.
the work to be a progression of events within a "great monothematic plan." In this way, Serov felt Beethoven was slowly presenting the "Ode to Joy" as a "symbol of Elysium."^56

Ultimately, Solomon acknowledges the possibility of Beethoven having had an ingenious plan. This conclusion is based upon the work of Robert Winter and Winter's research into the sketches for the Symphony.\(^{58}\) Ironically, this acknowledgment is in direct contrast to the critical response to the work of the theorist Rudolph Rêti, who himself mentioned a thematic similarity among the various themes in the Symphony.\(^{59}\) Rêti's critics, however, contended that it was possible for one to find whatever one wants in a work. This sentiment is echoed by a number of writers, including Solomon (although he ultimately acknowledges the possibilities of monothematicism in the Ninth Symphony).\(^{60}\)

---

56 Solomon, 14.

57 Solomon, 17.


60 Solomon, 14. Other writers who have rejected the work of Rêti, and ultimately this theory, include David Epstein in *Beyond Orpheus* (M.I.T. Press, 1979) and Nicholas Cook in *Music, Imagination, and Culture* (Clarendon Press, 1990). The
For many, Beethoven's music is about logic, and its structural aspects are of prime importance in its enjoyment. Therefore, accepting the possibility of monothematic construction seems appropriate. The Beethoven scholar Otto Baensch stated the obvious in reference to unity when he observed that "no major work of Beethoven will be structurally loose or jumbled and therefore, an explanation of the last movement that demonstrates its formal perfections can be right."\textsuperscript{61} To accept this assertion, however, requires proof, and like Debussy one must sort through a "fog of verbiage" and see where obvious errors in research have been made.\textsuperscript{62} Seeing the evidence of Beethoven's compositional choices only helps to make the case more obvious. In short, thematically, the Ninth Symphony is a creation of a masterpiece from a motive, a motive which gives rise to all musical aspects of the work.

The melodic unity of the Ninth Symphony is in partnership with the text of Schiller, providing a synthesis of two ideals which facilitate

\begin{flushright}
monothematic basis of the Ninth Symphony could have been illuminated by Gustav Nottebohm, the famed Beethoven scholar, but he was unaware of the Engelmann Sketchbook of April-May 1823, an important document containing sketches for the Ninth Symphony, which had been lost. He also chose to ignore numerous pages of sketches and other material for the work of which he was aware (Winter, 182). Had he not done so, perhaps the history of the Ninth Symphony would be less confusing.
\end{flushright}

\textsuperscript{61} Ernest Sanders, "Form and Content in the Finale of Beethoven's Ninth Symphony Symphony," \textit{The Musical Quarterly} 50 (1964): 59.

Beethoven's monothematic message. The unity of a musical theme and a textual message shape the foundation of the entire composition.

To gain an understanding of the significance of Beethoven's use of Schiller's text, one should know Beethoven's role in the musical life of Vienna. His stature and legacy as a composer had been established many years before the completion of the Ninth Symphony in 1824. His numerous successes included works in all media, but he was especially known for solo instrumental pieces, chamber music, and symphonies. Beethoven thought of himself as continuing the legacy of the great composers Haydn and Mozart. Having studied with both, his early compositions showed their influence. In Mozart's vein, Beethoven was a pianist, violist, and a gifted composer, and before the end of the eighteenth century Beethoven had gained a reputation throughout Europe, especially in the German speaking countries, as an exceptional performer and composer. The first independent works which separated him from his predecessors' models came after Beethoven's near suicide in 1801. With the completion of the Third Symphony, the "Eroica," in 1803, Beethoven became known as an innovative composer. This work, along with some of his piano and chamber pieces from the same period, shattered conventions as he expanded form, included more harmonic and rhythmic possibilities, and expanded the possible range of expression.
It is necessary to understand the aesthetic ideals of the period in order to gain an understanding of the impact Beethoven had on his contemporaries and future generations. Many have argued that Beethoven was a “bridge between the Classical and Romantic musical periods.” Because of his many different styles, it is difficult to classify Beethoven as neatly falling into either category. Instead, one might see Beethoven as expanding the beginnings of a Romantic ideal, which began with the later works of Mozart and Haydn, and developing this into his own musical aesthetic. This view offers different perspectives on the appreciation of his music.

The Classical era of music, as it was later called, was a time in which the dominant aesthetic ideal was that of an expressive vocal melody. The German theorist and aesthetician, Johann Mattheson, dominated musical thought with ideas espoused in Das Neu-Eröffnete Orchestre (1713). Mattheson stated that “a cultivated man may achieve a complete conception of the nobility and dignity of music by being a gentleman of international breadth and culture.” Mattheson had been influenced by opera (French

---

opera in particular) and his idea of “the complete man” was as essential to
the composition as melody and harmony.\textsuperscript{64}

The Gallant ideals espoused by Mattheson were in opposition to the
traditional learned polyphony of German church music, as Mattheson’s
melodic ideals were contrary to the rhetorical gestures which were prevalent
in the musical theories of the time. The aesthetic conflict pitted mathematics
against rhetoric, craft against taste, and learning against the gallant.\textsuperscript{65}
German music of the latter part of the eighteenth century emerged as a direct
result of the development of orchestral music. Eventually, the Gallant style
gave way to the emotional warmth and expressive intensity of the
empfainsamer Stil and was later followed by the Sturm and Drang high
Classicism of the late eighteenth century.\textsuperscript{66}

The next great philosophical views on music came from the time of
Immanuel Kant. He divided the arts into three categories, with music
occupying the area of the play of sensations.\textsuperscript{67} For Kant, the charm and
universal communicability of music was especially important, as music

\textsuperscript{64} Lippman, 59-60.

\textsuperscript{65} Lippman, 60.

\textsuperscript{66} Lippman, 62.

