INFORMATION TO USERS

This reproduction was made from a copy of a document sent to us for microfilming. While the most advanced technology has been used to photograph and reproduce this document, the quality of the reproduction is heavily dependent upon the quality of the material submitted.

The following explanation of techniques is provided to help clarify markings or notations which may appear on this reproduction.

1. The sign or “target” for pages apparently lacking from the document photographed is “Missing Page(s)”. If it was possible to obtain the missing page(s) or section, they are spliced into the film along with adjacent pages. This may have necessitated cutting through an image and duplicating adjacent pages to assure complete continuity.

2. When an image on the film is obliterated with a round black mark, it is an indication of either blurred copy because of movement during exposure, duplicate copy, or copyrighted materials that should not have been filmed. For blurred pages, a good image of the page can be found in the adjacent frame. If copyrighted materials were deleted, a target note will appear listing the pages in the adjacent frame.

3. When a map, drawing or chart, etc., is part of the material being photographed, a definite method of “sectioning” the material has been followed. It is customary to begin filming at the upper left hand corner of a large sheet and to continue from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. If necessary, sectioning is continued again—beginning below the first row and continuing on until complete.

4. For illustrations that cannot be satisfactorily reproduced by xerographic means, photographic prints can be purchased at additional cost and inserted into your xerographic copy. These prints are available upon request from the Dissertations Customer Services Department.

5. Some pages in any document may have indistinct print. In all cases the best available copy has been filmed.
The early Biblical landscapes of Thomas Cole (1825–1829)

Menefee, Ellen Avitts, M.A.
Rice University, 1987

Copyright ©1987 by Menefee, Ellen Avitts. All rights reserved.
PLEASE NOTE:

In all cases this material has been filmed in the best possible way from the available copy. Problems encountered with this document have been identified here with a check mark √.

1. Glossy photographs or pages √
2. Colored illustrations, paper or print
3. Photographs with dark background √
4. Illustrations are poor copy √
5. Pages with black marks, not original copy
6. Print shows through as there is text on both sides of page
7. Indistinct, broken or small print on several pages
8. Print exceeds margin requirements
9. Tightly bound copy with print lost in spine
10. Computer printout pages with indistinct print
11. Page(s) _________ lacking when material received, and not available from school or author.
12. Page(s) _________ seem to be missing in numbering only as text follows.
13. Two pages numbered _______. Text follows.
14. Curling and wrinkled pages
15. Dissertation contains pages with print at a slant, filmed as received
16. Other ____________________________________________
    ____________________________________________

University
Microfilms
International
RICE UNIVERSITY

THE EARLY BIBLICAL LANDSCAPES OF THOMAS COLE (1825-1829)

by

ELLEN AVITTS MENEFEE

A THESIS SUBMITTED
IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE
REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE

MASTER OF ARTS

APPROVED, THESIS COMMITTEE:

[Signatures of committee members]

Houston, Texas

May, 1987
THE EARLY BIBLICAL LANDSCAPES OF THOMAS COLE (1827-1829)

Ellen Avitts Menefee

ABSTRACT

Between 1825 and 1848 Thomas Cole produced many imaginary views based on literary, allegorical and religious themes. Historical landscapes of traditional religious subjects represent a small but significant element in the artist's oeuvre. Cole's early Biblical landscapes (those painted before the artist traveled to Europe) are significant indicators of the transitional character of Cole's work as he attempted to Americanize traditional European precepts of art. In them, Cole reveals an alliance with European art theory, adapted to produce didactic landscape paintings intended as a testimony to the power and majesty of God with man's relationship to God as the central focus. Cole combined American scenery with historical subjects which would be familiar to all - those extracted from the Bible. Subject matter is an essential clue in understanding the artist's intent. His work was a response to the zeitgeist of nineteenth century America.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to thank Dr. John S. Hallam for his assistance in establishing the original scope of this work and for providing ongoing suggestions for direction and refinement. His knowledge and sincere interest in this study helped sustain the initial enthusiasm with which it was begun. My thanks also to the members of my committee, Dr. William Camfield and Dr. Roger Ulrich for their helpful suggestions regarding my approach to certain aspects of this work.

I would also like to thank the members of my family for their patient understanding of the amount of time this project involved. My parents, Mr. and Mrs. Luther A. Avitts, Jr. deserve mention for their continued encouragement and support throughout this undertaking. My husband Tom I thank for his patience, continued emotional support and insightful suggestions.

Finally, I must give special recognition to Dr. Danuta Batorska, whose love of the arts and confidence in my abilities, provided the impetus necessary to begin that process of which this study is the culmination.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Illustrations ........................................ page V
Introduction .................................................. 1

Chapter

I. St. John in the Wilderness ............................... 8

II. The Garden of Eden and Expulsion From the Garden of Eden .......... 33

III. The Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge .......... 74

IV. Hagar in the Wilderness ............................... 89

V. Cole's Biblical Landscapes, 1829-1848 .............. 98

Bibliography ................................................ 106

Illustrations ................................................ 114
# ILLUSTRATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, Landscape, Composition, St. John in the Wilderness, 1827</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for Landscape, Composition, St. John in the Wilderness</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, Landscape, Composition, St. John in the Wilderness, Detail</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, Sunny Morning on the Hudson, 1827</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>After Salvator Rosa, St. John Preaching in the Wilderness. Engraving by John Brown, drawn by Richard Earlom, 1768</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Claude Lorrain, Landscape with Christ Preaching on Mt. Tabor, 1656</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>John Martin, The Bard, 1817</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>After Fransesco Zucarilli, John in the Wilderness. Engraving.</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, Landscape, Composition, St. John in the Wilderness, Detail</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, Landscape, Scene From 'The Last of the Mohicans', 1827</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, botanical sketch; Hollyhock</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, The Voyage of Life, Childhood, 1839-40</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>After Domenichino, Death of Hyacinthus. Engraving by Dominico Cunego, 1771</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, The Expulsion From the Garden of Eden, 1827-28</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, 'Scale of Colours for the Expulsion', preliminary sketch, c. 1827</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for Expulsion From the Garden of Eden</td>
<td>129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for Expulsion From the Garden of Eden</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, Expulsion - Moon and Firelight, c. 1827</td>
<td>131</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, Evening in Arcadia, 1843</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>John Martin, The Bridge of Chaos, published 1827</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Engraving after a Landscape by Salvator Rosa</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>John Martin, The Expulsion of Adam and Eve, published 1827</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, The Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge, 1829</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, View of the Moon, c. 1827</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, Kaaterskill Falls, 1825</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>John Martin, The Deluge, 1828</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>John Martin, Sadak in Search of the Waters of Oblivion, 1812</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Nicolas Poussin, Winter, 1660-64</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, Lake with Dead Trees, 1825</td>
<td>138</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, American Lake Scene, 1844</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, The Course of Empire, Desolation, 1836</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for <em>Hagar in the Wilderness</em></td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for <em>Hagar in the Wilderness</em></td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for <em>Hagar in the Wilderness</em></td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for <em>Hagar in the Wilderness</em></td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40.</td>
<td>Claude Lorrain, <em>Landscape with Angel Appearing to Hagar, 1668</em></td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, sketch after Claude Lorrain's <em>Landscape with Angel Appearing to Hagar</em></td>
<td>143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, <em>The Dead Abel, 1832</em></td>
<td>144</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, <em>'The Death of Abel', preliminary sketch</em></td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44.</td>
<td><em>Illustration to Canto IV, line 362, Salomon Gessner's The Death of Abel, trans. W. C. Oulton 1817</em></td>
<td>146</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45.</td>
<td>Thomas Cole, <em>The Angel Appearing to the Shepherds, 1834</em></td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
New two paintings. Left: *The Tempter.*  
Right: *Angels Ministering to Christ.* | 147  |
| 47.    | Thomas Cole, *The Lord is My Shepherd, 1848*                               | 148  |
INTRODUCTION

Thomas Cole (1801-1848) was one of the most admired artists of his day, recognized by his contemporaries as a leader in the development of a uniquely American art. His early biographers, most notably Louis LeGrand Noble in his 1853 study, praised his transcriptions of the nation's scenery and bestowed upon Cole the mantle of a 'truly American artist'.

Cole's first recognition in 1825 came at a time when America was clamoring for indications of the young nation's uniqueness and superiority. His early landscape paintings established him as a leader in the development of 'American' imagery. The reader of Cole's biographies will be struck by the emphasis placed upon the artist's nationalistic fervor. The fact that Cole was born in England and remained there until he was seventeen years of age was awkwardly reconciled by Cole's biographers in an attempt to focus on Cole's devotion to America. Similarly, his trips to Europe, from 1829 to 1832 and 1841 to 1842, were either downplayed or construed by the artist's partisans to be indicators of an ultimate loyalty to the new nation.

Cole's work, however, reveals a general alliance with European art theory based on the principles of Ideal Beauty and the prominence of history painting. His aspirations were not confined by national loyalties, which it now appears were not as emphatic as Cole's biographers wished
their audience to believe. More recent considerations of Cole's work have made this clear; the young artist was imbued with precepts of conventional English art theory which influenced his art throughout his career.

Modern studies of Cole focus on the topographical landscapes, such as Lake with Dead Trees and Kaaterskill Falls, which initially established his reputation, and upon the artist's later, more imaginative epic works, The Course of Empire and The Voyage of Life. Another, equally important aspect of Cole's oeuvre has, however, been overlooked - Cole's Biblical landscapes. This thesis proposes to examine Cole's Biblical landscapes painted between 1825 and 1829. Biblical landscapes in this context refer to those paintings depicting Biblical scenes or characters in which the landscape dominates the composition. Cole's other religious works, those of a more moralizing nature, such as Cross and the World, are beyond the scope of this study since they are not based directly on scripture. Biblical landscapes completed prior to Cole's first trip abroad will be considered. Focus on these early works will establish Cole's alliance with European theory and practice prior to a direct influence of European art. The paintings will be analyzed as indicators of the transitional character of Cole's work as he attempted to Americanize traditional European precepts of art. Cole's writings will be considered, as will contemporary response to each work.
Visual and literary sources will be proposed to establish influences on the artist's approach; discrepancies or adherence to these sources will be determined. Cole's purpose in producing such overtly religious works in a nation which for all practical purposes disallowed traditional religious imagery will also be examined. The early Biblical landscapes are major works within Cole's oeuvre through which he tested and expounded his evolving theology. The artist's later Biblical landscapes, those completed after he left for Europe, will be briefly considered in the final chapter of this study.

The emphasis in Cole's work moved from topographical to historical landscapes and later to moralizing epic works, though much overlap and continuance of various modes of representation is found throughout his career. The focus of this thesis will be an analysis of his early historical landscape period.

Cole did not make so great a distinction between landscape and religious themes as did his critics. For him, there was a blurring of the European based demarcations. The two were linked by his belief in the function of art to educate, elevate, and morally instruct the viewer. Moralism, whether presented through Biblical landscapes or secularized parable is the central focus of Thomas Cole's work. He directly confronted the societal consciousness of his day, expounding on it, responding to it and often
attempting to alter it. In his Biblical landscapes Cole combines his love of unspoiled nature with his religiosity; the land is invigorated by the spirit. For Cole, as for society in general, nature was a testimony to the majesty of God. Yet subject matter is an essential clue to an understanding of the artist's intent. To reach his audience and to attain a higher status in his profession, Cole combined American scenery with historical subjects which would be familiar to all—those extracted from the Bible.

Cole's earliest known Biblical themes, Belshazzar's Feast and Ruth Gleaning in the Field of Boaz, were executed in late 1822 or early 1823 while Cole resided in Steubenville, Ohio. The paintings were intended as partial payment of a debt owed a friend in nearby Zanesville, but unfortunately they were destroyed by two young boys who vandalized the artist's room. It is not known whether these works were Biblical landscapes, but their subject matter does reveal Cole's early interest in Biblical imagery.

The feast of Belshazzar would, in deference to the Biblical text, require an interior scene and a great number of figures. Cole's choice of the subject, however, suggests a knowledge of the works of the more noted artists of the day. John Martin, Benjamin West, and Washington Allston, all treated the theme of Belshazzar. Their success and notoriety lead many American artist of Cole's era to attempt
paintings of Biblical themes. 4

Ruth Gleaning in the Field of Boaz would more naturally lend itself to a landscape scene. The choice of subject matter also suggests a familiarity, through engravings, with Poussin's celebrated Summer, representing Ruth and Boaz. 5 Such a connection would establish an early grounding in the principles of English art theory of the eighteenth century which looked to Poussin, Claude, and Salvator Rosa for compositional models. Seen in conjunction with his other works of this time, it appears Cole's primary interest at the outset of his career lay in the production of historical works. Cole's early ambition was to be recognized as a history painter, traditionally accepted as the highest level to which an artist could aspire. 6 With the possible exception of Ruth Gleaning in the Field of Boaz, there is little evidence of his attempt at this time to combine historical subject matter and landscape painting. Only later does he come to focus on Biblical landscapes.

A Christ Crowned with Thorns and Mocked by Thomas Cole was exhibited at the Pennsylvania Academy in 1825. The same painting was exhibited at the Academy again in 1827 and 1828 as Ecco Homo, after Mingardi. 7 It is uncertain whether the painting, now lost, was predominantly a landscape scene, though the subject renders it improbable.

2. Ibid., p. 22.

These two works, along with a landscape, were intended to be sent to William A. Adams in lieu of monetary payment of a $35.00 debt incurred by Cole during his unsuccessful attempt as an itinerant portrait painter. Ibid., p. 18.


West's painting was also written about extensively. It is probable that Cole was indirectly familiar with this work, and could possibly have been familiar with one or more of the engravings, though there is no indication of this. West's work is composed of large figures within a shallow interior space.

John Martin's Belshazzar's Feast was painted in 1820, though not published as a mezzotint until 1826. The initial painting was well received in England where it was exhibited at the British Institution in 1821, and accounts of its success were widely published. Martin's work is primarily a massive architectural scene, scattered with a multitude of small figures. See William H. Gerdt and Theodore E. Stebbins, A Man of Genius: The Art of Washington Allston (1779-1843). (Boston, Museum of Fine Arts, Boston, 1979), p. 127.

Washington Allston began his painting of this subject in 1817 while in England. Inspired by the success of Martin's work, Allston altered his yet unfinished composition. He worked on it sporadically for the remaining twenty-six years of his life. During its initial stages, the work was favorably reported on by the American press, through which Cole could have followed its early progress and successful reception. Allston's work, 16' x 12', consisted of large figures within an architectural setting.

Joseph Wright of Derby is known to have completed a Picture of Belshazzar at the Feast when the Hand appeared writing on ye. wall. Little is known of this work, though it was apparently among the artist's holdings 1771-73. Its
present location is unknown.

Belshazzar's feast was also of popular literary interest. Cole, a voracious reader, would have been familiar with some of these expositions. Byron, among Cole's favorite poets, published his Vision of Belshazzar in 1815, and To Belshazzar in 1814.

4. William Dunlap's Christ Rejected, 1822 was based on a written description of West's painting of the same theme. Dunlap's Death on a Pale Horse was also based on West's work.

Joseph Steward of Connecticut, d. 1822, painted a Belshazzar's Feast which covered ninety square feet of canvas and contained fourteen figures. See Gerdts and Stebbins, op. cit., p. 127.


5. Poussin's Summer was engraved by Jean Pesne (1623-1700).


The Mingardi referred to could have been Francesco (d. 1812) or his brother, Giovanni Battista (1738-1796). Both were painters and engravers.
Behold, I send my messenger before thy face, 
which shall prepare thy way before thee. 
The voice of one crying in the wilderness, 
Prepare ye the way of the Lord, make his 
paths straight. Mark 1: 2-3

CHAPTER 1

ST. JOHN IN THE WILDERNESS

Landscape, Composition, St. John in the Wilderness of 1827 is Cole's earliest known Biblical landscape (fig. 1). The painting was purchased by Daniel Wadsworth, a friend and patron of the artist, and remained in his collection until 1848, at which time it was bequeathed to the newly founded Wadsworth Atheneum in Hartford.¹

St. John in the Wilderness is first referred to in the artist's correspondence in November of 1827 when, in a letter from Daniel Wadsworth to Cole, mention is made of having a frame made for "John the Baptist".² Wadsworth apparently purchased St. John in the Wilderness soon after its exhibition at the National Academy of Design in 1827.³

In a letter dated 5 December 1827, the day following Wadsworth's acknowledgement regarding the price of St. John, Robert Gilmor, Jr., a prominent Baltimore art collector and patron, wrote to Cole:

I had taken up my pen this morning for the express purpose of inquiring after my pictures, which had been so long delayed, and especially the St. John in the Wilderness which I had agreed to receive as one of them, and which you promised to send after you had done something that we had thought it wanted. (I saw it in the Catalogue of the Academy as one of the pictures
exhibited, and not hearing further from you presumed you had detained it till the exhibition was over) ... As it was a picture I saw and liked, I considered I rendered you a service by taking it as one of mine which you were to paint, and have ever since considered it as mine, & spoken of it as such to those who I thought had seen it at the exhibition.  

The artist, it seems, had sold a painting to Mr. Wadsworth which had been promised to Mr. Gilmor as one of a group of paintings commissioned in 1826. Upon receipt of Gilmor's letter regarding the delay in delivery of St. John, Cole's only recourse was to plead forgetfulness.

The debate over monetary issues woven throughout the correspondence between Cole and Gilmor suggests that Cole's forgetfulness was directly related to the artist's financial considerations. And though Mr. Gilmor readily accepted Cole's explanation, the gentlemen's debate continued unresolved in subsequent correspondence. Anticipating a favorable reception of his work at the National Academy of Design exhibition, it appears that Cole disavowed his verbal contract with Mr. Gilmor in hope of receiving double the agreed upon amount for this particular painting.

Unfortunately for the artist, his hopes were not realized. Though Cole's works were by this time in greater demand, St. John did not sell at the exhibition and Cole settled for a financial compromise; the work went to Daniel Wadsworth for $75.00 soon after the exhibition closed.

A sketch, previously overlooked in discussions of this work (though inscribed at the top 'St. John in the
Wilderness'), is found in Cole's 1827 sketchbook (fig. 2). The final work differs in many significant details from the preliminary sketch, though the initial compositional format is maintained. In his sketch Cole places St. John, the sole figure within the landscape, at the center of the composition, holding a cross in his left hand. The figure stands, arms extended, upon a promontory in the middle distance, surrounded by high mountain peaks and steep precipices. Shading indicates the artist's intention to focus on this central scene by obscuring the surrounding area with shadow. The foreground and the ledge on which St. John stands is covered with foliage. Cole created a more compact and focused scene in the final painting through strong chiaroscuro and slight changes in compositional arrangement. And in the inclusion of elements not found in the initial sketch, the artist has significantly altered the meaning of the work.

Utilizing a multi-episodic format, Cole includes in the lower right of the final composition an inconspicuous but powerful scene of the flight into Egypt (fig. 3). To the right of this scene are three figures, barely visible in the edge of the shadows. Associations are immediately made with the wise men from the East seeking the new born Christ. These elements, overlooked in prior considerations, of St. John are central to an understanding of the artist's purpose. Cole offers, in St. John in the Wilderness, a
narrative of the birth, life, death, and resurrection of Christ. Through dramatic lighting effects the artist carries the eye from the scenes in the lower right of the composition, relating to the birth and early life of Christ, to the figure of St. John and the cross, elements associated with Christ's baptism and crucifixion. The path of the mist, also a path of light, curves back toward the center of the canvas where it terminates in a burst of light, a conventional symbol of God. The figure of John activates this movement, a symbolization of the resurrection and ascension of Christ, the 'Light of the world'. Cole's interest in a multi-episodic format is soon carried to the production of pendant works and multiple canvases, through which Cole felt he could more readily express the concept of contrasts implicit in his earliest works.

The Colean sublime, fully developed in *St. John*, is first seen, though not assimilated, in earlier, pure landscapes such as *Snow Squall, Winter Landscape in the Catskills* (c. 1825-26) and *Sunrise in the Catskill Mountains* (1826).\(^1\) Cole's compositional formula is characterized by ascending forms massed along a series of overlapping diagonals, extreme spatial depth, and a foreground or middleground promontory which anchors the composition. A large center peak is typically separated from the foreground by a seemingly bottomless abyss. The background characteristically contains an area of threatening sky which
opens to a scene of calm in the distance. The underlying diagonal compositional format overrides any stabilizing foreground horizontal and activates the canvas, forcing movement through the potentially threatening landscape. Often, as in St. John, the immediate foreground is omitted and the point of view raised, forcing the viewer to hover precariously above the scene, denied a means of access into the pictorial space. Some areas of the painted surface are rich in intricate detail, while others remain dark, vague and difficult to read, creating a sense of mystery within the work. This tendency diminishes in Cole's later and more refined works which exhibit a greater uniformity of surface.

The middle distance promontory seen in St. John is an element often present in Cole's work of this era. It is central to his Sunny Morning on the Hudson, painted in the same year as St. John (fig. 4). It is also present in Gelyna (1826), View Near Ticonderoga (1826), Corroway (Chocorua) Peak, N.H. (c. 1827, now lost), and with somewhat lesser emphasis in Sunrise in the Catskill Mountains (1826). St. John in the Wilderness is a significant departure from Cole's earlier transcriptions of Catskill Mountain scenery, though they too are spiritualized landscapes, intended to arouse associations of Divine grandeur and transport the spectator into the presence of God. Based on
sketches of American scenery from which he selected elements deemed appropriate for the composition, Cole presents in St. John America's wilderness transformed; transformed to equal the grand idea of the Biblical subject. A comparison with his earlier works shows a move toward a more choreographed, more idealized nature. A unification through contrast is sought and attained through the utilization of a binary relationship between man and nature. The landscape overwhelms, engulfs, and establishes a context for the figures, emphasizing man's insignificance in the presence of nature's power and majesty. The concept of contrast is reinforced through the use of strong chiaroscuro and reiterated in the steep cliffs and narrow valleys of Cole's chosen nature.

_Landscape, Composition, St. John in the Wilderness_ is first an American landscape scene, and second a Biblical narrative. The Biblical landscapes that followed it were not. The artist, influenced by contemporary thought of a new and developing American culture, attempted to tie Biblical history to the American scene through the invention of specifically American associations. Cole transported St. John to the American wilderness, which he felt was an appropriately majestic setting for the narrative. _St. John_ is the earliest example of this attempted conflation. Cole stated in his 1835 _Essay on American Scenery_,

...the good, the enlightened of all ages and nations, have found pleasure and consolation in the beauty of
rural earth. Prophets of old retired into the
solitudes of nature to wait the inspiration of heaven.
It was on Mount Horeb that Elijah witnessed the mighty
wind, the earthquake, and the fire; and heard the
'still small voice' - that voice is YET heard among the
mountains! St. John preached in the desert; the
wilderness is YET a fitting place to speak of God.15

In light of his background as a youth in industrialized
England, Cole considered America's wilderness man's last
hope. This belief is symbolized in St. John in the
Wilderness. It exhibits the artist's desire to emulate the
precepts of European art theory while maintaining his
attachment to the American landscape.16 Unfortunately for
the artist, the American public was entrenched in a
tradition highly suspect of overtly religious art. While
Cole aspired to the revival of religious art, Protestant
America preferred sentimentality and moral didacticism.17
Cole's later works exhibit a movement away from attempts at
traditional religious imagery toward a more personal
expression of religious edification and instruction.18 His
eyearly convictions, however, remained essentially unaltered.

Cole's early works such as St. John demonstrate a
combination of natural observation, romantic feeling, and
assimilation of a variety of pictorial and literary
influences. All elements presented in St. John in the
Wilderness are gleaned from nature and synthesized to form a
landscape composition within a religious context. Working
from sketches, from which he would "make selections and
combine them, and so have nature for every object that he
paints", the artist sought proper pictorial embodiment for his chosen message. Elements were chosen to envelope idea within form. For Cole the spiritualized meaning of the work was inherent within the landscape. Accessibility by the observer, however, remained dependent upon the inclusion of a supportive narrative. The figures are an essential subtext. "Ever faithful to the scenes external to himself, ever true to the spirit and the forms of beauty everywhere before his sight, he wished his canvas at the same moment to speak a language eloquent of God, and man, and human life."20

The underlying framework of Cole's composition suggests a dependence on Salvator Rosa, whose works Cole knew as early as 1820 through engravings in a book loaned to him by an itinerant portrait painter.21 Rosa produced a number of paintings dealing specifically with the subject of St. John. At least one of these works, St. John Preaching in the Wilderness, was engraved by 1768 (fig. 5).22 In this composition, St. John stands upon a rock outcropping, separated from the gathered crowd, gesturing with his left hand while holding a cross in the right. The painting is a traditional representation of the subject and similar in concept to Cole's work. Cole's composition, though further removed from the figures and with the artist's characteristic emphasis on the landscape, exhibits a dependence on Rosa's presentation of the subject. The
artists' renditions of the wilderness environment are similar in the mountainous terrain, expressiveness of nature and prominent rock outcroppings.

Another artist of the seventeenth century, Claude Lorrain, painted *Landscape with Christ Preaching on Mount Tabor* (1656) (fig. 6). An engraving after this work by W. Hazlitt from 1821 suggests possible influence on Cole's *St. John*. Claude's work is an attempt at topographical fidelity, recreating in a compressed state, the exact historic site of the event depicted. By comparison, Cole exhibits a lack of concern with the topography of the Holy Land, since his is an American wilderness. In Claude's composition Christ stands upon the mount, placed in the middle distance, at the approximate center of the canvas. He is surrounded by a large gathering of which, as in Rosa's work, the observer becomes a part. Claude's composition is dominated, like Cole's *St. John*, not by the Biblical protagonist, but by the mount; the landscape becomes the focus of a spiritual event. In its general structure and concept, Cole's work reveals an indebtedness to Claude. In this work, and in Rosa's expressive landscapes, Cole found the beginnings of the romantic concept of a responsive, spiritualized nature which became central to his work. It is their work which is most often cited in discussions of Cole's sources.

Claude and Rosa's influence permeates English landscape
painting of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century. Cole often looked to the works of contemporary artists also influenced by their work. Matthew Baigell suggests that Cole's model for the figure of John and the rock outcropping on which he stands is found in John Martin's *The Bard* (1817), though Cole's familiarity with this work by 1826-27 is doubtful since Martin's painting was not engraved (fig. 7). Baigell has also proposed Claude Joseph Vernet's *Storm* (1787), and Philip James de Loutherbourg's *Avalanche in the Alps* (1803) as sources for Cole's characteristic rock outcropping seen in *St. John*. Considering Cole's British background and his early interest in art, it is possible that he would have been familiar with these works. They are, however, exemplary of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth-century portrayal of the sublime in nature. Therefore, a specific source for such general effects is difficult to identify and remains speculative. Cole could as readily have been familiar with similar works by a variety of European artists of the period. J.M.W. Turner's *The Fall of an Avalanche in the Grisons* (1810), and Richard Wilson's *The Destruction of the Children of Niobe* (c. 1759-60) are also similar in their sublime nature as well as in certain individual details.

As Cole choose the elements of his compositions from various sketches, so he apparently choose his style, borrowing appropriate motifs and assimilating a variety of
artistic conventions.28 Other possible sources for St. John in the Wilderness must be considered in addition to those discussed above.

Cole owned a print after Francesco Zucarelli's John in the Wilderness which presents John, raised upon a promontory with cross staff in hand, speaking to the masses (fig. 8).29 Though it is not known at what date this print became a part of the artist's collection, such representations are part of a long tradition with which Cole would have been familiar. Works of this nature were produced as early as the sixteenth century, as seen in Veronese's St. Anthony Preaching to the Fishes and Lorenzo Lotto's St. Jerome.30 The Zucarelli differs from Cole's work in that it is a history painting, with figures dominating the foreground plane. Yet the works contain significant similarities. In Zucarelli's composition, as in Rosa's, St. John stands on a rock outcropping, raised above the gathered crowd. Gesturing with both hands, a cross staff rests against his right shoulder. Cole has lifted this traditional representation and set it within his sublime landscape (fig. 9). Further, he has separated John from the cross, perhaps in response to the work of Richard Wilson.

Cole's St. John contains many significant affinities to Richard Wilson's White Monk paintings. His most popular and successful effort, Wilson painted over twenty versions of this theme during the 1760's. The White Monk III was
engraved and published as early as 1765 (fig. 10). Cole transforms the serenity and order of Wilson's composition, creating a sublime companion to Wilson's picturesque, while retaining certain elements found in Wilson's more stable design. Both artists place a prominent peak in the middle distance, extending from the edge of the canvas toward the central area of the composition. In each work a figure stands on the bluff, and to the right of that figure a cross is anchored. Silhouetted against the background, the figure and cross are established as the central organizational element in each composition. Wilson's White Monk presents itself as a probable source for Cole's silhouetted figure and cross. Between the observer's space and this promontory exists an abyss. In Wilson's work it is made navigable through the inclusion of a foreground space which allows for entry. A figure on horseback moving into the abyss leads the viewer safely toward the middle distance. Cole transforms the scene into a more threatening confrontation with nature. St. John provides no foreground to secure the viewer, and the abyss, dark and undefined blocks rather than invites entry and passage to the middle distance. While both artists express in their works a concern for moralistic didacticism in art, Wilson provides an example of the harmony to be found in contrasting elements structured by divine providence. Cole delights in focusing on the contrasts themselves. Yet in both works the elements of
nature are the intermediaries of divine communication.

Cole's use of contrasts evidences the impact of the Dissenting tradition. The Dissenting tradition refers to any religious sect not conforming to the doctrine of the Church of England. It was a widespread phenomenon, commonplace in England and America by the late eighteenth century. Focus upon contrasts permeated the literature and art of Dissent and became a "mental habit", a "cultural reflex" for those entrenched in its doctrine. Alan Wallach has established that Bolton-le-moor, Lancashire, England and Chorley, Lancashire, Cole's boyhood homes, were bastions of Dissent. He offers substantial evidence that the artist's ancestor's were adherents of dissenting thought. Obsession with antithesis was part of Cole's inherited world view, an element of the artist's complicated network of influences which came to permeate his work. Through contrast of man and divine power, the emphasis, of the landscape and the subtext of the Biblical narrative, is on the redemptive experience. In Cole's understanding it is the sole allowance for a direct relationship between God and man as established by Christ, an approachable Deity. In his attempt to wed God to a world uniquely American, Cole's St. John incorporates the Biblical narrative with the drama of the landscape experience. Historical references are not employed to elevate the landscape but to reinforce the experience already present in the composition. The
utilization of narrative elements serves to anchor the drama. Cole pragmatically stated, "for it is always my intention to introduce nothing in a picture for which I cannot give a good reason."40 The inclusion of figures, though diminutive in scale, is necessary for an understanding of Cole's St. John in the Wilderness.

Cole exhibited St. John at the National Academy of Design in 1827, along with four landscapes and Landscape, Scene From 'The Last of the Mohicans' which was based upon James Fenimore Cooper's 1826 novel (fig. 11). Cole utilized this popular literary theme to focus on man's futility in attempting to shape destiny.41 St. John in the Wilderness depicts a related theme, a pendant in concept; the power of God to rescue man from his futile struggle. In both works Cole's emphasis is on the spirituality of the moment depicted, expressed through the grandeur of nature which serves to accentuate the helplessness of man. By Burkean standards, however, St. John is the more imaginary and sublime composition; an overt attempt to spiritualize nature.42 The similarity of the two works, combined with the artist's focus in St. John on the sublimities of natural phenomenon, suggests that the religious reference here presented is a reflection of the spirituality of the landscape itself. The historical narrative is contained by the experience of the landscape with which Cole is primarily concerned; it sets the mood and carries the message of the
work. The figures, important in establishing a moment within the narrative, become unified elements of Divine creation. The introduction of figures serves to define the drama of the landscape and to reinforce, through narrative clues, the message Cole finds in nature.

Bryan Jay Wolf, in his application of a psychoanalytic approach to St. John, has extricated the autobiographical nature which he believes is implicit within the work. As a metaphor of the self in nature, the middleground promontory becomes representative of Cole's sense of self, characterized by the detailed groupings of objects which thrust toward the ideal, yet threatening peak, an emblem of permanence and solidity. The ever present abyss symbolizes the gap between desire and actuality. As a vehicle for allowance of accessibility, the inclusion by Cole of a vapor trail becomes important in the development of Cole's personalized nature. Utilized to indicate depth and direction, the vapor also serves to carry the eye of the viewer around the central peak to the calm of the background scenery. The vapor thus becomes, when viewed from this psychoanalytical perspective, a transference of Cole's psychic desire into pictorial terms. The mist is then an emblem, and the summation of Cole's symbolic vocabulary which reveals the message of the painting.

Aside from Wolf's psychoanalytic interpretation, Cole's vapor mist can also be read as a symbol of the descending
spirit of God. It is a transcription from reality, and one which Cole commonly related to the presence of God. He wrote of the Catskills:

... From this rock
The nearest to the sky, let us look out
Upon the earth, as the first swell of day
Is bearing back the duskiness of night.
But lo, a sea of mist o'er all beneath;

............... See! now ascends
The lord of day, waking with heavenly fire
The dormant depths, See how his luminous breath
The rising surges kindles: lo, they heave
Like golden sands upon Sahara's gales.
Those airy forms, dispersing from the mass
Like winged ships sail o'er the marvelous plain.
Beautiful vision! Now the veil is rent,...

The vapor trail becomes a significant element within the Biblical narrative, carrying associations of Divine presence. It is a representation of God extended to man, a translation of the spiritual into spatial terms. As a revelation of divinity and grace, the gap between possibility and desire is filled for the protestant mind. Conversely, the mist can be read as ascending to the heavens; a prefiguration of the translation and ascension of Christ.