\textsuperscript{67} The other categories were the arts of speech (rhetoric and poetry) and the formative
arts (sculpture, architecture, and painting). The play of sensations included music and
the art of color.
appealed to mathematics and speech for an explanation. "Every expression of speech," Kant stated,

has in its content a tone appropriate to the sense. This tone indicates more or less an affection of the speaker and produces it also in the hearer, which affection excites in its turn in the hearer the idea that is expressed in speech by the tone in question. Thus as modulations is, as it were, a universal language of sensations intelligible to every man, the art of tone employs it by itself alone in its full force, viz. as a language of the affections, and thus communicates universally according to the laws of association the aesthetic ideas naturally combined therewith. Now these aesthetic ideas are not concepts or determinate thoughts. Hence the form of the composition of these sensations (harmony and melody) only serves instead of the form of language, by means of their proportionate accordance, to express the aesthetic idea of a connected whole of an unspeakable wealth of thought, corresponding to a certain theme which constitutes the dominating affection in the piece.\(^{68}\)

Kant's philosophy on music was well-known to Beethoven. The composer even scribbled these words of Kant in a conversation book dating from February 1820, "The moral law within us, and the starry heavens above us."\(^{69}\) The quote was in relation to Beethoven's work on the Missa Solemnis, the composition preceding the completion of the Ninth Symphony. Beethoven's artistic aims are found in these words of Kant,

\(^{68}\) Lippman, 132.

\(^{69}\) Kinderman, 102.
especially those concerning aesthetic ideals. One can take the words from Kant which dealt with a dominating central theme and apply them to the Ninth Symphony, Beethoven's moral and philosophical statement of humanity.

For the Ninth Symphony, Beethoven returned to the text of Friedrich Schiller and the ideals of humanity exemplified in the poet's works. The concept of idealism in art was emphasized by Schiller as arising through the nobility of humanity. "Music, in its loftiest explanation must become shape, and act upon us with the tranquil power of the antique."\(^{70}\) The freedom of form was the only true aesthetic freedom to be expected, with real mastery consisting of the "annihilation of the materials" by way of the form.\(^{71}\) Beethoven's incorporation of monothematic form and Schiller's text into the Ninth Symphony helped to bridge the perceived limited capabilities of expressiveness in instrumental music by the inclusion of voices. Beethoven's aim in doing this, it seems, was to offer his hopes for the future of humanity based upon his music and the text of Schiller.

\(^{70}\) Lippman, 134.

\(^{71}\) Lippman, 134.
CHAPTER 5

STRUCTURAL AND THEMATIC ANALYSIS

Structural Analysis of All Movements

The Ninth Symphony begins in a most auspicious manner: hovering fifths in the violins seem to come from nowhere, as if the piece had been going on before and for the listener, only the present performance is of concern.

Example 1  First movement, mm. 1-5.

Note: This and all subsequent examples (unless indicated otherwise) are taken from the Dover edition of Ludwig van Beethoven's Ninth Symphony (1989).

What transpires during the first movement is a monumental shift away from convention, both in structure and in aesthetic meaning.
Standard sonata procedure of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries prescribed that in an exposition section, two main ideas should be contrasted in related tonal areas. The first movement of the Ninth Symphony contains features which contrast with this and other aspects of standard procedure. It begins on the dominant level and eventually moves to the presentation of the first theme on the tonic of D minor. A sudden modulation leads to B-flat, related by a third to the tonic, and the presentation of an abbreviated second theme (see Example 2a), followed by a move to F Major, which according to convention should be the key area for the second theme. The key of D minor is centrally important even in this section, however, and Beethoven reinforces this by returning to it after the first period of the second theme (see Example 2b). The exposition does not repeat, although the beginning of a repeat is suggested before the development begins. In the development section, Beethoven allows the first glimpse of the parallel major, D Major, which some commentators believe to be symbolic and the ultimate "goal" of the work.\footnote{Maynard Solomon writes extensively about this belief in his essay, "The Ninth Symphony: A Search for Order." He feels that the entire compositional goal of the piece is that D Major must "triumph" over D minor in order for the "Ode" of the fourth movement to have any significance. Also, each movement is viewed as a step in this direction, culminating in the fugue of the last movement.} After the development and the recapitulation, a most unusual coda arrives. It emphasizes the lowered-seventh scale degree, rather than following the standard eighteenth-
century practice of moving to the subdominant or a re-emphasizing of the dominant-tonic relationship.

Example 2a, 2b  1st movement, mm. 74-78, 87-88.

The second movement, by Classical standards, should be a slow movement, but Beethoven places a scherzo and trio movement here instead. The music begins with unison orchestral chords on tonic and dominant, followed by the solo timpani on the note F. With this beginning, Beethoven shatters traditional movement order and stylistic convention. Typically,
scherzo and trio movements are light and serve as a preparation for the forthcoming finale. The driving character of this movement emphasizes the tonic of D minor, with the secondary theme again in B-flat Major. D Major is emphasized in the transition which leads to the trio section. The solo timpani, which appears at the beginning of the scherzo and is heard a few more times in the movement, begins the struggle between major and minor as it strikes an unusual gesture which emphasizes minor at the beginning of the movement.\footnote{Acting as a solo instrument, the timpani is placed in an unusual role for its day, but not so for Beethoven. In the Fifth Symphony, he had used the timpani as an integral part of the transition between the third and fourth movements, and it was not unusual for Beethoven to make references to his own works in his compositions. This concept of self-referencing was a new technique for symphonic composers, and one which helped to make Beethoven's music more independent and further removed from the classical tradition. Other examples of self-referencing include the recitatives of the last movement of the Ninth Symphony, which suggests the recitatives of the Piano Sonatas Op. 106 and Op. 110. Also, the third relationships between themes in the first three movements are hallmarks of Beethoven's style, found in all genres of his works.}

The peculiarity of the first two movements is also a result of both harmonic and rhythmic abnormalities. The use of the third-related key areas is not entirely limited to Beethoven. Franz Schubert frequently employed this technique, but it was Beethoven who used it as a cohesive aspect in an entire symphonic work. The lack of emphasis on the dominant detracts from the standard classical procedure of tonic affirmation. To prolong the search for the correct key area, Beethoven often uses rhythmic displacements
and quick modulations to parallel keys. In the Ninth Symphony, resolution is also found in the progression from one movement to the next.