The figures echo the drama of nature, verifying what the landscape portrays. They balance the landscape and ultimately become expressive of the landscape experience. The histrionic cruciform stance of St. John, reinforces the concept of vulnerability while pointing to John's status as a prefiguration of Christ. Balanced by the cross this becomes the primary focus the composition, the point from
which and to which all else leads. John, through his message activates the landscapes. The cross, an emblem of God, is placed next to John as a shadow. He gestures toward it in indication of future events. Spotlighted by a 'divine' light, John restates in his stance the form of the cross toward which he gestures, signifying a possible unification of man with God. John becomes a literal transcription of his character and purpose; "a burning and shining light" come "to bear witness of the Light." The seeming vulnerability of the cross, itself a product of nature, is a further reference to the ultimate source of the power of nature over man, a theme which Cole later explores in his epic works. Within the cross symbol resides, for Cole, this ultimate power. John's message becomes Cole's: only through God, rather than self can one find release. Nature is employed to bring man to an understanding of the grandeur of God. Yet inherent within this message is the concept of choice. Decisions of man establish his destiny.

Anthropomorphized, the landscape is, conversely, suggestively human. Man is thus projected onto nature through the symbolizing of natural objects. This is seen most readily in Cole's representation of trees which "spring from some resemblance to the human form." The trees' purpose is symbolic as well as structural. Their strategic placement within the desolate mountain landscape restates the position of the primary figures and reiterates through
symbolization the relationship of John and Christ. In the context of John's purpose, the Biblical text states that "the axe is laid unto the root of the trees; every tree therefore which bringeth not forth good fruit is hewn down, and cast into the fire..."50 Cole's decaying and weather torn trees thus personify significant events of the narrative and assist in the creation of the sublime. The inclusion of the palm tree represents for Cole the exotic, signifying an Americanized representation of Cole's concept of the Holy Land. Cole's utilization of trees as personification suggests a familiarity with the writings of William Gilpin who stated that "they record the history of some storm, some blast of lightning, or other great event, which transfers its grand ideas to the landscape, and, in the representation of elevated subjects, assists the sublime."51 Nature becomes for Cole an embodiment of what he held to be religious truths. He projects these truths onto the landscape through the symbolizing of natural objects as extensions of the human self.

St. John was, according to the Biblical text, a precursor to Christ; a means through which one could "see the salvation of God."52 Cole relies on this traditional understanding of John's purpose, establishing the prophet as an intermediary to God. He effectively becomes 'a voice crying in the wilderness'. Yet for Cole it is not John alone, but all of nature which brings one to an
understanding of God. John serves to literalize the implicit message of the landscape. In his earlier pure landscapes Cole attempted to allow nature to carry the message alone. Here the artist has realized the necessity of anchoring and transmitting such personalized content through the inclusion of narrative. Cole's Biblical landscapes are a natural progression from his earlier paintings of unembellished nature. "His pictures, for a season, were simple reproductions of the scenery with which he was captivated, and then began to speak a language strong, moral and imaginative."53
1. Daniel Wadsworth, a wealthy land owner of Hartford, Connecticut was a patron and lifelong mentor of Thomas Cole.


3. McNulty suggests that St. John was delivered by Cole in July, 1827, when he is known to have visited Hartford. McNulty, loc. cit.

4. Ibid.


6. Cole wrote to Gilmor; ...with respect to the picture of St. John I assure you the promise I made of letting you have it entirely escaped my memory and I hope you will find me excusable when I inform you that on the morning I saw you my mind was harassed and perplexed by several disagreeable occurrences in the family that had just transpired before I saw you. Though my promise was forgotten, I recollect you saying that if it was agreeable to me you would take that picture - you also suggested some alterations which I thought judicious. I know I did not wish you to have the picture, and recollect saying that I would rather paint another composition instead, which I hoped would be better, and I then understood you to be satisfied with that arrangement. Believe me Sir no pecuniary reason, nor any that I did not then state, prevented me from sending the picture to you - and the proof of my sincerity in this respect is the fact that the picture remained in my room unsold, many weeks after it came from the Exhibition and, at a time when my wants were rather pressing.


7. See Letters, Robert Gilmor, Jr. to Thomas Cole, 5 December 1827, Baltimore Museum of Art, Annual II, p. 52. Cole opens his letter of 7 December 1826, quoted above, with an explanation of his and Mr. Gilmor's misunderstanding concerning St. John and follows immediately with a direct defense of his monetary decisions concerning his paintings. See Letters, Thomas Cole to Robert Gilmor, Jr., 7 December


11. Cole's *Sunny Morning on the Hudson River*, a pure landscape painted the same year as *St. John* also exhibits the artist's fully developed 'sublime' formula.

12. Cole's application of the 'Sublime' is in accordance with Edmund Burke's *Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful* published in 1757.

13. Similar rock formations are also employed by the artist in *Italian Landscape* (1839), and *Voyage of Life*. Manhood (1840).


His writings and his paintings also indicate an alliance with the teachings of Sir Joshua Reynolds. Cole likely studied Reynolds' *Discourses*, popular in the early nineteenth century.

18. Wallach believes that Cole's change was a deliberate response to American taste. The artist desired to direct his work to his American audience. See Wallach, op. cit., pp. 106ff.


21. Ibid., p. 12.


24. Ibid., p. 331.

25. John Martin's work was readily available in the United States by 1826-27. The Bard, however, was not among Martin's engraved works, and thus was unavailable to the American public. See Thomas Balston, John Martin 1789-1854: His Life and Works, (London & Southampton, Great Britain: The Camelot Press Ltd., 1947), appendix of works engraved.


27. In a letter from Thomas Cole to Robert Gilmor Jr., dated 25 December 1826 the artist writes, "I cannot think that beautiful landscape of Wilson's in which he has introduced Niobe and children an actual view..."; evidence of his familiarity with this particular work. Baltimore Museum of Art, Annual II, op. cit., p. 47.


Cole's work is analogous with Wilson's in several respects. They often contain a similar point of view. Wilson, in his more 'sublime' works at times incorporates the 'blasted' tree motif and a similar overall compositional format.

28. In a letter to Robert Gilmor Jr., dated 2 January 1827, Cole states "It would give me great pleasure to see your collection of pictures: I have never yet seen a 'fine picture' of any foreign landscape painter..." Cole was

29. The print is now in the collection of the Detroit Institute, Albany. Detroit Institute, Albany, photocopies, Cole's Print Collection, frame 58.

30. Kenneth Clark, Landscape Into Art, (London: John Murray Ltd., 1976), fig. 52, p. 85, fig. 61, p. 98. Chapters One and Three of Clark deal with the development of the type of landscape produced by Cole.

31. Solkin, op. cit., p. 215. According to W. G. Constable the engraved version by James Roberts, published in 1765, was engraved in reverse of Wilson's original composition. Constable believes the 1765 engraving is of a similar version to White Monk III, but one that omits the standing man in the foreground and replaces the round tower with a gabled structure. This version of the work was engraved again in 1818. W. G. Constable, Richard Wilson, (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1953), pp. 228-229.

32. The following analysis deals with Wilson's typical composition for his White Monk series. More individualized renditions do exist, though certain fundamental elements are retained throughout the entire series.

33. Such a transformation is exemplary of Cole's application of Burke's theory of the sublime in which the difference between the Beautiful and the Sublime is in part dependent upon access to (Beautiful) or blockage from (Sublime) the pictorial space.

34. Dissent, though its followers were greatly persecuted, began to grow as an institution in the 17th century. By the early 18th century it was tolerated. The late 18th and early 19th century saw it as an accepted alternative. Wallach, op. cit., pp. 114ff.

35. Wallach's terminology. Ibid.

36. Ibid.

37. For establishment of Cole's relation to the Dissenting tradition see Wallach. Ibid.
38. The concept of contrast became a preoccupation of Cole's as evidenced in his Departure and Return, Past and Present, The Course of Empire, Voyage of Life, and Cross in the World.

39. Repentence, conversion and salvation (redemption) were central themes of Dissent. See Wallach, op. cit., p. 179.


41. In the 1827 exhibition catalogue the following passage from Cooper's text was quoted: "Woman," he said, "choose! the wigwam or the knife of Le Subtil!" Cora regarded him not; but dropping on her knees, with a rich glow suffusing itself over her features, she raised her eyes and stretched her arms toward heaven, saying in a meek and yet confiding voice - "I am thine! do with me as thou seest best!" - But Cora neither heard nor headed his demand. The form of the Huron trembled in every fibre, and he raised his arm on high, but dropped it again, with a wild and bewildered air, like one who doubted. Once more he struggled with himself and lifted his keen weapon again - but a piercing cry was heard from above them, and Uncas appeared, leaping frantically from a fearful height, upon the ledge. - Last of the Mohicans, Vol. II, p. 266.


Bryan Jay Wolf is an associate professor of American studies and English, Yale University. His 1977 PhD dissertation, Yale University, contains a thorough post-mortem psychoanalytical evaluation of Cole.

In his study, Wolf applies the methodology of semiotics, Lacanian psychoanalysis and Freudian psychoanalysis to Cole's paintings. Though his approach offers new insights into the artist's work, Wolf tends to apply a twentieth century humanistic consciousness to the products of a nineteenth century Christian artist. What is
revealed is more often the philosophy of Wolf than the subconcious cultural concerns of Cole.


44. Ibid., p. 204.


46. See Wolf, op. cit., p. 204.

47. See Wolf, op. cit., p. 225.


49. In a notebook entry concerning the character of trees Cole wrote, "They spring from some resemblance to the human form. There is an expression of affection in intertwining branches; - of despondency in the drooping willow." Noble, op. cit., p. 41.


Therefore the Lord God sent him forth from the Garden of Eden, to till the ground from whence he was taken. So he drove out the man; and he placed at the east of the garden of Eden Cherubim, and a flaming sword which turned every way to keep the way of the tree of life. Genesis 3: 23-24

CHAPTER II

THE GARDEN OF EDEN and EXPULSION FROM THE GARDEN OF EDEN

In late 1827 and early 1828 Cole produced the first of his serial paintings, The Garden of Eden, A Composition and Expulsion From the Garden of Eden. These works represent an expansion on the theme of man's relation to God seen in St. John in the Wilderness. The subjects allow for a more explicit representation of the contrasts on which Cole's work characteristically depends. Dualities found in St. John have become more emphatic.

The Garden of Eden is known only through the artist's written descriptions, preliminary sketches, and an engraving after Cole's work by James Smillie (fig. 12). Cole's earliest mention of the subject, in his 1827 sketchbook, offers an initial description of the proposed work; "Garden of Eden, High mountains the highest with a cloud - middle distance lake [illegible] Promontories with woods - cliffs - nearer Plains with [remainder of description too faint to read clearly]."

The subsequent development of the theme can be followed
in a letter to Daniel Wadsworth dated 26 November 1827;

I am now painting in imagination a scene which I intend embodying on canvass for the next Exhibition - The subject is an extremely arduous one, and I am afraid that my strength in the Art will be but weakness in this attempt - The Garden of Eden is the subject - The Scene as it exists in my minds eye, is very beautiful, (as our own creations generally are) much more beautiful I know, than my art can realize; there is a heavenly atmosphere in the pictures of the imagination; there is too much of Earth in paint and canvas - If I had time I should indulge myself in attempting to describe the scene I have imagined; but can now only say that there are in it lofty distant Mountains, a calm expansve lake, wooded bays, rocky promontories - a solitary island, undulating grounds, a meandering river, cascades, gentle lawns, groups of noble trees of various kinds, umbrageous recesses, a crystal rill with bed of brilliant marble, golden sands, pebbles of every dye - banks of beauteous flowers, fruits, harmless and graceful animals &c &c - I am sure I have fatigued you - but I must say that our first parents shall not be forgotten they are on the flowery threshold of their bower, watching the glorious sun, rise from his eastern couch -.3

In this description of a picturesque scene Cole reveals his primary source of inspiration. His choice of wording relates directly to Milton's *Paradise Lost.*4 The basis for Milton's extended elaboration is the Biblical account of Eden's garden;

And the Lord God planted a garden eastward in Eden; and there he put man whom he had formed. And out of the ground made the Lord God to grow every tree that is pleasant to the sight, and good for food; the tree of life also in the midst of the garden, and the tree of Knowledge of Good and evil. And a river went out of Eden to water the garden; ... And the Lord took the man, and put him into the garden of Eden to dress it and to keep it.5

Inspired by Milton, Cole transforms this Paradise into pictorial equivalents ultimately dependent upon a complex intermingling of varied sources. As the artist stated in
reference to The Garden of Eden and Expulsion From the
Garden of Eden, "the labour and study have been great".6

Paradise, Adam and Eve, and the Expulsion were popular
literary themes of the late eighteenth century. Impetus for
Cole's subject could by found in a variety of literary
works. Lord Byron's Cain: A Mystery, published in 1821 and
Salomon Gessner's The Death of Abel, translated into English
in 1778, were widely read dramatizations of the Biblical
theme.7 Though focusing on man after the fall, both contain
descriptions of an earlier earthly Paradise.8 Gessner's
work also presents an elaborate rendition of the expulsion
of Adam and Eve.

A verbal reconstruction of the final work is offered by
William Cullen Bryant in his funeral oration for Cole,
delivered in 1848;

In this work he attempted what was almost beyond the
power of the pencil, a representation of the bloom and
brightness which poets attribute to the abode of man in
a state of innocence. In the distance were gleaming
waters, and winding valleys, and bowers on the gentle
slopes of the hills; but nearer, in the foreground, the
painter has lavished upon the garden a profusion of
bloom and hidden the banks, and oppressed the shrubs
with a weight of 'flowers of all hues' as Milton calls
these ornaments of his Paradise.9

Two preliminary drawings for The Garden of Eden exist
(figs. 13-14).10 Smillie's engraving exhibits close
adherence to the sketches, with only slight modifications.
A distant mountain with a waterfall and lake at its base,
only faintly visible in one of the initial sketches, becomes
a more prominent element within the final work. It encloses
the composition, establishing a contained environment for Eden's inhabitants.\textsuperscript{11} The waterfall, placed at the exact center of the canvas, falls to the lake in the center of the composition. Structurally it leads the eye toward the middle distance, to the 'bowers of Eden' where Adam and Eve reside. For Cole, water was a "component without which every landscape is defective."\textsuperscript{12} He considered it a "most expressive feature", with power to strongly effect the mind and emotions of man. The waterfall is a characteristic motif of Cole's early Biblical landscapes.\textsuperscript{13} It "presents to the mind the beautiful, but apparently incongruous idea, of fixedness & motion - a single instance in which we perceive unceasing change and everlasting duration. The waterfall may be called the voice of the landscape."\textsuperscript{14} The concept of 'unceasing change and everlasting duration' underlies the artist's perception of nature's fundamental character. Concerning lakes, Cole wrote, "Emerging in the primitive forest, and sometimes overshadowed by huge mountains, they are the chosen places of tranquility."\textsuperscript{15} In such a statement lies the essence of Cole's representation of the Garden of Eden; pastoral and tranquil nature in harmony with God. The motif is repeated in the gentle flowing brook in the foreground.

Cole found inspiration in the mountains of New Hampshire where "rock, wood, and water, brooded the spirit of repose, and the silent energy of nature stirred the soul
to its inmost depth." Yet American scenery alone cannot account for the artist's representation of the Garden. It contains elements unique to Cole's oeuvre. Cole's trip in 1820 to St. Eustatius in the West Indies, not before considered in relation to the artist's later work, was important in the artist's initial conception of The Garden of Eden. During this trip Cole produced "a copy of a view of St. Eustatia" and presumably kept a pictorial record of his experience through copious sketches. Though Cole never mention this trip or its effect upon his work in his writings, it is certain that the experience had a lasting influence upon him, and it is apparent that the elements presented in The Garden of Eden more closely relate to the lush 'flowery luxuriance' of the tropics than to any American mountain scenery. According to Noble, St. Eustatius created in the artist associations of Paradise.

The 'profusion of bloom' alluded to by Bryant and evidenced in Smillie's engraving and in the artist's sketches indicates a composition more detailed than is characteristic of Cole's work of this period. His interest in the rendering of plant life, carried to excess in this work, is verified by the numerous botanical studies scattered throughout his sketchbooks (fig. 15). As all elements within Cole's paintings, the overabundance of detail in The Garden of Eden was not without purpose. Cole wrote in his notebook of 1829, "In subjects of quiet
character it is proper, it appears to me, to introduce much detail... the eye delights in the minute..."  

Cole believed that detail should be subservient and "ministerative to the one effect," but never neglected. In such statements the artist reveals an adherence to the esthetics of Sir Joshua Reynolds who believed that the landscape artist "like the poet... makes the elements sympathize with his subject."  

As Cole later expressed in a statement regarding *The Voyage of Life, Childhood*, "The rosy light of the morning, the luxuriant flowers & plants, are emblems of the joyousness of early life."  