The resolution found between movements is especially evident with the beginning of the third movement, which functions as a point of resolution both structurally and harmonically. Each of the previous movements had begun in a D tonality, but this movement moves to the key of B-flat Major and presents two themes, one in the tonic, and one in D Major. The resolution is found in the notes which begin the third movement, as the first theme begins on the tonic of the entire Symphony, D, and in the second theme, which is presented in a different meter from that of the first theme but in the meter of the second movement. The entire movement is a series of variations on each theme, with each variation becoming more intense, and contrasts with the previous two movements in its texture, form, and melodic lines. Only with the last movement does Beethoven really resolve the contradictions he has created in the previous movements.

The highly dissonant and unique chord, the "Schreckensfanfare," begins the last movement and rattles the listener from the peace of the third movement.\textsuperscript{74} Cellos and basses then begin the final "search" for the correct theme. After several tries, the lower strings arrive at the "Ode" theme. From

\textsuperscript{74} Cook, 71.
this point, Beethoven employs various contrapuntal devices which center around the theme. Suddenly, there is another outburst of the "Schreckensfanfare," and the most glaring of all of Beethoven's breaks with tradition occurs: he introduces voices into the context of a symphonic piece. What follows is a musical interpretation of Beethoven's love for humanity through the music, which reflects the text of Schiller. The forward momentum of the Symphony has stopped, and except for the introduction of the Turkish elements in the march section of the Finale, Beethoven no longer uses any truly shocking procedures in the remainder of the work. Having arrived at his main compositional goal, he could no longer expand the work in any new directions beyond the reinterpretation of what he had stated in the previous movements. Through commonly employed compositional devices such as variation and fugue, he is able to incorporate the innovations of the previous movements into a cohesive whole.

**Thematic and Melodic Analysis**

The Ninth Symphony obtains its cohesive construction through emphasis on specific intervals which play important roles in the structural and thematic organization of the work. Beethoven sketched over thirty
versions of the “Ode to Joy” theme before he was satisfied with it. With this well-crafted melody in place, he devised the shape of the rest of the movement, and ultimately, that of the entire composition. The intervallic

---

75 Winter, 183.

76 Examining the structural content of the theme, one finds that it is very similar to that of other compositions from this period, notably the outline of the theme of the Piano Sonata Op. 110. If one notes the interval pattern of the binding theme of Op. 110, C, D-flat, E-flat, one can see how this outline is a transposition of the “Ode”.

---

Example 3  L.V. Beethoven, Complete Piano Sonatas (Dover, 1975), mm. 1-5.

Also, one can see the similarities between the “Fuga” of the sonata and the first theme of the third movement of the Symphony.

---

Example 4 Complete Piano Sonatas, mm. 445-459. Ninth Symphony, Third movement, mm. 3-6.
makeup of the first half of the “Ode” is as follows: half-step and whole-step ascending, then whole-step, half-step, whole-step, and whole-step descending (see Example 5). Of particular interest are the first three notes, which encompass a half-step followed by a whole-step. This melodic cell, F#-G-A, is the most important element in the monothematic basis of this work.\footnote{The “Ode” cell and its component parts are used in multiple ways in the Ninth Symphony. Included among these are the use of the inversion, retrograde, and retrograde inversion of the “Ode” cell. This analysis tries to examine the use of the “Ode” cell on the most minute level and demonstrate how Beethoven disguises the use of the “Ode to Joy” melody throughout the work.} Other cells appear in the second half of the theme. Examining the intervals from this section one sees the emphasis on the fourth, the major third, the minor sixth, the minor third, and the perfect fifth. Throughout the work, these intervals are emphasized melodically, harmonically, and structurally. It is from this deep association of intervallic structures that Beethoven begins his series of forecasts and foreshadowing for the theme of the last movement.
Example 5  Fourth movement, mm. 92-107.

The intervals of the "Ode" theme are presented at the beginning of the Symphony and at key structural points throughout all four movements (see Table 3 in the Appendix for a detailed analysis of the "Ode" theme and its presentation throughout the Ninth Symphony). Maynard Solomon has written that the opening measures of the Ninth Symphony encompass the whole of the future action, representing "an initial ambiguity leading to clarification." The work begins with ominous perfect fifths, minus a third, leaving no specific harmonic indication of the urgent sense of the "trauma" to come. This opening is similar to that of other Beethoven works; the Seventh Symphony, the Hammerklavier Sonata, and several of the late

\[78\] Solomon, 3.
quartets, all of which begin with similar rhetorical gestures.\textsuperscript{79} The fifths reappear at the conclusion of every movement of the Ninth Symphony, and in the Finale, the descending fifth motion provides a sense of closure to all the events which have occurred. Fifths also open the bass and cello recitatives of the Finale and are important structural entities throughout the recitative section.

Other important intervals from the "Ode" play a major part in the construction of the first movement as well. The absence of a third at the beginning emphasizes the ambiguous struggle between major and minor, something inherent in many of Beethoven's works. When he does give a sense of the harmony in measure 21, he does so by presenting the retrograde inversion of the main melodic cell of the movement: D-E-F.

\begin{center}
\begin{tikzpicture}
\draw[->,thick] (0,0) -- (2,0) node[above] {1/2 Step};
\draw[->,thick] (2,0) -- (4,0) node[above] {Whole Step};
\end{tikzpicture}
\end{center}

Example 6  First movement, mm 21-24. Fourth movement, mm. 92.