Cole's *Garden of Eden* contains many similarities to this later, more idiosyncratic work, in concept and in composition. In its 'profusion of bloom', soft atmospheric light, and gentle flowing brook, *The Voyage of Life, Childhood* is symbolic of man's initial placement in the Garden (fig. 16).

Typical of Cole's method, *The Garden of Eden* is informed by a variety of pictorial sources. It is, however, atypical of Cole's early compositional formula; framed by a profusion of lush trees, it opens to the center allowing for direct access to the mountain peak in the far distance. This structural arrangement exhibits a general dependence on Claude Lorrain. It is this Claudian formula which Cole utilized to create a self-contained environment for Paradise and its inhabitants.

Domenichino's *Death of Hyacinthus*, engraved by Domenico
Cunego and published in 1771, also exhibits a landscape similar in structure to Cole's Garden of Eden (fig. 17). The composition, with lush vegetation in the foreground and framed by trees, opens to a lake in the middle distance. Closing the composition to the horizon, a single peak, placed in the center of the canvas, dominates the far distance. The landscape, which Domenichino utilized as a backdrop for his figural drama becomes the foundation of Cole's composition. Cole was introduced to Domenichino's work in Oram's Precepts and Observations on the Art of Colouring in Landscape Painting which he had read in the spring of 1825. It must therefore now be considered a possible source for Cole's Garden of Eden.

The theme of the transience of man, found throughout Cole's oeuvre, was an ever present element of the European imagination. Writers such as Adam Ferguson in his History of Civil Society and Labillardière in Relation, translated into English in 1800, related the primitive societies to the cyclical nature of empires. Marchand's Voyages discussed the New World as a world in infancy, relative to the cyclical nature of worlds and the progress of man. Further, parallels between the exotic islands and the New World were often drawn. In American art of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries representations of the garden of Eden were commonly related to the idea of America as the New Eden. Americans typically viewed their land as the New
Paradise, God's empire in its infancy. Aligning himself with this view, Cole's *Voyage of Life* furthers the concept of bud, bloom and decay begun in *The Garden of Eden*. His later cycle, *The Course of Empire* is a further exploration of this approach to nature.

In his *Emma Moreton: A West Indian Tale* published in the *Saturday Evening Post*, 14 May 1825, Cole wrote:

> There are spots on this earth, where the sublime and the beautiful are united - when the heart of man feels its own nothingness or rises with the most ecstatic emotions - when the lips are sealed in reverence, but the soul feels unutterably. Such a spot is St. Eustatius.32

This combination and contrast of the beautiful and the sublime was to be fully developed in Cole's *Expulsion From the Garden of Eden*.

In *The Garden of Eden* and *Expulsion From the Garden of Eden* Cole realized the narrative potential of companion pictures. Though each work is complete in itself, when seen together they allow for greater depth and complexity of thought. *The Garden of Eden* and *The Expulsion From the Garden of Eden* were initially conceived of as individual works. The first painting did, however, ultimately inspire the second. *Expulsion From the Garden of Eden* is first mentioned in the artist's correspondence in April of 1828. In a letter to Wadsworth, Cole wrote, "I am endeavoring to finish for Exhibition a companion picture to the Garden of Eden - *The Expulsion of our first Parents from Eden*."33

The theme of the Expulsion was conceived only after The
Garden of Eden was fully developed. In a subsequent letter to Wadsworth Cole explains that his decision to paint the companion work was the result of the positive response by his public to The Garden of Eden.34

The Expulsion From the Garden of Eden is composed according to the typical Colean formula (fig. 18). The foreground abyss does not bar entry, however, but leads the eye into the composition, toward the bridge in the middle distance. The characteristic middle distance promontory here becomes the gate which separates Paradise from the fallen world. It forms a strong vertical element which divides the composition into two distinct scenes. Such a pronounced division of pictorial space focuses on the states of contrast utilized by Cole for effect; good:evil, joy:suffering, life:death, all effectively expressed through the representation of natural phenomenon. The left side of the canvas contains a sampling of Cole's sublime motifs: knarled and dying trees which frame the foreground, rocky, barren cliffs, waterfalls, a mountainous background and stormy sky - all lit by an erupting volcano in the far distance. The strong chiaroscuro of this portion of the composition creates a striking comparison with the pastoral scene to the right of Paradise's gate. Cole stated that his intent in this work was to introduce "the more terrible objects of nature" by heightening the effect through contrast and providing a "glimpse of The Garden of Eden in
its tranquillity. "35 Within Eden an atmospheric glow encompasses all, emanating from no single source. Cole's rendition of the Garden contains in a compact form, the elements found in his single painting The Garden of Eden. Gentle rolling hills, lush trees and vegetation, and a lake in the middle distance exist to 'heighten the effect' of the artist's sublime. The calm and serenity of the Garden is in strong contrast to the harsh temporal world, where the effect of storm, pervasive wind, and geological phenomenon is evidenced in all aspects of the evolving landscape. As in St. John in the Wilderness, the landscape is expressive of the meaning, with diminutive figures providing a supportive narrative.

Many preliminary sketches for Cole's Expulsion are found in the artist's sketchbooks. 36 They reveal the method and concerns of the artist as he approached and developed his theme. One, inscribed 'Scale of Colours for the Expulsion' exhibits Cole's knowledge and application of color theory as he utilized color to emphasize the contrast between 'Garden' and 'World' (fig. 19). 37 The range of colors are carefully planned by the artist in terms of concentric circles radiating from the light at Eden's gate. Each circle is labeled; the innermost, yellow, followed by orange, red, purple and blue, respectively. A wedge of green is inserted lower right, and one of blue in the upper right section of the composition. Cole studied color theory
as early as 1819 and characteristically utilized strong chiaroscuro and color contrast to enhance the visual impact of his work. 38

The remaining sketches deal more directly with the composition of the intended painting. 39 In one Cole utilized a grey wash to determine levels of light and shade contrast (fig. 20). 40 Exhibiting the same fundamental arrangement, these studies differ in certain details from the final painting. An additional drawing in Cole's 1827 sketchbook, inscribed at the bottom 'Expulsion from the Garden of Eden' presents a scene markedly different than Cole's final work or his numerous other sketches of the subject (fig. 21). The sketch, not before considered in its relation to Cole's final painting, may represent the first of Cole's ideas for the composition. The bottom left contains the following description;


The sketch shows a figure, presumably the cherubim which God stationed at the east of the garden, standing in the middle distance at the approximate center of the composition, apparently atop the 'wall of the garden' which divides the scene in half. He turns toward the 'world'. Above, clouds, inscribed 'Clouds in a Whirlwind' seem to emanate from the figures outstretched arms. The left half of the composition
exhibits a scene similar in conception to Cole's 'glimpse of the garden' offered in the final painting. The right portion suggests a stormy landscape. The scene is apparently the artist's initial conception of the work, representing Cole's original ideas for the subject prior to his amalgamation of various influences.

His earliest writings on the subject, in his 1827 sketchbook, describe the intended work: "Expulsion of Adam and Eve from the Garden of Eden - with stupendous mountain masses. After sunset, the sun lighting the ridges in the Garden -". A subsequent item in the artist's list of proposed subjects, "The Expulsion from the Garden - moon & firelight" suggests a further elaboration of the theme. Cole developed this later subject, which became the basis for the left portion of his Expulsion From the Garden of Eden as The Garden of Eden served as the basis for the 'glimpse' of the Garden in the right section of the canvas.

Cole's final version of Expulsion From the Garden of Eden does, however, exhibit a marked change in approach from his unfinished Expulsion - Moon and Firelight (fig. 22). In both works the observer hovers precariously at some undefinable point above a seemingly bottomless abyss. In this placement, Cole creates a symbolization of man's separation from Eden. The abyss is for Cole a symbol of the unalterable division between the two worlds. Cole's structural arrangement correlates with popular eighteenth
century 'excursion' poetry that "rose upon wings sublime" to view varied and exotic lands, and found in all the "greatness and vastness of God".43

In *Expulsion - Moon and Firelight* the rock arch gate is moved to the right of center, the natural bridge becoming the central focus of the composition. The observer moves right, further toward the center of the abyss. Such threatening placement is in marked contrast to the overall stability of design, attained through the symmetrical arrangement of forms. In this unfinished version, the gate to Paradise is balanced on the left by a promontory in the middle distance. To the right of the gate the existence of Eden is suggested by the clear blue sky and rutilant light. This glimpse of Eden is countered on the left by the inclusion of a calm expanse of water, a symbol of hope characteristic of Cole's work. Significantly, it is eliminated from the final version. A distant waterfall, echoing down the endless abyss divides the composition in half. *Expulsion - Moon and Firelight* is a less tormented landscape than the final *Expulsion From the Garden of Eden*. Adam and Eve have already passed into the temporal world. The 'flaming sword' of the Lord guards the entrance to Paradise from within the gate.44 Nature, though affected, has survived God's wrath, and in its calmer afterlife offers its inhabitants a more hopeful existence. *Expulsion From the Garden of Eden* is a more theatrical rendition of the
theme. It exhibits a landscape in turmoil as nature responds to the fury of God. It is nature expressive of God's anger, "a world made terrific by tokens of the anger of God."

In Expulsion - Moon and Firelight, a pure landscape devoid of figures, the artist has attempted to empower nature to convey the message of the work. Significantly, in his final version of the subject figures are introduced to provide context for the strong emotive quality of the painting. The mood is carried by the landscape, yet the content is dependent upon the inclusion of figures to engage the Biblical narrative. An outspoken advocate of all that was uniquely 'American', such an inclusion betrays Cole's affinity to European art theory and its imposed hierarchy of styles. It expresses his desire to raise his landscapes to the level of history painting; an attempt to produce 'a higher style of landscape'.

The natural bridge in Expulsion From the Garden of Eden and Expulsion - Moon and Firelight exemplifies Cole's adaptation of American topographical elements and popular landscape conventions. The single arch bridge emerged in landscape painting as a major pictorial device about 1800. An element of classical landscape, the naturalized bridge form was utilized in the nineteenth century as a common pictorial device. Employed by Cole as a secondary element in the foreground of Last of the Mohicans (fig. 11), it
becomes in Expulsion From the Garden of Eden a central organizing element.

Bridge of Fear is an entry in Cole's list of proposed subjects and several drawings of this theme are found among the artist's sketches. They are the basis for the natural bridge formation in Expulsion, Expulsion - Moon and Firelight, and Cole's later work Evening in Arcadia (1843) (fig. 23). One of these drawings is inscribed on the back, 'Overhanging rock in the White Mountains'. Initially a topographical phenomenon located within the American landscape, the natural bridge is transformed by Cole and adapted to his purpose.

In his illustrations for Milton's Paradise Lost, published in 1827, John Martin included The Bridge of Chaos (fig. 24). Cole's knowledge of Milton has been established, and it is evident that in his finished works The Garden of Eden and Expulsion From the Garden of Eden Cole depended strongly on Martin's rendition of these subjects. Cole's borrowings from Martin, most blatant in The Garden of Eden and Expulsion, can be detected throughout Cole's oeuvre in the use of particular motifs and concepts. In viewing Martin's illustrations for Paradise Lost, Cole realized the potential of serialized work; the narrative could be carried through a sequence of works, allowing for continuity and contrast.

The natural bridge formation, easily transmuted into a
more cavernous structure as seen in Cole's gate to Eden, is utilized again by the artist in *Voyage of Life, Childhood* and *Voyage of Life, Manhood*. This motif with all its attached psychological ramifications, is prevalent in many artists' work with which Cole would probably have been familiar. Joseph Wright of Derby often utilized the motif in the later eighteenth century as did Philip James de Loutherbourg, both influential artists in the development of late eighteenth and early nineteenth century English landscape painting. Cole's print collection contained several engravings of landscapes with similar rock formations (fig. 25).

The *Garden of Eden* and *Expulsion From the Garden of Eden* were exhibited as pendants at the National Academy of Design in 1828. Catalogue listings for both paintings were accompanied by passages from Milton's *Paradise Lost*. Significantly, Cole claims *Paradise Lost* rather than the Biblical text as his primary source.

Cole's dependence upon Martin's illustrations has been often noted and fully documented. The mezzotints, issued in full by 1827, were widely circulated in America. Martin was the first illustrator of Milton's work to focus on the landscape rather than the figures, creating a sense of place through the assignation of a visual environment. His approach was ideally suited to Milton, whose work is a literary description of Paradise, Hell, and Heaven. This
approach was equally well suited to Cole who, as Martin, had difficulty in dealing with the figure. It was this focus on landscape which reinforced Cole's dependence upon Martin, rather than Martin's predecessors in this endeavor.\textsuperscript{59}

Though Cole based his compositions on Martin's illustrations, inherent differences in the artists' approaches do remain recognizable. Martin's \textit{Expulsion} focuses on the desolation after the fall (fig. 26), Cole's on the contrast between the two states of existence. The abyss which Cole has included in his work threatens the viewer, hovering between the temporal world and Paradise. Martin's point of view, though elevated, remains stable by comparison. The far distance in each work contains a stormy, turbulent landscape. Cole's more detailed rendition is, however, more fully expressive of the turmoil within nature.\textsuperscript{60} Nature is employed as an allegory of the fate of mankind, offered by Cole as a warning of man's hopelessness when separated from God. These alterations remain loyal to Milton's rendition of the theme. Cole's audience, unlike Martin's, remains distanced from the figural drama and threatened by the divisional abyss open in the foreground. In his inclusion of the abyss Cole establishes an analogy between the temporal world as the abode of fallen man, and hell. Milton's "dark unbottom'd infinite Abyss" exists as a division of Paradise and Hell.\textsuperscript{61} The \textit{Expulsion From the Garden of Eden} and \textit{St. John in the Wilderness} are analogous
in content. Both point toward the coming Christ. The theme is stated in Milton's opening lines:

Of Man's First Disobedience, and the Fruit
Of that Forbidden Tree, whose mortal taste
Brought Death into the World, and all our woe,
With loss of Eden, till one greater Man
Restore us, and regain the blissful Seat.62

In Expulsion From the Garden of Eden Cole confronts the viewer with the idea of choice as the starting point of the soul's way to redemption by focusing on the contrast between self-dependence and dependence upon God.

Cole's dependence upon Martin was noted by contemporary critics. In a 1833 review of the American Academy of Fine Arts exhibition a critic wrote:

After all, however well he may succeed in his present line, he can never be more in the opinion of the world than what, we are sure he, no less than ourselves, would consider it a degradation for him to be called, an imitator of Pandemonium Martin.63

Cole's Garden of Eden and Expulsion were, however, well received at the 1828 National Academy of Design exhibition. Regarding The Expulsion, an anonymous critic for the New York Mirror wrote:

The artist, in this effort of his genius, has succeeded most happily in heightening the principal object of his picture, not only by the antithetical disposition of light and shade, but by the skillful contrast of a portion of the garden, still unfaded and lovely, seen on the right of the picture, with the arid, gloomy, and desolate appearance of every thing before the unhappy outcasts.64

Concerning The Garden of Eden the critic stated; "whatever is beautiful or bright, verdant or gay, in heaven and earth are here collected together, arranged in the most harmonious
order and pleasing not less by their juxtaposition than by their separate traits of loveliness".65 The critic went on to state that "the two pictures will contribute a large addition to the fame of the young artist who accomplished them".66 According to Noble they were admired by the public for their "poetic conception ... manner of composition ... and other artistic merits".67

The two paintings, uncommissioned and offered for sale at the exhibition, were less successful for the artist than the reviews suggest. Both remained in his possession at the close of the exhibition in July of 1828. Prior to the exhibition Cole wrote to Daniel Wadsworth in an attempt to secure a patron for the works.68 In a letter of March 11, 1828 Cole states that his intention to travel to Europe is dependent upon the sale of these works. Subsequent letters suggest that Wadsworth saw The Garden of Eden during a trip to New York in April of 1828. His response was apparently somewhat cool and critical.69

The following month, shortly after the opening of the exhibition at the National Academy of Design, Cole approached Gilmor concerning the two paintings:

The Exhibition of the Academy of Design is now open. ... I exhibit a number. Amongst them are two attempts at a higher style of landscape than I have hitherto tried. The subject of one picture is The Garden of Eden. In this I have endeavored to conceive a happy spot wherein all the beautiful objects of Nature were concentrated. The subject of the other is The Expulsion from the Garden. Here I have introduced the more terrible objects of Nature, and have endeavoured to heighten the effect by giving a glimpse
of The Garden of Eden in its tranquillity.

I wish you to consider that I have been speaking of what I wished to accomplish in these pictures, rather than of what I have done; for I may have failed in these efforts. I should, nevertheless, be much gratified if you could see them, even if it were only to point out wherein I have not succeeded. . . .