\textsuperscript{79} Solomon, 3.
There can be no mistaking the similarity to the "Ode" in the intervallic structure. Only after the statement in unison of the main theme does Beethoven allow harmonization, during a V-I progression, which again emphasizes the fifths from the opening.

Example 7  First movement, mm. 21-24.

The half-step also plays a major role in the construction of the first movement. In measure 24, there is a quick change in harmony from G-minor to E-flat Major, followed by a half-step shift in the bass and a descending chromatic line in the treble voices. This emphasis on the half-step as means of modulation plays a major role not only in this movement, but in the later movements as well.
Example 8  First movement, mm. 24-27.

The restatement of the opening theme, which now leads to B-flat Major, begins with the development of the three note motive, D-E-F, which is the retrograde inversion of the "Ode" theme. The emphasis on the half-step continues as well, leading to a blatant statement of the "Ode" theme by the winds.
Example 9  First movement, mm. 74-80.

The accentuation of the intervals of a half-step and a whole-step are further exploited. In measure 108, a sudden shift in harmony occurs with a move to B Major. The relationships represented by this modulation are many. B Major is a half-step from B-flat Major, a minor third from D Major/minor, a whole-step from A (the key in which the movement began), a tritone from the projected third of the key of the work (the tritone is emphasized in the third recitative), and a fifth from the ever-missing tonic third, F-sharp.
Diagram 1  1st Movement, mm. 11-114.

It is not until further development of the previous material that there is modulation towards the "tonic major." One should note the continued use of the half-step, especially in the bass voices from measures 108-158 (see Diagram 2), and in the slide from B-flat to A in 158-60.

Diagram 2  1st Movement, mm. 111-158.
Example 10  First movement, mm. 158-160.

In this move to the “tonic major” of B-flat Major, we see the introduction of an F-sharp, which appears to be leading towards D Major. Instead, there is a sudden change to G minor. There appears to be a second theme developing, but it is withheld until measure 218, when C minor is established, to present it in the whole ensemble. There is then a quick return to D minor and a long development of the initial three note motive, D-E-F. Eventually, this material is presented in unison, and it leads to the recapitulation, this time with the third in the bass voices. The “tragedy” of this moment is emphasized by the voicing of the harmony, as one can sense a lack of faith in this new key area because of the first inversion chord, and also because of the octave changes, effectively acting as “screams” in measures 311-317 (see Example 11). There is then a sudden change to B-flat Major for one bar, which is then followed by a return to D minor, emphasized by its repetition.
Example 11  First movement, mm. 311-317.

One other part of the opening unison phrase is developed. This is the material from immediately after the retrograde presentation of the "Ode" theme, and it is the same as the previous material in C minor, though now
developed in D minor (see Example 12). Beginning in measure 487, the rhythmic figure continues as Beethoven explores different harmonic possibilities, closing this section with a statement of the main motive in the bass voices.

Example 12  First movement, mm. 487-491.

(Key:  D minor, Instrumentation:  Violin I and II, Viola, Cello and Bass)

The coda of the movement is based on a chromatic ostinato figure, consisting of a series of descending half-steps, ascending whole-steps, and one last half-step (see Example 13a, b).
Example 13a  First movement, mm. 523-529.

In measure 543, Beethoven again exaggerates the half-step and the whole-step in a new way.

Example 13b  First movement, mm. 544-550.

(Instrumentation: Violin I and II, Viola, Cello, Bass)
Ultimately, this leads to another unison statement of the opening fanfare, followed by ascending scales and the main motive, ending decisively with a descending fifth.

Example 14  First movement, mm. 553-557.

(Key: D minor, Instrumentation: Violin I and II, Viola, Cello, Bass)
The first three bars of the main theme of the scherzo date from 1816, where in the sketches they were labeled "Fugue."\(^{80}\) This material developed into the fugue which appears after the frightening introduction to the movement, which is accentuated by the timpani’s forte entrance on F, the third of the D minor chord. The connections between the first and second movement themes are obvious. First, the main subject of the second movement is a sequential presentation of the main “Ode” cell, its inversion, and the retrograde inversion, as was much of the thematic material of the first movement.

Example 15  Second movement, mm. 9-12.

(Instrumentation: Oboe, Violin II)

Beethoven accomplishes this by using the opening of the melody of the “Ode” as the main melodic cell and constructs an inverted theme which is in retrograde and begins one half-step below the starting pitch of the “Ode,” on F-natural. Secondly, the first theme of the second movement begins with a

\(^{80}\) Kolodin, 320.
descending octave and an ascending fourth, reminiscent of the opening of the first movement, which begins with ascending fifths and fourths, covering the span of an octave and a fifth, allowing for the presentation of two different melodic octaves on E and A. The second theme, presented in C Major, is another showcase of the main melodic cell.

Example 16 Second movement, mm. 93-100.

Another interesting detail of the scherzo concerns the rapid harmonic shifts, quite a number of which are direct sequences of thirds (measures 151-176). This section of music parallels a section in the Op. 106 Sonata (see Table 4 in the Appendix). This sequencing also involves movement by half-step in its last six measures (measures 171-176).
Example 17  Second movement, mm. 151-176.

The beginning of the *Ritmo di tre battute* centers on E minor, which is soon overtaken by F Major. A shift of a major-third to A Major is followed by perhaps the most intense modulation in the movement, B-flat Major to A Major. This modulation is aided by an enormous crescendo, and serves as the dominant of the "terrifying" music just ahead.

Example 18  Second movement, mm. 256-261.
These quick modulations progress by half-step (E minor to F Major), whole-step (C Major to D minor at the second theme), a most obvious half-step modulation from B-flat Major to A Major (which is aided by an enormous crescendo), thirds and fifths (during the chains of modulatory gestures before the *Ritmo di tre* battute), and finally by fifth (at the restatement of the first theme).

![Musical notation image]

Example 19  Second movement, mm. 256-268.

At the end of this section, there is an arrival in B-flat, where the same modulation pattern is repeated. A brief statement of the tonic major occurs in measures 330-337, immediately followed by the tonic minor and a quick modulation through another series of keys.
Example 20  Second movement, mm. 330-346.

In measure 359, one can see another statement of the "Ode" cell and use of the cell in retrograde.

Example 21  Second movement, mm. 356-359
It is in the trio that Beethoven extensively explores the possibilities of the tonic major for the first time. The main theme presents not only the outline of the beginning of the "Ode,‖ but also some of the rhythmic intricacies.

Diagram 3  2nd Movement, mm. 426-434.

The theme begins on D, but ascends step-wise to F-sharp. At this point, the "Ode" theme is present in its entirety, with some slight rhythmic diminution and repetition.
Example 22 Second movement, mm. 426-430.

This tune is passed among various voices, sometimes being modified. In measure 506, the tune is combined with the previous counterpoint against a drone in the bass voices. This is the coda of the trio, and it emphasizes the half-step while further instilling the ultimate theme of the Ninth Symphony.

Example 23 Second movement, mm. 506-516.
The trio section has other obvious relations to the "Ode" theme and to the triumph of major over minor. Just as the "Ode" theme is symbolic, the theme of the trio, Martin Cooper believes, is similar to that of melodies that Beethoven might have heard at the Volksfest, held in 1814, to celebrate the defeat of Napoleon. The music of the trio is folk-like and also foreshadows the choral jubilation in the last movement.

The second movement concludes with a repeat of the scherzo, followed by a brief return to the trio, abbreviated after seven bars. A bar of rest separates this from the repeat of the two bars which precede the trio, but this time a conclusive cadence is achieved with octaves and descending fifths.

If one examines the plan of the entire Symphony, one sees that by the end of the second movement Beethoven has moved away from the great "tragedy" presented in the first movement. The first movement may be considered a funeral march in the spirit of the second movement of the "Eroica" Symphony; if that is the case, the second movement of the Ninth Symphony could be seen as the intensification of the emotions of the first movement, magnified by its relentlessly driving rhythmic patterns. The first and second movements are serious in tone and their moods are contrasted in the trio of the second movement and in the entirety of the third. The trio

---

81 Cooper, 312.
finally moves out of this dark mood towards the possibility that humanity could overcome the tragedy of its past and see the prospects of its future, an idea Beethoven held dear to his heart. Also interesting is the similarity between the first two movements in formal design; both are extended sonata-allegro structures. Each movement also contains augmented-sixth chords at the approach of the recapitulation. Only after this musical struggle has been presented is it appropriate to begin formulating the theme for joy itself.

The third movement begins by emphasizing specific intervals which have been crucial in the development of the work: the half and whole-steps. The movement begins in a key outside the D tonality, B-flat Major, but the first theme begins on the note D.

![Musical notation]

Example 24 Third movement, mm. 3-6.

(Instrumentation: Violin I)

---

Not surprisingly, the movement is in variation form, a form with which Beethoven seemed to be obsessed in his later years, and a technique that he had used extensively in the thematic variations of the "Ode" in the previous two movements. This movement also contains the first tender expression felt in the Symphony, and perhaps this mood was necessary to prepare for the exalting of joy in the Finale. The movement also leads away from the idea of musical abstraction so commonly associated with Beethoven's late period, and prevalent in the music of the previous two movements, especially the second. He does this by stopping the relentless rhythmic repetition, by the employment of more developed melodic lines, and by the use of thematic variation for another presentation of the "Ode" theme.

In the third movement, the first theme is a calm presentation of fourths, half-steps and whole-steps. In measures 1-3, one can see the intricate interlocking structures used by Beethoven in emphasizing the different interval patterns.
Example 25  Third movement, mm. 1-3.

The use of the half-step modulation seen in the other movements leads to the ascending chromatic line in the bass voices in measures 21-23.

Example 26  Third movement, mm. 21-23.
Also present in this same area is the use of broken chords in the violins and violas, reminiscence of the octaves from the first movement and similar to the opening of each of the two previous movements.

Example 27 Third movement, m. 21.

The second theme begins at the end of measure 24. The counter-melody in the bass voices emphasizes the half-step and rising whole-steps, which is an inversion of the counter-melody of the second part of the trio from the second movement. But most importantly, Beethoven uses a melody, richly set in D Major, that is only a lightly disguised version of the “Ode” melody itself, as well as emphasizing the “Ode” cell in the bass.
Example 28  Third movement, mm. 25-28. Fourth movement, m. 92.

If one were to strip this tune of the ornamentation, the “Ode” itself would be presented.

After a second statement of the first theme in B-flat Major, Beethoven uses G Major as the setting for the second statement of the second theme. The third statement of the first theme (this time in E-flat Major) gives rise to the triplet ornamentation which pervades the remainder of the movement and is another form of variation used by Beethoven.\(^\text{83}\)

---

\(^{83}\) The use of triplets and their use against the duple melody is reminiscent of the struggle between major and minor found in the first two movements.
Example 29  Third movement, mm. 83-94.

Extensive variations on this theme continue until the first of two unison orchestral passages, the second of which leads to D-flat Major, a major-third
relation from the present tonic (A Major), and a minor third from the tonic of the movement (B-flat Major).

Example 30  Third movement, mm. 131-134.

Also important in the movement is the use of G-flat major and augmented sixth chords, as had been seen in earlier movements.\textsuperscript{84}

\textsuperscript{84} Friedheim, 99.
Example 31  Third movement, mm. 131-134.