My going to Europe this fall depends in some measure on the sale of these two pictures. The price I ask for them is a high one. The labour and study have been great.70

Gilmor had stated in previous correspondence that he would help Cole financially with his trip, the advance to be repaid with paintings completed during Cole's stay in Europe.71 Cole, becoming increasingly anxious concerning the lack of patronage for these works, hoped to secure Gilmor's financial assistance by offering The Garden of Eden and Expulsion From the Garden of Eden.72

Unfortunately for the artist, his two loyal patrons had tastes more explicitly bent toward 'realistic transcriptions of nature'. The works failed to sell, either at the exhibition, or through extensive cajoling with his patrons.73 Eventually the works sold separately. The Garden of Eden was purchased, or perhaps won in a raffle, by a Mr. Wilkes in May of 1829.74 Cole intended to raffle Expulsion From the Garden of Eden and his Scene after the Deluge as well, but both works were privately sold to a Mr. Hosak prior to the event.75 Cole sailed to Europe the following month.

Why did these paintings by an artist at the height of his popularity fail to sell readily? Cole relates that The
Garden of Eden attracted so large an audience to his studio that he was forced to bar visitors until the painting was completed. Taste, however, is dependent upon a wide range of indeterminate factors. J. Bard McNulty suggests that the onslaught of viewers was more a curiosity in what a painter of "native landscapes" would produce under the guise of a traditional composition, an "historical landscape". Reviews, however, support the artist's optimistic view of the works. Noble, in his biography of the artist, attempts to reconcile the seeming contradiction, stating that this marked the era when the swell of general applause began to subside, and that the first note was struck of that censure which too often is inflicted upon original genius, when, in opposition to some popular taste, or conventionalism, it has the daring to think for itself, and act according to laws of its own.

William Cullen Bryant revealed the flaw of The Garden of Eden when he stated:

A single flower, or a group of several, may be very well managed by the artist; but when he attempts to portray an expanse of bloom, a whole landscape, or any large portion of it, overspread, and coloured by them, we feel the imperfection of the instruments he is obliged to use, and are disappointed by the want of vividness in the impression he strives to create. The Eden of Cole has great merits as a scene of tranquil beauty, but there was that in its design to which the power of the pencil was not adequate.

The paintings' lack of success may also be due in part to their close dependence upon another artist. There was too much of John Martin and too little of Thomas Cole in the works to please his American audience.

Cole's dependence on European artists also led to the
inclusion of motifs atypical his acclaimed 'Americanism'.
In the erupting volcano Cole introduces a motif never actually observed by the artist. The volcano, a geological phenomenon popularized in Cole's day, is an indication of Cole's interest in geology. It is equally indicative of his romantic approach to art, exhibiting one of the artist's primary concerns, the production of a strong dramatic effect.

By the 1820's accounts of volcanic eruptions were common and many artists were attempting scientifically accurate renderings of this popular image. The eruption of Vesuvius became a common subject from the mid eighteenth century, following the excavation of Herculaneum and Pompeii. An engraving by J. B. Cooke after John Martin's image of the eruption of Vesuvius (1822) was published in 1827 in Pompeii. Martin's The Destruction of Herculaneum and Pompeii was engraved by the artist in 1821. Joseph Wright of Derby produced a series of sketches and paintings of volcanic eruptions, several of which were engraved in the later eighteenth century. Transparency drawings of volcanic eruptions at night also became popular around the turn of the century.

In the inclusion of a volcano Cole reveals his awareness of contemporary English art as he restates the existing alliance between art and science prominent in the consciousness of early nineteenth century America. During
the first half of the nineteenth century the two disciplines developed concurrently, developing a binary support system. Both were viewed as viable routes to God. Geology utilized art just as art sought a scientific frame of reference for a knowledge of nature's basic principles. The two were crucial to America's sense of identity in its desire to confirm its 'providential destiny'.

For artists, and society as a whole, scientific advancements gave their emotions and their faith a credence as it uncovered God's secrets. Geology became the arena of controversy regarding God, man and religion.

A focus of contemporary thought, the volcano can be related to popular theories which emphasized the role of volcanic activity in geological occurrences. It is also directly linked to the popular Vulcanist/Neptunist debate. The Vulcanists, followers of James Hutton (1726-1797), believed that the earth developed as a result of extreme tensions within its interior. Neptunist, followers of Abraham Werner (1750-1817), were believers in the Biblical flood. They advocated a world precipitated from a universal sea which at one time covered the earth. Ellwood Parry sees in Cole's *Expulsion From the Garden of Eden* an exposition of the Vulcanists view. Cole's interest in these current issues did not, however, demand a commitment to either camp. Cole appears to have remained neutral, preferring to focus on geological phenomenon as indicators of a greater power:
these things are all mysteries - He who beholds the mountains, lifting their dark heads far in the tackleless blue, will feel his mind, called to the contemplation of the power that raised them, and must acknowledge its might - but the hour, the season when the work was consummated, when these vast fabrics were set on their deep foundations whether by the gradual mutation of the elements: or by some sudden convulsive effort of nature is unknown - time has blotted out the record - and we are impressed with the sense of our own blindness, and littleness, and with the greatness of the Creator.87

Cole, as most artists of his day, was familiar with current scientific breakthroughs.88 He was an acquaintance of Benjamin Silliman, professor of chemistry and natural history at Yale University.89 Silliman was the first president of the Association of American Geologists and the founder of the American Journal of Science and Arts, a journal which presented recent scientific findings and theories. His belief that "Science and Religion may walk hand in hand" was typical of many of his contemporaries.90 For the majority, science validated truth evident in nature and expressed in art. Cole saw science and the Bible as concurrent, not exclusive concepts. He accepted the Biblical explanation of man's creation and history and interjected current geological knowledge to heighten the impact of his work.

According to Bryan Jay Wolf, the volcano is an indicator of the artist's "rebellious spirit". Expulsion From the Garden of Eden is "profoundly anti-Christian in implication if not intent" for it offers no vision or hope of eternal redemption.91 The volcano, for Wolf, is symbolic
of eternal redemption. The volcano, for Wolf, is symbolic of fallen man's source of light or knowledge; now emanating from an earthly, rather than a divine source. The light of the volcano, symbolic of knowledge, now rises from within man's self and becomes his only source of hope. This seems, however, an inadequate translation of a religious painting. To offer hope is not the purpose of the work. Rather the artist's intent was to offer a warning, with the volcano a metaphor of the power and wrath of a jealous God. The meaning attached to the volcano is suggested in Cole's 

Emma Morton: A West Indian Tale. Here the erupting volcano is the harbinger of evil spirits. The temporal world offers, for Cole, not hope but doom and punishment; in contrast to the tranquillity of lost paradise. The concept of the 'fortunate fall' is not a viable reality for Cole. Cole remains true to the Biblical context, for at the time of the expulsion man was not afforded a 'vision', or covenant, to salvation. Cole is echoing Milton's view that the earth reacted violently, cursed by God at man's fall. The volcano is a motif Cole adopted as a symbolic element in 

Expulsion From the Garden of Eden and one which the artist would reuse in his more serene composition Mount Aetna From Taormina (1844). 

Cole carries the concept of the symbolic landscape further in Expulsion From the Garden of Eden than in his prior work. The repetition of the arch form in the gate to
Paradise, the bridge over which Adam and Eve pass, and the clouds in the distance, are symbols of transition, from Eden into a temporal world. Cole is perhaps also making conscious reference to the symbolism inherent in the arch form as the abode of God. The divine light which emanates from the gate lies at the geometric center of the canvas, supporting this symbolic interpretation and emphasizing Cole's belief in God as the center and true light of the universe. The concept of God as light is inherent in Christian thought and was a commonly utilized artistic representation of his presence. Through the transposition of light, Cole created a fusion of nature and Deity. In such presentations, Cole echoes America's challenge of the traditional concept, prevalent throughout most of the eighteenth century, which perceived God's existence as separate from nature. The emergence of landscapes of exalted meanings, begun in the late eighteenth century, can be directly related to the writings of English theoreticians such as Edmund Burke and Archibald Alison. Both considered the primary stimulus for the development of the sublime to be found in the vastness of nature; a reflection of the glory of God. Eighteenth century English literature held a fascination with the violence of nature exemplified in such geological phenomenon as earthquakes, volcanoes and storms. Such were considered manifestations of God's might and power. Violent nature was often viewed as God's vendication, a 'Divine Judgement'. Cole's acceptance of
such concepts, and his transormation of these literary views into pictorial elements is carried to its fullest in his rendition of the expulsion of Adam and Eve.

In a letter to Robert Gilmor in May of 1828, Cole described these works as "Two attempts at a higher style of landscape than I have hitherto tried". Cole had attempted historical landscape prior to these works, but the difference is one of artistic intent and focus. Though dealing with a scriptural subject which expounds on man's destiny, _St John in the Wilderness_ was seen by Cole as primarily a landscape which contained within it a spiritual message. _The Garden of Eden_ and _Expulsion From the Garden of Eden_, the first of Cole's serialized conceptions also deal with man's destiny but here the message is more focused, more urgent. Nature, presented as a contrast of the ominous and peaceful continues to play an active part. Nature reflects the state of man. The initial change in the earth's appearance is the result of sin. This traditional Christian view of the parallel of action, effect and decay initiated in the sins of man and transmitted to nature through geological changes is reflected in the writings of Milton;

_Earth trembled from her entails, as again In pangs, and Nature gave a second groan; Sky loured, and, muttering thunder, some sad drops Wept at completing of the mortal Sin_  
Original."103

The theme of the state of man echoed by that of nature is
further developed in Cole's later epic work *The Course of Empire*. Cole contrast this concept with the seemingly incompatible idea of the stability of nature; its "unceasing change and everlasting duration." He stated, "nature is not so changeable - it is we who change." The moral implications are significant in understanding the underlying theme of much of Cole's art; imperfection is in man, not nature: "Learn the laws by which the Eternal doth sublime and sanctify his works, that we may see the hidden glory veiled form vulgar eyes." Cole believed that "we are still in Eden; the wall that shuts us out of the garden is our own ignorance and folly."

In *Expulsion From the Garden of Eden* Cole offers an explicit contrast of damnation and salvation, presented through the sublime and the beautiful. It is an antithesis reinforced by every element of nature. Cole was to state in his 1835 *Essay on American Scenery*,

...in the mountains of New Hampshire there is a union of the picturesque, the sublime, and the magnificent; there the bare peaks of granite, broken and desolate, cradle the clouds; while the vallies and broad bases of the mountains rest under the shadow of noble and varied forests; and the traveller who passes the Sandwich range on his way to the White Mountains, of which it is a spur, cannot but acknowledge, that although in some regions of the globe nature has wrought on a more stupendous scale, yet she has nowhere more completely married together grandeur and loveliness - there he sees the sublime melting into the beautiful, the savage tempered by the magnificent.

Cole's concern has shifted from moral edification to a dire warning against what he viewed as man's impending doom.
1. The Garden of Eden is now lost.
Engraved by James D. Smillie, 1831. Inscription and signature; "From the original picture in the possession of C.[Charles] Wilkes, Esq. N.Y., James D. Smillie 1831". Notation on engraving: "Second engraving from a painting, the first being after 'Weir's Convent Gate.' For a Bible in Boston. Engraved for Peter Parley $250". Seaver, op. cit., pp. 50-51.


4. Out of the fertile ground he caus'd to grow
All Trees of noblest kind for sight, smell, taste;
... a fresh Fountain, and with many a rill
Water'd the Garden; thence united fell
Down steep glade ... Rolling on Orient Pearl and sands of Gold,
With many error under pendant shades
Ran Nectar, visiting each plant, and fed
Flow'rs worthy of Paradise ... Pour'd forth profuse on Hill and Dale and Plain,
Both where the morning Sun first warmly smote
The open field, and where the unpierc't shade
Imbown'd the noontide Bow'rs: Thus was this place,
A happy rural seat of various view:
... and Flocks
Crazing the tender herb, were interspos'd,
Or palmy hillock, or the flow'ry lap
Of some irriguous Valley spread her store,
Flowers of all hue, and without Thorn the Rose:
Another side, umbrageous Grotts and Caves
Of cool recess ... Luxuriant; meanwhile murmuring waters fall
Down the slope hills, disperst, or in a Lake,
... Her crystal mirror holds, ...
Milton, Paradise Lost, Book IV, lines 216-265.
This relationship is also pointed out by McNulty. See McNulty, op. cit., p. 20.

5. Genesis 3: 8-10, 15.

Also reprinted in M. & M. Karolik, Collection of American Paintings, 1815-1865, Museum of Fine Arts, Boston,
7. Gessner's *The Death of Abel* was translated into English in 1778 by Mrs. J. Collyer.

8. These works may also have been influential in Cole's planning of *Adam and Eve Discovering the Body of Abel*.


11. The single mountain peak is a motif typical to many of Cole's compositions. It is found in Cole's *Chocura Peak, N.H.* (c. 1827), *Moonlight* (1833-34), *Dream of Arcadia* (1838), and *Voyage of Life, Childhood* (1839).

12. McCoubrey, op. cit., p. 105. Interestingly, it was not only Cole's personal experiences within nature, but also the influence of patron Robert Gilmor, Jr., which brought him to this conclusion. In a letter dated 13 December 1826 Gilmor wrote, "Water always adorns a picture, whether it is the calm deep toned stream,...or the rippling current, not to speak of lakes,... Ruysdael, whose landscapes are among the finest we know, never failed to introduce it when he could, and whenever you give me the pleasure of seeing you here I will show you two or three instances of the kind in my own collection."


Cole at that time was less enthusiastic. His response of 25 December 1826 states, "I agree cordially with you about the introduction of water in landscapes: but I think there may be fine pictures without it."


13. Waterfalls are also seen in *St. John in the Wilderness, Expulsion From the Garden of Eden, and The Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge*.


15. Ibid., p. 104.

16. Ibid.
17. Cole traveled to St. Eustatius, one of the Leeward islands in the West Indies, with a friend "whose health required a trip South". Noble, op. cit., p. 8.

18. Ibid., p. 9.


Cook's first voyage to the South Pacific in the same year as the founding of the Royal Academy, opened up a new world for artistic expression. Cook's second voyage (1772-1774) included the painter William Hodges (1744-1796), a student of Richard Wilson. Hodges art attempted to combine scientific record and academic theory. Though of little immediate effect his work was important to the development of English landscape painting in its naturalist approach expressed within a traditional framework. Hodges, who published records of his travels in the later part of the eighteenth century sought to develop a style of painting which would combine the moral lessons of history painting with the esthetic pleasures of nature found in landscape painting. Though not grasped initially, this concept was adopted in the first half of the nineteenth century and became central to the romantic landscape movement.

The publication of Cook's Voyages created wide spread interest in 'exotic' lands during the 1780's in England. The account of the third voyage was published with sixty-one engraved plates after drawings by John Webber (1752-1798). Many English landscape painters and theorists are known to have read the accounts. The interest in the exotic increasingly became an aspect of the Romantic movement.

General interest in the Pacific grew toward the end of the eighteenth century. In 1788 Keats Account of Pelew Islands was published. The following year a more popular version, The Interesting and Affecting History of Prince Lee Boo, appeared. It went through twenty editions between 1789 and 1850. The voyage which it recalls, that of Henry Wilson's Antelope retained William Davis (1763-1823), a history and portrait painter who had studied at the Royal Academy.

Alexander von Humboldt's Ansichten der Natur (1808), an attempt to convey a sense of the wonder and majesty of nature in her exotic forms, was translated into most European languages early in the nineteenth century. By 1810 the work was well read and well known. For Humboldt, the noblest forms of nature were to be found in the tropics. His writings had a significant effect upon landscape painting in Europe and America. They spawned an interest in travel not equalled since Cook's Voyages.

William Westall (1781-1850) was landscape painter to
the Investigator expedition of 1801 to explore Australia's coast. A probationer at the Academy, Westall was recommended to the expedition post by Benjamin West. Engravings by Westall were published in 1814. Westall traveled extensively, in search of the exotic. In 1808 his paintings of his travels were exhibited in London. Three of 'foreign' views were exhibited at the Academy in 1812. "In the foregrounds were displayed the magnificent and gorgeous foliage of the flora of the country, painted with great attention to their botanical character." Bernard Smith, op. cit., p. 145. Originally printed in Art Journal (1850), p. 105.

The romantic concept of the Pacific as Paradise preserved persisted into the later eighteenth and early nineteenth century. Interest in exotic and distant lands at the turn of the century was furthered by publishing houses (Havell & Son) & (Rudolph Ackermann), which published illustrated books of foreign travel and of exotic landscapes. Cole was probably aware of these books while a boy in England. They would certainly have spawned his desire to visit such lands in search of the exotic and the picturesque.

20. Ibid.


22. Noble, op. cit., p. 82.

23. Cole writes further, "In confirmation of this doctrine I have only to appeal to Claude, G. Poussin, and Salvator Rosa."

From notebook entry, 12 December 1829. Noble, op. cit., p. 82-83.

24. Sir Joshua Reynolds, Discourse XIII.


26. As is characteristic of Cole, his work contains a profusion of detail not found in Claude.


30. Ibid., p. 112-113.

31. This view was strongly emphasized in literature which, however, typically focused on Adam.

32. Reprinted in Dillenberger, op. cit., p. 98.


34. Letters, Thomas Cole to Daniel Wadsworth, 5 June 1828, McNulty, op. cit., p. 42.


38. According to Noble, while residing in Steubenville, Ohio Cole was lent by a portrait painter named Stein "an English work on painting, illustrated with engravings, and treating of design, composition and colour". Noble, op. cit., p. 12.


39. Detroit Institute of Art, photocopies, 39.483. Four sketches are found in Cole's 1827 sketchbook, photocopies, ALC-4.


42. This presentation, of the abyss as the division of worlds, is found throughout Milton's Paradise Lost.


The European hierarchy of styles was assimilated by the American academies of art with little alteration. The American hierarchy is outlined in a 1827 review of the National Academy of Art exhibition. It establishes 'Epic', 'Dramatic' and 'Historic' paintings as supreme. 'Historical landscape' ranked third, followed by 'Landscape' and 'Marine Pieces'. Reprinted in Merritt, Baltimore Museum of Art, Annual II, op. cit., p. 18.


48. Uvedale Price, a central figure in the development of the concept of the sublime, wrote in praise of the bridge, especially the arch stone bridge. Though with a neo-classical bent, he discussed the form in terms of its "grandeur", "beauty" and "difficulty of execution" in his Essay on the Picturesque, 1796. His concepts were adopted and developed by the romantic movement. Ibid.

50. Detroit Institute of the Arts, photocopies, 39.219.


53. See Benedict Nicolson, Joseph Wright of Derby: Painter of Light, 2 vols., (Great Britain: The Paul Mellon Foundation for British Art, 1968). Nicolson also discusses the prominence of this motif and its use by other artists such as Sydney Parkinson and Peter Fabris.

54. There are three such prints. All appear to be works by Rosa. Detroit Institute, Albany, photocopies. Cole's Print Collection, frames 34, 38, 40.

55. The Garden of Eden entry was accompanied by;
'Lowly they bow'd adoring, and began
Their orisons each morning duly paid
In various style'
Milton
Catalogue entry quoted in Parry, "Thomas Cole and the Practical Application of Landscape Theory," op. cit., p. 17. The listing for Expulsion was accompanied by the following quote;
'They, looking back, all the eastern side beheld
Of Paradise, so late their happy seat,
Waved over by the flaming brand; the gate
With dreadful faces throng'd, and fiery arms.
Some natural tears they dropt, but wiped them soon;
The World was all before them to choose
Their place of rest, and Providence their guide;
They, hand in hand, with wandering steps and slow,
Through Eden took their solitary way.
Paradise Lost, book xii.
Catalogue entry quoted in Seaver, op. cit., p. 55.
56. John Martin's mezzotints of *Paradise Lost* were commissioned by Samuel Prowett, an American publisher, in 1823. The resultant twenty-four mezzotints were issued in four sets beginning 20 March 1825, all parts being issued by 1827. See Christopher Johnstone, *op. cit.*, p. 17.

Martin's mezzotints were published in *The Token* shortly after they were issued, exact date unknown. See Seaver, *op. cit.*, p. 6.

57. Martin characteristically focused on the landscape. As Cole, his compositions contained diminutive figures within an expansive landscape setting. In 1816 Martin was appointed Historical Landscape Painter to Prince Leopold and Princess Charlotte.


59. *Paradise Lost* had previously been illustrated by Blake, Hogarth, Fuseli, Barry, and Thornhill, among others. See Johnstone, *op. cit.*, p. 111.

60. Cole is here utilizing several Burkean elements of the sublime: magnificence, grandeur, contrast, and isolation. See Burke, *op. cit*.


68. Cole first mentions *The Garden of Eden* in his letter to Daniel Wadsworth dated 27 November 1827. He does not approach Gilmor until after the exhibition has begun, in a letter of 21 May 1828.

69. See letter from Thomas Cole to Daniel Wadsworth, 23 April 1828. In it Cole responds defensively to his patrons' criticisms of his work. McNulty, op. cit., p. 38.


72. In his statement wishing Gilmor to see the works, Cole subtly states his desire. Gilmor had previously mentioned to the artist that should Cole paint anything which he felt Gilmor "might like to possess on seeing it, let me hear from you." (letter, 13 December 1827). As Wadsworth, Gilmor responds with apprehension; "I should like very much to see your two new pictures, though the subjects are both trying ones, particularly the Garden of Eden, which would require the skillful execution of the figures & animals..."(letter, 24 May 1828). The letter continues with Gilmor citing various reasons he would not be interested in purchasing certain works of art. *Baltimore Museum of Art, Annual* 11, op. cit., pp. 58-59.

73. Cole continued to write both Gilmor and Wadsworth concerning the paintings and bewailing his fear that without their selling he would be unable to travel to Europe. See Letters Thomas Cole to Daniel Wadsworth, 5 June 1828, 13 October 1828, 10 November 1828, April 1829, McNulty, op. cit., pp. 42, 46, 49, 54. See also Letters Thomas Cole to Robert Gilmor, Jr., 5 January 1829, 20 January 1829, 2 February 1829, 18 February 1829, 20 April 1829, 25 May 1829, 31 May 1829, and Robert Gilmor, Jr. to Thomas Cole, 15 January 1829, 25 January 1829, 21 February 1829, 22 April 1829, *Baltimore Museum of Art, Annual* 11, pp. 60-68.


77. Ibid., p. xviii.


79. Ibid., pp. 61-62.


West included the image in the background of his Cicero Discovering the Tomb of Archinedes (1797).

81. Published by Cooke and including descriptive letterpress to each plate by T. L. Donaldson.

82. Joseph Wright of Derby's work is in keeping with the tradition of picturesque topography. It exhibits a dependence upon the work of Pierre-Jacques Volaire (1729-1805), a self-proclaimed specialist in volcanic eruptions. Volaire was, according to Nicolson, the first artist to transpose Vesuvius into the quise of romanticism. See B. Nicolson, op. cit., pp. 77, 79.


84. Ibid., p. 49.

85. Ibid.


Daniel Wadsworth mentions Silliman and his family in a letter to Cole as early as 5 November 1827, suggesting Cole was acquainted with the scientist at this early date. Letters, Daniel Wadsworth to Thomas Cole, 5 November 1827, McNulty, op. cit., p. 15ff.


Many of the noted scientists of the day, such as Asa Grey, a strong supporter of Darwin, and Louis Agassiz, Darwin's chief antagonist in America, held firmly to the concept of godly design.

91. Wolf, op. cit., p. 101-102. Wolf continues his analysis of the volcano motif; The Volcano is Cole's artistic answer to God; it represents an inversion of the divine light that illumines Eden and proclaims a new covenant between man and world, replacing an older covenant of hope set before Noah and sealed in the image of the rainbow. This statement, however, is an inaccurate account of biblical history, chronologically incorrect. The expulsion
of Adam and Eve from Paradise preceded God's covenant with Noah.

92. Ibid., p. 100-101.

93. Ibid.

94. In his short story Cole writes;
a wild imagination might have supposed that
volcanic fire was again lighting up the blasted rocks,
and that the evil spirit of the mountain was again
raging in the deep crater, that had for ages and ages
been so peaceful and quiet. Thomas Cole, Emma Morton:
A West Indian Tale, op. cit., p. 1.

95. For a discussion of Milton's theology as expressed
in Paradise Lost see Baigell, op. cit., p. 40 and M. and M.
Karolik, op. cit., p. 86.

96. This motif can also be found in Cole's sketch for
Proserpine Gathering Flowers in the Fields of Enna, Detroit
Institute of Arts, photocopies, 39.395.

97. See Adele M. Holcomb, "The Bridge in the Middle
Distance: Symbolic Elements in Romantic Landscape," The Art

98. This view was advocated by theoreticians Dennis,
Shaftsbury, and Addison, among others. See M. Nicolson, op.
cit., p. 323.


101. Letters, Thomas Cole to Robert Gilmor, 21 May
1828, Baltimore Museum of Art, Annual II, p. 58. Also
reprinted in Noble, op. cit., p. 64.

102. M. Nicolson, op. cit., pp. 84ff. Milton's
relation to the argument that God cursed also the earth at
the time of man's fall is also cited by Baigell, op. cit.,
p. 40.

Martin Luther also taught that since Adam there has
been a progressive degeneration; that the evil in man
directly effects nature. See M. Nicolson, op. cit., p. 97.

103. Milton, Paradise Lost, cited by M. Nicolson, op.
cit., p. 87.


106. McCoubrey, op. cit., p. 110. The idea that nature is intrinsically good, that evil resides in man is a teaching of Calvinism. Cole thus exhibits further affinities with the inherent world view of the Dissenting tradition.


108. Ibid., p. 103.
And the ark rested in the seventh month, on the seventeenth day of the month, upon the mountains of Ararat. And the waters decreased continually until the tenth month: in the tenth month, on the first day of the month, were the tops of the mountains seen. Genesis 8: 1-5

CHAPTER III
THE SUBSIDING OF THE WATERS OF THE DELUGE

In 1829 Cole completed a work which seems in marked contrast to his earlier Biblical landscapes. The Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge is a calmer rendition of nature and as such more characteristic of the artist's mature works (fig. 27).

The foreground design remains typical of Cole, with its rugged cliffs, bold promontories, fallen trees, and rushing water. But in this work the artist has focused on the area of calm which resided only in the far distance of his earlier compositions. The contrast between the sublime and the beautiful seen in The Expulsion From the Garden of Eden is now in balance; the fury of nature has stilled. Cole has portrayed the aftermath rather than the event.

The Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge was exhibited at the National Academy of Design in 1829. Critical response was mixed, perhaps because of the unique character of the work. A review of the exhibition in the New York Mirror stated that "the manner in which it has been treated is worthy of his [Cole's] established reputation." The
critic for the New York American had a converse opinion:

On each side of a portrait by Ingham is a picture by Cole; the one we were told, and could not believe even after we were told, intended to represent the subsiding of the waters of the Deluge, of which it conveyed not the slightest idea, as it seems to us...²

The painting, together with The Expulsion From the Garden of Eden was purchased by a Dr. Hosack of New York in May of 1829, just prior to Cole's departure for Europe.³ It was exhibited at the Academy again in 1831 and in 1833, and was on view at the Baltimore Museum of Art in 1837.⁴ In 1874 it was among a group of paintings sold at the Leavitt Art Rooms, Brooklyn, New York.⁵ After this sale there is no record of the painting until 1974 when it was discovered in the collection of Mrs. James Wallace Dean of Knoxville, Tennessee.⁶

Cole's list of proposed subjects in his 1827 sketchbook contains numerous entries which refer to a deluge scene.⁷ Yet there are no known preliminary sketches for The Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge. One seemingly unrelated entry, "Mountains on the moon" did, however, result in a sketch similar in composition and mood to The Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge (fig. 28). In both, the observer views the scene from the confines of a cave-like structure. It is a format based on Cole's studies of nature and is reminiscent of the artist's paintings of Kaaterskill Falls, a popular tourist attraction in the Catskill Mountains and one which contains a shallow grotto
through which one can walk behind the upper fall (fig. 29). The ragged cantilevered cliff in Cole's View of the Moon, is repeated in the middle distance of the deluge scene. The rocky landscape interspersed with pools of water, typical of many of Cole's sketches of American scenery, is found in both works. Cole apparently incorporated his imagined lunar landscape into his "World after the Deluge".

The topography of the moon was a popular topic of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Cole's View of the Moon evidences the artist's interest in Astronomy and Geology, and indicates a knowledge of scientific and philosophic literature of the day.

Ellwood Parry suggests that the Deluge painting is a representation of the Neptunist theory of Creation, just as The Expulsion From the Garden is an exposition of the Vulcanist concept. The effect of the flood upon the earth's topography was a longstanding debate still popular in Cole's day. The artist's interest in this topic and his more general interest in geology is evidenced in his work. The Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge was not, however, intended as a presentation of Creation, but rather as one of salvation; of God's ability to destroy man through the power of nature, and conversely, God's power to offer man salvation from this destruction.

The Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge has been associated with John Martin's work of a similar theme. A
mezzotint by Martin after his painting The Deluge (1826) was on display at Colman's Literary Emporium in New York by January of 1829 (fig. 30). 14 Two drawings after the Martin work are found in Cole's 1827 sketchbook. 15 Parry theorizes that in his Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge Cole presents a response and a companion piece to Martin's more traditional interpretation. 16 Martin chose a more sublime rendition of the fury of nature and the rising of the tempestuous waters. Cole's is a different approach. Lacking the heroics common to most deluge scenes, it represents the calm after the storm as the waters 'assuaged' and receded from the mountain tops. It offers not empathy but rather a simple, profound statement of God's power.

Another work of Martin, which contains more affinities to Cole's work than previously suggested sources, should be considered as a probable influence on Cole's Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge. Martin's Sadak in Search of the Waters of Oblivion (1812), engraved by E. J. Roberts and published in The Keepsake in 1828, emotes an austerity and majesty atypical of the majority of Martin's work (fig. 31). 17 In it the observer remains distanced from the pictorial space, and as characteristically found in Cole's work, hovers above a dark foreboding abyss. The scene is composed entirely of sharp and threatening rock outcroppings interspersed with pools of water which empty over the crags and cliffs in rushing torrents. Cole presents a similar
scene, suggesting that he was again looking to Martin for inspiration and for specific motifs.

The Biblical flood was a popular subject among artist of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. Poussin's Winter (c.1660-64), a deluge scene, served as a prototype for many of these works (fig. 32).18 Often engraved, it was particularly popular in England and France during the eighteenth century. Poussin's was the first known depiction of the subject in which a sublime landscape dominates the figures.19 It was applauded for its sublimity of conception and for its terror rendered through simplicity. J.M.W. Turner was the first in England to follow Poussin's precedent of painting the deluge as essentially a landscape.20 Considering Poussin's work 'too tame', however, he chose a more theatrical rendition of the theme.21 Many English artists followed Turner in attempting deluge scenes, but with few exceptions they are tempestuous renditions, with many prominent figures.22

Cole did not follow the lead of his contemporaries. Instead, he adopted Poussin's austerity and economy of means, to the point that his subject became unidentifiable to his audience. Yet as a critic in the New York Mirror wrote, "There is a grandeur in the simplicity of the picture which we cannot but admire."23 In his Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge Cole most effectively renders the 'still, small voice' of his powerful God. His attempt to
intensify the event through understatement is carried to extreme. Only the skull and the distant boat aid the viewer in an explanation of the scene.

The **Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge** is Cole's only Biblical landscape exclusive of figures. The sole reference to humanity is found in the skull, a traditional symbol of the vanity of life, presented in the foreground. Cole reduced the human factor to barest minimum, desiring the landscape to carry the content of the work. As seen in **St. John in the Wilderness** and **Expulsion From the Garden of Eden**, however, it is the inclusion of figures which provide the narrative context. Without them content is not easily discerned. In his shift of emphasis to the post climatic event, Cole, in deference to the Biblical text, excluded figures. In doing so he presents his audience with a strong work, though one onto which a variety of meanings can be imposed. Prior to its discovery in 1974 the painting hung for nearly three quarters of a century unidentified as a Biblical landscape.24

Important to many artists as a visual source, Poussin's **Winter** was not the initiate of the common interest in this theme. Popularity was based upon contemporary literature and accounts of disasters at sea. The vogue for the theme grew in the later half of the eighteenth century.25 Johann Jakob Bodmer's **Noah** (1752) was published in English by 1767 and Salomon Gessner's **Le Deluge**, written shortly after
Bodmer's work, was available in English by 1802. Byron's *Heaven and Earth: A Mystery*, published in 1821, is further indication of the era's romantic fascination with themes of tempest and deluge. Though Byron focuses on the world prior to the deluge, closing with the rise of the flood waters, its philosophical content is analogous to Cole's painting:

```
If thou wouldst avoid their doom, forget
That they exist: they soon shall cease to be;
While thou shalt be the sire of a new world,
And better.26
```

Cole's *Deluge* is a representation of the dawn of this new world. Like Cole's previous Biblical landscapes, it contains a warning of the consequences of an angered God and a call for repentance. To Cole the Deluge was divine punishment for human fallacy. He emphasizes the new world emerging and offers a warning regarding its abuse by man. It is a theme which he developed further in his later series *The Course of Empire*.

The marine disaster was popular Romantic iconography in literature and the Fine Arts, utilized for both documentary and allegorical ends. The characteristic English formula of the period, the vessel centered on the canvas and presented broadside on the horizon, was adapted by Cole.27 The fury of the storm tossed vessel and the suspended pathos of the drifting boat were of great importance in late eighteenth and early nineteenth century British art as representations of human helplessness against the powers of nature.28 Both can be related to common feelings and anxieties of a
revolutionary period. The solitary condition, the bleakness, and incapacity inherent in the drifting boat motif suggests feelings of despondency and despair. Cole's work contains similar underlying emotions, linking Cole with contemporary English thought. It was England, his native land, which shaped his world view and thus his approach to art in America. In the early nineteenth century the drifting boat is rare. Not until after 1840 is it a frequent motif, displacing the storm tossed boat in popularity. Cole, in *Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge*, is a forerunner of this more austere presentation. In his later series, *The Voyage of Life*, the artist would combine the storm tossed and the drifting boat motifs as symbolizations of the inertia of life's stages.