Unison orchestral passages lead to the conclusion of the coda in B-flat, and the movement ends, as did the first, with ascending scales and, as in the first and second movements, a V-I movement in the bass voices.
Example 32 Third movement, mm. 155-157.

(Key: B-flat Major, Instrumentation: Flute I, Oboe I, Clarinet I and II, Bassoon I and II, Horn in B-flat, Horn in E-flat, Trumpet in B-flat, Timpani, Violin I and II, Viola, Cello, Bass)
The connections among the first three movements are clear. Through intervallic, harmonic, and structural means, Beethoven connects these movements and foreshadows his thematic expression of joy. One last look at the "Schreckensfanfare," which begins the last movement, shows a connection between the third movement and the Finale.\textsuperscript{85} This linkage is accomplished by the juxtaposition of D minor and B-flat Major chords, together constituting the "Schreckensfanfare" (see Example 33a and Example 33b). In essence, as he had done throughout the piece, Beethoven maintains the tonality of the previous movement while returning to the tonic key of the Symphony.

\textsuperscript{85} Treitler, 32-34.
Example 33a  Fourth movement m. 1

Example 33b  Reduction of "Schreckensfanfare"
A look at the recitatives that begin the melodic portion of the fourth movement demonstrates how intricately these bits of genius are connected to the previous movements and the soon-to-be-heard theme of joy (see Example 34). All the basic interval patterns—the minor and major thirds, the perfect fourths and fifths, the octaves, the tritone, and of course, the half-step, make their appearance and are combined in the separate melodies. In each recitative, Beethoven emphasizes the different interval patterns, beginning the first recitative as he had begun the first movement with the perfect fifth A-E. As can be seen in the example, Beethoven then outlines the "Ode's" main melodic cell throughout the subsequent recitatives. Each recitative concentrates on the cell as well as the perfect fourth, the inversion of the perfect fifth. Special emphasis is placed on the intervals which constitute the cell: the half-step and the whole-step.
Example 34  Fourth movement, mm. 8-16, 24-29, 38-47, 56-62, 
65-75, 80-90, 92-107.  

(Instrumentation: Cello and Bass)

After the initial appearance and subsequent variations on the "Ode"
theme, Beethoven presents one more melody at "Seid umschlungen
Millionen!"  This melody is also composed of the same half-steps, thirds,
whole-steps, and fourths as the "Ode" theme and is presented on the

---

Note that some intervals labeled as Minor or Major Thirds are actually Minor or
Major Sixths. They are labeled as Minor or Major Thirds (their mirror images) for
clarity and simplicity in the analysis.
subdominant level, emphasizing the importance of the relationship of the fourth.

Example 35  Fourth movement, mm 595-602.
During this section, Beethoven uses augmented rhythmic values, much as he had done in the Missa Solemnis. At the next big section of the movement, Beethoven symbolically combines the two previous themes into one giant mass of sound.

Example 36  Fourth movement, mm. 655-658.

This is significant because it emphasizes not only the "oneness" of the Symphony's thematic ideas but Beethoven's ideal humanity by the combination of two distinct melodic ideas with text.

---

Kinderman, 115-116. Kinderman also notes the symbolic use of trombones in this section, a technique used by Beethoven at a similar point in the Missa Solemnis. Another important connection between the Ninth Symphony and the Missa Solemnis occurs at the "Über Sternen muß er wohnen," where there is a similarity between key areas, E-flat major, the key which is commonly associated with the Trinity. This same E-flat is present at the Major 9th chord which precedes the double fugue which ends the work.
The music of the chorus ends with an assertive descending fifth against scales in the strings, bringing together two of the earlier compositional features one last time. A rousing extension of the tonic concludes the work with ascending scales and a final descending fifth.

Example 37  Fourth movement, mm. 826-830.

(Key: D Major, Instrumentation: Piccolo, Flute I and II, Oboe I and II, Clarinet I and II, Bassoon I and II, Contrabassoon)

The Ninth Symphony obtains its cohesive construction through emphasis on specific intervals which play important roles in the structural and
thematic organization of the work. Beethoven uses the main melodic cell of the "Ode" as the germ for the harmonic possibilities in the structure of the piece, extracting the intervals of this theme to act as a foundation for all harmonic progressions. Consequently, the structure of each movement, and ultimately, the entire work, is based on the harmonic content of the "Ode" theme. In this way, Beethoven embeds his monothematic plan deep in the fabric of the piece.
CHAPTER 6

CONCLUSIONS

To many modern commentators, the Ninth Symphony is a conglomeration of many ideas and ideals. Views on the musical themes, ideological statements (both musical and textual), symbols, and the overall design of the work can be combined with the work of past writers, listeners, and modern researchers and integrated into a new philosophy of the work. Only recently, as musicological research has changed its focus, has this become possible, and it has yielded new interpretations. To this end, the Ninth Symphony becomes a symbol with many different meanings.

The Ninth Symphony holds such deep associations concerning brotherhood and humanity that it has had a unique sociological status in many societies. During World War I, Allied troops hummed the “Ode” as their unique hymn and credo. Ironically, the Frenchman Camille Mauclair even declared that the piece belonged to the whole world except for Germany. After World War I, the piece became a highlight of Nazi culture, and it was even performed as part of Adolf Hitler’s birthday celebration in 1942. Later, in 1965, Chinese leaders cited the work as an example of the Western illusion that a “progressive and just society could be achieved without class conflict.” In 1989, the Ninth Symphony was performed in Berlin at a special Christmas concert held to celebrate the reunion of
Germany. In this performance, the conductor, Leonard Bernstein, changed the words of the “Ode” for the occasion, substituting “Freiheit” [Freedom] for “Freude” [Friend]. And finally, the European Union has voted to make the “Ode” theme the anthem of Europe.