Cole's work is also a forerunner of another phenomenon of nineteenth century art, Luminism. The violent manifestations of nature as seen in *Expulsion* are gone; calm now prevails. Cole has found that "the richest chords are those struck by the gentler hand of nature." Yet, as in his earlier, more activated renditions of nature, all elements of the composition were extracted by Cole from the American landscape. His deluge scene is based on studies of New Hampshire scenery:

Shut in by stupendous mountains which rest on crags that tower more than a thousand feet above the water, whose rugged brows and shadowy breaks are clothed by dark and unbroken solitude ... I was overwhelmed with an emotion of the sublime, such as I have rarely felt. ... the silent energy of nature stirred the soul to its
inmost depths.\textsuperscript{32}

Crystalline expanses of water, though here broken by falling cataracts, evenness of light, and the austerity of presentation seen in The Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge foreshadows the works of the Luminists. The characteristic bright light and strong chiaroscuro of Cole's art was employed for religious associations and to elicit a greater dramatic effect. In The Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge Cole eliminated the strong contrasts of light and shade, believing that their absence evoked a 'soul soothing power'.\textsuperscript{33}

Interest in more austere renditions of nature can be detected in some of Cole's earliest landscapes such as Lake with Dead Trees (1825) (fig. 33), though this movement toward a classical understatement is more frequently found in the artist's later works. Cole's American Lake Scene (1844) exhibits an even closer alliance with the developing Luminist philosophy (fig. 34).

The 'still, small voice' which Cole contrasted with more explosive demonstrations of God was transformed by Luminism to a more meditative, more introverted approach to the American landscape.\textsuperscript{34} The clarity of atmosphere characteristic of Luminist works, dematerialized nature in a pure and constant light.\textsuperscript{35} For Cole, light contained the obvious and traditional reference to God. It became for the Luminist a means by which the landscape artist transmitted
object into spirit. 36

Cole's Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge is a transitional painting. Crystalline expanses of water are contrasted with the fury of the rushing waterfall. Water was considered by Cole "a most expressive feature" and one employed to illicit specific associations:

in the unrippled lake, which mirrors all surrounding objects, we have the expression of tranquility and peace - in the rapid stream, the headlong cataract, that of turbulence and impetuosity." 37

Luminism eliminated the turbulent aspect of water.

Cole's remains a painterly approach. The artist's presence remains between the audience and the pictorial space in contrast to the anonymity resulting from the luminist eradication of brushstroke. Cole's work also remains monumental in size. For the luminist, monumentality was obtained within a small framework, through scale.

The Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge contains a theme analogous to that offered in Cole's later work The Course of Empire, Desolation (fig. 35). What Cole considered the evil nature of man, his corrupt and rebellious nature, has been crushed by a vengeful God. Calm follows such all encompassing destruction. In both works hope survives in the suggestions of life renewed, though emphasis is on the desolation and destruction representative of God's wrath and power.

The artist's focus on the consequences of God's wrath, seen in Expulsion From the Garden of Eden is here carried to
its logical end; a hope of redemption and salvation from the wrath of God. As in his earlier Biblical landscapes, nature in accord with Cole's message; man is at the mercy of a powerful God whose anger is transmitted through the violence of nature. Yet there is an alteration in Cole's outlook evidenced in the artist's choice of a more serene presentation. In *The Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge* man is offered a new beginning.

   A review of the 1831 exhibition printed in the New York Mirror 7 May 1831 is a more straightforward description of the work:
   
   The vast flood, gradually subsiding, leaves the peaked mountain tops visible; and the drenched world, as it again meets the light, has an air of deep solemnity and solitude extremely impressive. The effect is increased by the skull in the foreground.


3. Cole intended to raffle these works but they were purchased by Dr. Hosack prior to the event. See Letters Thomas Cole to Robert Gilmor, Jr., 25 May 1829, 31 May 1829, Baltimore Museum of Art, Annual II, p. 67-68.


6. The painting had been purchased at an art gallery in New York between 1900 and 1904 by Ms. Minnibel Smith (the first Mrs. James Wallace Dean). At the time of purchase the painting was not known to be Cole's Deluge. During restoration of the painting in 1974 the signature and date were discovered and attribution to Cole established.

7. The 35th entry in Cole's list is "First rainbow after the deluge". "World after the Deluge" is the 42nd. Other listings appear to also be conceptually related to Cole's idea for his deluge scene. The 39th entry "Rocks and trees heaped confusedly together as having been carried by the floods from the mountains" is followed by "A picture in which nothing shall be but bare rocks and clouds - rocks piled on rock". Numbers 49 and 87, both listed as "Solitude" are also suggestive of Cole's Deluge. Thomas Cole's List "Subjects for Pictures," Baltimore Museum of Art, Annual II, op. cit., p. 86.
8. Cole's spoke of Kaaterskill "possessing a singular feature in the vast arched cave that extends beneath and behind the cataract." McCoubrey, op. cit., p. 105.


10. In 1708 John Wilkes wrote in That the Moon May Be a World, "I affirm that there are very high mountains in the moon. "Kepler and Galilaeus think that they are higher than any which are upon our earth". John Wilkes, That the Moon May Be a World, in Mathematical and Philosophical Works, (London, 1708), I, p. 71, cited in M. Nicolson, op. cit., p. 151.

Interest in the moon was spurred by Galileo's discovery of mountains on the moon. It was a popular topic of the 17th and 18th centuries. Marjorie Hope Nicolson states; "From the Somnium (Kepler's fictitious description of lunar topography) passed into literature (even down to the nineteenth century) a grim, austere, yet majestic picture of lunar mountains, in which were combined the grandeur and terror of the 'Sublime'." M. Nicolson, op. cit., p. 132.


See page 53. A Neptunist conception of creation would be in keeping with Milton's view as expressed in Paradise Lost. See Book VII, I. 282-287.


14. Martin's work was well received. As stated in a notice in The Critic: A Weekly Review of Literature, Fine Arts, and Drama, I, January 3, 1829, p. 159, "In every respect, a work well deserving the encomiums that have been lavished on it in England," reprinted in Parry, "Thomas Cole and the Practical Application of Landscape Theory," op. cit., p. 18.

Martin's Deluge was engraved and published in September of 1828. Johnstone, op. cit., p. 17.


This is the second version of this subject. The first
is now lost.

18. Poussin's Winter was engraved by Jean Audran

The Burlington Magazine, vol. CXXIII, no. 940 (July 1981),
p. 390.

20. Turner painted his deluge scene in 1804-05. He
first saw Poussin's work in the Louvre in 1802. Verdi, op.
cit., p. 397-398.

21. Ibid.

22. Benjamin West, 1791, 1805; John Martin 1826, 1828,
1834; Francis Danby c. 1828, 1839; Joshua Shaw 1813.
Joshua Shaw's The Deluge, Towards its Close is a more
desolate scene, depending more heavily on Poussin's work.

354.


26. Byron, Heaven and Earth, from Poems and Dramas of

27. This characteristic formula is exemplified in John
Sell Cotman's Dismantled Brig. See Adele Holcomb, "John
Sell Cotman's Dismantled Brig and the Motif of the Drifting

28. In his study of the drifting boat motif in English
romanticism, Adele M. Holcomb states that it endured
because,
... the capacity of the imperilled ship to typify
various crises was rooted in so many traditions,
religious and secular, as to appear the property of
none. Its evocative power seemed inherent in the
phenomenon itself.
Adele M. Holcomb, op. cit., p. 29.


An exception cited by Holcomb is Francis Danby's Sunset
At Sea After A Storm (1824) and John Sell Cotman's
Dismantled Brig (1806).

32. Ibid., p. 104.
33. Letters, Thomas Cole to Daniel Wadsworth, 8 December 1828, McNulty, op. cit., p. 52.
34. See Novak, Nature and Culture, op. cit., p. 28ff.
35. Ibid.
36. Ibid., p. 41.
37. McCoubrey, op. cit., p. 103.
Barbara Novak relates the "purity" and "tranquility and peace" which Cole sees as characteristics of water to the language of "Christian mysticism". Novak, Nature and Culture, op. cit., p. 41.
And Abraham rose up early in the morning, and took bread and a bottle of water, and gave it unto Hagar, putting it on her shoulder, and the child, and sent her away: and she departed, and wandered in the wilderness of Beer-sheba.

And the water was spent in the bottle, and she cast the child under one of the shrubs.

And she went, and sat her down over against him a good way off, as it were a bowshot: for she said, Let me not see the death of the child. And she sat over against him, and lifted up her voice and wept.

And God heard the voice of the lad, and the angel of God called to Hagar out of heaven, and said unto her, What aileth thee, Hagar? fear not; for God hath heard the voice of the lad where he is. Genesis 21: 14-17

CHAPTER IV
HAGAR IN THE WILDERNESS

Cole painted Hagar in the Wilderness in the spring of 1829, intending to take it to Europe with him as a "means of introduction among artists", and anticipating that the skill which it exhibited would impress his talents upon a European public.¹ Cole considered it his finest work.² Soon after its completion, Hagar was exhibited at Colman's Gallery in New York where the painting was well received by the public and the press.³ The artist left for England with Hagar in the Wilderness on June 1, 1829. The painting was not mentioned in Cole's subsequent correspondence from London, and the work was seldom referred to again by the artist.

According to the London correspondent for the New York Mirror, Cole had used unstable colors in Hagar and later painted another subject over the original work.⁴ Cole's
biographer, Louis Legrand Noble, verifies that the Hagar was indeed painted over, but adds that poor reception of the work in England, rather than 'unstable colors', was the artist's primary motivation. Graham Hood, in his reconstruction of the painting, theorizes that Cole's *A Lake in New Hampshire, USA.*, exhibited at the British Institute in 1831 is the repainted canvas. This painting, later referred to by Cole as *A Solitary Lake in New Hampshire, US America*, returned to America with the artist, and was eventually acquired by Frederick Church.

_Hagar in the Wilderness_ is Cole's only work which is known to have been painted over by the artist. Some have interpreted this as a refutation by Cole of his earlier method of painting and mode of thought. Cole, however, did not at this time stop production of his characteristic works; either Biblical landscapes or other works dealing with nature as an overriding force. The destruction of _Hagar_ seems to have been the result of more pragmatic reasoning.

The subject of Hagar is found near the beginning of Cole's 1827 list of subjects. The development of the theme can be followed in the artist's sketchbook and through his written correspondence. Cole's letter to Daniel Wadsworth written in April of 1829 offers a description of the painting:

_I have been spending [a] month or two in painting a landscape not quite so large as the Garden of Eden -_
The subject is Hagar and Ishmael in the Wilderness - I have endeavored to represent a desert wilderness without mountains bounded by the horizon sky [Hot? flat?] sandy plains with here and there a date tree to enable the eye to measure the vast distance - Immense clouds of thunderous sultry aspect rise like towers from the extended desert - and cast their broad showers over extended desert - Hagar is seated in the bed of a river - with her back toward Ishmael who is seen 'at the distance of bow shot' [lying?] under in the shadow of a shrub - in the bed of the [word?] are dead trees rocks and sand glowing under the intense heat of a high sun - Hagar appears to have been following in search of water the bed of the river which from the rocks and gulfs of the foreground is seen winding over the immense plain until it is lost in the horizon - In a deep quiet spot hidden as it were from the view of Hagar - is seen water - an antelope standing in it and allaying his thirst - Around it all is green whilst the rest of the landscape is brown barren and glowing beneath the burning sun - I have endeavoured to picture the helplessness of a female in a torrid and infrequented wilderness - the extended and apparently illimitable plains show how distant she will be from the aid of man - and how painful slow her journeying - And how 'ready to perish' and yet the means of life - water - is so very near - but [undiscovered?] until heaven itself shall point it out."¹⁰

Another description appeared in a review of the exhibition of Hagar at Colman's Gallery in the New York Commercial Advertiser, 16 April, 1829:

The foreground is relieved by masses of broken rocks, among the stunted herbage of which stand a few scattered date trees, but of too sickly growth to cast a shade. Among the rocks, and in the bed of what was once a brook, or torrent, the sinuous course of which is discernable for many miles, winding through the wilderness, though now dry as the surrounding deserts, sits Hagar [sic], as she 'lifted up her voice and wept,' the empty water pot by her side, and at a distance, beneath all that there is of shadow, lies the child. Beyond the whole is a vast and apparently illimitable desert, burning beneath a sky as of heated brass; and far in the background, towards the left of the picture, arise heavy darkening masses as of sand, suspended, or borne aloft on the wings of a retiring whirlwind.¹¹
Two preliminary sketches for *Hagar in the Wilderness* are found in Cole’s 1827 sketchbook. One of these, faintly inscribed in the center ‘Hagar’, is similar in composition to *The Garden of Eden* in which Cole utilized the typical Claudian formula, framing the scene with lush trees (fig. 36). What appears to be a figure stands in the middle distance, to the left of center, at the edge of a brook or pool of water. The second sketch, inscribed ‘Hagar’ in the lower right, more closely resembles written descriptions of the final painting (fig. 37). A large rock dominates the left foreground. Immediately behind it the artist places a large tree and dense foliage. A single figure, presumably Hagar, seated under a slender tree in the right foreground, balances the composition. She faces what appears to be a river bed in the center middleground. Large clouds enclose the left half of the background while to the right Cole’s ‘vast and apparently illimitable desert’ is suggested in the far distance.

Several studies for the figure of Hagar (fig. 38) and one sketch of Ishmael and Hagar (fig. 39) are found in the same sketchbook. The figure of Hagar seated weeping, her knees drawn to her chest, closely resembles the figure in the second preliminary sketch of the composition. Typical of Cole, the figures are presented in profile or turned away from the observer, alleviating the necessity of attempting foreshortening. Inadequacy in dealing with the figure was a
shortcoming which Cole hoped to overcome through studies in Europe.\textsuperscript{13}

A comparison of the sketches and the written descriptions suggests that slight, but significant changes were made in the final painting. The hidden scene of water described in the artist's text, an important element in the finished painting, is not found in either of the preliminary sketches. Its inclusion exemplifies Cole's continuing emphasis on contrasts; the lush green, hidden retreat set against the dry and barren desert is reflective of the theme of need and fulfillment inherent in the work.

Cole's \textit{Hagar} appears to have followed the Biblical text more closely than his previous Biblical landscapes. The descriptions of the work are not of an Americanized wilderness but of Cole's perception of an Eastern desert. It is also his first work not intended for an American audience and suggests an attempt by the artist to conform more closely to European taste.

The expulsion of Hagar, Abraham's concubine, and their son, Ishmael from the camp of Abraham was a popular subject in late eighteenth, early nineteenth century art in Europe and America. Artists to whom Cole often looked for inspiration, Rosa and Claude, both produced works dealing with this theme. Rosa's \textit{Hagar and Ishmael} was engraved in the first half of the eighteenth century by Hamlit Winstanley.\textsuperscript{14} Claude produced many variations of the theme.
One of them, *Landscape with the Angel Appearing to Hagar* (c. 1668) was engraved by Arthur Pond in 1734 (fig. 40). A drawing after this work is found in Cole's 1827 sketchbook (fig. 41). The sketch carries no inscription and has not been identified as a preliminary sketch for Cole's treatment of the theme. It establishes Claude as a primary source of inspiration for Cole's *Hagar*. Cole's sketch is similar in compositional format to Claude's work, though he has chosen to eliminate the pastoral middle distance, pulling the rocky terrain forward to a more prominent position. Claude's figure of Hagar in the right foreground, seated under a lone tree, closely resembles Cole's final conception. Cole, however, chose to present an earlier moment in the narrative; a moment when man is overcome by nature. He thus remains loyal to the message inherent in all his early Biblical landscapes; man's helplessness and the necessity of dependence upon God for survival. Deliverance is possible only through divine grace and guidance.

Many American artists also produced works dealing with Hagar and Ishmael. It was a subject relevant to nineteenth-century America; Hagar entered an unknown wilderness with the assurance that a new nation under God would be founded through her son, Ishmael. Similarly, America saw itself as a nation sanctioned by God and entering an unknown and potentially threatening wilderness. In his attempt of the subject of Hagar in the wilderness,
Cole exhibits his alignment with contemporary American thought. His 'American' consciousness contributed to the complex amalgamation of influences and concerns expressed in his work. Hagar exemplifies Cole's continued attempt to place American ideas within a religious context while looking to Europe for models of pictorial expression.


7. The painting, A Solitary Lake in New Hampshire, US America, now resides at the Church estate in Olana. At the time of Hood's study it had not been x-rayed.


9. Graham Hood has completed a thorough reconstruction of the lost work through a comprehensive study of these available documents. See Hood, op. cit.


12. Hood sites a third sketch in the same sketchbook. Though similar in composition, it is not inscribed 'Hagar' and appears to be a pure landscape. See Hood, op. cit., fig. 4, p. 48.