Recently, Leo Treitler observed that the Ninth Symphony,

more than any other work of the Tradition, it demands interpretation. It does so in and of itself because it blatantly confounds efforts to account for its events on strictly formalist terms, but also by virtue of the interpretational, or hermeneutic, field in which it has been transmitted to us.

Treitler argues against Wagner’s case for the end of symphonic music, as Treitler believes that the text does not make the Symphony “articulate” and its meaning unquestionable.

Modern writers offer differing opinions on the recitatives and the work as a whole. Martin Cooper believed that the recitatives should have been reserved for the sketchbooks. Nicholas Cook feels that Schenker’s approach to the music is limited because it fails to see the possibilities of the recitatives as being music about music, or to quote Cook, “music interpreted by itself.” Cook has also concluded that the recitatives accomplish temporal

---

88 Cook, 93-96.


90 Taruskin, 248.
modulation, transforming the musical themes of the preceding movements into real time, the time of performance. It is as if musical time changes into "dramatic or realistic time."\(^{91}\)

Since its premiere in 1825, interpretations of the "meaning" of Beethoven's Ninth Symphony have continuously varied. Reactions have been influenced by the aesthetic ideals of the time and by the changing social contexts with their applicable meanings. Cultures value art which is transcendent, and Beethoven's Ninth Symphony, because of its deviations from convention as well as its unconventional use of Classical idioms, is just that. A whole new generation of Europeans and other cultures will discover new meanings for the Ninth Symphony, just as their predecessors had done before them. The Ninth Symphony is great art because of its power, in part created by itself, but mostly because some societies value the work as essential to their cultures. The ideals of the Ninth Symphony are virtually infinite because of what it was, is, and will become to every culture which desires an interpretation.

On a more sophisticated level, however, scholars have spent considerable time examining the available materials which relate to the Ninth Symphony. Only recently, however, has it been possible for scholars to have the benefit of a complete picture surrounding the formulation of the

\(^{91}\) Cook, 88-92.
work. Because of at least 150 years of misinformation, much of what is perceived to be true regarding the genesis of the piece must be looked at again in order to grasp its true history.

The first step in this examination is to acknowledge the possibility of a different way of seeing the work. With this in mind, one can use one of the two theories of thinking which are available to historians: the diachronic mode--the focus of which is representing the past as continuous narratives, making change and novelty the main parts of history; to hold past, future, and the passage between them as the primary categories for knowing the objects of history; to think of the past as prehistory of the present, and the present as consequence of the past.\textsuperscript{92}

The other type of historical thinking seeks knowledge of the past for its "individuality and its particularity... as it really was." This "synchronic mode" of reasoning is more interested in seeing an event's meaning rather than its content. This is summarized by Thomas Carlyle,

\begin{quote}
Alas for our 'chain' and or chainlets, of 'causes and effects,' which we so assiduously track through certain handbreadths of years and square miles, when the whole is a broad, deep immensity.\textsuperscript{93}
\end{quote}

If one can sift through the mounds of incomplete and incorrect information, then one can see that it is probable and highly likely that the

\textsuperscript{92} Treitler, 37.

\textsuperscript{93} Treitler, 38.
“Ode to Joy” was the key and necessary element in the formulation of the Ninth Symphony, and without it, the work would not have existed. It is true that sketches of the Ninth Symphony span a wide period of years and that pieces and fragments of material which appear symphonic in nature compare with elements used in the Symphony. But what recent research has shown is that not all of this material was central in the construction of the Ninth Symphony. What the Engelmann Sketchbook reveals is that the Ninth Symphony, from a diachronic perspective, was consciously composed in a monothematic way. What the music itself demonstrates, in a synchronic mode, is that its construction is deeply interwoven with many musical and extra-musical factors. It would not have been possible for Beethoven to complete the work in the form in which we now know it if he had not consciously used his constructive powers to create a piece with a series of deep connective symbols, forms, structures, and themes.

In the Ninth Symphony, cohesiveness comes from a variety of sources: thematic, structural, and symbolic unity; disunity; the procession from chaos to order; and the choice of certain key centers over other key centers. The Ninth Symphony asks participants in the listening process to acknowledge many historical and long-held associations. Solomon believes

94 This symbolic unity is seen through Beethoven’s use of the “Ode” text and his belief in it.
that the Ninth Symphony asks many questions, but that the answer lies in only one idea: the discovery of "a principle of order in the face of chaotic and hostile energy."\textsuperscript{95} Though I believe that we are still, as Richard Taruskin says, "in the valley of the Ninth Symphony,"\textsuperscript{96} I feel confident that at least one layer of the verbiage can and should be removed.

\textsuperscript{95} Solomon, 25.

\textsuperscript{96} Taruskin, 256.
APPENDICES

TABLE 1

Sources for the "Ode" Theme (See page 26)

\[
\text{Wusst ich, wusst ich, dass du mich lieb und}
\]

\[
\text{werth ein bis-chen hiel-test,}
\]

Gegenliebe, 1795 and later in the Choral Fantasy Op. 100 (1808), p. 572.

\[
\text{"An die Hoffung," 1805, p. 160.} 
\]
TABLE 1, continued

\begin{figure}
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{music.png}
\caption{Freude, schöner Götterfunken}
\end{figure}

Ninth Symphony, 1824, p. 100.

TABLE TWO

Text of the Finale

Verse 1
Freude, schöner Götterfunken,
Tochter aus Elysium,
Wir betreten feuertrunken,
Himmlische, dein Heiligtum.
Deine Zauber binden wieder,
Was die Mode streng geteilt;
Alle Menschen werden Brüder,
Wo dein sanfter Flügel weilt.

Joy, beautiful spark of the gods,
daughter of Elysium,
Intoxicated with your fire,
heavenly one, we enter your shrine.
Your magic power reunites
what strict custom has divided,
All men become brothers
where your gentle wing rests.

Verse 2
Wem der grosse Wurf gelungen,
Eines Freundes Freund zu sein,
Wer ein holdes Weib errungen!
Mische seinen Jubel ein!
Ja -- wer auch nur eine Seele
Sein nennt auf dem Erdenrund!
Und wer's nie gekonnt, der stehe
Weinend sich aus diesem Bund.

Whoever has the great good fortune
to enjoy mutual friendship,
Whoever has taken a loving wife,
let him join us in celebration!
Yes! Even he who has nothing to call
his own but his soul!
But he who cannot rejoice,
let him steal weeping away.

Verse 3
Freude trinken alle Wesen
An den Brüsten der Natur;
Alle Guten, alle Bösen
Folgen ihrer Rosenspur.
Küsse gab sie uns und Reben,
Einen Freund, geprüft im Tod;
Wollust ward dem Wurm gegeben,
Und der Cherub steht vor Gott.

All creatures partake of joy
at Nature's breast;
Nature nourishes all
that is good or evil,
Dispensing kisses and wine to us,
a friend tested in death.
The worm is in ecstasy,
and the cherub stands before God.
### TABLE TWO, continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chorus 4</th>
<th>Chorus 1</th>
<th>Chorus 3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Roh, wie seine Sonne fliegen</strong></td>
<td><strong>Brothers, go on your way as glad</strong></td>
<td><strong>Do you fall to your knees, millions?</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Durch des Himmels prächt'gen Plan,</strong></td>
<td><strong>as the stars as they hurtle,</strong></td>
<td><strong>World, do you sense your Maker</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Laufen, Brüder, eure Bahn,</strong></td>
<td><strong>Through the heaves, as joyful</strong></td>
<td><strong>Seek him beyond the stars!</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Freudig, wie ein Held zum Siegen.</strong></td>
<td><strong>as a hero on his way to triumph.</strong></td>
<td><strong>Beyond the stars he must dwell!</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Seid umschlungen, Millionen!</strong></td>
<td><strong>Be embraced, you millions!</strong></td>
<td><strong>Such' ihn übem Sternenzelt!</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Diesen Kuss der ganzen Welt!</strong></td>
<td><strong>Here's a kiss for all the world!</strong></td>
<td><strong>Über Sternen muss er wohnen.</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Brüder -- überm Sternenzelt</strong></td>
<td><strong>Brothers! above the canopy of the</strong></td>
<td><strong>Beyond the stars he must dwell!</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Muss ein lieber Vater wohnen.</strong></td>
<td><strong>stars there must dwell a loving father!</strong></td>
<td><strong>Nicholas Cook, Beethoven Symphony No. 9</strong> (Great Britain, Cambridge University Press, 1993), 108-109.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE 3

The "Ode" Theme and Connections to the Entirety of the Ninth Symphony

Example 1 - 11 show the "Ode" cell and its use in various forms as well as its emphasis on the 1/2 step found in the "Ode" cell.
TABLE 3, continued

5  
\[ \text{Retrograde Inversion} \quad \text{Inversion} \]
\[ \text{Perfect Fourth} \quad \text{"Ode" Cell} \]
Movement 2, m. 22

6  
\[ \text{2nd Theme} \]
Movement 2, m. 93

7  
\[ \text{Major vs. minor} \]
Movement 2, m. 354

8  
\[ \text{Trio} \]
Movement 2, m. 426

9  
\[ \text{Retrograde Inversion} \quad \text{"Ode" Cell} \quad \text{"Ode" Cell Rearranged} \]
Movement 3, m. 25

10  
\[ \text{Perfect Fourth} \quad 1/2 \text{Step} \quad \text{Whole Step} \quad \text{Retrograde Inversion} \]
Movement 4, m. 59

11  
\[ \text{Retrograde} \quad \text{"Ode" Cell} \quad \text{Perfect Fourth} \]
Movement 4, m. 72
TABLE 3, continued

Examples 12-18 show the use of the "Ode" cell and emphasis of the 4th, 5th and octave.

1. Movement 1, m. 20
2. Movement 1, m. 490
3. Movement 2, m. 9
4. Movement 2, m. 424
5. Movement 3, m. 26
6. Movement 3, m. 120
7. Movement 4, m. 8
TABLE 3, continued

Examples 19-20 show use of the "Ode" and other intervals.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Bar</th>
<th>To chord of</th>
<th>Common Interval</th>
<th>Bar</th>
<th>To chord of</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>D flat Major</td>
<td>Major third</td>
<td>152</td>
<td>B flat Major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>B flat minor</td>
<td>minor third</td>
<td>153</td>
<td>G minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1-2</td>
<td>G flat Major</td>
<td>Major third</td>
<td>154-159</td>
<td>E flat Major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>E flat minor</td>
<td>minor third</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>C minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>B Major</td>
<td>Major third</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>A flat Major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(C flat minor)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-8</td>
<td>G sharp minor</td>
<td>minor third</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>F minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>E Major</td>
<td>Major third</td>
<td>163</td>
<td>D flat Major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>C sharp minor</td>
<td>minor third</td>
<td>164</td>
<td>B flat minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9-10</td>
<td>A Major</td>
<td>Major third</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>G flat Major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>F sharp minor</td>
<td>minor third</td>
<td>166</td>
<td>E flat minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>D Major</td>
<td>Major third</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>C flat Major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>B minor</td>
<td>minor third</td>
<td>168</td>
<td>A flat minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>G Major</td>
<td>Major third</td>
<td>169</td>
<td>E Major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(F flat Major)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>E minor</td>
<td>minor third</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>C sharp minor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>C Major</td>
<td>Major third</td>
<td>171</td>
<td>A Major</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

BIBLIOGRAPHY


SOURCES UNAVAILABLE FOR RESEARCH