13. For a study of Cole and the problem of dealing with the human figure see Ellwood Parry, "Thomas Cole and the Problem of Figure Painting," American Art Journal, 4, no. 1 (Spring 1972), pp. 66-86.


16. A mezzotint of Benjamin West's Hagar was published in 1805 by Valentine Green. John Singleton Copley's Hagar and Ishmael, engraved by R. Dunkarton, was published by Copley in 1798. A preliminary drawing of the subject (1827), by Asher B. Durand is in the New York Historical Society, though no finished painting has yet been located. All of these artist's works are dominated by figures pushed to the foreground plane; the landscape is secondary.

CHAPTER V

COLE'S BIBLICAL LANDSCAPES, 1829-1848

After 1830 Cole began to concentrate on the epic paintings which brought his greatest success. Biblical landscapes become rarer in Cole's oeuvre, though he returned to them periodically throughout his career. His public, however, preferred his sentimental moralizing lessons to traditional Biblical subjects. Cole's few later Biblical landscapes are more generalized and less detailed works; changes brought about by the artist's study in Europe. They are more classically balanced compositions in which individual elements appear more unified and colors more subtle. The horizontal arrangement and open composition, characteristic of these later works, is indicative of the influence on Cole of the panorama, popular in England at the time.¹ In contrast to his earlier Biblical landscapes, they are of a more meditative mood.

Elijah in the Wilderness - Standing at the Mouth of the Cave (now lost) was painted in late 1829 or early 1830, soon after Cole's arrival in Europe. Several studies for the work appear in Cole's sketchbook.² They suggest a scene similar in composition to Cole's earlier Biblical landscapes. A dependence on John Martin is evident. The artist returned to the subject in 1844-45; unfortunately this work too is lost.³ A sketch for the later painting again reveals the strong influence of John Martin.⁴
In 1832 Cole produced an oil sketch, *The Dead Abel* (1832) (fig. 42), intended as a study for *Adam and Eve Discovering the Body of Abel*, a work which was never realized. The sketch is the result of Cole's concentration on figure drawing at the Academy in Florence and his direct study of European masters.

Comparison with an earlier sketch in Cole's 1827 sketchbook inscribed 'Death of Abel' exemplifies the change in Cole's approach after his arrival in Europe (fig. 43). The earlier compositional sketch adheres to the structural formula typical of Cole's early Biblical landscapes; diminutive figures in the middleground surrounded by towering peaks. The foreground is expectedly omitted, the landscape expressive. The later oil sketch, painted at the Florence Academy, is indicative of Cole's desire to master the human form. It is Cole's first work in which a foreground figure dominates the landscape setting.5

The figure of Abel suggests a source not before considered in relation to this work. Salomon Gessner's *The Death of Abel*, translated into English by W. C. Oulton in 1811, contained engraved illustrations to the text. One of these, illustrating Canto IV line 362, depicts Cain kneeling over his brother's lifeless body (fig. 44). The two figures are pushed to the foreground plane and dominate the scene. Cole's figure of Abel is a direct transposition from the engraving. Cole, unskilled in the technique of
foreshortening, positioned the figure parallel to the picture plane, yet the pose remains the same. In both works the figure lies on his back, one leg extended and slightly turned out, the other drawn toward the body. One arm is extended, the other pulled in with the hand resting on the ground above the figure's head. It seems apparent that the illustrative engraving was a source for Cole's figure of Abel.

In 1832 or 1833 Cole painted Christ and the Woman of Samaria, exhibiting it at the National Academy of Design in 1833. Its present location is unknown and no preliminary sketches for the work have been established. Adherence to the Biblical text would, however, require an outdoor scene.

In 1834, after returning to America, Cole completed The Angel Appearing to the Shepherds, the largest canvas of his career (fig. 45). In size alone the work is expressive of the influence of Cole's European trip; it was predicated on the popularity of the panorama, and indicative of the artist's interest in the production of public art. Cole's few completed Biblical landscapes of this period are large in scale, intended for public exhibition rather than private patronage.6

Cole, influenced by European art, adopted a new compositional formula in his later works. First suggested in The Dead Abel and fully developed in The Angel Appearing to the Shepherds, it is a horizontal, more stable format
with figures moved to the foreground. Yet the artist's later works still contain Cole's ever present play of contrasts. In *The Angel Appearing to the Shepherds* it is expressed in the dramatic chiaroscuro and in the serenity of the scene of the right background set against the drama of the angel's appearance in the left portion of the canvas. The figures further illustrate the artist's increased ability and confidence in the depiction of the human figure. Figural studies for the three shepherds appear in Cole's 1829 sketchbook. The reclining figure is based on Cole's drawings of the Elgin marbles which the artist studied at the British Museum. The remaining two figures were adapted from Cole's male figure studies drawn at the Academy in Florence.

Cole's *After the Temptation* (1843) follows the same compositional formula utilized in *The Angel Appearing to the Shepherds* (fig. 46). Characteristic of Cole's later Biblical subjects it is a more austere landscape. The figures in the right foreground are more prominent here than in any of Cole's previous works. Unfortunately the painting has been cut in half, reportedly by the artist, and now resides in two separate institutions.

Perhaps the best known of Cole's later Biblical landscapes, *The Lord is My Shepherd* (1848) exhibits the amalgamation of Cole's various modes of presentation (fig. 47). It is not, as the artist's previous Biblical
landscapes, a transcription of a Biblical narrative. The Lord is My Shepherd is a more idiosyncratic interpretation of a Biblical concept expressed in one of the psalms. In this respect it more closely resembles Cole's later epic works such as The Voyage of Life, relying upon commonly associated emblems. In composition the painting is characteristic of Cole's later Biblical landscapes; a more classical format, a more sentimental presentation.

Cole was a transitional figure in American art. He transferred traditional European views and the aims of historical landscape painting to the American wilderness, attempting to make European artistic thought America's own. Cole's emphasis was on the moral benefits to be derived from nature; the realization of divine immanence. After Cole, art became less overtly Biblical and more a pure rendition of nature. The generation of landscape artists which followed produced a more serene, less didactically moralizing art. The work of these artists, such as Frederic E. Church and Albert Bierstadt, is more a true celebration of America's landscape. With their work pure nature came to be imbued with spiritual value. Though a few artist occasionally attempted to emulate Cole's elevated style, the general trend was toward representation rather than interpretation of America's scenery. What emerged was a religious, nonBiblical art, linked to the grandeur of the American landscape and containing an inherent sense of
Several prominent concepts of nature coexisted within the zeitgeist of early nineteenth century America. Furthered by naturalist philosophers and theologians of the day, nature was viewed as the primordial Wilderness, the 'agrarian dream' or Garden of the World, Eden (the original Paradise), or the Promised Land. Consequently Americans considered themselves God's chosen people awaiting the millennial regaining of Paradise, the New Jerusalem. Such concepts, rather loosely defined, were interpreted and adjusted to fit the psychological needs of everyman. Thus the nineteenth century projected many varied, and at times contradictory, moral, religious and nationalistic ideas onto the American landscape. Yet their single unifying force was a belief in man's ability to commune with God through nature, an issue central to the late eighteenth and early nineteenth century landscape movement. Potential threat to these fundamental beliefs grew as a consequence of the wilderness' steady destruction in the nineteenth century. Such destruction, carried out under the banner of 'progress', brought into question the inviolability of nature. Concerns regarding the repercussions of such destruction of nature, evidenced in Cole's landscape paintings, are central to the content of his early Biblical landscapes. They reflect Cole's world view, a Christian world view centered on man's relation to nature and tainted
in its artistic expression by English philosophy and art theory. The interrelation between nature and humanity was inescapable for the early nineteenth century American mind; one echoes the other. This correlative nature is the foundation of Cole's Biblical landscapes.
1. The panorama was invented by Robert Barker of Edinburgh in 1787.


3. See Merritt's notes, loc. cit.

4. Detroit Institute of Art, photocopy, 39.342. This sketch strongly resembles Martin's Moses on the Mount.

5. For a study of Cole's difficulties in dealing with the human figure see Parry, "Thomas Cole and the Problem of Figure Painting," op. cit.

6. Cole was an outspoken advocate of public art.

7. The reclining figure is based on Ilissus from the West Pediment of the Parthenon.

8. Parry, "Thomas Cole and the Problem of Figure Painting," op. cit., p. 81. For a complete history of this work and a synopsis of its meaning see Parry, loc. cit.

9. The two sections are now entitled The Tempter, in The Baltimore Museum of Art and Angels Ministering to Christ, in the Worcester Art Museum. For a complete history and reconstruction of this work see William H. Gerds, Jr., "Cole's Painting After the Temptation," Baltimore Museum of Art, Annual II, op. cit., p. 103-111.


12. For an in depth discussion of America's views of nature during the era, and their relation to art of the period see Barbara Novak, Nature and Culture, op. cit.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


The Bible. *King James Version*.


"Thomas Cole and the Problem of Figure Painting," The American Art Journal 4, no. 1 (Spring 1972), 66-86.

"Thomas Cole's Ideas for Mr. Reed's Doors," The American Art Journal XII, no. 3 (Summer 1980), 33-45.


Fig. 1. Thomas Cole, Landscape, Composition, St. John in the Wilderness, 1827, oil on canvas, 36 x 28 15/16 in. (91.4 x 73.5 cm), Wadsworth Atheneum, Hartford, Connecticut.
Fig. 2. Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for St. John in the Wilderness, Thomas Cole's 1827 sketchbook, Thomas Cole Papers, New York State Library, Albany.
Fig. 3. Thomas Cole, Landscape Composition, St. John in the Wilderness, detail.
Fig. 4. Thomas Cole, Sunny Morning on the Hudson, 1827, oil on panel, 18 3/4 x 25 1/4 in. (48 x 64 cm), Museum of Fine Arts, Boston, M. and M. Karolik Collection.
Fig. 5. After Salvator Rosa, St. John Preaching in the Wilderness. Engraving by John Brown, drawing by Richard Earlom, 1768, Fogg Art Museum, Harvard University.
Fig. 6. Claude Lorrain, Landscape with Christ Preaching on Mt. Tabor, 1656, oil on canvas, 66 1/2 x 101 1/2 in. (169 x 258 cm), private collection, U.S.A.
Fig. 7. John Martin, *The Bard*, 1817, oil on canvas, 84 x 61 in. (213.4 x 155 cm), Lang Art Gallery.
Fig. 8. After Francesco Zucarelli, John in the Wilderness. Engraving in Thomas Cole Print Collection, The Detroit Institute of Arts.
Fig. 9. Thomas Cole, Landscape, Composition, St. John in the Wilderness, detail.
Fig. 10. Richard Wilson, *The White Monk III*, early 1760s, oil on canvas, 21 x 27 1/2 in. (53.3 x 69.8 cm), Walter Stowe collection, Headington, Oxford.

Fig. 11. Thomas Cole, *Landscape, Scene From 'The Last of the Mohicans'* 1827, oil on canvas, 25 x 37 in. (63 x 94 cm), New York State Historical Association, Cooperstown, New York.
Fig. 13. Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for *The Garden of Eden*, The Detroit Institute of Arts. (39.300).
Fig. 14. Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for The Garden of Eden, The Detroit Institute of Arts. (39.357).
Fig. 15. Thomas Cole, botanical sketch, Hollyhock, The Detroit Institute of Arts. (39.174).
Fig. 16. Thomas Cole, The Voyage of Life, Childhood, 1839-40, oil on canvas, 52 1/2 x 78 1/2 in. (133.4 x 199.4 cm), Munson-Williams-Proctor Institute, Utica, New York.

Fig. 17. After Domenichino, Death of Hyacinthus. Engraving by Dominico Cunego, published 1771.
Fig. 18. Thomas Cole, *The Expulsion From the Garden of Eden*, 1827-28, oil on canvas, 39 x 54 in. (99 x 137 cm), Museum of Fine Arts, Boston, M. and M. Karolik Collection.

Fig. 19. Thomas Cole, 'Scale of Colours for the Expulsion', preliminary sketch, c. 1827, pencil on paper, Cole Papers, New York State Library, Albany.
Fig. 20. Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for Expulsion From The Garden of Eden, c. 1827, pen and wash on paper, The Detroit Institute of Arts. (39.366).
Fig. 21. Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for Expulsion From the Garden of Eden, Thomas Cole's 1827 sketchbook, Thomas Cole Papers, New York State Library, Albany.
Fig. 22. Thomas Cole, Expulsion - Moon and Firelight, c. 1827, oil on canvas, 36 x 48 in. (91.3 x 121.9 cm), The Thyssen-Bornemisza Collection.
Fig. 23. Thomas Cole, *Evening in Arcadia*, 1843, oil on canvas, 32 x 48 in. (81.3 x 121.9 cm), Wadsworth Atheneum, Hartford, Connecticut.
Fig. 25. Engraving after a Landscape by Salvator Rosa, Thomas Cole Print Collection, The Detroit Institute of Arts.
Fig. 27. Thomas Cole, *The Subsiding of the Waters of the Deluge*, 1829, oil on canvas, 35 3/4 x 47 5/8 in. (90.8 x 121.4 cm), National Gallery of American Art.
Fig. 28. Thomas Cole, *View of the Moon*, pen and wash, Thomas Cole's 1827 sketchbook, Thomas Cole Papers, New York State Library, Albany.
Fig. 29. Thomas Cole, Kaaterskill Falls, 1825, oil on canvas, 25 x 36 in. (63 x 91 cm), Wadsworth Atheneum, Hartford, Connecticut.
Fig. 30. John Martin, The Deluge, 1828, mezzotint, 21 x 30 in. (53.3 x 76.2 cm), Victoria and Albert Museum, London.
Fig. 31. John Martin, Sadak in Search of the Waters of Oblivion, 1812, oil on canvas, 30 x 24 1/2 in. (76.2 x 62.4 cm), Southampton Art Gallery.
Fig. 32. Nicolas Poussin, Winter, 1660-64, oil on canvas, 46 1/8 x 63 in. (117.1 x 160 cm), The Louvre.
Fig. 33. Thomas Cole, Lake with Dead Trees, 1825, oil on canvas, 27 x 34 in. (69 x 86 cm), Allen Art Museum, Oberlin College.
Fig. 34. Thomas Cole, American Lake Scene, 1844, oil on canvas, 18 1/4 x 24 1/2 in. (46.3 x 62.2 cm), The Detroit Institute of Arts.
Fig. 35. Thomas Cole, The Course of Empire, Desolation, 1836, oil on canvas, 39 1/2 x 61 in. (100.3 x 154.9 cm), The New York Historical Society.
Fig. 36. Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for Hagar in the Wilderness, pencil on paper, Thomas Cole's 1827 sketchbook, Thomas Cole Papers, New York State Library, Albany.

Fig. 37. Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for Hagar in the Wilderness, pencil on paper, Thomas Cole's 1827 sketchbook, Thomas Cole Papers, New York State Library, Albany.
Fig. 38. Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for Hagar in the Wilderness, pencil on paper, Thomas Cole's 1827 sketchbook, Thomas Cole Papers, New York State Library, Albany.

Fig. 39. Thomas Cole, preliminary sketch for Hagar in the Wilderness, pencil on paper, Thomas Cole's 1827 sketchbook, Thomas Cole Papers, New York State Library, Albany.
Fig. 40. Claude Lorrain, Landscape with Angel Appearing to Hagar, 1668, 42 x 55 in. (107 x 140 cm), Munich Alte Pinakothek.
Fig. 41. Thomas Cole, sketch after Claude Lorrain's Landscape with Angel Appearing to Hagar, Thomas Cole's 1827 sketchbook, Thomas Cole Papers, New York State Library, Albany. (39.80).
Fig. 42. Thomas Cole, The Dead Abel, 1832, paper mounted on wood panel, 17 5/8 x 28 7/8 in. (44.7 x 73.3 cm), Albany Institute of History and Art, Albany, New York.
Fig. 43. Thomas Cole, 'The Death of Abel', preliminary sketch, Thomas Cole's 1827 sketchbook, Thomas Cole Papers, New York State Library, Albany.
"then with clenched fist
His forehead violently struck."

CANTO IV, line 362.

Fig. 44. Illustration to Canto IV, line 362, Salomon Gessner’s The Death of Abel, trans. W.C. Oulton 1811.
Fig. 45. Thomas Cole, The Angel Appearing to the Shepherds, 1834, oil on canvas, 105 x 180 in. (266.7 x 457.2 cm), Chrysler Museum at Norfolk, Virginia.

Fig. 46. Thomas Cole, After the Temptation, 1843, oil on canvas. Now two paintings. Right: Angels Ministering to Christ, 51 x 40 1/2 in. (129.5 x 102.8 cm), Worcester Art Museum. Left: The Tempter, 51 x 40 in. (129.5 x 101.6 cm), The Baltimore Museum of Art.
Fig. 47. Thomas Cole, *The Lord is My Shepherd*, 1848, oil on canvas, 32 x 48 in. (81.2 x 121.9 cm), Mabel M. Swan.